#### University of Central Florida

#### **STARS**

Honors Undergraduate Theses

2024

## Intent, Content, and State Specific Circumstances 25 Years Later: A Comparative Analysis of Contemporary Protections for Women Refugees Among Beijing Declaration Signatory Countries

Grace Bennett *University of Central Florida*, gr756016@ucf.edu

Part of the Comparative Politics Commons, International and Area Studies Commons, and the International Relations Commons

Find similar works at: https://stars.library.ucf.edu/hut2024 University of Central Florida Libraries http://library.ucf.edu

This Open Access is brought to you for free and open access by STARS. It has been accepted for inclusion in Honors Undergraduate Theses by an authorized administrator of STARS. For more information, please contact STARS@ucf.edu.

#### **STARS Citation**

Bennett, Grace, "Intent, Content, and State Specific Circumstances 25 Years Later: A Comparative Analysis of Contemporary Protections for Women Refugees Among Beijing Declaration Signatory Countries" (2024). *Honors Undergraduate Theses*. 12.

https://stars.library.ucf.edu/hut2024/12

# INTENT, CONTENT, AND STATE SPECIFIC CIRCUMSTANCES 25 YEARS LATER: A COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS OF CONTEMPORARY PROTECTIONS FOR WOMEN REFUGEES AMONG BEIJING DECLARATION SIGNATORY COUNTRIES

by

#### **GRACE BENNETT**

A thesis submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the Honors Undergraduate Thesis program in International and Global Studies in the College of Sciences and in the Burnett Honors College at the University of Central Florida Orlando, Florida

2024

Thesis Chair: Dr. Anca Turcu, Ph.D.

#### **ABSTRACT**

Women refugees suffer from high levels of abuse, discrimination, and sexual and gender-based violence. This paper aims to determine what factors account for different levels of state commitment to protections for women refugees. Existing literature suggests a connection between states' concern for gender equality and ethical treatment of women, and their commitment towards the protection of women refugees. A content analysis of the Beijing Declaration 25+ national reports, along with the World Health Organization, United Nations, and other similar reports, seeks to further explore this connection. In doing so, this study examines three categories: states' stated intentions or concerns, state norms (laws), and incidence (statistics) of ill-treatment or discrimination of women. The analysis focuses particularly on national policies revolving around sexual and gender-based violence, laxity of laws or law enforcement when it comes to gender-based violence or rape, women being trafficked, domestic violence, and cultural attitudes towards rape, among other defining factors. A series of case studies of countries that are top recipients of refugees, and their neighbors, round up the analysis portion of the paper. Findings indicate a telling connection between protections of women refugees and states' general commitment to broader protections for women.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<u>LIST OF TABLES</u>	iv
LIST OF MODELS	v
<u>INTRODUCTION</u>	1
LITERATURE REVIEW AND THEORETICAL IMPLICATIONS	3
<u>HYPOTHESIS</u>	6
DATA SETS AND METHODOLOGY	7
STATISTICAL ANALYSIS	13
CASE STUDIES	19
<u>Iran</u>	21
<u>Iraq</u>	23
Russia	24
Belarus	25
Germany	27
<u>Denmark</u>	28
<u>India</u>	30
<u>Pakistan</u>	32
<u>CONCLUSIONS</u>	34
Summary of Findings: Statistical Analysis	34
Summary of Findings: Case Studies	34
Summary of Findings: Hypotheses	35
Implications for Future Research	36
<u>REFERENCES</u>	38
APPENDIX A: CORRELATION MATRICES	49

## LIST OF TABLES

Table 1.Independent Variables by Category and Source	8
Table 2. Number of Mentions of Keywords "Sexual Violence" and "Gender Based Violence'	'(2
Term Beijing +25 Independent Variable) and "Women Refugees/Refugee Women," "Displace	ed
Women," and "Women Asylum Seekers" (Dependent Variable) For Top Refugee Host Coun	tries
and Neighbors	20
Table 3. Appendix A1: Correlation Matrix of Combined Category 2 & 3	50
Table 4. Appendix A2: Correlation Matrix of OECD SIGI Data (Including Dimensions)	50
Table 5. Appendix A3: Correlation Matrix of World Bank: Women, Business, and the Law	
(2016)	51
Table 6. Appendix A4: Correlation Matrix of 2 Term Beijing +25 Keywords	51
Table 7. Appendix A5: Correlation Matrix of 9 Term Beijing +25 Keywords	52

## LIST OF MODELS

<u>Model 1: 2 Term Beijing +25</u>	15
Model 2: 9 Term Beijing +25	
Model 3: Combined Category 2 & 3 Regression.	

#### INTRODUCTION

Women refugees are a demographic that suffers from some of the highest levels of sexual and gender-based violence in the world, such as rape, trafficking and forced or child marriage. And while knowledge of this has begun to spread within the past few years due to an increase in reports and articles in the media, awareness has not generated change: there is still a tremendous lack of protective measures for women refugees. The media has ensured that the world understands these issues are occurring, and yet some countries are failing more than others to take necessary measures towards women refugee protection. The aim of this thesis is to determine which factors account for why some countries have greater levels of commitment to protection of women refugees than others, by analyzing attitudes towards gender protections in their respective national contexts.

To do so, this study will employ a content analysis of the national reports for the 25th anniversary of the Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action of 169 countries, which will be measured against similar analyses of national legislation, outcomes, and data on gender-based restrictions and violence in each country. Rooted in theoretical studies that have suggested a similar connection, all be it along different dimensions, this study will seek to determine if such national characteristics are pertinent to attitudes towards refugees. This analysis will entail several multinomial regressions, connecting concern for women refugees (DV) with stated protections, and laws/cultural norms (IV) as found in various specialized databases. Variables will be operationalized through content analysis. In addition to the overall statistical analysis, the paper will also offer a more limited case study approach of the following countries: Iran, Iraq, Germany, Denmark, Belarus, and Russia, which were randomly selected out of 169 cases. The

limited number of cases is justified due to the nature of this thesis and limitations on time and resources. Iraq will serve as a regional comparison to Iran, Denmark will serve as a comparison to Germany, and Belarus will serve as a comparison to Russia. Due to the overwhelming prevalence in the media and literature in recent years on the treatment of women in India, this country will also be included as a case study, with neighboring Pakistan also employed as a comparative case study. Taking a comparative approach will allow the differences in factors that determine a country's interest in protections for women refugees to become much clearer.

#### LITERATURE REVIEW AND THEORETICAL IMPLICATIONS

Protections for women refugees have been at the center of a growing literature for the past decade. First, such studies focused on NGO operations, and challenges posed by economic and security-related shortages (McConnachie 2014). But, more recently, the focus has shifted to broader context of host countries. As such, several studies assert that broader patterns of illtreatment of women will be mirrored in the treatment of women refugees. The literature suggests some countries' increase in weaponization of sexual violence, and its utilization in conflict, correlates with a general decrease in concern for the wellbeing and safety of women (refugees) within the same countries. A country's use of sexual violence during wartime ties hand in hand with sociocultural factors such as hypermasculinity and gender inequality during peacetime (Alexandre and Mutondo 2022), and gender norms influence the use of sexual violence at both strategic military and private levels (Guarnieri and Tur-Prats 2023). Vu et al. conducted a systematic review of literature using multiple databases and revealed that about one in five refugees or displaced women in humanitarian crises experienced sexual violence. This number is likely an underestimation of the true number, due to the various factors barring many women from reporting their experiences with sexual violence (Vu et al. 2014).

Kalra and Bhugra use the cross-cultural perspective theory to assess how societal gender roles affect rates of sexual violence. They argue that sexual violence is more likely to occur in cultures that support ideas of male superiority and the inferiority of women, than in cultures that view men and women as equal (Kalra and Bhugra 2013).

More so, Ulrike Krause, finds in a study of Congolese women refugees in Uganda, that sexual violence, along with discrimination and domestic violence are prevalent. This she links to broader societal and cultural norms that prevent Ugandan officials from intervening to ameliorate

the situation. Thus, even though refugee camps are set up to provide protective environments for refugees, they more readily meet gender neutral standards, like shelter and food, but fail to do so when it comes to gender (women)-specific needs. Krause thus joins a number of authors, who through empirical studies in the field connect gender, vulnerability, and general challenges to gender protections (or lack thereof) typical of the host country (Krause 2020).

Refugee protections, just like refugee camps, operate against the background of a receiving or host state, and the administrative powers, cultural traits, and normative provisions of their respective governments that also coordinate with the United Nations and various international aid agencies (Agier 2011; Janmyr 2014).

However, individual states' policies regarding refugees can vary to a great degree. More progressive policies grant refugees rights of movement, work, and property, as well as extensive protections from abuse. Therefore, a state's institutional/normative framework, its general concern for the wellbeing of women in general, as well as its statement of intentions or plans for protecting women, as stated in international documents, can signal levels of protection for women refugees (Krause 2020). Tolerance of violence against women in public spheres is an important indicator of how women refugees will be treated or perceived in certain societies or states (Fiddian-Qasmiyeh 2014). The same goes for private spheres: institutional or normative tolerance of domestic violence bodes ill for treatment of women in general, but also especially for women refugees in most states (Dutton 2001; Horn 2010).

Participants in Rebecca Horn's study identified gender roles, marriage practices, and belief of the acceptability of familial violence within both the culture of the host state and the refugee camp as the top cultural factors contributing to domestic violence in Kakuma refugee camp.

Amy Friedman finds that along with the health and safety issues commonly faced by all refugees, women refugees face additional gender-based risks that are propagated by the cultural environment of their host countries, along with cultural and religious beliefs surrounding rape and gendered violence. A culture's indifference to sexual violence or rape, usually paired with a paucity of strong legal structures aimed at protecting women, fosters an unsafe environment for all women in society, and especially women refugees. The refugees' cultural and religious beliefs surrounding rape also contribute to the high levels of sexual violence faced by women refugees (Friedman 1992).

#### **HYPOTHESIS**

H1: Based on the theoretical implications of the literature reviewed above, I hypothesize that a country's stated concern for women refugee protections is a function of several factors, including concern for women's wellbeing, cultural considerations, laws and a broader background of incidents of violence or discrimination against women.

H2: I expect that stated concern for women's wellbeing and more laws aimed at protecting women in general will lead to more concern for the protection of women refugees.

H3: At the same time, higher numbers of reported abusive or discriminatory incidents against women in society will denote a lesser concern for the protection of women refugees.

#### DATA SETS AND METHODOLOGY

The Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action was adopted by the UN on September 15, 1995, at the Fourth World Conference on Women and informs the dependent variable (DV) in this study. Its aim was to implement principles that would achieve greater gender equality and women's rights and is widely considered to be one of the most transformable global agendas in this regard. The 25th anniversary national reports, submitted in 2019, provide reviews of the progress made, policies implemented and planned to be implemented, and challenges faced by each state in its mission to advance women's rights over the course of the past 25 years. The 25th anniversary national reports are often referred to as the Beijing +25 reports and will be referred to as such in this thesis.

In order to conduct this study in a comparative manner, 169 countries were included: all the countries that submitted their Beijing +25 national reports, excluding four countries whose national reports were not compatible with the keyword search function. It must also be noted that for reports that were only available in a language other than English, a translation application was also utilized.

Each state's level of concern for women refugees that this study focuses on is defined in this paper by the number of times the keywords "women refugees/refugee women," "displaced women," and "women asylum seekers," is mentioned in each country's Beijing +25 report. This will serve as the study's dependent variable (DV).

Independent Variables (IVs) will be measured along three categories, derived from the literature review and theoretical discussion covered above: 1. State Intent or Concern Category, 2. Normative Category, 3. State Statistics (on discrimination, abuse, femicide etc.) Category, and will be drawn from various data sources, as shown in the table and descriptions below.

Table 1.Independent Variables by Category and Source

Categories	Data Source
Category 1: State Intent or Concern	25+ Beijing Declaration 2 Terms
	25+ Beijing Declaration 9 Terms
Category 2: State Norms/ Laws	World Bank 2016 Data
	World Bank 2019 Data
Category 3: State Statistics	WHO Data on Violence
	SIGI Data on Discrimination, Abuse, etc.
	UNODC Data on Killings

As part of the State Intent Category (1), the study takes into account independent variables based on a keyword search of the +25 Beijing Declaration for the following terms:

- -Sexual Violence
- -Gender-based violence
- -Child Marriage/s
- -Forced Marriage/s
- -Early Marriage/s
- -Reproductive Health
- -Reproductive Rights
- -Sexual Abuse
- -Trafficking/Trafficked

The sets of keywords mentioned above, and the number of times that each was mentioned within each of the 169 Beijing +25 reports are used in this study to define the levels concern for

the protection for women refugees. Through an analysis of the text, and number of mentions of keywords of the Beijing +25 documents, intent will be measured, rather than action.

The number of mentions of such terms per country are indicative of a country's concern for women's safety or general wellbeing. A higher number of mentions would infer more concern for women's wellbeing and this might signal more concern for women refugees. As shown by the list above, key words imply concern with matters such as violence against women and rape of women, laxity of concern or action when it comes to gender-based violence, child marriage, and rape, as well as gender-related killings of women and girls, domestic violence, and cultural attitudes towards rape.

Besides the number of keywords in each Beijing +25 Declaration as described above, functioning as independent variables, five other datasets are utilized in this study to develop other independent, or explanatory, variables, pertaining to the categories listed above. These datasets were pulled from the Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD), the World Health Organization, the United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime, and the World Bank. The OECD data addresses the explanatory factor of cultural and societal gender norms, the World Health Organization data addresses the explanatory factor of intimate partner violence, the United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime data addresses the explanatory factor of gender-based killings of women and girls, or femicide, and the World Bank data addresses the explanatory factors of domestic violence law, child marriage law, and marital rape law.

From the OECD Social Institution and Gender Index (SIGI) Scores: Levels of Gender Discrimination, gender discrimination is measured through SIGI scores which are calculated through the analysis of four dimensions: discrimination in the family, restricted physical integrity, restricted access to productive and financial resources, and restricted civil liberties. The

SIGI scores range from 0 to 100 with 0 meaning no discrimination and 100 meaning absolute discrimination. The OECD's most recent SIGI scores are used in this study, in the form of the fifth edition from 2023, and 140 countries have SIGI scores calculated in this edition. For the purposes of this study, only countries that had also submitted Beijing +25 reports and that had no data gaps in the SIGI data were included, resulting in the OECD SIGI data of 125 countries being eligible to act as an independent Variable. X Variable 1 from the OECD SIGI data is the numeral SIGI score, ranging from 0 to 100. This score considers all four dimensions of the SIGI, discrimination in the family, restricted physical integrity, restricted access to productive and financial resources, and restricted civil liberties.

The dataset from the United Nations Office of Drugs and Crimes' database, data UNODC, utilized in this study is the data on Gender-related Killings of Women and Girls. This data is measured in total rates, per 100,000 population. The data year used in this study is 2019, as that was the year the countries involved in the Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action were invited to submit their Beijing+25 reports. Again, countries with data gaps in the UNODC data, as well as countries that had not yet submitted their Beijing +25 reports were excluded, leaving 99 countries and data points eligible to be used as an independent Variable in this study. There is only one X Variable for this data set, and X Variable 1 is the rate per 100,000 population of gender-related killings of women and girls for 2019.

From the World Bank, two different datasets were used. The first is the World Bank: Women, Business, and the Law dataset from 2019. From this dataset, domestic violence law is measured with a yes or no response to the question, "Is there legislation specifically addressing domestic violence?" The yes or no responses are then coded into numerical values for this study, where No=0 and Yes=1. Countries with data gaps in the World Bank: Women, Business, and the

Law 2019 data, as well as countries that had not yet submitted their Beijing +25 reports were excluded, resulting in 163 countries remaining eligible to be used as an independent Variable. There is only one X Variable in this dataset, and X Variable 1 is the coded Yes or No response to the question "Is there legislation specifically addressing domestic violence?" in 2019.

The second World Bank dataset comes from the World Bank: Women, Business, and the Law data from 2016. This 2016 data has been included in an effort to provide as detailed and comprehensive an outlook as possible, as there it includes a wider set of data points that are most relevant to this study as compared to other years of the World Bank's Women, Business, and the Law reports. The data included for this study measures domestic violence, child marriage, and marital rape laws with yes or no questions and responses. The Yes and No responses are coded into numerical values, where No=0 and Yes=1. There are seven Yes or No questions asked, with each corresponding to an X variable. X Variable 1 corresponds to the question, "Is there domestic violence legislation?". X Variable 2 to the question, "Are there clear criminal penalties for domestic violence?". X Variable 3 to the question, "Is child marriage void or prohibited?". X Variable 4 to the question, "Is child marriage penalized?". X Variable 5 to the question, "Is marital rape explicitly criminalized?". X Variable 6 to the question, "Are rape perpetrators exempt if they are married to the victim?". And X Variable 7 to the question, "Are rape perpetrators exempt if they marry the victim?".

The dataset utilized from the World Health Organization, Global Database on the Prevalence of Violence Against Women depicted WHO's current national estimates in percentages of Physical and/or Sexual Intimate Partner Violence. The national estimates are measured using a combination of data from 2000 to 2018 and are presented as lifetime rates for those between the ages of 15 and 49. Intimate partner violence is violence that occurs between those in an intimate

relationship. Again, the countries with data gaps in the WHO dataset, as well as those that had not submitted Beijing +25 reports were excluded, leaving 136 countries and data points eligible to function as an independent Variable. There is only one X Variable for the WHO dataset, and X Variable 1 is the WHO's national estimates in percentages of Physical and/or Sexual Intimate Partner Violence.

#### STATISTICAL ANALYSIS

In order to determine the connection between this study's dependent variable (as described above) and the independent variables in the three categories listed above, I have conducted several multinomial regressions. As an additional test to ensure the soundness of the models, correlation matrices for the datasets with more than one X variable were conducted. These can be found in Appendix A.

The dependent variable, the total number of mentions of the keywords "women refugees/refugee women," "displaced women," and "women asylum seekers" has been categorized for the purposes of the multinominal regressions. The categories exist as follows: 0 to 2 total mentions of the dependent variable keywords indicate a Low stated concern for women refugees. 3 to 5 total mentions of the keywords indicated a Medium level of concern for women refugees. 6 total mentions of the keywords and above indicated a High level of concern for women refugees. The categories are coded, where a Low level of concern = 1, a Medium level of concern = 2, and a High level of concern = 3.

Category 1 tests (below), measure state intent or concern, utilizing the 25+ Beijing

Declaration data, as described above. Mentions of certain terms: two terms for Model 1 and nine
terms for Model 2, as part of the declaration, yield results for 169 countries (N). However, the
explanatory power of the first model is rather weak (low R Square) and the independent
variables are not statistically significant for the two independent variables in Model 1. These
results indicate that stated concern for sexual violence or gender violence impacting women in
society does not predict concern for refugees, at least when it comes to the 25+ Beijing

Declaration two terms test.

Similarly, the explanatory power for Model 2 is rather low, with a .13 R Square value. However, there is one term, "forced marriage," that is statistically significant (at a p value of <.001 or <.05). This signifies a strong connection between high stated concern for issues of forced marriage and high concern for women refugees and further indicates that state intent/concern for women in society is related to states' expressed concern for women refugees.

Model 1: 2 Term Beijing +25

Regression Statistics				
Multiple R	0.21			
R Square	0.05			
Adjusted R Square	0.03			
Standard Error	0.65			
Observations	169			

		Standard	
	Coefficients	Error	P-value
Intercept	1.282	0.075	0.00
Sexual Violence	0.006	0.004	0.17
Gender-based			
Violence	0.007	0.003	0.03

Model 2: 9 Term Beijing +25

Regression Statistics				
Multiple R	0.37			
R Square	0.13			
Adjusted R Square	0.09			
Standard Error	0.63			
Observations	169			

	C fC: -:	Standard	D1
	Coefficients	Error	P-value
Intercept	1.133	0.103	0.00
Sexual Violence	0.002	0.004	0.64
Gender-based			
violence	0.006	0.003	0.04
Child Marriage	-0.006	0.008	0.43
Forced Marriage	0.037	0.011	0.00
Early Marriage	-0.008	0.015	0.57
Reproductive Health	0.009	0.008	0.23
Reproductive Rights	0.016	0.032	0.60
Sexual Abuse	0.004	0.013	0.77
Trafficked/Trafficking	0.001	0.003	0.84

Model 3: Combined Category 2 & 3 Regression

Regression Statistics		
Multiple R	0.51	
R Square	0.26	
Adjusted R Square	0.11	
Standard Error	0.69	
Observations	67	

			<i>P</i> -
	Coeffic ients	Standard Error	valu e
Intercept	2.151	0.652	0.00
OECD SIGI score	-0.009	0.011	0.38
UNODC: Gender Related Killings of Women and Girls (Rates)	-0.124	0.041	0.00
World Bank: Women, Business, and the Law 2019	-0.339	0.515	0.51
World Bank: Women, Business, and the Law 2016 (Is there domestic violence legislation?)	0.548	0.356	0.13
World Bank: Women, Business, and the Law 2016 (Are there clear criminal penalties for domestic violence?)	-0.296	0.225	0.19
World Bank: Women, Business, and the Law 2016 (Is child marriage void or prohibited?)	-0.089	0.315	0.78
World Bank: Women, Business, and the Law 2016 (Is child marriage penalized?)	-0.133	0.189	0.48
World Bank: Women, Business, and the Law 2016 (Is marital rape explicitly criminalized?)	0.055	0.233	0.82
World Bank: Women, Business, and the Law 2016 (Are rape perpetrators exempt if they are married to the victim?)	-0.273	0.417	0.52
World Bank: Women, Business, and the Law 2016 (Are rape			
perpetrators exempt if they marry the victim?)	0.323	0.465	0.49
WHO: Physical and/or Sexual Intimate Partner Violence (15-49)	0.001	0.011	o <b>-</b> c
National Estimates in percentages	0.004	0.014	0.79

Model 3 pertains to Category 2: State Norms/Laws and Category 3: State Statistics. Data from the World Bank was utilized for Category 2, and data from the Office of Economic Cooperation and Development, World Health Organization, and United Nations Office of Drugs and Crime was utilized for Category 3. The explanatory power is high, with a 26% R-square value and a 51% Multiple R value, revealing a correlation between concern for women refugees and state norms and laws, and state statistics on gender-based violence, discrimination, and femicide.

Additionally, there is statistical significance for the United Nations Office of Drugs and Crime: Gender Related Killings of Women and Girls, depicted by a P-value of less than 0.01. The coefficient for the UNODC data is inversely related to the dependent variable, revealing that the more gender related killings of women and girls, the fewer total mentions of the dependent variable keywords, and as such, the lower level of concern for women refugees.

#### **CASE STUDIES**

While this thesis takes a holistic approach and analyzes all 169 Beijing +25 reports in the comprehensive statistical analysis presented above, it also provides a set of detailed case studies of refugee host countries with less than ten mentions of the 2 Term IV keywords, "sexual violence" and "gender-based violence". This benchmark is chosen as few mentions of the terms, compared to other countries', may indicate low concern for violence against women in these particular countries, and may tie (as explained above) into low concern for women refugees. The selected countries' immediate neighbors will also be studied, in order to provide a pertinent regional comparison. The top seven refugee host countries by number of refugees, in order of greatest to least number of refugees, were Turkey, Iran, Colombia, Germany, Pakistan, Uganda and Russia.

Table 2. Number of Mentions of Keywords "Sexual Violence" and "Gender Based Violence" (2 Term Beijing +25 Independent Variable) and "Women Refugees/Refugee Women," "Displaced Women," and "Women Asylum Seekers" (Dependent Variable) For Top Refugee Host Countries and Neighbors

Refugee Host Country	Sexual Violence (IV)	Gender Based Violence (IV)	Total Number of Mentions of Sexual Violence and Gender Based Violence (IV)	Total Number of Mentions of Women Refugees/Refugee Women, Displaced Women, Women Asylum Seekers (DV)
Turkey	5	10	15	14
Iran	3	0	3	1
Colombia	24	1	25	0
Germany	7	1	8	33
Pakistan	9	10	19	1
Uganda	12	8	20	7
Russia	0	2	2	0
Neighboring Countries	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
Georgia (Turkey)	14	7	21	0
Iraq (Iran)	26	6	32	14
Brazil (Colombia)	10	0	10	3
Denmark (Germany)	3	12	15	8
India (Pakistan)	9	1	10	0
Rwanda (Uganda)	2	10	12	3
Belarus (Russia)	6	3	9	0

The top refugee host countries that had less than ten mentions of the 2 Term IV keywords, deemed for the purposes of this study as countries with low levels of concern for women or women refugees are: Iran, Germany, and Russia. Their neighbors, none of whom serve as a top refugee host country, are Iraq, Denmark, and Belarus. Belarus is the only one of the neighboring countries to also have less than ten mentions of the keywords. These countries, along with India, as mentioned before due to its recent prevalence in the media on the topic of violence against women, will serve as the focal points of study. Pakistan's case study will also be included, as India's neighboring state.

Thus, based on this broader observation in the literature, this paper hones in on sexual and gender-based violence in Iran, Germany, Russia, and their neighbors Iraq, Denmark, Belarus, as well as India and Pakistan. Literature specific to these countries reveals some key patterns for those countries with higher levels of protections and those with lower levels of protections. There appears to be a common theme in countries with lower levels of protections where the armed forces of these countries use rape as a weapon for political purposes. The available literature reveals this to be particularly true in the cases of India and Russia.

#### Iran

Iran's "National Report on Women's Status in the Islamic Republic of Iran (Beijing + 25)," included 1 total mention of the keywords "women refugees/refugee women," "displaced women," and "women asylum seekers," And 3 total mentions of the 2 Term IV keywords, "sexual violence" and "gender-based violence." For a document that was 200 pages long, there appears to be an unproportionate focus on these topics, a surprising revelation, given the high rates of sexual violence in Iran, and Iran's role as a top refugee host country. There was also no mention of reproductive health or rights within this document.

The governmental attitudes and policies in Iran could help explain some of these discrepancies. In Iran, following the nationwide demonstrations that began in September 2022, state agents have been using sexual violence to punish and torture detainees as young as 12 years old (Amnesty International 2023). Additionally, the government in Iran has also used gender-based violence and sexual violence as a form of punishment by arresting women who they claim are not following the rules of modesty and the moral codes and then proceed to rape them (Kristof 2022). These recent events are indicative of the Iranian government's unconcerned, and what could even be considered supportive, attitude towards sexual violence and could help to explain why Iran's national report for Beijing +25 did not seem particularly focused on alleviating these issues.

In the case of domestic violence in Iran, Marzieh Kargar Jahromi et al. conducted a cross-sectional study on married women between the ages of 16 and 18 to determine the factors associated with a higher risk of domestic violence. The study revealed that domestic violence, whether it be physical, sexual, or emotional, was associated with younger women, a shorter length of marriage, drug use, and the women's levels of education. Women between the ages of 15 and 25 were far more likely to be victims of domestic violence, as well as with women who had been married for five years or less. Women with higher levels of education were also found to be less likely to be victims of domestic violence than women with lower levels of education, and the paper concluded that one of the key methods to reduce the levels of sexual violence in Iran is to increase the education levels of the men and women there (Kargar Jahromi et al.).

Aghtaie looks at how the implementation of a religious state in Iran has affected rape law and culture. She describes how not only are so-called "moral police," specifically targeted at women still a large part of Iranian culture, but also how any mention of rape has essentially

vanished from Iranian academic and professional literature. Aghtaie reveals that there is no mention of rape in Iranian academic articles or books, and in the off chance that rape is mentioned in legal literature, it is always referred to by another name. Aghtaie claims that Iranian culture does everything within its power to turn a blind eye on the topic of rape (Aghtaie 2011).

In a survey conducted with 188 Afghan women refugee participants, between the ages of 15 and 49, in Iran, 79.8% of participants reported experiencing some form of intimate partner violence within the past year (Delkhosh et al. 2018). The survey also revealed that 67.3% of participants had a primary level of education or lower, signifying the link between level of education and risk of domestic violence (Delkhosh et al. 2018)

#### Iraq

In Iraq's Beijing +25 report, the keywords "women refugees/refugee women," "displaced women," and "women asylum seekers," are mentioned 14 times. The IV keywords "sexual violence" and "gender-based violence" are mentioned 32 times. This presents a stark difference to neighboring Iran's very limited use of the same terms, as described above.

In a survey taken of 176 pregnant women living in two refugee camps in Erbil, Iraq, 13% of participants reported experiencing abuse, whereas nearly 22% of participants reported knowing of a situation of intimate partner violence outside of their family. The study further revealed that factors such as lack of access to a private doctor and low levels of education increased the participants' risk of experiencing intimate partner violence (Mishkin 2022). Additionally, 58.6% of women in Erbil, Iraq have reported experiencing intimate partner violence in their lifetime (Al-Atrushi et al. 2013).

In another survey taken of 92 internally displaced persons in Iraq, 58% of the women participants reported having been exposed to partner violence within the past year (Goessmann 2019).

In a survey of 326 married Yazidi women in displaced persons camps in Iraq, intimate partner violence was reported as common, as was exposure to gender-based violence during Islamic State captivity and attacks. 66% of the participants reported experiencing intimate partner violence within the past year, and 54% of participants reported having experienced abduction and sexual slavery. The risk of intimate partner violence was not found to have been affected by experience of abduction. Rates of depression and PTSD were high as a whole (Goessmann 2020).

While levels of gender-based violence and sexual violence in Iraq are much higher than they should be, Iraq has been taking action to combat it and has been praised internationally for its work to do so. On January 31, 2022, the WHO and the Ministry of Health in Iraq launched the first ever gender-based violence strategic plan in Iraq with the goal of creating a better medical response system to gender-based violence, as well as reducing the stigma surrounding it (World Health Organization 2022). Additionally, the UN Human Rights Committee commended Iraq on its judicial pursuit of perpetrators of sexual violence, revealing that Iraq isn't merely claiming to be attempting to rectify this situation, it is taking the necessary action to do so (OHCHR 2022).

#### Russia

Russia's national report for Beijing +25 mentioned the keywords "women refugees/refugee women," "displaced women," and "women asylum seekers" 0 times, despite being a top refugee host country, and the keywords "sexual violence," and "gender-based violence," 2 times. When analyzing recent Russian events and policies, an explanation for this

begins to emerge. Not only is sexual violence being used by Russian troops against Ukrainians as a weapon of war, but prisoners in Russia are also being systematically raped (Prosvirova 2022).

Additionally, levels of domestic violence in Russia are exceedingly high, but the response system available to victims of domestic violence there is very poor. These responses include a rule that states that if domestic violence is reported to the police, the perpetrator cannot be arrested unless the violence is so severe that the victim must go to the hospital (Rollins 2022).

Putin has also adopted a strategy to push the ideas of morality in order to distract Russians from the governmental corruption, which has led to an increase in traditional values, toxic masculinity, and as a result, domestic violence (Rollins 2022). The domestic violence culture in Russia also generally sticks to the line of thinking that this is something to be expected within the home and should not be discussed outside of it. Similar lines of thinking when it comes to domestic violence are also present in the governments, law enforcement, and culture in general in India, Iran, and Belarus. To address the use of sexual violence by Russian forces against Ukrainian women and children since the 2022 Russian invasion of Ukraine, Pietrzak argues that Russia is using rape as a weapon in a systemic manner to purposely target civilians. Pietrzak uses systemic theory and Just War Theory as the backbone for his research and concludes that the top Russian political powers have without a doubt supported the ethnic cleansing being perpetrated by the Russian troops, particularly against women and children. He also claims that this systemic cleansing campaign can more than likely be considered a genocide (Pietrzak 2022).

#### Belarus

Neighbor to Russia, Belarus' national report for Beijing 25+ included 0 total mentions of the terms "women refugees/refugee women," "displaced women," and "women asylum seekers,"

and 9 total mentions of the keywords "sexual violence" and "gender based violence." Culturally similar in many ways to Russia, this can in part be explained by the governmental attitudes towards gender-based and domestic violence there. Domestic violence is an immense issue in Belarus, but much like in Russia, it is widely considered socially unacceptable to talk about and a part of the culture that must merely be accepted in silence. Stereotypical roles for men and women are also still very prevalent in Belarus, exacerbating this situation (Amnesty International 2021). Additionally, following the protests in 2020, many of the protestors were imprisoned. They have subsequently been subjected to rape and torture (OHCHR 2022). At some point, these actions, and the use of sexual violence as a punishment must tie back to state actors and the policies of the government.

Following his tumultuous reelection in 2020, Alexander Lukashenko and the Belarusian government have instigated four major crises. These include an economic crisis, humanitarian crisis, political crisis, and military crisis (Korosteleva & Petrova 2023). The humanitarian crisis, sparked by the Belarus-European Union border migrant crisis that Lukashenko initiated, has resulted in the maltreatment of refugees in Belarus, including sexual and gender-based violences. In Belarus, the refugees report experiencing abuses like rape and inhuman treatment by Belarusian authoritative figures, such as border guards and police (Human Rights Watch). The U.S. Department of State reported that the Belarusian government engaged in minimal cooperation with humanitarian organizations such as the Office of the UN High Commissioner for Refugees in providing protection for refugees and asylum seekers (U.S. Department of State). The Bruzgi migrant holding camp was also identified as a facility where reports of rape and sexual violence were common (U.S. Department of State).

The Belarusian government has attempted to silence these reports of human rights violations through the eradication of almost 1,000 civil societies and NGOs (U.S. Department of State).

Additionally, while non-marital rape is typically prosecuted, marital rape is oftentimes not adequately addressed by the courts (U.S. Department of State).

#### Germany

Germany's national report for Beijing +25 mentioned the keywords "women refugees/refugee women," "displaced women," and "women asylum seekers" 33 times, the highest number of mentions of the 169 documents analyzed, and the keywords "sexual violence" and "gender-based violence" a total of 8 times.

Another top refugee host country, while Germany has displayed much greater effort in taking on the responsibility of providing its large number of refugees with the necessary aid, accommodation, and assistance with assimilation, gender disparities in these assimilation programs have been quick to appear. Due to familial obligations, women are far less likely to be able to attend the German language and assimilation courses, resulting in both a language fluency gap between genders and unequal power dynamics (Weise 2017).

For a small group of "highly qualified" women refugees and asylum seekers in Germany, a series of programs at both the federal and local levels have been created to help them access the German labor market (Hillman & Koka 2021). However, these programs are still based on a refugee system that is shaped by different rights and gender roles, preventing successful integration of the women refugees into the German workforce.

Susanne Worbs and Tatjana Baraulina confirm that though women refugees in Germany are highly motivated to participate in integration to German society and the labor market, they

tend to be disadvantaged compared to refugee men in Germany, due to family obligations, fewer qualifications, lower rates of German language acquisition, and less labor market experience in their origin country (Worbs & Baraulina 2017).

Like many refugee women, those in Germany have experienced high rates of sexual violence, likely in the country from which they fled, or while on the run. Unfortunately, Germany has not been able to provide these women with the adequate support in response to such traumas once they arrive, resulting in a high number not being adequately treated for their trauma, both mentally, and in some cases, physically. Additionally, a large number of communal refugee shelters in Germany have been found to be unsafe for women, due to issues such as overcrowding, the use of bathroom and shower facilities that do not always lock, and victim blaming (Bierbach 2019).

Amongst 620 refugee women surveyed at reception centers throughout Germany, participants reported having been less likely to be exposed to domestic violence than other traumatic incidents such as war, hunger, and housing insecurity. Despite this, domestic violence was found to have the most significant effect on depression of the participants and was therefore concluded to have the greatest impact on the mental health of the women refugees (Moran et al. 2023).

#### Denmark

Denmark, neighbor to Germany, had 8 total mentions of the keywords "women refugees/refugee women," "displaced women," and "women asylum seekers," and 15 total mentions of the keywords "sexual violence" and "gender-based violence" in its Beijing +25 national report. Although it is a country well-known for its supposed gender equality, Denmark is home to one of Europe's highest levels of rape. This is in large part due to laxity in rape laws and outdated gender norms. Rape in Denmark is both oftentimes unreported, and when reported,

unlikely to be persecuted. In 2017, it was estimated that anywhere from 5,100 to 24,000 women in Denmark were raped, or experienced attempted rape. Of those, only 890 cases were reported to the police, and only 94 of cases resulted in convictions (Amnesty International 2019). The outdated rape laws, biased judicial system, and culture of victim blaming are all factors that promote such an unjust system.

By analyzing Denmark's treatment of refugees, both at the local and national level, Victoria Canning claims that the refugee host states play a role in worsening the long term impacts of past sexual violence through the highly stressful situations they place refugees in. These situations include extended detention, inadequate accommodation, and a lack of physical and mental health support (Canning 2016).

Furthermore, Canning asserts that Denmark has exhibited non-adherence to the Istanbul Convention through its treatment of women refugees and asylum seekers. In an effort to deter the numbers of asylum seekers, the government of Denmark has implemented policies such as extended detention and the decrease of refugee in-country rights. These policies cause disproportionate harm to women refugees and asylum seekers and increase their risk of gendered violence for a variety of reasons, including the exacerbation of poverty, a known contributor to gender-based violence. The insecurity of their situation also prevents women asylum seekers from seeking the necessary mental health services. Sexual harassment has also been commonly reported in asylum centers in Denmark, and as a result, women are often forced to self-isolate, further compromising their mental health (Canning 2019).

#### India

India's national report for the 25th anniversary of the Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action included 0 total mentions of "women refugees/refugee women," "displaced women," and "women asylum seekers," and 10 total mentions "sexual violence" and "gender-based violence."

Media and literature in recent years has revealed the blatant disregard of the Indian government's policies towards perpetrators of sexual violence and the high levels of sexual violence experienced by women there. The Indian government's lax policies towards perpetrators of sexual violence, its disregard for the victims, and in some cases, even support of the attackers has been further corroborated by recent rape cases in India. In 2002, a pregnant Muslim woman, Bilkis Bano, was raped by multiple attackers. Fourteen members of her family were also murdered in this attack. The attackers were sentenced to life in prison, but the federal government of India approved an early release for the prisoners, and on August 15, 2022, this early release was enacted (Pandey 2022). In another recent incident, two women in Manipur were gangraped, and two family members were killed trying to rescue them. Manipur has long been an area of ethnic tension and conflict, but the violence there has spiked in the past few years. As a response to this spike in violence, the Indian government shut down local access to the internet, and while Prime Minister Modi has spoken out against these crimes, he has failed to take any real action, instead choosing to distract the public from these atrocities, by speaking publicly about all the violence occurring in provinces run by his opposition party (Ayyub 2023). Modi's disregard for the sexual violence crisis in India is also evidenced by his support for the release of the attackers from the Bilkis Bano case, mentioned above. Additionally, rape is being used as a what can only be described as a state sanctioned weapon against Muslims in the Kashmir region (Askari 2021).

This dismissive attitude of the Indian federal government towards sexual violence in India, as well as the anti-Muslim attitude, has increased greatly since Modi and the Bhartiya Janata Party came to power in 2014 (Maizland 2022).

Askari claims that the current Modi government in India is supporting the use of sexual violence against women in the Kashmir territory in order to end the Muslim freedom struggle there. Askari argues these points from a securitization perspective, a theoretical perspective that claims that security issues and their level of concern are not naturally occurring, but rather orchestrated by politicians and other decision-makers. In this case, Askari argues that the Modi government's labeling of the minority groups in India as dangerous and aggressive creates a security issue that was not necessarily present before, and this is used to "justify," the use of aggression and violence against these groups in order to reach the government's end goal of a Hindu State (Askari 2021).

Additionally, Varma uses the feminist theoretical perspective to argue that since the Hindu right, Modi government came to power, the prevalence of sexual violence as a force in private and public lives has increased tenfold. This change in the social and political dynamic has resulted in an Indian state that values masculine superiority and a return to traditional values. Varma argues that sexual violence is being used by the Modi government for three main reasons: to control minority populations through its use as a weapon of war, to control societal classes and castes, and to structure the family dynamic and take control over women's bodies and reproductive rights (Varma 2017).

Westmarland and Gangoli's edited book, *International Approaches to Rape*, provides insight to the governmental policies and cultural attitudes on rape and sexual violence in India and Iran. Gangoli reveals that in the Indian legal system, rape is typically viewed as a shameful

act and loss of honor on the part of the woman, rather than a serious act of violence on the part of the perpetrator. Additionally, unless the victim is under 15, rape within a marriage is not considered illegal, and when rape cases are brought to court, the "promiscuity" of the victim is also questioned and considered when deciding on the outcome. As some context into the situation of sexual violence in India, Gangoli also adds that the number of rapes reported per day have increased 700% since 1971 (Gangoli 2011).

#### Pakistan

Pakistan, a neighboring country to India, has also been included to serve as a comparison to India. It must be noted that Pakistan is a top refugee host country, while India is not. Pakistan had 1 total mention of the keywords "women refugees/refugee women," "displaced women," and "women asylum seekers," and 19 total mentions of sexual and gender-based violence in its Beijing +25 national report, compared to the 10 total mentions of sexual and gender-based violence of India's report.

Afghan refugees are one of the most prominent refugee demographics in Pakistan. Bakare et al. identify a connection between gender inequality and structural inequality in the refugee camps in Pakistan. The patriarchal norms in the Afghan and Pakistani cultures run deep within the structures of the refugee camps. For example, schools for girls are often not available in the camps, further widening the education gap between the men and women refugees and promoting gender inequality (Bakare et al. 2024).

Additionally, a 2010 study revealed that one in five married Pakistani women experience intimate partner sexual violence. Factors that contribute to these high rights of intimate partner violence in Pakistan are patriarchal norms, as well as a societal acceptance of marital rape

(Kapadia 2010). In 2016, the World Bank reported that marital rape was not explicitly criminalized in Pakistan.

While the levels of gender-based violence, sexual violence, and domestic violence are still very high in Pakistan, recent policies and events suggest that the government there is attempting to alleviate these issues, and this can be reflected in its Beijing +25 2 Term IV.

Recent policy changes also exhibit these attempts.

In January 2022, Pakistan's first female Supreme Court Justice, Ayesha Malik, was sworn in, and she has already taken action to change the patriarchal legal norms. Malik is also trying to improve the medical response to victims of sexual violence and outlawed the use of the "virginity test" during the examinations of rape and sexual assault victims (BBC 2022). Additionally, in 2019, Pakistan's Chief Justice announced that over 1,000 courts would be created and dedicated to dealing with cases of gender-based violence against women as he claimed that this has been an issue that has long been neglected (Reuters 2019).

#### CONCLUSIONS

## Summary of Findings: Statistical Analysis

As discussed above, the statistical models tested through various databases are rooted in the literature regarding broader social contexts and possible outcomes when it comes to concern for women refugees. The study operationalizes country concern for women refugees (the dependent variable) in a new and original way. The study also offers a new categorization of possible explanations for such support, rooted in the literature, that is novel and connected to various existing data sources, that have been coded and tested in multinominal regression models.

This paper's contribution comes from the fact that these assumptions were statistically tested and yielded strong explanatory and statistically significant results. These results provide evidence of a connection between the dependent and independent variables discussed, with a particularly strong inverse relationship revealed between state level of concern for women refugees and rates of gender related killings of women and girls. These connections are further corroborated by evidence depicted in the case studies.

## Summary of Findings: Case Studies

In the cases of Pakistan, Germany, and Denmark, when the necessary gender-specific approach is not taken, strong governmental involvement in refugee policies and structure results in structural inequality and gender discrimination. In the cases of Iran, Iraq, Germany, and Pakistan, this structural inequality presents itself as a lack of educational facilities for women refugees, further deepening gender inequality between men and women refugees. This promotes

a vicious cycle that results in the decrease of opportunities for women refugees to integrate into the host country labor market.

Patriarchal norms are also revealed to promote domestic and intimate partner violence amongst both women refugees and women as a whole, as evidenced in the cases of Russia, India, and Belarus. In the cases within which marital rape or domestic violence is more culturally accepted, rape as a weapon is also more likely to be utilized. The connection between the presence of patriarchal norms and prevalence of sexual violence as a weapon is therefore also revealed through the cases of India and Russia.

High levels of gender-based violence are present throughout the refugee and internally displaced camps of the case study countries. Per the statistical analysis, high rates of femicide, a form of gender-based violence, is revealed to have a strong connection to lower levels of state concern for women refugees. Similar findings on issues of gender-based violence in both the case studies and statistical analysis further strengthen the link between state concern for women refugees and state statistics on gender-based violence.

Unfortunately, even in countries such as Iraq and Pakistan, whose governments are attempting to make cultural and policy-based shifts towards greater equality and protections for women and away from an acceptance of sexual and gender-based violence, these forms of violence are still very present amongst women refugees.

#### Summary of Findings: Hypotheses

H1: The high explanatory power of the statistical analysis of state norms/laws and state statistics, strong statistical significance of the UNODC: Gender-related Killings of Women and Girls within the statistical analysis, and the case study evidence support Hypothesis 1, and the claim that a country's stated concern for women refugee protections is a function of several

factors, including concern for women's wellbeing, cultural considerations, laws, and a broader background of incidents of violence or discrimination against women. The statistical significance of the keyword "forced marriage" in Model 2 further supports the claim that state intent/concern for commonly faced issues by women in society is linked to corresponding levels of state concern for women refugees.

H2: The high explanatory power found in the statistical analysis of Category 2 (State norms/laws) supports Hypothesis 2, and the notion that stated concern for women's wellbeing and more laws aimed at protecting women in general will lead to more concern for the protection of women refugees. Laws on domestic violence, marital rape, and child marriage were tested in this analysis.

H3: The high explanatory power found in the statistical analysis of Category 3 (State Statistics) supports Hypothesis 3 and reveals a connection between higher numbers of reported abusive or discriminatory incidents against women in society and a lesser concern for the protection of women refugees. Rates of intimate partner violence, discrimination and abuse, and gender-related killings of women and girls were tested in this analysis. A particularly strong statistical significance was found between high rates of gender-related killings of women and girls and low rates of state concern for women refugees. The case studies also indicate a connection between high numbers of abusive or discriminatory incidents against women in society, and high levels of similar issues amongst women refugees.

#### Implications for Future Research

The study helps signal that there is still a lot of work to be completed to better understand what shapes countries' concern for and support of women refugees, but that there is also a solid foundation to be built upon through the scope of state intent and concern, state norms and laws,

and state statistics. Hopefully, this analysis will provide an interesting and fruitful foundation for further research exploring this topic. Building on my findings, future studies might gather data on the actual treatment of women refugees (rather than just stated state concern) and analyze them in the context of the statistical models employed above. As such, concrete data and measures will be analyzed against normative and other statements. Such research might yield even more significant results than those covered here, even as gathering data for the dependent variable would be a task well beyond the time and resource limitations of this study.

Overall, examining the treatment of women refugees and the factors that influence it must remain a matter of great concern, and be a priority for both academic and governmental entities, in a world where both the number of refugees and the precarity of women's circumstances, as well as the many challenges they face, are constantly increasing.

### **REFERENCES**

Aghtaie, N. (2011) 'Breaking the Silence: Rape Law in Iran and Controlling Women's Sexuality', in Westmarland, N. & Gangoli, G. (ed.) *International Approaches to Rape*. University of Bristol: The Policy Press, pp. 121-145.

Agier, M. (2011): Managing the Undesirables. Refugee Camps and Humanitarian Government. Cambridge: Polity Press.

Al-Atrushi, H. H., Al-Tawil, N. G., Shabila, N. P., & Al-Hadithi, T. S. (2013). Intimate partner violence against women in the Erbil city of the Kurdistan region, Iraq. *BMC Women's Health*, 13(1), 37. https://doi.org/10.1186/1472-6874-13-37

Alexandre, A. & Mutondo, K. (2022) 'Behind the weapon of war: sexual violence in wartime as a reflection of social attitudes towards women in peacetime,' *Journal of Sexual Aggression*, 28:2, pp. 149-163, DOI: 10.1080/13552600.2021.1949500

Amnesty International (2019). "Denmark: Pervasive "rape culture" and endemic impunity for rapists exposed." *Amnesty.org*. <a href="https://www.amnesty.org/en/latest/news/2019/03/denmark-rape-culture-exposed/">https://www.amnesty.org/en/latest/news/2019/03/denmark-rape-culture-exposed/</a>

Amnesty International (2023). "Iran: Child detainees subjected to flogging, electric shocks and sexual violence in brutal protest crackdown." *Amnesty.org*.

https://www.amnesty.org/en/latest/news/2023/03/iran-child-detainees-subjected-to-flogging-electric-shocks-and-sexual-violence-in-brutal-protest-crackdown/

Amnesty International (2021). "Stop Violence Against Women: Belarus Domestic Violence, more than a private scandal." *Amnesty International*. <a href="https://www.amnesty.org/en/wp-content/uploads/2021/08/eur490142006en.pdf">https://www.amnesty.org/en/wp-content/uploads/2021/08/eur490142006en.pdf</a>

Askari, Dr. M. (2021). 'Use of Rape as Weapon against Women by Indian Forces in Occupied Kashmir: A Securitization Perspective.' *Journal of Politics and International Studies*. 7(2). Pp. 15-31. <a href="http://journals.pu.edu.pk/journals/index.php/jpis/article/viewFile/6793/3501">http://journals.pu.edu.pk/journals/index.php/jpis/article/viewFile/6793/3501</a>

Ayyub, R. (2023). "A grisly rape case has shaken India. Modi needs to act." *The Washington Post. https://www.washingtonpost.com/opinions/2023/08/01/modi-india-manipur-violence-rape/* 

Bakare, N., Sadaf, L., Wahaj, Z., Kamal, K., & Anwar, S. (2024). Human Security and Sustainable Development Goals: The Voices of Afghan Women Refugees in Pakistan. *Journal of Asian and African Studies*, 0(0). https://doi.org/10.1177/00219096231219757

BBC (2022). "Pakistan's first female Supreme Court judge sworn in." *BBC News*. https://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-asia-60110891

Bierbach, M. (2019). "How Are Women Protected in German Refugee Shelters?" *Infomigrants*. <a href="https://www.infomigrants.net/en/post/19299/how-are-women-protected-in-german-refugee-shelters?ref=hir.harvard.edu">https://www.infomigrants.net/en/post/19299/how-are-women-protected-in-german-refugee-shelters?ref=hir.harvard.edu</a>

Canning, V. (2019). Degradation by design: women and asylum in northern Europe. Race & Class, 61(1), 46-63. <a href="https://doi.org/10.1177/0306396819850986">https://doi.org/10.1177/0306396819850986</a>

Canning, V. (2016). Unsilencing Sexual Torture: Responses to Refugees and Asylum Seekers in Denmark, *The British Journal of Criminology*, Volume 56, Issue 3, Pages 438–455, https://doi.org/10.1093/bjc/azv079

Delkhosh, M., Merghati Khoei, E., Ardalan, A., Rahimi Foroushani, A., & Gharavi, M. B. (2019). Prevalence of intimate partner violence and reproductive health outcomes among Afghan refugee women in Iran. *Health Care for Women International*, 40(2), 213–237. <a href="https://doi.org/10.1080/07399332.2018.1529766">https://doi.org/10.1080/07399332.2018.1529766</a>

Dutton, D. (2001). Domestic Assault of Women: Psychological and Criminal Justice Perspectives (Revised and Expanded Edition), Vancouver, BCUBC Press

Fiddian-Qasmiyeh, E. (2014): *The Ideal Refugees: Gender, Islam, and the Sahrawi Politics of Survival*. New York: Syracuse University Press.

Friedman, Amy R. (1992): "Rape and Domestic Violence: The Experience of Refugee Women." In: *Women & Therapy* 13(1-2), p. 65-78.

Gangoli, G. (2011) 'Controlling Women's Sexuality: Rape Law in India', in Westmarland, N. & Gangoli, G. (ed.) *International Approaches to Rape*. University of Bristol: The Policy Press, pp. 101-120.

Guarnieri, E. & Tur-Prats, A. (2023) 'Cultural Distance and Conflict-Related Sexual Violence,' *The Quarterly Journal of Economics*, Volume 138, Issue 3,pp. 1817–1861, https://doi.org/10.1093/qje/qjad015

Goessmann, K., Ibrahim, H., & Neuner, F. (2020). Association of War-Related and Gender-Based Violence With Mental Health States of Yazidi Women. *JAMA network open*, *3*(9), e2013418. https://doi.org/10.1001/jamanetworkopen.2020.13418

Goessmann, K., Ibrahim, H., Saupe, L. B., Ismail, A. A., & Neuner, F. (2019). The contribution of mental health and gender attitudes to intimate partner violence in the context of war and displacement: Evidence from a multi-informant couple survey in Iraq. *Social Science & Medicine* (1982), 237, 112457. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.socscimed.2019.112457

Hillmann, F., Toğral Koca, B. (2021). "By women, for women, and with women": on the integration of highly qualified female refugees into the labour Markets of Berlin and Brandenburg. *CMS* **9**, 3. <a href="https://doi.org/10.1186/s40878-020-00211-3">https://doi.org/10.1186/s40878-020-00211-3</a>

Horn, R. (2010): "Exploring the Impact of Displacement and Encampment on Domestic Violence in Kakuma Refugee Camp." In: *Journal of Refugee Studies* 23(3), p. 356-376.

Human Rights Watch. (2022). Violence and Pushbacks at Poland-Belarus Border. *HRW.org*. https://www.hrw.org/news/2022/06/07/violence-and-pushbacks-poland-belarus-border

India's Report On the Implementation of Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action in Context of the Twenty Fifth Anniversary of the Fourth World Conference on Women and the Adoption of the Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action 2019

https://www.unwomen.org/sites/default/files/Headquarters/Attachments/Sections/CSW/64/National-reviews/India.pdf

Janmyr, M.(2014): Protecting Civilians in Refugee Camps. Unable and Unwilling States, UNHCR and International Responsibility. Leiden: Brill.

Kalra G, Bhugra D. (2013). 'Sexual violence against women: Understanding cross-cultural intersections.' *Indian J Psychiatry*. 55(3):244-9. doi: 10.4103/0019-5545.117139. PMID: 24082244; PMCID: PMC3777345. https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC3777345/

Kapadia, M., Saleem, S., Karim, M. (2010) The hidden figure: sexual intimate partner violence among Pakistani women, *European Journal of Public Health*, Volume 20, Issue 2, Pages 164–168, <a href="https://doi.org/10.1093/eurpub/ckp110">https://doi.org/10.1093/eurpub/ckp110</a>

Kargar Jahromi M, Jamali S, Rahmanian Koshkaki A, Javadpour S. (2015). 'Prevalence and Risk Factors of Domestic Violence Against Women by Their Husbands in Iran.' *Glob J Health Sci*. 8(5):175-83. https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC4877196/

Korosteleva, E., & Petrova, I. (2023). Power, People, and the Political: Understanding the Many Crises in Belarus. *Nationalities Papers*, *51*(4), 875–887. doi:10.1017/nps.2022.77

Krause, U. (2020). "Violence against women in camps? Exploring links between refugee camp conditions and the prevalence of violence." *Health in Diversity–Diversity in Health: (Forced)*Migration, Social Diversification, and Health in a Changing World (2020): 187-208.

Kristof, N. (2022). "Iran Uses Rape to Enforce Women's Modesty." *The New York Times*. https://www.nytimes.com/2022/12/17/opinion/iran-women-rape.html

Maizland, L. (2022). "India's Muslims: An Increasingly Marginalized Population." *Council on Foreign Relations*. <a href="https://www.cfr.org/backgrounder/india-muslims-marginalized-population-bjp-modi">https://www.cfr.org/backgrounder/india-muslims-marginalized-population-bjp-modi</a>

McConnachie, Kirsten. Governing refugees: Justice, order and legal pluralism. Routledge, 2014.

Mishkin, K. E., Ahmed, H. M., & Maqsood, S. S. (2022). Factors associated with experiencing lifetime intimate partner violence among pregnant displaced women living in refugee camps in Erbil, Iraq. *Global Public Health*, *17*(12), 3455–3464.

https://doi.org/10.1080/17441692.2022.2048409

Moran JK., Jesuthasan J., Schalinski I., et al. (2023). Traumatic Life Events and Association With Depression, Anxiety, and Somatization Symptoms in Female Refugees. *JAMA Netw Open*. 6(7):e2324511. doi:10.1001/jamanetworkopen.2023.24511

National Report on Women's Status in the Islamic Republic of Iran (Beijing + 25).

<a href="https://www.unwomen.org/sites/default/files/Headquarters/Attachments/Sections/CSW/64/National-reviews/Iran.pdf">https://www.unwomen.org/sites/default/files/Headquarters/Attachments/Sections/CSW/64/National-reviews/Iran.pdf</a>

National Review of the Implementation of the Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action (1995) on Gender Equality and the Empowerment of Women: Republic of Belarus

https://www.unwomen.org/sites/default/files/Headquarters/Attachments/Sections/CSW/64/National-reviews/Belarus-en.pdf

National Review of the Implementation of Beijing +25 Declaration and Platform for Action: Republic of Iraq

https://www.unwomen.org/sites/default/files/Headquarters/Attachments/Sections/CSW/64/National-reviews/Iraq\_en.pdf

National Report on Women's Status in the Islamic Republic of Iran (Beijing + 25).

<a href="https://www.unwomen.org/sites/default/files/Headquarters/Attachments/Sections/CSW/64/National-reviews/Iran.pdf">https://www.unwomen.org/sites/default/files/Headquarters/Attachments/Sections/CSW/64/National-reviews/Iran.pdf</a>

OECD SIGI Scores: Levels of Gender Discrimination. (2023). <a href="https://www.oecd-">https://www.oecd-</a>
ilibrary.org/sites/4607b7c7-en/1/4/1/index.html?itemId=/content/publication/4607b7c7en&\_csp\_=a6be4df33c99961512705b97977ea566&itemIGO=oecd&itemContentType=book#ta
blegrp-d1e20400-1bfddc937b

OHCHR. (2022). "Experts of the Human Rights Committee Commend Iraq for its Judicial Pursuit of Perpetrators of Sexual Violence, and Ask about the Civil and Political Rights of Displaced Persons." *United Nations*.

https://www.ohchr.org/en/news/2022/03/experts-human-rights-committee-commend-iraq-its-judicial-pursuit-perpetrators-sexual

OHCHR. "Interactive dialogue on the High Commissioner's report on Belarus." (2022). *OHCHR.org*.

https://www.ohchr.org/en/statements-and-speeches/2022/03/interactive-dialogue-high-commissioners-report-belarus

Pandey, G. (2022). "Rising crimes against Indian women in five charts." *BBC News*. https://www.bbc.com/news/world-asia-india-62830634

Pietrzak, . (2022) 'The Putinization of the situation of women and children during the 2022 Russian invasion of Ukraine.' *Research Gate: Statu Nascendi:* 5(2).

https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Piotr-Pietrzak-

7/publication/367964656\_The\_Putinization\_of\_the\_situation\_of\_women\_and\_children\_during\_t he\_2022\_Russian\_invasion\_of\_Ukraine/links/63db5dc462d2a24f92e9f10e/The-Putinization-of-the-situation-of-women-and-children-during-the-2022-Russian-invasion-of-Ukraine.pdf

Prosvirova, O. & Boldyrev, O. (2022). "Ex-inmates reveal details of Russia prison rape scandal." *BBC News*.

https://www.bbc.com/news/world-europe-62465043

Report of the Islamic Republic of Pakistan on the implementation of the Beijing Declaration and

Platform for Action +25

https://www.unwomen.org/sites/default/files/Headquarters/Attachments/Sections/CSW/64/Natio

nal-reviews/Pakistan.pdf

Reuters. (2019). "Pakistan to create 1,000 courts to tackle violence against women." The

Guardian.

https://www.theguardian.com/world/2019/jun/20/pakistan-to-create-1000-courts-to-tackle-

violence-against-women

Rollins, Kay. (2022). "Putin's Other War: Domestic Violence, Traditional Values, and

Masculinity in Modern Russia." Harvard International Review.

https://hir.harvard.edu/putins-other-war/

The World Bank: Women, Business, and the Law (2019). <a href="https://wbl.worldbank.org/en/wbl">https://wbl.worldbank.org/en/wbl</a>

The World Bank: Women, Business, and the Law (2016).

https://thedocs.worldbank.org/en/doc/810421519921949813-

0050022015/original/WomenBusinessandtheLaw2016.pdf

United Nations. (2019). dataUNODC

### https://dataunodc.un.org/

U.S. Department of State. (2022). 2022 Country Reports on Human Rights Practices: Belarus. Bureau of Democracy, Human Rights, and Labor. <a href="https://www.state.gov/reports/2022-country-reports-on-human-rights-practices/belarus/">https://www.state.gov/reports/2022-country-reports-on-human-rights-practices/belarus/</a>

Varma, Rashmi. (2017). '(Un)Modifying India: Nationalism, Sexual Violence and the Politics of Hindutva.' *Feminist Dissent*. no.2. https://doi.org/10.31273/fd.n2.2017.64

Vu A, Adam A, Wirtz A, Pham K, Rubenstein L, Glass N, Beyrer C, Singh S. (2014). The Prevalence of Sexual Violence among Female Refugees in Complex Humanitarian Emergencies: a Systematic Review and Meta-analysis. *PLoS Currents*, 6. doi:

10.1371/currents.dis.835f10778fd80ae031aac12d3b533ca7

https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC4012695/

Weise, H. (2017.) "Two-tiered integration?" *Deutsche Welle*. <u>https://www.dw.com/en/women-refugees-face-difficult-path-to-integration-in-germany/a-40593611?ref=hir.harvard.edu</u>

Worbs, S., & Baraulina, T. (2017). Female Refugees in Germany: Language, Education and Employment. (BAMF- Brief Analysis, 1-2017). Nürnberg: Bundesamt für Migration und Flüchtlinge (BAMF) Forschungszentrum Migration, Integration und Asyl (FZ). https://nbn-resolving.org/urn:nbn:de:0168-ssoar-67555-1

World Health Organization. (2022). "First gender-based violence strategic plan launched in Iraq." *Relief Web*.

https://reliefweb.int/report/iraq/first-gender-based-violence-strategic-plan-launched-iraq-enar

World Health Organization, Global Database on the Prevalence of Violence Against Women <a href="https://vaw-data.srhr.org/">https://vaw-data.srhr.org/</a>

# **APPENDIX A: CORRELATION MATRICES**

Table 3. Appendix A1: Correlation Matrix of Combined Category 2 & 3

	OECD SIGI	UNODC Gender Related Killing of Women and Girls	World Bank 2019: Is there legislation specifically addressing domestic violence? Score:	World Bank 2016: Is there domestic violence legislation? No=0,	World Bank 2016: Are there clear criminal penalties for domestic violence? No=0,	World Bank 2016: Is child marriage void or prohibited? No=0,	World Bank 2016: Is child marriage penalized? No=0,	World Bank 2016: Is marital rape explicitly criminalize d? No=0,	World Bank 2016: Are rape perpetrator s exempt if they are married to the victim? No=0,	World Bank 2016: Are rape perpetrator s exempt if they marry the victim? No=0,	WHO: Physical and/or Sexual Intimate Partner Violence (15-49) National Estimates in percentage
Variables	Score	(Rates)	No=0, Yes=1	Yes=1	Yes=1	Yes=1	Yes=1	Yes=1	Yes=1	Yes=1	s
OECD SIGI Score	1										
UNODC Gender Related Killing of Women and Girls (Rates)	0.095709159	1									
World Bank 2019: Is there legislation specifically addressing domestic violence? Score: No=0, Yes=1	-0.435867228	0.08282185	1								
World Bank 2016: Is there domestic violence legislation? No=0, Yes=1	-0.372004344	0.14743812	0.639664815	1							
World Bank 2016: Are there clear criminal penalties for domestic violence? No=0, Yes=1	-0.237685531	-0.0926456	0.226235407	0.19057579	1						
World Bank 2016: Is child marriage void or prohibited? No=0, Yes=1	0.033217321	-0.0424483	-0.079026078	-0.1235429	0.11462806	1					
World Bank 2016: Is child marriage penalized? No=0, Yes=1	-0.104235067	0.12082557	0.255765645	0.13720111	0.26472209	0.21378813	1				
World Bank 2016: Is marital rape explicitly criminalized? No=0, Yes=1	-0.192157939	0.14532161	0.169659592	0.37615927	0.50300554	0.05219899	0.19423644	1			
World Bank 2016: Are rape perpetrators exempt if they are married to the victim? No=0, Yes=1	0.525321027	0.10299961	-0.362202857	-0.3363114	-0.3372391	0.09836066	-0.0046815	-0.3701383	1		
World Bank 2016: Are rape perpetrators exempt if they marry the victim? No=0, Yes=1	0.534246481	-0.1011356	-0.202380952	-0.2702032	-0.2262354	0.07902608	-0.1297635	-0.2973809	0.14158839	1	
WHO: Physical and/or Sexual Intimate Partner Violence (15-49) National Estimates in percentages	0.255071706	0.24316023	-0.151657504	-0.1485229	-0.1038712	-0.0149972	0.04134648	-0.0113589	0.35497205	0.06060864	1

Table 4. Appendix A2: Correlation Matrix of OECD SIGI Data (Including Dimensions)

Variables	SIGI score	Classificati on	Discriminat ion in the family	Restricted Physical Integrity	Restricted Access to Productive and Financial Resources	Restricted Civil Liberties
SIGI score	1					
Classification	0.97478405	1				
Discrimination in the family	0.93387418	0.91573071	1			
Restricted Physical Integrity	0.68630404	0.68299553	0.54812981	1		
Restricted Access to Productive and Financial Resources	0.82011135	0.77185213	0.68105163	0.49706443	1	
Restricted Civil Liberties	0.77297993	0.76682905	0.653452	0.43971094	0.45116595	1

Table 5. Appendix A3: Correlation Matrix of World Bank: Women, Business, and the Law (2016)

	Is there domestic violence legislation?	Are there clear criminal penalties for domestic violence?	Is child marriage void or prohibited?	Is child marriage penalized?	Is marital rape explicitly criminalized?	Are rape perpetrators exempt if they are married to the victim?	Are rape perpetrators exempt if they marry the victim? No=0.
Variables	No=0. Yes=1	No=0. Yes=1	No=0. Yes=1	No=0, Yes=1	No=0. Yes=1	No=0, Yes=1	Yes=1
Is there domestic violence legislation? No=0, Yes=1	1	140-0, 163-1	140-0, 163-1	110-0, 163-1	140-0, 163-1	140-0, 763-7	763-7
Are there clear criminal penalties for domestic violence? No=0, Yes=1	0.437697986	1					
Is child marriage void or prohibited? No=0, Yes=1	0.172798692	0.084787041	1				
Is child marriage penalized? No=0, Yes=1	0.11895993	0.07519783	0.132307485	1			
Is marital rape explicitly criminalized? No=0, Yes=1	0.37765904	0.487681415	0.114137177	0.136259965	1		
Are rape perpetrators exempt if they are married to the victim? No=0, Yes=1	-0.145937929	-0.190958219	-0.011670708	0.04770469	-0.324799177	1	
Are rape perpetrators exempt if they marry the victim? No=0, Yes=1	-0.227124191	-0.158921023	0.061499115	-0.109379591	-0.222107999	0.164820992	1

Table 6. Appendix A4: Correlation Matrix of 2 Term Beijing +25 Keywords

Variables	Sexual violence	Gender based violence
Sexual violence	1	
Gender based violence	0.141880746	1

Table 7. Appendix A5: Correlation Matrix of 9 Term Beijing +25 Keywords

Variables	Sexual violence	Gender based violence	Child Marriage/s	Forced Marriage/s	Early Marriage/s	Reproductive Health	Reproductive Rights	Sexual Abuse	Trafficking/Tra fficked
Sexual violence	1								
Gender based violence	0.141880746	1							
Child Marriage/s	0.005009512	0.002420259	1						
Forced Marriage/s	0.213252221	0.017239545	0.148399222	1					
Early Marriage/s	0.025234003	-0.036832309	0.195574682	0.200359125	1				
Reproductive Health	0.007778677	0.086788611	0.135889442	0.138786302	0.305753239	1			
Reproductive Rights	0.202773274	0.111196708	-0.046887693	0.084717479	0.032154288	0.285080712	1		
Sexual Abuse	0.146653126	0.060391944	-0.016563303	0.203417095	-0.027186239	0.114416066	0.239364025	1	
Trafficking/Trafficked	0.130741043	0.134520914	0.057232618	0.163366929	0.037708667	0.293297561	0.175148678	0.141906367	1