#### University of Central Florida

#### **STARS**

Graduate Thesis and Dissertation 2023-2024

2023

# Inclusion and Interpretation: Examining Difficult History Topics at Eighteenth-Century Historic Sites in Southeastern Pennsylvania

Cassidy Michonski University of Central Florida

Part of the Public History Commons, and the United States History Commons Find similar works at: https://stars.library.ucf.edu/etd2023
University of Central Florida Libraries http://library.ucf.edu

This Masters Thesis (Open Access) is brought to you for free and open access by STARS. It has been accepted for inclusion in Graduate Thesis and Dissertation 2023-2024 by an authorized administrator of STARS. For more information, please contact STARS@ucf.edu.

#### **STARS Citation**

Michonski, Cassidy, "Inclusion and Interpretation: Examining Difficult History Topics at Eighteenth-Century Historic Sites in Southeastern Pennsylvania" (2023). *Graduate Thesis and Dissertation 2023-2024*. 33. https://stars.library.ucf.edu/etd2023/33

# INCLUSION AND INTERPRETATION: EXAMINING DIFFICULT HISTORY TOPICS AT EIGHTEENTH-CENTURY HISTORIC SITES IN SOUTHEASTERN PENNSYLVANIA

by

#### CASSIDY MICHONSKI B.S. University of South Florida, 2019

A thesis submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Arts in the Department of History in the College of Arts and Humanities at the University of Central Florida Orlando, Florida

Fall Term 2023

© 2023 Cassidy Michonski

#### **ABSTRACT**

This thesis explores four distinct eighteenth-century historic sites in southeastern Pennsylvania and how they interpret difficult history topics. Difficult history, the parts of our nation's past that may be uncomfortable to discuss and learn about, should be included in historic site narratives to ensure that all people who lived at these sites are represented. Telling the stories of enslaved people, Indigenous groups, women, and members of the LGBTQ+ community often means addressing difficult topics. Four sites—Elfreth's Alley, Stenton, the Daniel Boone Homestead, and the 1719 Museum—were examined for this study. A review of their staff training and institutional investment in interpretation, the comprehensive nature of their historical content, and their community outreach—all different methods for establishing a thorough interpretation—demonstrates that each of the sites have provided more inclusive interpretation in their narratives over time. These efforts have coincided with social movements such as the Civil Rights Movement and the American Indian Movement, the professionalization of public history, and the evolution of each site's community. Implementing difficult history into conversations at historic sites is a relatively new debate in the field; this research supports the argument that including narratives that challenge our comfort and incorporating community voices matter.

#### **ACKNOWLEDGMENTS**

The past three years have been filled with laughter, tears, clarity, confusion, ambition, procrastination, hard work, late nights, and lots of caffeine. This thesis could not have been possible without the help from many people along the way and I would like to take the opportunity to thank them here.

First and foremost, I would like to thank Dr. Rosalind Beiler for her continued guidance and support. As my advisor, my professor, my supervisor, and my friend, she has shared a vast amount of knowledge with me over the last few years. She has constantly encouraged me, and she has shown me that anything can be possible if you put your mind to it. Both professionally and personally, she has made a huge difference in my life.

I would also like to thank my other committee members, Dr. Caroline Cheong and Dr. Ezekiel Walker, for their support, guidance, and patience throughout this process. Special thanks to Dr. Peter Larson and the Barton Research Grant for making my research in Pennsylvania possible, and to Sira Ambrosecchia for helping me organize my travel plans. I am also incredibly thankful for Esther and Elam Stoltzfus and Donna Rilling for allowing me to stay in their homes during my visits to Pennsylvania.

Many thanks to all of those at the historic sites, archives, and libraries that have assisted in my research. In no particular order: Sarah Weatherwax with the Library Company of Philadelphia, Aaron McWilliams with the Pennsylvania State Archives, Tiffany Fisk with the 1719 Museum, Heather Hicks with the Daniel Boone Homestead, Ted Maust with Elfreth's Alley, Laura Keim with Stenton, and with special thanks to all of the folks at the Historical Society of Pennsylvania and Mennonite Life.

Thank you to my dear friends—Amber Santoso, Cory Salcedo, Sam Badias, Tiffany
Leveille, Leigh Gay, Sara Fazli, and Robert Madden—without whom I would not have made it.

Their willingness to proofread my chapters, bring me coffee, cheer me on, or even just let me cry, have truly meant the world to me.

And of course, thank you to my wonderful parents, Tammy and James Michonski, for being my biggest fans. I will never be able to thank you enough for all that you have done for me. This is all for you.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

LIST OF TABLES	viii
INTRODUCTION	1
Historiography	2
Methodology and Sources	8
Rubrics	11
Historic Sites	14
Daniel Boone's Homestead	14
The Logan Family's Stenton	16
The 1719 Museum	17
Elfreth's Alley	18
Conclusion	19
CHAPTER 1: INSTITUTIONAL INVESTMENT AND STAFF TRAINING	20
Introduction	20
Institution and Site Mission Statements	23
Staff and Volunteer Training Materials	28
Conclusion	35
Rubrics	38
CHAPTER 2: COMPREHENSIVE CONTENT	42
Introduction	42
Content That Includes All of the People Who Lived at a Site	45

The Use of Inclusive Language	57
Conclusion	63
Rubrics	64
CHAPTER 3: COMMUNITY OUTREACH	68
Introduction	68
Defining Communities	70
Site Outreach to Respective Communities	74
Geographic Location/Neighbors	74
Tourists	79
Heritage: Genealogy/Religion	82
Education	85
Conclusion	86
Rubrics	88
CONCLUSION	92
REFERENCES	98
Primary Sources	98
Secondary Sources	102

## LIST OF TABLES

Table 1: Institutional Investment and Staff Training	2
Table 2: Comprehensive Content	3
Table 3: Community Outreach	1
Table 4: Institutional Investment and Staff Training—1719 Museum	3
Table 5: Institutional Investment and Staff Training—The Daniel Boone Homestead	)
Table 6: Institutional Investment and Staff Training—Stenton	)
Table 7: Institutional Investment and Staff Training—Elfreth's Alley	l
Table 8: Comprehensive Content—Stenton	1
Table 9: Comprehensive Content—Elfreth's Alley	5
Table 10: Comprehensive Content—1719 Museum	5
Table 11: Comprehensive Content—The Daniel Boone Homestead	7
Table 12: Community Outreach—Stenton	3
Table 13: Community Outreach—1719 Museum	)
Table 14: Community Outreach—The Daniel Boone Homestead	)
Table 15: Community Outreach—Elfreth's Alley	1

#### INTRODUCTION

This thesis examines eighteenth-century historic house museums and how they interpret and educate visitors about difficult history through both their online and physical resources such as brochures, informational pamphlets, and publications. By using the sites' informational materials from past years and comparing them to current documents, I have examined how sites' interpretations of difficult history have changed over time. Difficult history encompasses the topics of our collective past that people sometimes struggle to accept or even acknowledge. It can include topics such as slavery, the treatment of Indigenous peoples and relations between them and European settlers, attitudes towards women and gender, and specific events such as wars or genocides. One of the reasons we learn about such topics is to respect and remember "those who sacrificed and served, and also those who suffered." Overall, the historic sites that I have examined have made major changes in terms of their staff training, the comprehensive nature of their interpretational materials, and outreach to their respective communities. These changes correspond to larger changes that have happened within the field of public history and within society.

The research questions that inform my study are: How do the staff and management working at historic sites want visitors to understand the difficult history interpreted at their sites? What best practices have scholars identified for discussing and teaching difficult history at historic sites? How do historic sites currently approach or interpret topics of difficult history, specifically the topics of slavery, Whites' relations with Indigenous peoples, and views of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Magdalena H. Gross and Luke Terra, "What Makes Difficult History Difficult?" *Phi Delta Kappan* 99, no.8 (2018): 52.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Julia Rose, *Interpreting Difficult History at Museums and Historic Sites*, (Lanham: Rowman and Littlefield, 2016), xi.

women and gender? How have the interpretations of difficult history at these historic sites changed over time? Why are these sites interpreting and presenting these topics as they do?

#### Historiography

This thesis primarily contributes to the field at the intersection of difficult history and historic sites—focusing specifically on sites' inclusion of the topics of slavery, interactions between European and Indigenous peoples, and the role of women and gender in eighteenth century communities. Historians working on these two areas of emphasis—difficult history and public history—have provided extensive research on how to interpret difficult topics and the best practices for the incorporation of comprehensive content at public history sites. Difficult history encompasses the details about the past that often make people today uncomfortable or upset because of the trauma, damage, oppression, and destruction that has occurred.<sup>3</sup> Interpreting difficult knowledge is a recent development in the field of public history with the larger debates beginning in the mid- to late-1980s. As the intersection of difficult history and public history is still a newer topic of study, this research explores their connections through four sites. It uses the sites as case studies for applying the suggestions of best practices and evaluating the practicality and functionality of them which will allow for further research and implementation.

Suzanne B. Schell wrote a foundational article on how interpretations are presented at historic sites in 1985. She points out that one of the largest differences among historic sites is their use of interpretive methods. Do the sites simply provide labels for the objects and do nothing more, or do they provide the context and importance of the artifact in an effort to establish connections between the visitors and the object? She argues that those sites which only

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Rose, *Interpreting Difficult History*, 10-11.

provide labels and no interpretation present visitors with a very passive experience; as a result, visitors do not establish a connection with the object, structure, or people who lived at the site. Schell discusses how the interpretation presented at historic site museums has evolved over time, yet still holds many gaps in the interpretational framework due to their use of passive presentation. She attributes these gaps to the original purpose of preserving historic sites which was to inspire patriotism in visitors by creating shrines to America's "heroes" such as the founders. As time has progressed, more and more historic sites are moving toward providing interpretations for their visitors. These interpretations then aid the sites in becoming "powerful educational tools." Schell acknowledges that not all museums and other historic sites were moving towards the education and relation of history to their visitors at the time her article was written. One of the reasons for this was that there were many incomplete historical records which made it difficult to formulate interpretations that would accurately share the information of the site to the public.

More recent scholars have pointed out different factors that affect how historic sites present difficult history. In 2002, Jennifer Eichstedt and Stephen Small examined the representation of slavery in southern plantations located in Virginia, Georgia, and Louisiana that are now public sites. They found that the plantations, currently owned and operated by African Americans, were more inclusive of African American history at their sites than the non-African American owned sites. Eichstedt's and Small's research supports the notion that those running the historic site are an influential factor on how the history of that site is presented.

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Suzanne B. Schell, "On Interpretation and Historic Sites," *The Journal of Museum Education*, 10, no.3 (1985): 8.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Schell, "On Interpretation and Historic Sites," 8.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Schell, "On Interpretation and Historic Sites," 9.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Jennifer L. Eichstedt and Stephen Small, *Representations of Slavery: Race and Ideology in the Southern Plantation Museum* (Washington, D.C.: Smithsonian Institution Press, 2002), 4-5.

A second issue scholars have addressed regarding interpreting the past at historic sites is whose stories are being told—whose narratives the sites center and whether those narratives are discussing themes of difficult history. For example, does the site focus on the white family who once lived there, or does it tell the stories of all, including enslaved people and servants? Scott E. Casper's 2009 book examines the forgotten story of Sarah Johnson, a slave at George Washington's Mount Vernon home for more than 50 years. He presents the history of Sarah and the hundreds of other enslaved people whose stories have been ignored or misinterpreted at Mount Vernon. Casper's research involved uncovering the daily lives of these enslaved men and women; since publishing his work, he has partnered with the site to provide interpretations for the staff to use. 10 We see this issue again in Heather Huyck's 2020 book where she argues that women's history remains a less interpreted topic at historic sites and museums despite the extensive literature about women's history. She claims that, while women's history is discussed at these institutions, it is not as expansive as other topics. Hyuck provides useful resources and examples for how to connect women's stories to objects that already exist at these historic institutions in hopes that this will expand their interpretation and presentation of women's history.<sup>11</sup>

Scholars have also pointed to a third issue connected to interpreting difficult history: historic site administrators' and interpreters' discomfort with the effect it has on visitors.

Addressing this issue, James Oliver Horton and Lois E. Horton provide information about the

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Scott E. Casper, *Sarah Johnson's Mount Vernon: The Forgotten History of an American Shrine*, (New York: Hill and Wang, 2009), 3.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Casper, Sarah Johnson's Mount Vernon, 4, 6.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> "Sarah Johnson's Mount Vernon." C-SPAN, March 25, 2008. https://www.c-span.org/video/?204093-1%2Fsarah-johnsons-mount-vernon.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Heather Hyuck, *Doing Women's History in Public: A Handbook for Interpretation at Museums and Historic Sites*, (S.I.: Rowman and Littlefield, 2020), xvi-xvii.

controversial viewpoints of incorporating the topic of slavery into historic sites in 2006. The authors argue that gaps in guests' education led to their apprehension towards learning about slavery at historic sites. James O. Horton states that "our tendency is to turn away from history that is unflattering and uncomfortable, but we cannot afford to ignore the past, even the most upsetting parts of it." He believes that site interpreters want to preserve visitors' ideas about patriotism and therefore suppress telling the story of slavery. Museum administrators and educators are also concerned about the reaction that visitors have when challenged with stories that contradict their view of the United States as a morally upright nation. These reactions are why the sites frequently choose to omit certain difficult history in their exhibits and tours. The authors call for more discussion, both amongst public historians and the general public, to uncover the best way to approach these topics. 14

Historian Teresa Bergman also examines the relationship between historic sites, difficult history, and the public and how they can move forward "as partners in historical interpretation." In her 2013 book, Bergman describes controversial topics that historic sites have had trouble presenting, such as slavery and the treatment of Indigenous people. At many of these sites, issues that are considered "difficult history" are often misinterpreted or silenced in an effort to promote patriotism in visitors. <sup>16</sup> Bergman provides case studies of difficult history exhibits, or lack of, at certain historic sites to show as examples for readers and to demonstrate

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> James O. Horton and Lois Horton, eds., *Slavery and Public History: The Tough Stuff of American Memory*, (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press), 36.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> James O. Horton, "Slavery in American History: An Uncomfortable National Dialogue." In *Slavery and Public History: The Tough Stuff of American Memory*, Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, (2006): 36-37. <sup>14</sup> Horton and Horton, eds., *Slavery and Public History*, 38.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> Teresa Bergman, *Exhibiting Patriotism: Creating and Contesting Interpretation of American Historic Sites*, (Walnut Creek: Left Coast Press, 2013), Back Cover.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> Bergman, Exhibiting Patriotism.

the proper ways that sites can partner with their publics for interpretation. In 2016, author Julia Rose attributed the challenges that historians face when they include these conversations to visitors' desire to respectfully memorialize historical subjects – especially the country's founders. Another tension Rose identified is the need for sites to present these topics in a way that does not make guests uncomfortable, as they still need guests to visit to keep their facilities open.<sup>17</sup>

A final factor in the field regarding difficult history is the effect of public engagement on site interpretation. Bergman's 2013 book identifies the ways historic sites are changing their interpretations as a result of their evolving relationship with the public. She finds that they are becoming more visitor-centered and are incorporating visitor feedback into their exhibits. As a result, many are changing their interpretation of the past to fit what visitors want to see. At many of the sites Bergman examines—the USS Arizona Memorial, the California State Railroad Museum, the Alamo, the Lincoln Memorial, and the Mt. Rushmore National Memorial—the interpretation presented has shifted to suppress the voices of enslaved people and stories about whites' relations with indigenous people. Bergman's research assesses the growing engagement and conversation that is happening between the historic sites and the public and identifies the effect it has on the interpretation presented. <sup>18</sup>

Jill Ogline Titus also addressed the issue of difficult history and public engagement in a 2014 article regarding the engagement of visitors through the interpretation of slavery and emancipation. <sup>19</sup> She finds that historic sites continue to focus on the labor duties and typical days

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> Rose, *Interpreting Difficult History*, 3-4.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> Bergman, Exhibiting Patriotism, 88-89.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> Jill Ogline Titus, "An Unfinished Struggle: Sesquicentennial Interpretations of Slavery and Emancipation," *Journal of the Civil War Era* 4, no.2, (2014): 338-340.

of the enslaved rather than telling the stories of specific enslaved people living on the site. By presenting broad, generalized perspectives rather than the actual people who once lived on the site, interpretations fail to personify the past in a way that engages and resonates with visitors. While Titus acknowledges improvements in the interpretation of slavery over time, she suggests that sites need to go further by discussing the relationship between the slaveholders and the enslaved. Doing so, she believes, will establish a deeper connection between visitors and the enslaved who lived at specific sites. Rose also addresses this issue; she believes that the proper inclusion of difficult history in historic sites and museums can have a positive influence on visitors. She offers a model for how to present topics appropriately in her Commemorative Museum Pedagogy which consists of five nonlinear steps: reception, resistance, repetition, reflection, and reconsideration. These steps serve as guidance for museum and historic site professionals to follow to improve their interpretation techniques for reaching guests.

In 2020, Anne Lindsay argued that historic sites are designed to white-wash history and therefore eliminate or hide the stories of African Americans, Indigenous people, and women. This is due to the struggle to sensitize the issues without vilifying the white men who are the focus of the sites. <sup>22</sup> Lindsay's research on many eighteenth-century sites concludes that incorporating these difficult histories would both be more inclusive of the stories and people from these sites and provide more critical thinking amongst visitors. Her research was conducted over a ten-year period that allowed her to re-visit sites and assess the changes they made. Lindsay noticed that sites began to incorporate more complex histories to educate their visitors

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> Titus, "An Unfinished Struggle," 340-341.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> Rose, *Interpreting Difficult History*, 5.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> Lindsay, *Reconsidering Interpretation*, (New York, NY: Routledge), 14-15.

on a deeper level. She concludes that within the ten-year period she visited these sites, there were improvements made in the effort to interpret difficult history.<sup>23</sup>

The research presented in this thesis expands on the arguments of these scholars by providing an in-depth look at four historic sites as case studies and how they are applying the previously listed methods of best practice—incorporating difficult history topics into site narratives and communicating with the public on what topics they would like to see discussed—to evaluate which sites and institutions have been keeping pace with the implementation of these suggested practices. While there are more areas of issues within the theme of difficult history, this thesis will focus on those previously listed as they are most relevant to this topic of research.

#### **Methodology and Sources**

To analyze the interpretation of difficult history at historic sites, this thesis focuses on four eighteenth-century sites in Pennsylvania. The sites are Daniel Boone's Homestead in Berks County, the Logan family's Stenton mansion in Germantown, the 1719 Hans Herr House in Lancaster County, and Elfreth's Alley in Philadelphia. Each of these historic sites interprets a person or family who once lived there, with the exception of Elfreth's Alley which tells the stories of a group of people unrelated to each other who once lived on the street. The sites were chosen because they represent a variety of institutional homes and difficult history topics and institutional investment. The Daniel Boone Homestead was chosen because it is owned and operated by the Pennsylvania Historical and Museum Commission which is a state agency. Stenton was chosen because they have made overwhelming changes in regard to the incorporation of enslaved people's history into their narrative based on the population changes in

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> Lindsay, *Reconsidering Interpretation*, 14-15.

the site's geographic location. The 1719 Museum was selected because of the Native American longhouse replica that is located on the site. Finally, Elfreth's Alley was chosen because of their recent research into the resident women who were lesbian couples and a transgendered visitor—both very unconventional ways of life for the eighteenth century. The selected sites offer opportunities to explore how sites with different institutional homes have interpreted the difficult histories of the people who lived there. As previously mentioned, the Daniel Boone Homestead is owned and operated by the state, whereas the other three sites are all privately owned and operated. Elfreth's Alley and the 1719 Museum are the sole historic sites run by their institutional operators: the Elfreth's Alley Association and Mennonite Life. Stenton is not the only site run by their owning institution, the National Society of The Colonial Dames of America in the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania; however, they are a group of dedicated women whose sole purpose is to preserve history to share with the public. This variety of parent institutions allowed for further research into the reasoning behind the interpretive changes at each site.

This research examines whether the sites include the stories of everyone who lived at the site (i.e., women and enslaved people), and whether their histories are comprehensive (i.e., do they include the treatment of and attitudes towards indigenous people, the enslaved, and women). It also studies how the interpretation of these stories has changed over time at each site. My methodology is qualitative with a case study approach. I have analyzed each site's information to explore its discussion of difficult topics, word choice, and presentation of ideas. Each site was thoroughly and deeply researched and treated as a separate case study; then was compared to the other sites. I focused on the educational and informational materials that are provided by the sites and compared those with older materials to identify any changes in the site's interpretation of difficult history. I also conducted field research by participating in both in-person and online

tours (when available) of each site. While on these tours, I presented myself as an average visitor. I did not ask specific questions pertaining to my research, nor did I introduce myself or identify myself as a historian. The purpose of this method was to ensure that I received the same tour and information as the other guests. According to historian Anne Lindsay, who completed similar research, identifying herself as a historian or mentioning her research led to longer and more detailed tours than she otherwise would have received, providing a different interpretation of the past than the average visitor. After the tours, I identified myself and my project and met with the curators of each site to discuss the history of the site and why they have chosen the specific interpretations to present to their visitors. I have also compared the sites' brochures and tour scripts from previous years with current publications to see how the interpretation and presentation of difficult history has changed over time.

To measure how these sites are presenting their information, I will use a rubric based on four of the six categories of comprehensive interpretation outlined by Kristin Gallas and James DeWolf Perry.<sup>25</sup> The first and second categories are institutional investment and staff training which will be combined into one chapter. Institutional investment is the degree to which the site's operating institution is involved in the interpretations presented.<sup>26</sup> Staff training examines the extent to which staff and volunteers are trained on the history, interpretations, and sensitivity of the issues being presented.<sup>27</sup> Both institutional investment and staff training are important factors when studying how difficult knowledge is presented at eighteenth-century sites. Any changes made in the comprehensive nature of the stories that are told are then correlated with

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> Lindsay, *Reconsidering Interpretation*, 5.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> Kristin Gallas and James DeWolf Perry, "Developing Comprehensive and Conscientious Interpretation," *American Association for State and Local History* 69, no.2 (2014): 4.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> Gallas and DeWolf Perry, "Developing Comprehensive and Conscientious Interpretation," 5.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> Gallas and DeWolf Perry, "Developing Comprehensive and Conscientious Interpretation," 6.

professional developments and best practices in the field. The inclusion of topics of difficult history can be attributed to the institution and the site management as they are the ones in charge of interpretation. The changes seen at the four sites examined in this thesis have overall improved what visitors are learning at the sites and can be correlated with the development and progress of professional history over time. The third category is comprehensive content which evaluates how inclusive the narrative of the history and people of the site is.<sup>28</sup> This content will be evaluated through the examination of the difficult history topics discussed and the language used to describe them. All four of the sites researched have made positive changes over time in regard to the inclusive content being incorporated into the narratives. The fourth category is community involvement which covers the extent to which the community/public is involved and engaged in the interpretations being presented at the sites.<sup>29</sup> The degree to which a community is involved in a site influences the interpretation presented. Communities can include physical neighborhoods, tourists, teachers, etc. and they have an impact on the interpretations being presented. In general, they have positively impacted the interpretations and have helped to make improvements. While this is the basis for chapter three, I have changed the topic to "outreach" rather than "involvement" as I am only examining the sites' outreach, rather than the reciprocal relationship between sites and their communities. Below are the rubrics that will be used in each of the chapters. The completed rubrics for each site will be placed at the end of each chapter.

#### **Rubrics**

<sup>20</sup> 

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> Gallas and DeWolf Perry, "Developing Comprehensive and Conscientious Interpretation," 4.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> Gallas and DeWolf Perry, "Developing Comprehensive and Conscientious Interpretation," 5-6.

Table 1: Institutional Investment and Staff Training

	Excellent	Fair	Needs Work
Institution and Site Mission Correlation	Institution and Site mission statements match and correlate with each other in terms of inclusive language and content interpretation.	Institution and Site mission statements slightly match and correlate with each other in terms of inclusive language and content interpretation.	Institution and Site mission statements differ too much in terms of inclusive language and content interpretation.
Language within Mission Statements	Language within mission statements is inclusive and updated.	Language within mission statements is somewhat inclusive and updated.	Language within mission statements is not inclusive nor updated.
Language and Inclusion within Staff Training/ Interpretive Guides	Language within Staff Training/Interpretive Guides is written with inclusive language and provides comprehensive content.	Language within Staff Training/Interpretive Guides is written with some inclusive language and/or provides somewhat comprehensive content.	Language within Staff Training/Interpretive Guides is written with little or no inclusive language and/or provides little or no comprehensive content.
Staff Training Materials that Address Race, Ethnicity, Gender, and Identity Awareness	Staff Training Materials address race, ethnicity, gender, and identity awareness among staff/volunteers.	Staff Training Materials somewhat addresses race, ethnicity, gender, and identity awareness among staff/volunteers.	Staff Training Materials do not address race, ethnicity, gender, and identity awareness among staff/volunteers.

Table 2: Comprehensive Content

	Excellent	Fair	Needs Work
Language within Written Materials & Website Information	Site uses inclusive and updated language within <i>all</i> written materials and website information.	Site uses some inclusive and updated language within <i>all</i> written materials and website information OR uses inclusive and updated language within <i>some</i> written materials and website information.	Site uses inclusive and updated language in little or none of their written materials or website information.
Content of All People that Once Lived at the Site	Site includes comprehensive and inclusive content of all of the people that once lived at the site.	Site includes some inclusive content of all of the people that once lived at the site.	Site includes only content of the white men that once lived at the site.
Difficult History Interpretation Change Over Time	Difficult history interpretation has changed over time and has kept up with societal progress.	Difficult history interpretation has changed over time, but has not changed as much as it could have.	Difficult history interpretation has changed very little or not at all over time.

Table 3: Community Outreach

	Excellent	Fair	Needs Work
Site Outreach to their Respective Community	Site actively reaches out to the community to participate in site activities, fundraisers, etc., and is open to suggestions from the public.	Site somewhat invites the community to participate in site activities, fundraisers, and is somtimes open to suggestions from the public.	Site does not invite the community to participate in site activities, fundraisers, and is not open to suggestions from the public.
Status of Relationship Between Site and the Community	The relationship between the site and the community is a positive one.	The relationship between the site and the community is a somewhat positive one.	The relationship between the site and the community is either a negative one or does not exist.
Inclusivity Within Site to Community Communications	The communications between the site and community are inclusive of the history and welcoming to all people.	The communications between the site and community are somewhat inclusive of the history and are generally welcoming.	The communications between the site and the community are not inclusive of the history and/or are not welcoming.

#### **Historic Sites**

#### Daniel Boone's Homestead

The Daniel Boone Homestead is the farm in Berks County, Pennsylvania where Daniel Boone was born in 1734 (d. 1820).<sup>30</sup> He lived here until 1750 when his family moved to North Carolina.<sup>31</sup> Boone is known as a pioneer of the American frontier as he explored and later settled modern-day Kentucky. He has often been memorialized as an American hero. Boone was born

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> Sharon Hernes Silverman, *Daniel Boone Homestead: Pennsylvania Trail of History Guide* (Mechanicsburg, PA: Stackpole Books, 2000), 7.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> "Historic Site: The Daniel Boone Homestead," *Daniel Boone Home*, accessed September 2021, https://www.thedanielboonehomestead.org/.

into a Quaker family; he practiced Quaker beliefs as a child while he lived in his family home but did not follow their practices as an adult. Historians claim that Boone was not affiliated with a particular church. In 1756, Boone married Rebecca Bryan and together they had ten children.<sup>32</sup> While he was often portrayed in the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries as an "Indian fighter," Boone remembered killing only three Indigenous people during his lifetime.<sup>33</sup> The Boone family owned enslaved people throughout his lifetime, and Boone himself had enslaved people whom he took with him on his ventures west. According to historical records, he owned at least seven slaves as an adult.<sup>34</sup>

After the Boone family moved to North Carolina, the Pennsylvania homestead was owned by Daniel Boone's uncle; he sold it in 1770 to the DeTurk family, who lived there until the 1820s. In the 1930s, Daniel Carter Beard formed a committee to save and restore the property. The Commonwealth of Pennsylvania purchased the homestead in 1938 and began the restoration process, which allows visitors today to view the historic site as it was in the eighteenth century. The Pennsylvania Historical and Museum Commission currently operates the site with the purpose of educating visitors on Daniel Boone and his family's history in Pennsylvania.<sup>35</sup>

The Pennsylvania Historical and Museum Commission (PHMC) was created in 1945 to collect, conserve, and interpret the culture and history of Pennsylvania. According to the PHMC's website, its mission is to "discover, protect and share Pennsylvania's past, inspiring

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> Hernes Silverman, *Daniel Boone Homestead*, 10-11.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> Daniel J. Herman, "The Other Daniel Boone: The Nascence of a Middle-Class Hunter Hero, 1784-1860," *Journal of the Early Republic* 18, no.3, (1998): 434. See also: John Mack Faragher, *Daniel Boone: The Life and Legend of an American Pioneer*, (Norwalk, CT: Easton Press, 1995).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> Neal O. Hammon and James Russell Harris, "Daniel Boone the Businessman: Revising the Myth of Failure," *Register of the Kentucky Historical Society* 112, no.1 (2014): 5-50.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> "Historic Site: The Daniel Boone Homestea," *Daniel Boone Home*.

others to value and use our history in meaningful ways."<sup>36</sup> I chose to examine this site's interpretation of slavery because Daniel Boone is regarded as an American hero, yet he owned enslaved people throughout his life and I wanted to explore how this site incorporates this piece of difficult history into the narrative of Boone's life.

#### The Logan Family's Stenton

Built in 1730, the Stenton mansion was home to James Logan and his family. Logan family members were well-known Quakers involved in the politics of the British colonies, and eventually, the United States. James Logan (1674-1751) originally immigrated to the colony of Pennsylvania from Ireland; William Penn, who brought him to the colony, later became his employer and a close friend. Tames Logan married Sarah Reed in 1714 and together they had four children. Logan named Stenton after the location of his father's birthplace in Scotland. In the eighteenth century, the Logans owned enslaved people who lived on and operated their plantation. The mansion remained in the Logan family for six generations and has had few alterations to its original physical space, both inside and outside, providing visitors with an authentic glimpse into the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries. Stenton curators acknowledge that in the past, the site's interpretation focused almost exclusively on James Logan. In recent years, they have worked to incorporate the stories of other residents at Stenton in the eighteenth century, including an enslaved woman named Dinah who was brought to the property around 1753 and is most notably remembered for saving Stenton from being burned by British soldiers

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> "About PHMC," Pennsylvania Historical and Museum Commission, Commonwealth of Pennsylvania Government, accessed September 2, 2022, https://www.phmc.pa.gov/About/Pages/default.aspx.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> Laura C. Keim, *Stenton: A Visitor's Guide to the Site, History, and Collections*, (Philadelphia, PA: The National Society of the Colonial Dames of America in the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, 2014), 1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> Keim, Stenton: A Visitor's Guide to the Site, 2-3.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> "Stenton: A House of Learning, Past and Present," Stenton, accessed September 2021, https://www.stenton.org/.

in 1777.<sup>40</sup> Dinah's story is now incorporated in the information on the site's website and in the house exhibits.<sup>41</sup> I chose this site for its interpretation of slavery to examine the reasons why they include Dinah's story, how her story is being told, and how it compares to the history being interpreted at the other three sites.

According to Stenton's website, its mission is to educate and preserve "the story of Stenton and its place in American history, and work to enrich community life." The house has been preserved since 1899 by the National Society of the Colonial Dames of America in the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania (NSCDAPA). The NSCDAPA was established in 1891 to renew a patriotic interest for visitors in those who founded our nation. They work on historic preservation and education about the nation's history through the historic sites they own and operate. Because the NSCDAPA has a very specific mission dedicated to showcasing the patriotic view of historic people and sites, one might question whether their interpretation of the site includes everyone who once lived there.

#### The 1719 Museum

The 1719 Museum interprets the story of Christian Herr (1679-1750), a German-speaking Mennonite, who immigrated to Pennsylvania in 1711 with a group of other Mennonites led by his father, Hans Herr. <sup>45</sup> Between 1711 and 1719, Christian Herr and his family lived in a log house until they built a stone house. This stone house was eventually occupied by Christian, his

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> "Memorial Plans," Stenton, accessed Jul 13, 2023,

https://www.stenton.org/files/ugd/29e2a6 15a275a412149dea7dfc7e6708f7639.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> "Stenton: A House of Learning, Past and Present," Stenton

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup> "Stenton: A House of Learning, Past and Present," Stenton

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>43</sup> "Stenton: A House of Learning, Past and Present," Stenton

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>44</sup> "About: NSCDA-PA," The National Society of the Colonial Dames of America in the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, accessed September 2021, https://www.nscdapa.org/about.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>45</sup> Steve Friesen, *A Modest Mennonite Home: The Story of the 1719 Hans Herr House, An Early Colonial Landmark*, (Intercourse, PA: Good Books, 1990), 26, 33, 61.

wife Anna, their seven children, and Christian's parents Elizabeth and Hans. It was also used as a Mennonite meeting house and place of worship. Christian Herr lived in the stone house until his death in 1750.<sup>46</sup>

The 1719 Museum is a registered historic landmark and has been operated by Mennonite Life, formerly the Lancaster Mennonite Historical Society, since 1969 with restorations to the house beginning in 1970.<sup>47</sup> As of 2022, the site and the owning institution have undergone a rebranding. The mission of this site as listed on the historical society's website is to "hold, honor, and share items and stories featuring the lived experiences and faith values of Lancaster Mennonites and interrelated communities." I chose to examine this site's interpretation of Indigenous people's history because the site includes an Eastern Woodlands Indigenous longhouse on the property. The longhouse, added in 2013, tells the history of Indigenous people in Pennsylvania, specifically those in Lancaster County where the 1719 Museum is located. <sup>49</sup> The choice to incorporate a longhouse on the historic site's property shows an advancement towards interpreting difficult history.

Elfreth's Alley

Elfreth's Alley, named after the blacksmith and property owner Jeremiah Elfreth, consists of a row of houses that were built beginning in 1703 on a small, narrow alley that was a cart path where many artisans and traders lived as they contributed to Philadelphia's economy.

Preservation and restoration efforts to save the alley began in the early 1900s and led to the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>46</sup> Friesen, A Modest Mennonite Home, 41-42, 60.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>47</sup> Friesen, A Modest Mennonite Home, 102.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>48</sup> "The Oldest Homestead in Lancaster County," The 1719 Hans Herr House, accessed October 2021, https://hansherr.org/. Site inactive in 2022.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>49</sup> "The Oldest Homestead in Lancaster County," The 1719 Hans Herr House.

establishment of the Elfreth's Alley Association in 1934. The alley consists of 32 houses; only 2 are in use today as the Elfreth's Alley Museum and gift shop and the rest still provide residential housing.<sup>50</sup>

The site today is interpreted with a focus on the working-class women who lived there in the eighteenth century.<sup>51</sup> The museum also provides a podcast to share the story of Elfreth's Alley and its connections to other parts of Philadelphia and the British colonies.<sup>52</sup> This podcast explores topics such as lesbian relationships and transgender women, which makes this a unique site for examining interpretations of women's and gender history.

#### Conclusion

Each of the four sites examined in this study—the Daniel Boone Homestead, Elfreth's Alley, Stenton, and the 1719 Museum—have exhibited change over time with regard to the interpretations they presented. The sites have shown improvements in their staff and training materials, the inclusion of comprehensive content, and the extent of their community outreach. The changes to the stories told at each site have been consistent with the social developments in our society, growth in the profession of history, and the evolution of the sites' respective communities. While the interpretation of difficult history is still a sensitive subject, increasingly the sites examined here are integrating these topics into the stories they tell using the field's best practices.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>50</sup> "Elfreth's Alley Museum," Elfreth's Alley Museum, accessed October 2021, https://www.edfrethsalley.org/.

<sup>51 &</sup>quot;Elfreth's Alley Museum," Elfreth's Alley Museum.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>52</sup> "Elfreth's Alley Museum," Elfreth's Alley Museum.

#### CHAPTER 1: INSTITUTIONAL INVESTMENT AND STAFF TRAINING

"Good interpreters must be intelligent, well-educated, and experienced in some activity reasonably similar to that of interpreting a historic site . . . . A cultivated background can equip them to meet the public with poise, and to answer a broad range of questions." <sup>53</sup>

#### Introduction

When examining the levels of interpretation of difficult history topics at a historic site, it is imperative to take a close look at the staff training materials. These materials are what the staff, and in many cases, the volunteer docents, use as references for providing tours, answering questions, and interpreting the site. Shirley Low, writing in 1965, pointed to the need for docents and staff to have a well-informed background in order to accurately interpret information and answer visitor questions. She argued that good interpreters should have qualities such as an educational understanding of the site, graciousness and patience when encountering guests, and a professional attitude. After the museum or site has found employees that meet these qualifications, it is up to the management to properly prepare and train staff members on how to interpret the site. An analysis of the staff and volunteer materials for each site provides a better understanding of how the sites and their respective institutions engage with one another.

Since the 1970s and 1980s, the professionalization of public history as a field has changed how historic sites operate and how training for site personnel is conducted. The growth of accreditation programs, graduate and PhD programs in public history, and the establishment

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>53</sup> Shirley P. Low, "Historic Site Interpretation: The Human Approach," *History News* 20, no.11 (1965): 233-44.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>54</sup> Low, "Historic Site Interpretation: The Human Approach," 234-235.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>55</sup> Low, "Historic Site Interpretation: The Human Approach," 236.

of "best practices" have changed the field.<sup>56</sup> Furthermore, historians have outlined the purpose of interpretation at historic sites. To provide meaningfully preserved history, Patricia Mooney-Melvin states that "interpretation is the medium for educating the public about the history associated with historic sites, cultural landscapes, the built environment, and artifactual remains."<sup>57</sup>

One of the key works to shape interpretation at historic sites was Freeman Tilden's 1977 book *Interpreting Our Heritage* which is frequently used for historic houses, museums, state parks, and other public history sites when they are developing or re-examining the stories they present. Tilden argues that the sites communicate with their visitors through their analysis of the past. He provides six principles of interpretation for site staff to use as a guide as they outline specifically what are interpretations, how to incorporate them through the themes at each site/exhibit, and how to use them to connect with the public.<sup>58</sup> The six principles are: 1) Interpretations that do not make connections between visitors and the site are not useful, 2) Information is not interpretation—interpretation builds upon the information that is provided, 3) It is viewed as an art that combines history, science, architecture, etc., 4) The goal of interpretation is not to instruct visitors, but to encourage them to learn more, 5) It should aim to interpret the entire story, not just a part of it, and 6) Interpretation for children should have an

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>56</sup> Patricia Mooney-Melvin, "Professional Historians and the Challenge of Redefinition," *Public History: Essays From the Field*, (Malabar, FA: Krieger Press, 1999): 5-7. As public history is now a well-known area of study and has numerous graduate programs at universities across the United States, there are still efforts to improve the quality of these programs. See Robert R. Weyeneth and Daniel J. Vivian, "Public History Pedagogy: Charting the Course: Challenges in Public History Education, Guidance for Developing Strong Public History Programs," *The Public Historian* 38, no.3 (2016): 25–49.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>57</sup> Patricia Mooney-Melvin, "Beyond the Book: Historians and the Interpretive Challenge," *The Public Historian* 17, no.4 (1995): 78.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>58</sup> Tilden, *Interpreting Our Heritage*, (Chapel Hill, NC: University of North Carolina Press, 1977), 17-18.

entirely different approach, rather than a diluted adult interpretation.<sup>59</sup> Tilden's six principles are an important part of staff training that continues to shape the work of historic sites.

Other scholars have continued to build on Tilden's work. Nina Jensen and Mary Ellen Munley maintained in 1985 that museum staff have two areas of responsibility in which they need to be trained: collections and learning/education. These two responsibilities go hand-in-hand. Museum staff need to know how to preserve the artifacts in their collections and to educate the public about them. Revertheless, in 2004, Mary Kay Cunningham argued that there are still gaps in the literature for best practices in staff training. She noted that while there was a literature about the philosophical pedagogy of training methods, there still was a severe lack of tangible tools available. The purpose of her book was to provide those tools and resources for museums and historic sites to add to their staff and docent training materials. These tools include writing practices, group activities, and interactive lectures to help teach appropriate ways to interpret information. Cunningham's work demonstrates a bridge between the best practices of site interpretation methodology and the tools needed.

Reflecting the professionalization of the field, the training materials at the historic sites being examined here have changed over time—in some cases, drastically; some include more interpretation in general, more inclusive language, more comprehensive mission statements, and the identification of gender and identity biases. Most of these improvements have happened in the past 10 years. This chapter examines changes in the staff training materials and compares them to the changes in history as a field and public history best practices. Each of the institutions

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>59</sup> Tilden, *Interpreting Our Heritage*, 18.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>60</sup> Nina Jensen and Mary Ellen Munley, "Training for Museum Education Professionals," *The Journal of Museum Education* 10, no. 4 (1985), 12.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>61</sup> Mary Kay Cunningham, *The Interpreter's Training Manual for Museums*, (Washington, DC: American Association of Museums, 2004), ix.

examined here has a high investment in its interpretation. This is evident in the alignment of the mission statements of parent institutions and their sites and how they match with the interpretations in the staff and docent training materials. An overlap of mission statements is seen in institutions that only operate one site. For institutions that operate more than one site, there are larger differences between the sites studied here and their parent institution mission statements as the institution missions are typically broader to encompass more sites. Institutional investment is significant to the operation of a historic site because all of the people involved (board, staff, management, docents, etc.) should share the same goals when it comes to topics and methods of interpretation. The board and management are responsible for allocating resources and ensuring the topics are approached appropriately. <sup>62</sup> For this reason, each operating institution should have a high investment, or stake, in its site as the interpretations presented at each site reflect on the mission of the institution.

#### **Institution and Site Mission Statements**

Mission statements present brief overviews of the purpose of the historical site, institution, or association that are created to provide a general understanding of the site's goals and objectives for the public, the institution's board members, staff, and docents. They show what is important to the institution and the site. For example, if a site's mission statement focuses on representing diversity, one could expect the site to have a diverse narrative embedded in its interpretation. One way to evaluate the investment of an institution in its historic site is to look at the alignment of mission statements with what is happening at the site itself. The level of overlap

۵,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>62</sup> Kristin L. Gallas and James DeWolf Perry, "Developing Comprehensive and Conscientious Interpretation of Slavery at Historic Sites and Museums," *History News* 69, no.2 (2014): 4.

between the goals and purpose of the sponsoring institution and those of the site provides one indication of how much the institution invests in the site. According to Christopher C. Morphew and Matthew Hartley, there are two purposes of a mission statement; the first is to provide clear lines between what is the role of the institution and what is not, and the other is to demonstrate "a shared sense of purpose" that "has the capacity to inspire and motivate those within an institution and to communicate its characteristics, values, and history to key external constituents."63 As a result, when the mission statements of supporting institutions and historic sites align, it demonstrates that institutional investment is resulting in shared goals, values, and vision. <sup>64</sup> Two of the sites being examined in this research have exactly the same mission statements as their parent institutions. Those are the 1719 Museum and Mennonite Life, and Elfreth's Alley and the Elfreth's Alley Association. The 1719 Museum mission statement correlation is interesting because the site's mission statement was adopted by their sponsoring institution, Mennonite Life in 2022 when both entities went through a rebranding process; they now share the same statements. Mennonite Life was previously the Lancaster Mennonite Historical Society and their former mission statement was to "[preserve] and [interpret] the culture and context of Anabaptist-related faith communities connected to Lancaster County, Pennsylvania."65 After the site was rebranded in 2022, they adopted the same mission as the 1719 Museum which was to "hold, honor, and share items and stories featuring the lived experiences and faith values of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>63</sup> Christopher C. Morphew and Matthew Hartley, "Mission Statements: A Thematic Analysis of Rhetoric across Institutional Type," *The Journal of Higher Education* 77, no.3 (2006): 457.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>64</sup> "Mission Statements & Strategic Planning," Sustaining Places: An Encyclopedia of Resources for Small Historical Organizations, March 10, 2023, https://sustainingplaces.com/collaboration-2/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>65</sup> "Lancaster Mennonite Conference Historical Society," Lancaster Mennonite Conference Historical Society - GuideStar Profile, accessed April 15, 2023. This source, while accessed in 2023, holds information from the Lancaster Mennonite Historical Society prior to the rebranding the institution underwent in early 2022 when they changed to "Mennonite Life." As the historical society's old website does not exist anymore, I am using this source to show the historical society's previous mission.

Lancaster Mennonites and interrelated communities."66 When it comes to inclusivity within their missions, the statement incorporates sharing the "lived experiences...of interrelated communities" but it does not specify which communities.<sup>67</sup> This shows growth as the site and institution both now work to include the history of Indigenous peoples and other groups such as English, Scottish, and Irish settlers, as well as enslaved people, within their interpretation.

For Elfreth's Alley and the Elfreth's Alley Association (EAA), their mission statements are exactly the same, which is unsurprising as the EAA was created with the sole purpose of preserving Elfreth's Alley. The mission statement is "to preserve and protect the Elfreth's Alley historic district, while interpreting the contributions of everyday Philadelphians to our American story."68 The use of the phrase "everyday Philadelphians" in their mission can be viewed as a catch-all statement rather than a purposefully inclusive one, similar to the "interrelated communities" mentioned in the 1719 Museum's mission.<sup>69</sup> However, it could also be argued that this phrase of "everyday Philadelphians" is accepting those who challenged gender and identity standards by categorizing them as everyday people. Because of the ambiguity within the phrase, clarification would assist stakeholders to know whose history the site and institution aim to interpret. Overall, it does seem easier for there to be a correlation between mission statements at these historic sites and institutions as the sites are the only ones that the institutions operate.

More significant differences in mission statements arise within institutions that operate many sites. One of those larger institutions is the Pennsylvania Historical and Museum

<sup>66 &</sup>quot;Vision, Mission and Core Values," Mennonite Life, [2022] https://mennonitelife.org/about/vision-mission-corevalues/; "About," 1719 Hans Herr House Museum and Tours, https://www.hansherr.org/about, accessed September 2021 (website inactive in March 2022).

 <sup>67 &</sup>quot;Vision, Mission and Core Values," Mennonite Life.
 68 Elfreth's Alley Museum, "About," Elfreth's Alley Association, n.d, accessed September 5, 2022. https://www.elfrethsalley.org/about.

<sup>69</sup> Elfreth's Alley Museum, "About."

Commission (PHMC). The PHMC oversees over 20 historic sites in the state of Pennsylvania, along with the State Museum of Pennsylvania and the Pennsylvania State Archives. 70 The PHMC's mission is to "discover, protect and share Pennsylvania's past, inspiring others to value and use our history in meaningful ways."71 The Daniel Boone Homestead, one of the many sites operated by this larger institution, has a mission statement similar to that of the PHMC. Their mission is to preserve the site's "historic, cultural, and natural resources to educate and interpret the life of Daniel Boone, the history of the Oley Valley and promote environmental stewardship through engaging, and interactive experiences that are relevant, accessible, and meaningful to diverse audiences."<sup>72</sup> Although they are similar, they do not completely overlap as the PHMC aims to inspire others to interpret history in "meaningful ways" and the Homestead does not touch on this.<sup>73</sup> The goal to inspire others to interpret history in meaningful ways is significant as it relates to making connections between guests and the past which is an important goal in regard to comprehensive interpretation. This is also important for an organization that includes many different kinds of sites as it should be inspiring those sites to present impactful interpretations specific to each site. However, regarding inclusivity, the PHMC's mission can be described in two ways. On the one hand, it can be seen as a catch all statement that is broad, open to interpretation, and could be clearer with a more definitive stance on inclusion of all people's history. On the other hand, it is broad and open to interpretation which allows for the inclusion of

\_

https://www.phmx.gov/About/Pages/default.aspx.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>70</sup> Pennsylvania Historical & Museum Commission, "Historic Sites and Museums," Commonwealth of Pennsylvania Government, n.d., accessed September 5, 2022, https://www.phmc.pa.gov/museums/pages/default.aspx.

<sup>71</sup> Pennsylvania Historical & Museum Commission, "About PHMC," n.d., accessed October 2021,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>72</sup> "About Us: The Daniel Boone Homestead," Daniel Boone Home, accessed April 22, 2023, https://www.thedanielboonehomestead.org/about-us.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>73</sup> "About PHMC," Pennsylvania Historical & Museum Commission, n.d., https://www.phmc.gov/About/Pages/default.aspx.

history from all of the sites they operate and this ambiguity can be argued to include all people's history. In contrast, the Homestead's mission is specific to interpreting solely the life of Daniel Boone and the broad history of Oley Valley. The history of Oley Valley includes both Indigenous groups and white settlers and is the region where the Homestead is located.<sup>74</sup> This demonstrates inclusivity on the Homestead's part as its mission is dedicated to incorporating the history of all people who once lived within neighboring areas.

Another example of an institution that administers multiple sites is the National Society of the Colonial Dames of America in the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania (NSCDAPA) which operates three sites in Pennsylvania. One of its sites is Stenton, the former home of statesman James Logan. The NSCDAPA's mission is to "actively [promote] an appreciation of America's national heritage through historic preservation, patriotic service, and educational projects. The NSCDAPA education and preservation, we interpret the story of Stenton and its place in American history, and work to enrich community life. The Stenton and the NSCDAPA, they have a crossover in laying out the importance of historic preservation to American history; however, Stenton's mission statement focuses specifically on Stenton and its importance within the community whereas the NSCDAPA's mission focuses more on a national level of American history. This difference is expected considering they operate at different

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>74</sup> Gabrielle M. Lanier, "Review," *The Pennsylvania Magazine of History and Biography* 121, no. 1/2 (1997): 139-41. Among the settlers were those from Sweden, England, France, Switzerland, Germany, and the Netherlands. They also had great religious diversity as settlers brought the beliefs of Quakers, Lutherans, and Moravians with them.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>75</sup> NSCDA, "Museum Properties: NSCDAPA," *The National Society of the Colonial Dames of America*, accessed September 5, 2022, https://www.nscdapa.org/museum-properties.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>76</sup> The National Society of the Colonial Dames of America in the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, "About: NSCDA—PA," NSCDA, accessed April 22, 2023, https://www.nscdapa.org/about.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>77</sup> Stenton, "History & Mission," *The National Society of the Colonial Dames of America: Pennsylvania*, accessed September 5, 2022, https://www.stenton.org/history-mission.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>78</sup> Stenton, "History & Mission."

levels; it also highlights the contrast in priority of interpretational goals as Stenton aims to interpret its relevance in history and to enhance community relations and the NSCDAPA aims to promote an appreciation for American history. The NSCDAPA's institutional investment in the Stenton site is strong but they do not have the same level of interest in the local community and Stenton-specific history that the site itself does.

While the missions for the Daniel Boone Homestead and Stenton do not share as much of an overlap with their sponsoring institutions as is the case for the 1719 Museum and Elfreth's Alley, both institutions still have a high investment in their sites which is seen through the topics discussed in their staff training materials as demonstrated below.

## **Staff and Volunteer Training Materials**

Each of the four Pennsylvania historic sites have training materials and interpretive guides for their staff and volunteers to use. The purpose of these guides is to provide useful information about the sites and the people who once lived there, as well as tips for how to interpret their stories. The information provided in these training materials will provide a deeper look into the history that these sites and institutions are providing to the public. Some of them have made enhancements over the years that have kept up with changes in the profession of history, whereas other sites have not had any significant changes at all. The improvements correlate with the professionalization of history and the development of best practices within the field.

The site that has had the most growth over time within their staff materials is the 1719 Museum, which currently has a curator and several others on staff and docents as the main contacts for guests. Docents are provided with an interpretive guide; most recently the guide

from 2018 was updated in early 2022. There are many differences between the two versions despite there only being a four-year gap between the two. The 2018 version instructs the staff and volunteers that they are to tell the full story of Native American history including both positive and negative interactions with white colonists. The interpretive themes of the Herr House and the Native American longhouse were faith and spirituality, architecture, daily life, colonial context, descendants, and building and restoration. The section of the guide that outlines the longhouse tour is very brief and holds minimal information. For example, one of the points simply instructs interpreters to provide a "General history of the tribes who lived here," but does not provide any specific information to share. This shows that the staff or volunteer was expected to do their own research on the general history of Indigenous people who inhabited the area. As a result, staff and docents would likely find different information from different sources, providing uneven interpretations and perspectives to their guests. The intentions of this guide were positive, but it lacked sufficient information for staff members to do their jobs easily.

The updated 2022 interpretive guide provides much more specific background and information for staff and docent volunteers. The guide's opening language – "As we recommit to focusing on the history of the Herrs and the indigenous people who met them," – demonstrates a shift in the site's priority for interpretation. 82 Towards the end of this introduction, there is a brief paragraph that discusses the importance of keeping up with current research methods and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>79</sup> The 1719 Herr House & Native American Longhouse Staff, *1719 Herr House and Native American Longhouse: Volunteer Guide Handbook* (Willow Street, PA: The 1719 Hans Herr House, 2018), 13.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>80</sup> The 1719 Herr House & Native American Longhouse Staff, *1719 Herr House and Native American Longhouse*, 13-16.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>81</sup> The 1719 Herr House & Native American Longhouse Staff, 1719 Herr House and Native American Longhouse, 19.

<sup>82</sup> The 1719 Museum Staff, 1719 Museum: Interpretation Manual (Lancaster, PA: Mennonite Life, 2022), 2.

educational practices to "provide visitors with an authentic and relevant experience." This demonstrates a self-awareness of bias that staff and docents may have, and the work that is being done to counteract that bias when providing interpretation to the public. The guide also contains a section titled "Principles of Interpretation" which uses Freeman Tilden's six principles, which is one of the frequently used sources for aiding in interpretational methods at historic sites and museums. At This shows the site's dedication to maintaining professional standards as they are using a foundational source in the field and they are reworking their interpretations regularly. In the "Interpretive Approach" section, the guide encourages volunteers and staff to use the context it provides rather than simply regurgitating facts to guests. Within this section are objectives, themes, and references/resources for staff and volunteers to learn from. This shows a commitment within upper management at the site and institution to provide staff and docents with the highest level of knowledge possible and to encourage interpreters to have successful interactions with guests.

The Daniel Boone Homestead is the site that, after the 1719 Museum, has had the most change over time in its training materials. While the Homestead has not had as many changes as the 1719 Museum, it does have more training materials than Stenton and Elfreth's Alley. The Daniel Boone Homestead has one curator who is currently the only person on staff and one volunteer from the Friends of Daniel Boone Homestead organization. Prior to 2020 (when the site closed for covid), there was a larger group of volunteers with the Friends of the Daniel Boone Homestead. According to Heather Hicks, the current curator of the site, the Friends were dissatisfied with the direction the site was taking to discuss topics of difficult history, so they

<sup>83</sup> The 1719 Museum Staff, 1719 Museum: Interpretation Manual, 2.

<sup>84</sup> The 1719 Museum Staff, 1719 Museum: Interpretation Manual, 7.

<sup>85</sup> The 1719 Museum Staff, 1719 Museum: Interpretation Manual, 8.

resigned from their volunteer positions. They also took many administrative materials with them when they left. This included any updated docent scripts and tour information.<sup>86</sup>

Currently, volunteers at the Daniel Boone Homestead are provided with interpretive guides in the form of an exhibition script. The current script was last updated in 2012. There are many contradictory statements regarding the interpretation of Boone's life in the Homestead's materials. The main theme listed in the exhibition script is the "Myths and Truths of Daniel Boone (with Focus on His Adult Life)." This is an interesting theme for the Homestead to focus on as the script then reads: "The interpretation of the Daniel Boone Homestead does little at this time to discuss Daniel Boone's adult life." Furthermore, the learning objectives for the docents to follow include having their guests describe why Daniel Boone is famous and the importance of his role in westward expansion both of which revolve around his achievements as an adult. It then states that during Boone's first attempt to settle land in Kentucky in 1773, Boone and his group were attacked by Native Americans and Boone's son was killed in this battle. Rellingly, this is the only reference to Boone's relationship to Indigenous people, even though that was a large part of his life as a pioneer of westward expansion.

It is interesting to see the difference between the discussion of Daniel Boone's relationship with Native Americans and his ownership of slaves. The script states that Daniel Boone did not grow up with "enslaved African Americans" because he lived in a Quaker household; but then it continues by noting that although some Quakers did own slaves in the previous century, most did not.<sup>89</sup> The script mentions that when Boone lived in Kentucky in

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>86</sup> Author interview with Heather Hicks, Daniel Boone Homestead, Birdsboro, PA, October 2, 2021.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>87</sup> Daniel Boone Homestead Staff, *Docent Exhibition Script* (Birdsboro, PA: Daniel Boone Homestead, August 25, 2012) 1

<sup>88</sup> Daniel Boone Homestead Staff, Docent Exhibition Script, 2.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>89</sup> Daniel Boone Homestead Staff, *Docent Exhibition Script*, 8.

1787, he owned seven enslaved Africans with three of them being identified as Easter, Loos, and Cote. Daniel Boone, his wife, and children are categorized as being "among the few eighteenth-century Kentucky families who owned slaves, and Daniel's descendants continued to support slavery until the end of the Civil War." This interpretation does match up with the mission of the Homestead to "educate and interpret the life of Daniel Boone" as it discusses his childhood and adult life. 91

There is a short packet of "Extra Background Reading for Docents" titled *The History of Slavery in Pennsylvania*. This is a brief overview of the enslavement of African Americans in Pennsylvania beginning in the 1600s. In the second paragraph of this reading, it states that "Slavery in Pennsylvania was different than large plantation slavery" and proceeds to say that enslaved people in Pennsylvania were typically well fed and clothed, and "sometimes treated like members of the family." These statements attempt to paint slavery in a better light in the north to try to preserve Daniel Boone's status as an American hero, which is consistent throughout the site's materials. In the next paragraph, it says that enslaved people who ran away from their owners had "bad behavior" and that the infamous Black Codes were for the "help of returning fugitive slaves." In reality, Black Codes were about hunting down enslaved people whose owners viewed them as property. The next several pages of the reading discuss the early push by German Quakers and Mennonites for anti-slavery efforts in Pennsylvania and the gradual abolition movement. The packet later notes that "when Daniel Boone grew up and moved into

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>90</sup> Daniel Boone Homestead Staff, *Docent Exhibition Script*, 9.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>91</sup> "About Us: The Daniel Boone Homestead," Daniel Boone Home, accessed April 22, 2023, https://www.thedanielboonehomestead.org/about-us.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>92</sup> Daniel Boone Homestead Staff, "Docent Information, Further Research," *Daniel Boone Homestead*, 1.

<sup>93</sup> Daniel Boone Homestead Staff, "Docent Information, Further Research," 1.

Kentucky, he himself acquired several slaves."<sup>94</sup> That concludes the information provided in this reading on Daniel Boone's ownership of enslaved people. The packet and exhibition script demonstrate many inconsistencies and together create a jumble of information for docents and staff to provide to guests.

The documents that are currently in use at the Daniel Boone Homestead do not address staff and docent biases, nor do they show a significant change over time. As they are at least ten years old, they are outdated considering the amount of research in the historical community that has been completed since 2012. However, the Homestead does still talk briefly about the enslaved people who once lived at the site and the enslaved people who the Boone family once owned which shows an attempt to provide docents with necessary information and interpretation for public tours.

Although Stenton has shown great change over time in terms of the comprehensive content they provide visitors, their changes in staff materials have not been as extensive. Stenton has a large staff with Laura Keim as their curator and docents are either staff or volunteers.

Docents are provided with a detailed interpretive guide of the house which, although it is very different from their 1985 information guide, is still dated. Most of the information provided in the first half of the 1985 guide focuses on the history of the furniture and material culture in the Stenton mansion. The second half of the guide is a sample tour of the main Stenton house and does not include the garden or other smaller buildings on property. The sample tour also primarily focuses on the furniture and architecture of the house and its rooms. However, the 2003 version, while still emphasizing historic objects and furnishings, also touches on

-

<sup>94</sup> Daniel Boone Homestead Staff, "Docent Information, Further Research," 6.

<sup>95</sup> Stenton Staff, Guides Training Info, (Philadelphia, PA: Stenton, 1985).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>96</sup> Stenton Staff, Guides Training Info.

interpretive themes to connect the history of the house and Logan family to common human experiences. <sup>97</sup> This demonstrates a better understanding of the need to interpret the history of the family and their enslaved servants, and not just the furniture. The guide covers the location of the Stenton mansion; James Logan's role in colonial America; the role of the plantation; and the women of Stenton including Deborah Logan, James Logan's wife, and Dinah, an enslaved woman who lived and worked on the property. While the 2003 guide is now 20 years old, it still holds impressive interpretive information for the site. Stenton curator Laura Keim acknowledges that the current guide is dated and that the interpretive committee wants to update it with recent research, but at the moment, they rely on videos embedded in their website to aid docents with their updated interpretation. <sup>98</sup>

The last site is Elfreth's Alley which contains very little information about interpretation in their staff materials. Elfreth's Alley has one curator, Ted Maust, and he is currently the only person on staff. Tours are provided by Maust on a limited schedule or by seasonal docents.

Docents for the site are volunteers with the Elfreth's Alley Association who are given docent guides/volunteer manual for their training. The 2022 Volunteer Manual provides information on who the Elfreth's Alley Association is, how to be a good volunteer, a brief history of the alley, the major storylines of the house at 126 Elfreth's Alley (the current location of the museum), and resources to learn more. 99 Most of the manual revolves around how to be a good volunteer with suggestions such as being polite, asking questions, standing in places out of the way of guests, etc. The brief history of the alley is a condensed history of some of the more popular houses on

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>97</sup> Stenton, *Interpretive Plan*, NSCDAPA, 2003, accessed September 5, 2022, https://www.stenton.org\_files/ugd/29e2a6\_d901cacba4cc46bda13fd622dd8632fb.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>98</sup> Stenton, "Programs," NSCDAPA, 2022, accessed September 5, 2022, https://www.stenton.org/programs.; Administrative Interview with Laura Keim. Philadelphia, PA, October 1, 2021.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>99</sup> Elfreth's Alley Association, *Volunteer Manual* (Philadelphia, PA: Elfreth's Alley Association, 2022).

the street. <sup>100</sup> The manual lacks information and about the people who once lived at the site, including the lesbian and transgender people and other laborers who are discussed in depth on the site's podcast. This shows that while the site and its institution share the mission to interpret "everyday Philadelphians," there is a disconnect between the information that is shared within different materials produced by the EAA.

### Conclusion

The changes in training materials for staff interpreters and the alignment of mission statements between the historic sites discussed here and their parent organizations reflect the evolution of the discipline of history. In the mid-1980s the professionalization of public history as its own field was very new and was still a divisive topic amongst academic historians. We can compare this to the information seen in the sources for the historic sites being examined in this thesis. The 1985 training guide for Stenton, for example, does not provide much interpretation but focuses rather on the furniture, color schemes, and material culture in the house. This correlates with Mooney-Melvin's argument that prior to the establishment of public history graduate programs, there was a large focus on the "facts" (i.e. building and furniture information) and therefore there was not much, if any, historical interpretation of people to be made at historic sites or museums. <sup>101</sup> Mooney-Melvin elaborates that the purpose of interpretation at historic sites is to provide meaningfully preserved history and she discusses the ways that public historians struggle with this task. The Stenton guide from 1985 demonstrates the rise in public history and interpretational methods as the curators at Stenton were attempting

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>100</sup> Elfreth's Alley Association, Volunteer Manual, 8-12.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>101</sup> Patricia Mooney-Melvin, "Professional Historians and the Challenge of Redefinition," *Public History: Essays From the Field*, (Malabar, FA: Krieger Press, 1999): 5-7.

to train their staff and volunteers, but the lack of information about people may have stemmed from the controversy and newness of the field itself.

Another example of a site fitting into this evolution of professionalism is the PHMC which had a budget of only a few thousand dollars in 1937, one year prior to acquiring the Daniel Boone Homestead. Between then and 1965, the staff members of the PHMC were unpaid as there were not enough funds to pay salaries. Mooney-Melvin argues that the field of history did not begin to reach the four attributes of professionalism until post-WWII. The PHMC, which is operated by the state government, was clearly not a priority before the 1960s. This meant that funding for the state's historic sites, including the Daniel Boone Homestead, suffered.

The 1960s also demonstrate the Daniel Boone Homestead's attempt to professionalize in another way. The Homestead proposed to build a longhouse on the property, and to be more inclusive in its interpretation in their 1968 Master Plan. <sup>104</sup> The late 1960s is when members of the PHMC began to be paid staff and historic sites began to become a priority. This shows how institutions invested in historical interpretations and staff training materials that correlate to changes within the field of public history.

Throughout this research, it is apparent that there are still gaps in the inclusivity of these historic sites' staff training materials. While three of the four sites have made improvement over time, there are still further improvements that could be made. The materials examined in this chapter are significant to the overall gauging of each site's difficult history interpretation because

<sup>102</sup> S.K. Stevens, "The Pennsylvania Historical and Museum Commission," *History News* 20, no.7 (1965): 146-147.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>103</sup> Mooney-Melvin, "Professional Historians and the Challenge of Redefinition," 5-7. The four attributes of professionalism are as follows: 1) Formal/professional training, 2) Staff having applicable skills and using them, 3) Committing to serving society in a positive way, and 4) Professional organizations having the ability to create their own standards for professional knowledge and how it is used.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>104</sup> Price and Dickey, Master Plan: Daniel Boone Historic Site, (Birdsboro, PA: Daniel Boone Homestead, 1968).

docents serve as a first contact for guests and should embody the site's interpretive goals in their presentation of information. The institutions' investment in each of their sites varies as sites like the 1719 Museum and Elfreth's Alley are the only historic sites that their institutions run. This shows a difference in the investment of the institutions and how that plays a role in the materials provided to staff and docents.

# Rubrics

Table 4: Institutional Investment and Staff Training—1719 Museum

	Excellent	Fair	Needs Work
Institution and Site Mission Correlation	Institution and Site mission statements match and correlate with each other in terms of inclusive language and content interpretation.	Institution and Site mission statements slightly match and correlate with each other in terms of inclusive language and content interpretation.	Institution and Site mission statements differ too much in terms of inclusive language and content interpretation.
Language within Mission Statements	Language within mission statements is inclusive and updated.	Language within mission statements is somewhat inclusive and updated.	Language within mission statements is not inclusive nor updated.
Language and Inclusion within Staff Training/ Interpretive Guides	Language within Staff Training/Interpretive Guides is written with inclusive language and provides comprehensive content.	Language within Staff Training/Interpretive Guides is written with some inclusive language and/or provides somewhat comprehensive content.	Language within Staff Training/Interpretive Guides is written with little or no inclusive language and/or provides little or no comprehensive content.
Staff Training Materials that Address Race, Ethnicity, Gender, and Identity Awareness	Staff Training Materials address race, ethnicity, gender, and identity awareness among staff/volunteers.	Staff Training Materials somewhat addresses race, ethnicity, gender, and identity awareness among staff/volunteers.	Staff Training Materials do not address race, ethnicity, gender, and identity awareness among staff/volunteers.

Table 5: Institutional Investment and Staff Training—The Daniel Boone Homestead

	Excellent	Fair	Needs Work
Institution and Site Mission Correlation	Institution and Site mission statements match and correlate with each other in terms of inclusive language and content interpretation.	Institution and Site mission statements slightly match and correlate with each other in terms of inclusive language and content interpretation.	Institution and Site mission statements differ too much in terms of inclusive language and content interpretation.
Language within Mission Statements	Language within mission statements is inclusive and updated.	Language within mission statements is somewhat inclusive and updated.	Language within mission statements is not inclusive nor updated.
Language and Inclusion within Staff Training/ Interpretive Guides	Language within Staff Training/Interpretive Guides is written with inclusive language and provides comprehensive content.	Language within Staff Training/Interpretive Guides is written with some inclusive language and/or provides somewhat comprehensive content.	Language within Staff Training/Interpretive Guides is written with little or no inclusive language and/or provides little or no comprehensive content.
Staff Training Materials that Address Race, Ethnicity, Gender, and Identity Awareness	Staff Training Materials address race, ethnicity, gender, and identity awareness among staff/volunteers.	Staff Training Materials somewhat addresses race, ethnicity, gender, and identity awareness among staff/volunteers.	Staff Training Materials do not address race, ethnicity, gender, and identity awareness among staff/volunteers.

Table 6: Institutional Investment and Staff Training—Stenton

	Excellent	Fair	Needs Work
Institution and Site Mission Correlation	Institution and Site mission statements match and correlate with each other in terms of inclusive language and content interpretation.	Institution and Site mission statements slightly match and correlate with each other in terms of inclusive language and content interpretation.	Institution and Site mission statements differ too much in terms of inclusive language and content interpretation.
Language within Mission Statements	Language within mission statements is inclusive and updated.	Language within mission statements is somewhat inclusive and updated.	Language within mission statements is not inclusive nor updated.
Language and Inclusion within Staff Training/ Interpretive Guides	Language within Staff Training/Interpretive Guides is written with inclusive language and provides comprehensive content.	Language within Staff Training/Interpretive Guides is written with some inclusive language and/or provides somewhat comprehensive content.	Language within Staff Training/Interpretive Guides is written with little or no inclusive language and/or provides little or no comprehensive content.
Staff Training Materials that Address Race, Ethnicity, Gender, and Identity Awareness	Staff Training Materials address race, ethnicity, gender, and identity awareness among staff/volunteers.	Staff Training Materials somewhat addresses race, ethnicity, gender, and identity awareness among staff/volunteers.	Staff Training Materials do not address race, ethnicity, gender, and identity awareness among staff/volunteers.

Table 7: Institutional Investment and Staff Training—Elfreth's Alley

	Excellent	Fair	Needs Work
Institution and Site Mission Correlation	Institution and Site mission statements match and correlate with each other in terms of inclusive language and content interpretation.	Institution and Site mission statements slightly match and correlate with each other in terms of inclusive language and content interpretation.	Institution and Site mission statements differ too much in terms of inclusive language and content interpretation.
Language within Mission Statements	Language within mission statements is inclusive and updated.	Language within mission statements is somewhat inclusive and updated.	Language within mission statements is not inclusive nor updated.
Language and Inclusion within Staff Training/ Interpretive Guides	Language within Staff Training/Interpretive Guides is written with inclusive language and provides comprehensive content.	Language within Staff Training/Interpretive Guides is written with some inclusive language and/or provides somewhat comprehensive content.	Language within Staff Training/Interpretive Guides is written with little or no inclusive language and/or provides little or no comprehensive content.
Staff Training Materials that Address Race, Ethnicity, Gender, and Identity Awareness	Staff Training Materials address race, ethnicity, gender, and identity awareness among staff/volunteers.	Staff Training Materials somewhat addresses race, ethnicity, gender, and identity awareness among staff/volunteers.	Staff Training Materials do not address race, ethnicity, gender, and identity awareness among staff/volunteers.

## **CHAPTER 2: COMPREHENSIVE CONTENT**

"For many years, the history field at large has neglected to interpret, interpreted incompletely, or perpetuated myths about the presence and lives of enslaved people at historic sites and museums across the country. We have an obligation to the public to share a comprehensive and conscientious story of the past, especially as studies show that the public considers museums to be their most trusted source of historical information." <sup>105</sup>

### Introduction

Historic sites have made great efforts over the years to improve their interpretation of difficult history including updating their language within their materials and providing comprehensive content about all people who once lived or worked at a site. These improvements have been made in their respective sites' written materials (brochures, pamphlets, etc.), websites, podcasts, training materials, and tour scripts. The timing of the changes they have made mirror societal movements such as the Civil Rights Movement, American Indian Movement, LGBTQ+ representation, and the support of the Black Lives Matter movement. The Civil Rights Movement is considered to have officially begun in 1954 when the National Association for the Advancement of Colored People (NAACP) challenged school segregation leading to the Supreme Court case of Brown v. Board of Education. The court's decision reversed the Plessy v. Ferguson decision of "separate but equal." Brown v. Board of Education was a catalyst for widespread activism regarding civil rights for the African American community. 106 The

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>105</sup> Kristin Gallas and James DeWolf Perry, "Developing Comprehensive and Conscientious Interpretation," *History News* 69, no.2 (2014): 1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>106</sup> George Burson, "The Black Civil Rights Movement," OAH Magazine of History 2, no.1 (1986): 35.

American Indian Movement was officially founded in 1968 in Minneapolis and initiated acts of protest against the many years of oppression and harassment that Native tribes had endured. The purpose of the movement was to achieve political, social, and cultural changes that would allow for Indigenous tribes to be free of the discrimination and abuse they had been experiencing. 107 Representation of and support for the LGBTQ+ community has grown since the Stonewall Riots of 1969 when members of the community engaged in physical fights with police officers during the raid of a gay club in New York City. The rioting continued for six days after the raid and "marked the beginning of the 'gay rights movement." Originally started as a hashtag following the 2013 acquittal of George Zimmerman for the killing of Trayvon Martin, "Black Lives Matter" evolved into a movement for justice for African Americans resulting in major political and cultural shifts. The continued use of this phrase has been linked to widespread protests regarding the treatment of African Americans every year since it was first used. 109 The way the historic site's shifts in interpretation mirror these social movements demonstrates their dedication to providing inclusive histories and keeping in touch with society's expectations more generally.

To measure how each historic site is interpreting its topics of difficult history, this study uses Kristin Gallas and James DeWolf Perry's categories of comprehensive interpretation.

Chapter two addresses the inclusivity of the narrative each site presents. 110 Comprehensive content is defined here as the connection of the site's materials to its mission and audience and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>107</sup> Dick Bancroft, Laura Waterman Wittstock, and Rigoberto Menchu Tum, *We Are Still Here: A Photographic History of the American Indian Movement* (Minnesota: Borealis Books, 2013).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>108</sup> David Carter, Stonewall: The Riots That Sparked the Gay Revolution, (New York, NY: Griffin, 2011), 2.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>109</sup> Russel Rickford, "Black Lives Matter: Toward a Modern Practice of Mass Struggle," *New Labor Forum* 25, no. 1 (2016): 34-35.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>110</sup> Gallas and DeWolf Perry, "Developing Comprehensive and Conscientious Interpretation," 4.

the extent to which those materials tell an inclusive history of the site. <sup>111</sup> Marianna Adams and Judy Koke, who discuss the purpose of Comprehensive Interpretive Plans (CIP) argue that whether staff agree on how to interpret the topics they are presenting, who the audience is and how they can be reached, and what the end-goals of a visit to the museum/site should be for a visitor are critical components of interpretation. <sup>112</sup> Comprehensive content at museums and historic sites is important as it indicates the connection between the site's overarching goals, the content of its interpretation, and its audience. <sup>113</sup>

This chapter examines how the interpretation of difficult history has changed over time. How has each site kept up with society's progress in terms of its use of inclusive language, presentation of comprehensive narratives, incorporation of material that reflects both its audience/community and important social movements? The improvement of difficult history interpretation over time is important because it addresses whether the sites have been paying attention to the literature and recommendations of historians and public history professionals, as well as their audience or community and the shifts within society as a whole.

The main categories of comprehensive content being examined at each site are the language used in written materials and website information, content about the people who lived at the site, and how the interpretation of difficult history changed over time. Language use focuses on whether the site currently employs inclusive language. Are the sites using inclusive language in all of their materials or only some of them? Are they not using it at all? Language is important because it affects the way the audience thinks about the subject the site is presenting.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>111</sup> Marianna Adams and Judy Koke, "Comprehensive Interpretive Plans: A Framework of Questions," *The Journal of Museum Education* 33, no.3 (2008): 293-294.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>112</sup> Adams and Koke. "Comprehensive Interpretive Plans," 294-296.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>113</sup> Adams and Koke, "Comprehensive Interpretive Plans," 298.

If a site uses negative language, the audience will inherently feel a negative way about the subject compared to neutral language, which will allow for the audience to develop its own interpretation of the material.<sup>114</sup>

In addition to language, the extent to which interpretive content is comprehensive will be measured by the amount of information it presents about the people who lived at the site. Does the narrative of the site include all of the people who once lived or worked there? This is important because it ensures that everyone's story is being told. The omission of a person or people's history, whether intentional or accidental, does not allow for visitors to have an all-encompassing understanding of that site. Absences or erasures can be harmful to those whose stories have been omitted, and to their descendants. <sup>115</sup>

Overall, the four sites examined in this study have made changes over time to the language used within their materials and they have become more inclusive when telling the stories of the relevant people to the site. The sites with the most change over time are Stenton and Elfreth's Alley as they have made more significant changes in recent years to include narratives of marginalized people in their interpretation. The Daniel Boone Homestead and the 1719 Museum have also made changes over time; however, their revisions have not been as dramatic as those made by the other two sites.

### Content That Includes All of the People Who Lived at a Site

One of the key ways to measure the comprehensive nature of content is by looking at whose stories are included in the narrative. The Daniel Boone Homestead has had little change in

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>114</sup> Amy Sheldon, "Gender, Language, and Historical Interpretation," The Oral History Review 17, no.2 (1989); 93-94.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>115</sup> Sheldon, "Gender, Language, and Historical Interpretation," 95.

interpretation over time regarding the content it provides and its inclusiveness. The 1968 Master Plan for the site includes a chapter on reconstructing a Lenape Indian Village on the property. The authors of the plan had discussions with Dr. John Witthof from the University of Pennsylvania and Dr. William Hunter of the Pennsylvania Historical and Museum Commission when creating their layout. 116 The plan was to reconstruct a 1750s-style Lenape Longhouse "surrounded by a series of at least four small cabins; and fields of maize, squash, beans, and sunflowers."117 There were specific instructions for what materials the longhouse would be made of and how the materials would be held together to protect them in inclement weather. The plan also proposed reconstructing outbuildings, corn cribs, and other storage facilities; however, the authors stated that construction on these areas should wait until further research was completed to ensure they were accurate and authentic. According to the plan, "previous attempts to reproduce such Indian villages have proven to be expensive to build and both difficult and costly to maintain." <sup>118</sup> This statement proved to be true; the plans to reconstruct the Indian village were abandoned because of a lack of funding. The 1968 Master Plan demonstrates the Homestead's dedication to including the interpretation of the Indigenous Lenapes living in the region as they anticipated recreating an entire village on the property. Although the village was never created, the plan shows the extent to which site managers wanted to ensure it was authentic and historically accurate. However, as inclusive as this plan was, this is the only source that thoroughly discusses the Lenapes' interactions and importance at the Homestead and within this area of Berks County, Pennsylvania.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>116</sup> Price and Dickey, *Master Plan: Daniel Boone Historic Site. Daniel Boone Homestead*, (Birdsboro, PA: Daniel Boone Homestead, 1968).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>117</sup> Price and Dickey, Master Plan, 24.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>118</sup> Price and Dickey, *Master Plan*, 24-25.

The same year the Master Plan proposed building the Lenape village, the American Indian Movement was founded. This organization was established after many years of discrimination and harmful Indian policies from the federal government. The American Indian Movement formally organized simultaneously to the Civil Rights Movement that occurred from 1954 to 1968 and led to the Civil Rights Act of 1968. Given the context of these ongoing movements at the time the Master Plan was written, Homestead managers likely responded to these social movements by creating a plan to include local Indigenous history in the interpretation of their site.

The Homestead's record for including enslaved people, however, is less straightforward. The Homestead's Docent Exhibition Script, which was most recently updated in 2012, states that Daniel Boone owned at least seven enslaved people. <sup>121</sup> In an informational brochure from 1962, the site is described as a place that "tells not only the story of Boone himself, but the story of the persistence and hard work which extended Pennsylvania's first frontier." <sup>122</sup> However, despite this statement, the brochure only discusses Boone. The rest of the brochure does not address Boone's or his family's relationship to the other people around them and in their household who persisted through hard work. That includes enslaved household members and Indigenous neighbors who were likely working hard to survive displacement by settlers like the Boones. <sup>123</sup> In a similar fashion, a visitor's guide from 2021 provides an overview of Boone's life and does

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>119</sup> Stephen Cornell, "Crisis and Response in Indian-White Relations: 1960-1984," *Social Problems* 32, no.1 (1984): 44-59.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>120</sup> Kenneth B. Clark, "The Civil Rights Movement: Momentum and Organization," *Daedalus* 95, no. 1 (1966): 239–67.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>121</sup> Daniel Boone Homestead Staff, "Docent Exhibition Script," *Daniel Boone Homestead.*, (August 25, 2012): 1-10, accessed September 2021.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>122</sup> Pennsylvania Historical and Museum Commission, *Daniel Boone Homestead on the Pennsylvania Trail of History*, (Harrisburg, PA: Pennsylvania Historical and Museum Commission, 1962).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>123</sup> Daniel J. Herman, "The Other Daniel Boone: The Nascence of a Middle-Class Hunter Hero, 1784-1860," *Journal of the Early Republic* 18, no.3 (1998): 429-457.

not mention slavery nor his relationship with Indigenous peoples at all. The brochure does mention that the house was eventually sold to William Maugridge but does not mention his ownership of slaves either, nor the displacement or treatment of local Indigenous groups.<sup>124</sup>

While Daniel Boone only lived in this house for a short period of time, much of the content in the site's interpretation revolves around the image of Boone as an American hero through his pioneering travels later in his life. In that context, the omission of Boone's treatment and displacement of Native Americans in his travels and his ownership of enslaved people is glaring. The docent materials do include a discussion of his participation in slavery, yet it is not integrated into any printed materials, the website, or the tour. 125 Although the Indigenous peoples and the enslaved people who Daniel Boone owned did not live on the property when the Boone family owned it, the Homestead's focus on Boone's later life as a pioneer suggests they should be included in the narrative. Failure to integrate them into the interpretation means that this site does not present a comprehensive and inclusive history of everyone who once lived there or those who interacted with Boone and his family.

In comparison to the Daniel Boone Homestead, the 1719 Museum has changed its interpretation to tell a more complete story. The 1970 site brochure describes the Herr House as the "Oldest House in Lancaster County, Pennsylvania" and that it was "used as an early Mennonite Meeting Place." There is no information on the Herr family or the importance of this site, other than that it is the oldest house in the county. The brochure also makes no mention

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>124</sup> Pennsylvania Historical and Museum Commission, *Daniel Boone Homestead: Visitor Guide*, Pennsylvania: Pennsylvania Historical and Museum Commission, May 2018, accessed September 2021.

<sup>125 &</sup>quot;About us: The Daniel Boone Homestead," Daniel Boone Home, accessed April 22, 2023, https://www.thedanielboonehomestead.org/about-us; Daniel Boone Homestead, Site Tour, Birdsboro, PA, October 2021

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>126</sup> Lancaster Mennonite Conference Historical Society, *Visit the Historic Hans Herr House: Built in 1719*, (Lancaster, PA: Lancaster Mennonite Conference Historical Society, 1970).

of neighboring Indigenous peoples that the Herrs would have interacted with. At the time that the Herr family arrived at this area in Lancaster, there were Indigenous people already living there with whom the family and other settlers would have interacted on a daily basis. Most notably, there was a village of Conestogas (refugee Indigenous people) who had been pushed off their lands in various places and had moved to the region. There was a major interpretation change at this site from 1970 to the 2000s when site administrators decided to incorporate local Indigenous groups' stories.

In the early 2000s, there was discussion among the 1719 Museum staff, the former Lancaster Mennonite Historical Society, and local Native Americans to build a longhouse replica on the site of the Herr house property. The museum and historical society worked with the Circle Legacy Center in Lancaster, Pennsylvania to accomplish this task. Work on the longhouse began in 2012 and it was officially opened to the public on May 18, 2013. This decision to incorporate a Native American longhouse on the property was based on the long history of Native American tribes in southern Pennsylvania and the lack of public awareness about their histories. The purpose, as listed on the museum's former website, is to "accurately and respectfully present the story of Native Americans in Pennsylvania." Staff at the 1719 Museum have worked continually with local Indigenous people to interpret the longhouse and the artifacts located within it. 129

\_\_\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>127</sup> Daniel K. Richter, "A Framework for Pennsylvania Indian History," *Pennsylvania History: A Journal of Mid-Atlantic Studies* 57, no. 3 (1990): 247.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>128</sup> 1719 Hans Herr House Museum and Tours, "About," *The 1719 Herr House*. https://www.hansherr.org/about, accessed September 2021; site inactive in March 2022.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>129</sup> 1719 Hans Herr House Museum and Tours, "About."; Administrative Interview with Tiffany Fisk, 1719 Museum, March 11, 2022; The 1719 Museum also works closely with the Circle Legacy Center to interpret Indigenous history, see "Welcome to the Circle Legacy Center," Circle Legacy Center, accessed July 12, 2023, https://circlelegacycenter.com/.

A book titled *Life in a Longhouse Valley* by Bobbie Kalman which was written in 2001 is recommended for docents as background reading on Native American Longhouses. The book is written like a children's book and provides a general overview of Northeastern Native American Longhouses. It does not discuss specific tribes, but it does present the information in an objective manner. This serves as an easy way for docents to gain a general background knowledge on Native American longhouses to aid in their interpretation during tours. It also shows that site administrators seek to provide their docents with a broad background on Indigenous history.

Between 2018 and 2021, the site used a Docent Interpretive Guide that explained the Longhouse. It states: "We made a conscious decision not to interpret any particular tribe or nation, but choose rather to interpret the eastern woodland culture." The guide states that the goal of the 1719 Museum is to "tell the story of their [eastern woodland peoples'] culture and heritage" with "honesty and integrity, without bias or prejudice." The Longhouse is divided into two sections for artifacts: pre-contact with white settlers and post-contact with white settlers. The Guide provides a brief background on context for the colonial time period and Native Americans who were living within this region; however it does not break up the information between pre- and post-contact so it may be difficult for a newer docent to connect the information to the artifacts. The first state of the provides and the provides are the provides and the provides are the provides and the provides are the provide

In a brochure printed in 2021, the longhouse is described as "the kind of dwelling used by Native Americans before the arrival of Europeans." It also does not provide any context for why

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>130</sup> Bobbie Kalman, *Life in a Longhouse Village*, New York, NY: Crabtree Publishing Company, 2001.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>131</sup> The 1719 Herr House and Native American Longhouse Staff, *1719 Herr House, Native American Longhouse: Volunteer Guide Handbook*, Willow Street, PA: The 1719 Hans Herr House, 2018, 13.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>132</sup> The 1719 Herr House and Native American Longhouse Staff, 1719 Herr House, 13.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>133</sup> The 1719 Herr House and Native American Longhouse Staff, 1719 Herr House, 14.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>134</sup> The 1719 Herr House and Native American Longhouse Staff, 1719 Herr House, 14-15.

it is important to Pennsylvania's history or the story of the Herr family to include a longhouse on the site. 135 After the 1719 Museum underwent rebranding, the institution changed the description of the longhouse and described it as a place where visitors can "learn about the first people who lived on, farmed, and hunted this land." 136 The most recent pamphlet also invites visitors to "learn the context of what brought Indigenous people and Mennonite families, like the Herrs, together here." 137 These changes show a desire by the institution and site to provide a more detailed description of the Indigenous people who lived on the land by describing them as the first ones to live, farm, and hunt in the area. The language that invites visitors to learn the context of what brought Indigenous people and the Herr family to Lancaster, Pennsylvania demonstrates a push towards inclusivity by intertwining the narratives, rather than separating them as the 2021 brochure did. Overall, the 1719 Museum interprets the site's history to the public in an inclusive manner as they attempt to tell a holistic narrative of the people who lived on the site and as well as those with whom they interacted with in nearby settings.

Both Stenton and Elfreth's Alley are sites that have had major changes to their interpretation to present more comprehensive stories of the past. In Stenton's Historic Structure Report, conducted in 1982 by the National Society of Colonial Dames of America in The Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, the foreword states that "Colonialism is no longer fashionable. In addition to its social problems, even its cultural artifacts have come under recent scrutiny." The Report's statement shows that the historical community had begun to develop an awareness of how the public viewed certain aspects of history, and the language used to describe those

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>135</sup> 1719 Hans Herr House, 1719 Hans Herr House, Willow Street, PA, 2021.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>136</sup> Mennonite Life, 1719 Museum: Experience Early American Life, Lancaster, PA: Mennonite Life, 2022.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>137</sup> Mennonite Life, 1719 Museum: Experience Early American Life.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>138</sup> Reed Laurence Engle, *Historic Structure Report: Stenton*. November 1982, Box 1, Bound Volume, F.4 Bound Volumes: Publicity and Events, Stenton Archives, Philadelphia, PA, October 1, 2021.

aspects. It confirms Suzanne Schell's point that by the time of her article in 1985, many historic sites had moved past passive representation of artifacts and began interpreting the deeper history of the sites. The Historic Structure Report supports Schell's point that discussions about how to interpret difficult history began to enter discussions in the field of public history in the early 1980s.<sup>139</sup>

In the mid-2010s, Stenton's staff started the Dinah Project to incorporate African American history in their site and to confront the disparities in the narrative being presented there. Dinah was an enslaved woman who worked for the Logans and was eventually freed by them, along with the other enslaved people who worked and lived at the Logan mansion. They were not previously discussed in the Stenton tours or literature. Management staff at Stenton worked to incorporate community voices into the interpretations being presented on African American history at the site through the hosting of community meetings. These meetings were open to the public and all were encouraged to attend. The staff hosted the open discussions and they took extensive notes to help them gain an understanding of how they could improve the interpretations they provided of this area of difficult history. 140 The project has been successfully executed and has continually expanded. This is evidenced in an informational brochure on the Dinah Memorial Project from 2021 that discusses the story of Dinah, along with the statement that she "asked for her and won her freedom in 1776, and decided to stay as a paid laborer." <sup>141</sup> She was also memorialized through a bronze plaque on the property in 1912 by the Colonial Dames who own and operate Stenton. The brochure also mentions that "through this project, we

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>139</sup> Suzanne B. Schell, "On Interpretation and Historic Sites," *The Journal of Museum Education*, 10, no.3 (1985): 8.

<sup>140</sup> Stenton, Community Meeting Flier, Philadelphia, PA: Stenton, 2019.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>141</sup> Stenton, Who Was Dinah? The Dinah Memorial Project. Philadelphia, PA: Stenton, n.d., acquired September 2021; "Dinah," Stenton.

hope to begin telling the stories of all of the people who lived and labored at Stenton, not just the Logan family," which shows the site's dedication to providing an inclusive narrative for guests.<sup>142</sup>

Stenton openly acknowledges the importance of discussing history in today's society in another brochure from 2021 that discusses the Dinah Memorial on the site. This brochure states that "Stenton is rich in early American stories told from the perspective of the family and community of servants—paid and enslaved—who lived and labored here. These stories reflect issues central to the development of the United States, still relevant today." While brief in information, the brochure still provides a thorough overview of the people who once lived on the property.

Further evidence of the changes at the site are found in a book written by Stenton's curator, Laura Keim, titled *Stenton: A Visitor's Guide to the Site, History and Collection*, which has a section that focuses on service. It reads: "At Stenton, there were enslaved Africans owned by the Logans as property." While there was not an extensive amount of information provided on slavery at Stenton or during the eighteenth century in the book, it is significant to recognize that the author explicitly described the enslaved Africans as property, rather than sugar coating or omitting the Logan family's ownership of slaves. As of 2022, the site has gone from minimal mention of enslaved people on the property to an entire memorial on-site, a section of the website dedicated to Dinah and the project, and interpretation on Dinah laced through the

-

Society of the Colonial Dames of America in the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, 2014, 33. This book is still published and sold on-site as of 2022.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>142</sup> Stenton, Who Was Dinah?

Stenton: A House of Learning, Past and Present, Philadelphia, PA: Great American Treasure, n.d., 1-2.
 Laura C. Keim, Stenton: A Visitor's Guide to the Site, History and Collections, Philadelphia, PA: The National

narrative on the on-site tour. Site staff have explicitly and transparently worked to provide an inclusive narrative of all who once lived at Stenton.<sup>145</sup>

The changes seen at Stenton in their interpretation of slavery from 2014 to 2022 correspond to the rise of the Black Lives Matter (BLM) movement, which was first established in 2013 to bring awareness to the discrimination and mistreatment of African Americans. As Stenton is located in a predominantly Black neighborhood, (41.4% of the population is Black, 39.3% is Caucasian, 7.4% is Asian, and 0.3% is American Indian or Alaska Native.), which has been greatly impacted by the BLM movement, this has resulted in the site feeling the need to involve their history in the site. Stenton presents the content of its history in an open and honest manner. Its staff has worked hard over recent years to tell more inclusive stories that represent all of the people who lived and worked on the property which is evident through their Dinah Project and the fundraising and publicizing of it.

Elfreth's Alley is another site that has had major changes over the years in the comprehensive nature of its interpretation. Although staff and volunteers have struggled to incorporate interpretations of difficult history into their written materials, the site's podcast has explored those topics with extensive episodes showcasing research on the gender and sexuality of the people who lived on the Alley in the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries.

1

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>145</sup> Stenton's website has an entire section dedicated to learning more about Dinah and the memorial project, see "Dinah," Stenton, accessed May 8, 2023, https://www.stenton.org/dinah.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>146</sup> Russell Rickford, "Black Lives Matter: Toward a Modern Practice of Mass Struggle," *New Labor Forum* 25, no. 1 (2016): 34–42.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>147</sup> "U.S. Census Bureau Quickfacts: Philadelphia City, Pennsylvania; United States," accessed March 26, 2023, https://www.census.gov/quickfacts/fact/table/philadelphiacitypennsylvania,US/PST045221; In Germantown, Pennsylvania in 2015, Lawanda Horton invited Black men and boys to write letters addressed to Trayvon Martin, who was killed by a Hispanic man in 2012. The letters were designed as an outlet for these men and boys to describe all of the times they had been racially profiled, how it made them feel, and the changes they would like to see in the system. See: Lara Witt, "Letters to Trayvon," *The Philadelphia Inquirer*, February 27, 2015, https://www.inquirer.com/phillu/news/2015227\_Letters\_to\_Trayvon.html.

In the Volunteer Manual from 2022, the brief history of the Alley that is given focuses more on the architecture and design of the homes rather than the people who lived there. The manual does provide information about the two women, Mary Smith and Sarah Melton, who lived in house 126 in the mid-1700s. In this house, Smith and Melton created their own business making mantuas, a type of gown, and other dresses. Because they were known for their work throughout Philadelphia, their business was successful, and they achieved an independent income allowing them to own and pay for the house as two single women. This is the only information the manual provides these two women; the rest of it moves on to discuss the Alley in the nineteenth century with a focus on architecture.

However, the first episode of Elfreth's Alley's podcast discusses Melton's and Smith's life together. Because both women were single, shared a bedroom, listed each other as the beneficiaries in their wills, and referred to each other as sisters-in-law despite sharing no relation, the podcast creators infer that there was some form of romantic relationship between them. hother reason to support this inference is that it would have been incredibly difficult financially for two women to afford living on their own in the mid-eighteenth century, and it was not socially acceptable to be living in a household that included no male family members. Even if the two women did not have a queer relationship, they still lived a nonnormative lifestyle in a time when doing so was not accepted, would have been heavily scrutinized, and could even involve the law. The second podcast episode begins with co-host Isabel Steven reading the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>148</sup> Elfreth's Alley Association, Volunteer Manual, (Philadelphia, PA: Elfreth's Alley Association, 2022), 8.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>149</sup> Elfreth's Alley Association, Volunteer Manual, 12.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>150</sup> Ted Maust and Isabel Steven, "Episode 1: The Dressmakers," June 24, 2020, The Alley Cast, 20:51, https://www.elfrethsalley.org/podcast/2020/6/23/episode-1-the-dressmakers.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>151</sup> Maust and Steven, "Episode 1: The Dressmakers."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>152</sup> Maust and Steven, "Episode 1: The Dressmakers."

names of 60 women who lived on Elfreth's Alley, and the years they lived there. Between 1790 and 1813, these 60 women were all listed as heads of households in the federal census records, and they account for about 20-30 percent of the street's residents within that period. Historians have argued that it is very odd for women to be listed as heads of households, own property, or maintain finances in this time period. Even though this appears to go against the social norms of the time, it seems that this may have been the norm for residents of the alley since households headed by women were relatively common during this 23-year period.

The creation of the podcast in the summer of 2020 resonated with events at that time which threatened members of the LGBTQIA+ community. In 2019, the Trump administration ruled that transgender people could no longer enlist in the U.S. military if they had or required a medical transition. <sup>154</sup> In June 2020, the Trump administration passed another regulation that removed protection for transgender patients who were receiving medical care. <sup>155</sup> Neither of these were received well by the LGBTQIA+ community and resulted in backlash against President Trump and his administration, as well as a resurgence in ally support for the LGBTQIA+ community. In the context of these events and the resulting voices demanding equality and representation for all, Elfreth's Alley staff and volunteers created their podcast. The site's interpreters also chose to discuss topics of difficult history in a format that is frequented by the younger generation.

11

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>153</sup> Ted Maust and Isabel Steven, "Episode 2: Spinsters, Runaway Wives, and Widows," July 1, 2020, *The Alley Cast*, 24:54, https://www.elfrethsalley.org/podcast/2020/7/1/episode-2-spinsters-runaway-wives-and-widows.
 <sup>154</sup> Brent Kendall and Nancy A. Youseff, "Supreme Court Allows Trump Administration to Implement Transgender Restrictions in Military," *The Wall Street Journal*, Dow Jones & Company, January 22, 2019, https://www.wsj.com/articles/supreme-court-allows-trump-restrictions-on-transgender-military-service-for-now-11548168481.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>155</sup> Stephanie Armour, "Trump Administration Issues Rule to Roll Back Transgender Protections in the Affordable Care Act," *The Wall Street Journal*, Dow Jones & Company, June 13, 2020, https://www.wsj.com/articles/trump-administration-issues-rule-to-roll-back-transgender-protections-in-the-affordable-care-act-11591992461.

While the podcast episodes discuss topics of difficult history, especially those pertaining to women and gender history, this media is different from other materials the site produces. None of the current publicity it distributes mentions these topics. Consequently, analyzing the site's interpretation of women and gender history is difficult as staff and volunteers of Elfreth's Alley discuss the topics appropriately and in-depth, but only in one medium.

## The Use of Inclusive Language

While content provides one way to measure the interpretation of difficult history at eighteenth-century sites, the language that interpretive materials use supplies another. Resources from the Daniel Boone Homestead demonstrate that the site has not kept current with social standards for inclusive language. The site's Docent Exhibition Script describes the enslaved women owned by the Boone family while living on the frontier as "likely assist[ing] Daniel's wife, Rebecca, in the family's tavern doing domestic chores such as cooking and cleaning." <sup>156</sup> It is unclear how many of the seven enslaved people the Boone family owned were women as sources do not discuss that information. On the frontier, it was likely that Rebecca was doing a lot of domestic work and the enslaved women were aiding her in these duties; however, it's interesting that this is the only information provided on the duties of the enslaved women. <sup>157</sup> There are no details on the enslaved men (if there were any) and their duties either. The script then goes on to say that Daniel Boone's descendants supported slavery until the Civil War ended but it does not mention that Daniel Boone himself was a slave owner or supporter. <sup>158</sup>

15

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>156</sup> Daniel Boone Homestead Staff, "Docent Exhibition Script," *Daniel Boone Homestead*, (August 25, 2012): 1-10, accessed September 2021.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>157</sup> Walsh, Margaret, "Women's Place on the American Frontier," *Journal of American Studies* 29, no. 2 (1995): 244.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>158</sup> Daniel Boone Homestead Staff, "Docent Exhibition Script."

The book titled *Daniel Boone Homestead: Pennsylvania Trail of History Guide Book* published in 2000 by the PHMC refers to Daniel Boone as a "pathfinder, defender, pioneer" but the book does not mention his role as a slave owner.<sup>159</sup> The three words used to describe Boone are meant to present him as a hero and a Westward expansion trailblazer as they all have positive connotations. By using language that emphasizes Boone's role as a hero and omitting references to his slaveholding or his interactions with Indigenous people, this guidebook struggles to provide a holistic, comprehensive interpretation of Boone. As the book was published in 2000, best practices in the field suggest the need to provide an updated edition with more inclusive interpretations of difficult history.

The Daniel Boone Homestead does provide docents with optional background information to aid in their interpretation during tours; however, the word choice is questionable. The authors of the informational packet claim that there is no evidence of Boone's family owning any enslaved people while they lived at the Homestead, but that Daniel Boone did "[acquire] several slaves" when he moved to Kentucky as an adult. This information is particularly interesting as it is the only information provided that states that Daniel Boone owned slaves. Not only is it an optional source for docents to read, but it also frames him as "acquiring" enslaved people, rather than buying him. This seems like the word choice used was an attempt to make the reality sound less harsh.

As these sources demonstrate, it is evident that the Daniel Boone Homestead has not had much change over time with regard to the language the site uses in written materials whether it is

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>159</sup> Sharon Hernes Silverman, *Daniel Boone Homestead: Pennsylvania Trail of History Guide*, (Mechanicsburg, PA: Stackpole Books, 2000).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>160</sup> Daniel Boone Homestead Staff, "Docent Information, Further Research," *Daniel Boone Homestead*, 1-8, accessed September 2021.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>161</sup> Daniel Boone Homestead Staff, "Docent Information, Further Research."

a book published by their owning institution, the PHMC, or docent scripts. While the site is not using entirely harmful language, it does create an interpretation of Boone that is incomplete.

Like the Homestead, Elfreth's Alley has also witnessed little change in the language it uses. A guidebook from 1942 describes the people who lived at Elfreth's Alley as "plain people" meaning that they were average folks who worked for a living to pay for their home and family. <sup>162</sup> In another guidebook published in 1964, the first page reads: "This is Elfreth's Alley, the only street in the city [Philadelphia] which has come down to us intact, and [is] still very much lived in by the same kinds of busy men and women whose daily lives centered around this narrow lane so long ago." <sup>163</sup> Within this guidebook, the house at 117 Elfreth's Alley is described as being rented from 1774 to 1783 by a "Negro tailor" named Cophey Douglas, his wife Phoebe, and their children. The guidebook was written in 1964, prior to the Civil Rights Act of 1968 when the use of "Negro" began to decline. <sup>164</sup>

Both language and focus changed by the time Maust and Steven published their first podcast episode in 2020. When they discuss the life that Sarah Melton and Mary Smith shared together in the late 1700s, they use the terminology of "female couples," "partners," "queer," and "heterosexual household" that we find appropriate today. While the first two episodes of the podcast explore the history of women, sexuality, and the politics of the patriarchy, the third episode takes us into gender with the "Public Universal Friend," a woman by birth who

\_

<sup>165</sup> Maust and Steven, Episode 1: The Dressmakers, June 24, 2020.

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>162</sup> Florence S. Nyce, *Yesterday in Elfreth's Alley*, 1942, Box 15, Folder 1, Series VIII: Sales and Promotion,
 Guidebooks, Elfreth's Alley Association Archives, Elfreth's Alley Association, Philadelphia, PA, March 7, 2022.
 <sup>163</sup> "Elfreth's Alley: A Residential Street Where People Have Lived in Harmony Since 1713," 1964, Box 15: Series
 VII: Sales and Promotion, Guidebooks, Promotional Materials, Folder 3: EAA: Sales and Promotion, Guidebooks,
 General Guide 1964, Item 1, Elfreth's Alley Archives, Philadelphia, Pennsylvania.

<sup>164</sup> Jim Crow Museum, "When Did the Word Negro Become Socially Unacceptable?" Ferris State University: Jim Crow Museum, October 2010. https://www.ferris.edu/HTMLS/news/jimcrow/question/2010/october.htm

transformed into what Steven describes as a "genderless spirit." <sup>166</sup> The Public Universal Friend (PUF) lived a nonbinary lifestyle as they did not use gendered pronouns, wore a mix of male and female clothing, and altered voice and linguistics. <sup>167</sup> Throughout the episode, the speakers address the Public Universal Friend as "PUF," "the Public Friend," "the Friend," or "the Comforter" to avoid using gendered pronouns. Although the identity of the PUF was never confirmed to be what we address today as "transgender" the podcasters infer that the PUF's identity is similar to those today who are transgendered. The speakers also use the currently accepted terminology of "transgender" throughout the episode.

While the current pamphlets and guidebooks for the Elfreth's Alley do not use terms like "negro," they do not include any discussion of African Americans, lesbians, or transgender people at all. However, the podcast does integrate the diverse people who lived on the Alley and uses the current, acceptable terms for addressing them. The site is clearly aware of societal norms and current terminology; best practices suggest that they incorporate this language throughout all of their materials and not just the podcast.

Both the Stenton mansion and the 1719 Hans Herr House have exhibited great changes when it comes to the language used in interpretation materials. In a "Facts about Stenton" paper that does not have a publication date, Dinah, who was a female slave owned by the Logan family, is described as "an old colored servant." Both the label of "servant" for an enslaved person and the use of "colored" instead of "African American" helps identify the source as being written in the early to mid-1900s. <sup>168</sup> In the 1982 Historic Structure Report for Stenton, the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>166</sup> Ted Maust and Isabel Steven, Episode 3: The Public Universal Friend in Philadelphia, *Elfreth's Alley*, Podcast Audio, July 8, 2020, https://www.elfrethsalley.org/podcast/2020/7/7/episode-3-the-public-universal-friend-in-philadelphia.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>167</sup> Maust and Steven, Episode 3: The Public Universal Friend in Philadelphia.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>168</sup> Stenton, "Facts about Stenton," Stenton, n.d.

enslaved people and the paid servants who worked at Stenton in the eighteenth century are repeatedly grouped together as "servants." The report also notes: "James Logan had a personal manservant, Sarah Logan owned a female slave, and both had a housekeeper, numerous other slaves, indentured servants, and retainers." The document demonstrates the plethora of workers, both paid and enslaved, that the Logans had working for them.

While historians now typically use "enslaved people" instead of "slaves," Stenton is keeping up with this language in later sources and the 1982 report did identify them as slaves who were owned as property and treated as such.<sup>171</sup> In a *Friends of Stenton* newsletter dispersed in fall of 2020 that includes an update of the Dinah Memorial Progress, an overview of her significance to Stenton is provided as: "a once enslaved and then free woman, who lived and labored at Stenton from the 1750s until her death in 1805, and who was memorialized in 1912 for saving Stenton from burning by the British in 1777."<sup>172</sup> As seen, the site used current correct language to identify Dinah as an "enslaved" woman versus a "slave." Through the sources analyzed, it is clear to see that much progress has been made over time in regard to the language used when discussing enslaved people at Stenton.

The 1719 Museum also has made significant strides in keeping up to date by using appropriate language in its interpretive materials, specifically when discussing Indigenous peoples. A 1970 brochure of the site describes the house as being "used as an early Mennonite meeting place," but there is no mention any of the nearby Indigenous groups that would have

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>169</sup> Engle, *Historic Structure Report*, 318.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>170</sup> Engle, *Historic Structure Report*, 318.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>171</sup> Vanessa M. Holder, "'I Was Born a Slave': Language, Sources, and Considering Descendant Communities," *Journal of the Early Republic* 43, no.1 (2023): 75-83.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>172</sup> Stenton Staff, Friends of Stenton: Newsletter and Appeal, Philadelphia, PA: Stenton, Fall 2020.

lived there at the same time as the Herr family.<sup>173</sup> In 1990, Steve Friesen briefly discusses positive interactions between white settlers and neighboring Conestoga Indians.<sup>174</sup> While his book mainly focuses on the Mennonites settling on the land and only briefly mentions the relationship between the Mennonites and the Conestogas, it highlights that the Conestogas were pleased with the immigrants as they "not only tolerated each other but cooperated."<sup>175</sup> Friesen elaborates that the Herrs had close contact with the Indigenous group and that on several occasions, members of the tribe stayed in the Herr's house during snow storms. Friesen refers to the Conestogas repeatedly as "Indians," a term that was accepted in 1990s, but is now less commonly used.

By 2021, the 1719 Museum had changed the language it used to refer to Indigenous people. A brochure of the site from 2021 mentions the reconstructed eastern woodlands

Longhouse that was built on the property in 2013 and describes it as "the kind of dwelling used by Native Americans before the arrival of Europeans." The 2022 brochure for the museum describes it as a place to "visit the home they [the Herrs] built in 1719 and learn about their life alongside their Indigenous neighbors." This brochure also describes the reconstructed Longhouse as "an Indigenous Longhouse reproduction" where visitors can "learn about the first people who lived on, farmed, and hunted this land." 178

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>173</sup> Lancaster Mennonite Conference Historical Society, *Visit the Historic Hans Herr House: Built in 1719*, Lancaster, PA: Lancaster Mennonite Conference Historical Society, 1970.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>174</sup> Steve Friesen, A Modest Mennonite Home: The Story of the 1719 Hans Herr House, An Early Colonial Landmark, Intercourse, PA: Good Books, 1990.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>175</sup> Friesen, A Modest Mennonite Home, p.38.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>176</sup> "1719 Hans Herr House Museum and Tours," 1719 Hans Herr House, 2019, accessed 2021.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>177</sup> Mennonite Life, 1719 Museum: Experience Early American Life. Lancaster, PA: Mennonite Life, 2022.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>178</sup> Mennonite Life, 1719 Museum: Experience Early American Life.

In terms of referring to Indigenous people, the preferred terminology is to use the tribes specific name such as the Conestogas; however "Indigenous people/tribes," and "Native Americans" are also widely accepted by the historian community and the Indigenous tribes themselves. The need to use the correct terminology when referring to Indigenous groups comes from the power behind who is deciding on the names used. 179 The preference to use specific names comes from the Indigenous tribes themselves—they have historically been referred to as "Native Americans" or "American Indians" which categorizes them as a singular racial group when there actually are over 500 distinct tribes in the United States. 180 The 1719 Museum has not used exact tribe names in their interpretations in recent years; however, this is due to the fact that they are not interpreting one specific tribe's history at their site, but rather a general overview of Indigenous life/history for eastern woodlands groups. The terminology used in these sources demonstrates the 1719 Museum's efforts to keep up with current language regarding Indigenous peoples, especially since the reconstruction of a Longhouse on its land.

#### Conclusion

All four of the eighteenth-century sites examined here have sought over the years to provide a more comprehensive narrative and to use inclusive language. The changes they made mirrored social movements that were happening simultaneously. While Elfreth's Alley and Stenton have made the most progress over time, the Daniel Boone Homestead and the 1719 Museum have still made notable changes to make their content and language more inclusive.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>179</sup> Nora Slonimsky, Jessica Choppin Roney, and Andrew Shankman, "Introduction: 'What's in a Name?'" *Journal of the Early Republic* 43, no. 1 (2023): 59-60.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>180</sup> Michael Yellow Bird, "What We Want to Be Called: Indigenous Peoples' Perspectives on Racial and Ethnic Identity Labels," *American Indian Quarterly* 23, no. 2 (1999): 3.

Although it is difficult to measure the direct impact of the American Indian Movement, the Civil Rights Act of 1968, the creation of the Black Lives Matter movement, and the movement for LGBTQIA+ rights, it is noteworthy that the big changes in the interpretations presented at the sites correspond with the years of these social changes.

# **Rubrics**

Table 8: Comprehensive Content—Stenton

	Excellent	Fair	Needs Work
Language within Written Materials & Website Information	Site uses inclusive and updated language within <i>all</i> written materials and website information.	Site uses some inclusive and updated language within <i>all</i> written materials and website information OR uses inclusive and updated language within <i>some</i> written materials and website information.	Site uses inclusive and updated language in little or none of their written materials or website information.
Content of All People that Once Lived at the Site	Site includes comprehensive and inclusive content of all of the people that once lived at the site.	Site includes some inclusive content of all of the people that once lived at the site.	Site includes only content of the white men that once lived at the site.
Difficult History Interpretation Change Over Time	Difficult history interpretation has changed over time and has kept up with societal progress.	Difficult history interpretation has changed over time, but has not changed as much as it could have.	Difficult history interpretation has changed very little or not at all over time.

Table 9: Comprehensive Content—Elfreth's Alley

	Excellent	Fair	Needs Work
Language within Written Materials & Website Information	Site uses inclusive and updated language within <i>all</i> written materials and website information.	Site uses some inclusive and updated language within <i>all</i> written materials and website information OR uses inclusive and updated language within <i>some</i> written materials and website information.	Site uses inclusive and updated language in little or none of their written materials or website information.
Content of All People that Once Lived at the Site	Site includes comprehensive and inclusive content of all of the people that once lived at the site.	Site includes some inclusive content of all of the people that once lived at the site.	Site includes only content of the white men that once lived at the site.
Difficult History Interpretation Change Over Time	Difficult history interpretation has changed over time and has kept up with societal progress.	Difficult history interpretation has changed over time, but has not changed as much as it could have.	Difficult history interpretation has changed very little or not at all over time.

Table 10: Comprehensive Content—1719 Museum

	Excellent	Fair	Needs Work
Language within Written Materials & Website Information	Site uses inclusive and updated language within <i>all</i> written materials and website information.	Site uses some inclusive and updated language within <i>all</i> written materials and website information OR uses inclusive and updated language within <i>some</i> written materials and website information.	Site uses inclusive and updated language in little or none of their written materials or website information.
Content of All People that Once Lived at the Site	Site includes comprehensive and inclusive content of all of the people that once lived at the site.	Site includes some inclusive content of all of the people that once lived at the site.	Site includes only content of the white men that once lived at the site.
Difficult History Interpretation Change Over Time	Difficult history interpretation has changed over time and has kept up with societal progress.	Difficult history interpretation has changed over time, but has not changed as much as it could have.	Difficult history interpretation has changed very little or not at all over time.

Table 11: Comprehensive Content—The Daniel Boone Homestead

	Excellent	Fair	Needs Work
Language within Written Materials & Website Information	Site uses inclusive and updated language within <i>all</i> written materials and website information.	Site uses some inclusive and updated language within <i>all</i> written materials and website information OR uses inclusive and updated language within <i>some</i> written materials and website information.	Site uses inclusive and updated language in little or none of their written materials or website information.
Content of All People that Once Lived at the Site	Site includes comprehensive and inclusive content of all of the people that once lived at the site.	Site includes some inclusive content of all of the people that once lived at the site.	Site includes only content of the white men that once lived at the site.
Difficult History Interpretation Change Over Time	Difficult history interpretation has changed over time and has kept up with societal progress.	Difficult history interpretation has changed over time, but has not changed as much as it could have.	Difficult history interpretation has changed very little or not at all over time.

### CHAPTER 3: COMMUNITY OUTREACH

"The visitor may come to the site for a great variety of reasons, but the goal is achieved when the visitor gains an understanding of the reasons [why] that historic site is important to the community, state, nation, world—and most of all to the visitor." 181

#### Introduction

In the quote above, William T. Alderson and Shirley Payne Low point to the significance of a reciprocal relationship between a historic site and its targeted community. A strong relationship between the site and its audience, whether physical or virtual, creates a stronger interpretation by including the voices of those in the community, frequent visitors, and descendants. Engagement allows people to feel that they play a part in history and creates a stronger bond to the people who lived in the physical house and at the location. A weaker relationship between a historic site and its targeted audience leaves visitors feeling unattached to the place and the stories being told. A lack of connection hinders the site from growing in a positive direction.

Furthermore, strong community engagement provides room for the site to introduce difficult history topics because there is a level of trust between the two groups. Without trust, the site and community will not be able to coexist in an effective manner. <sup>183</sup> The interactions between the site and its community set the basis for the relationship and help shape interpretation

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>181</sup> William T. Alderson and Shirley Payne Low, *Interpretation of Historic Sites* (Walnut Creek, CA: AltaMira Press, 1996), 5.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>182</sup> David W. Young, Stephen G. Hague, George W. McDaniel, and Sandra Smith, "Not Dead Yet: Historic Sites Providing Community Leadership," *History News* 64, no.3 (2009): 15.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>183</sup> David W. Young, et. al. "Not Dead Yet," 15.

and communication. Franklin Vagnone, Deborah Ryan, and Olivia Cothren identify "relationship-building and developing narratives with local communities" as one of the key benchmarks for maintaining the health of historic house museums. <sup>184</sup> A reciprocal relationship results in stronger and more effective interpretations.

Public historians also argue that, beyond building trust, historic sites have an obligation to their communities. Dolores Hayden writes that museums and historic sites "are challenged daily to become accountable to the diverse urban public, whose members are both taxpayers and potential audiences." Such arguments demonstrate the need for sites to involve their communities in the interpretations they present because they are interacting with a diverse range of visitors and have a responsibility to tell their stories.

With the telling of these stories comes the responsibility to go beyond presenting positive interpretations of the past; sites have an obligation to share the perspectives of those involved in topics of difficult history such as enslaved people. In 2019, James W. Loewen maintained that misinterpretations happen at historic sites across the U.S. because they want to share the positive aspects of the people who lived at their sites or events that happened there. By omitting the topics of difficult history, the sites are omitting narratives that members of the community can connect with. Loewen also argues that "what a community erects on its historical landscape not only sums up its view of the past but also influences its possible futures." <sup>186</sup> He argues for the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>184</sup> Franklin Vagnone, Deborah Ryan, and Olivia Cothren, "The Anarchist Guide to Historic House Museums: Evaluation Methodology for Historic House Museums," *The Public Historian* 37, no. 2 (2015): 102.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>185</sup> Dolores Hayden, *The Power of Place: Urban Landscapes as Public History* (Cambridge, MA: The MIT Press, 1995), 7.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>186</sup> James W. Loewen, *Lies Across America: What Our Historic Sites Get Wrong*, (New York, NY: The New Press 2019), 28.

importance of a site engaging its community in deciding which interpretations to present so that together they create a positive and lasting impact on visitors, as well as an ongoing relationship.

The focus of this chapter is on community outreach and the way it shapes the interpretations being presented at the four eighteenth-century Pennsylvania sites, especially regarding difficult history topics. Thomas Cauvin argues that the relationship between sites and their communities should be one of collaboration and that they should work as "partners to design richer interpretations of the past." He maintains that this relationship should be a core practice throughout the entire process of developing interpretations rather than one step in the process. Outreach is different from marketing, which here is defined as the services and opportunities a museum or historic site uses to attract *new* audiences. This chapter examines community outreach rather than community involvement, which is outside the scope of this thesis. Outreach relates specifically to the efforts of site administrators and employees to connect with their communities. 189

### **Defining Communities**

For the purpose of this thesis, *community* is defined as those who are influenced by and, in turn, affect the interpretation, growth, development, existence, and management of each site. This definition is derived from Tammy S. Gordon's use of the term community in which she defines it as those "with a heavy investment in the topic through descent or personal experience,

<sup>10&#</sup>x27;

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>187</sup> Thomas Cauvin, *Public History: A Textbook of Practice*. (New York, NY: Routledge, 2016), 205.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>188</sup> Timothy Ambrose and Crispin Paine, *Museum Basics: The International Handbook*, (London, UK: Routledge, 2018), 48-49.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>189</sup> Mary Ann Levine, Kelly M. Britt, and James A. Delle, "Heritage Tourism and Community Outreach: Public Archaeology at the Thaddeus Stevens and Lydia Hamilton Smith Site in Lancaster, Pennsylvania, USA," *International Journal of Heritage Studies* 11, no.5 (2005): 399-414.

[who] tell the history of their specific place or community from their own perspective."<sup>190</sup> Gordon uses this definition in her study of community-curated history; this thesis adopts her definition because she has conducted extensive research on the role of community-based identity for her study.

Stakeholders are those who have a particular interest or stake in the site. In this case, stakeholders will be used interchangeably with the term community as both can be described as having interests in historic sites. Other types of stakeholders are staff members, board members, volunteers, etc. Stakeholders are important relationships for the health of historic sites as the purpose of these relationships is to create museums as "sustainable, high-performance [organizations]" that are attentive to the requests of the community. 191

Each of the communities discussed in this chapter have different interests in the four sites examined here. The four types of communities as stakeholders identified in this research are those who live within the geographic location; tourists; those interested because of genealogical, religious, and ethnic connections; and educators.

The first set of stakeholders are those who are neighbors to or are living close to the historic site. These people may feel a personal investment in the site because it is in their physical community. Likewise, those managing the site may or should feel a responsibility to the neighborhood and choose to include their opinions and suggestions when curating new exhibits and providing interpretations. <sup>192</sup> These stakeholders are important to include in decision-making

<sup>191</sup> Pamela Sloan, "Redefining Stakeholder Engagement: From Control to Collaboration," *Journal of Corporate Citizenship*, no. 36 (2009): 26.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>190</sup> Tammy S. Gordon, *Private History in Public: Exhibition and the Settings of Everyday Life* (Lanham, MD: AltaMira Press, 2010), 11.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>192</sup> Sandra Bruku, "Community Engagement in Historical Site Protection: Lessons from the Elmina Castle Project in Ghana," *Conservation and Management of Archaeological Sites* 17, no. 1 (2015): 67-76.

because the site affects their physical community and can represent what they stand for, events they can attend, and how the stories of their neighborhood are presented and discussed. The local community also holds a very important relationship with the site and can either help promote it or prevent it from being successful. Fostering a strong relationship with the people in its geographical location can be essential for a site's survival. Tourists are a second type of community. This group of stakeholders are those who visit the site, physically or virtually. They typically have an interest in the history being presented at the site, whether it is specific to the place, the people who lived there, the time period it represents, or events that occurred there. Tourists are an important group of stakeholders for any historic site; however, some sites rely more heavily on them than others depending on the type of history they are presenting. <sup>193</sup> A site like Elfreth's Alley, for example, relies more on tourism because it is in the heart of Philadelphia, just a short walk from many other well-known historic sites and museums. Its interpretation of early American history fits well with the emphasis that many tourists may want to learn about.

Heritage shapes the interests of a third community of stakeholders who are connected to a site because of a cultural or family connection to the stories it tells. There are three types of heritage such communities can represent: genealogical, religious, or ethnic. In the first case, people who have traced their ancestors to those who lived at the site have a genealogical connection. They have a stake in understanding the stories of specific people from the past. The second factor is religion, which focuses on those who identify with a site based on their religious

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>193</sup> Melanie K. Smith, *Cultural Tourism in a Changing World: Politics, Participation and Re(presentation)*, Mike Robinson, ed., (Clevedon, UK: Channel View Publications 2010), 89-91, 94-95. The sixth chapter in this book focuses on community participation and empowerment through tourism. This chapter argues that the tourist community must be part of the process in order to reach the end-goal of the site, location, etc.

beliefs. In the third case, ethnic or cultural groups, such as Indigenous people who have a long history in the region, have a stake in the stories told at historic sites. This three-part community connected through heritage plays an important role in the success of a site. Patrons who belong to this group often feel a deep level of devotion to the site and ownership of the stories it tells, which makes them an important group for a site to engage with when making interpretative decisions. <sup>194</sup>

Finally, a fourth community is educators and teachers who have an investment in historic sites as places of education that can be incorporated into lessons and the learning process. This community holds an important place in historic sites' relationships because teachers, schools, school district boards, and states (through their standards), have specific guidelines about what and how students learn. Teachers want to connect what their students are learning in their classroom with historic sites to encourage students to make personal connections with the past. However, teachers can only do so if a site is providing interpretations that meet appropriate standards. <sup>195</sup> Integrating community voices, such as those of educators, into the interpretations of a historic site is an important way to ensure visitors' learning.

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>194</sup> Terry G. Wiley, *Handbook of Heritage, Community, and Native American Languages in the United States: Research, Policy, and Educational Practice*, (New York, NY: Routledge, 2014). This source focuses on Native American communities and how historians can move forward to discuss their history more accurately and respectfully, as well as how to incorporate the Indigenous peoples in the process.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>195</sup> Christine Baron, Sherri Sklarwitz, Hyeyoung Bang, and Hanahi Shatara, "What Teachers Retain from Historic Site-Based Professional Development," *Journal of Teacher Education* 71, no.4 (2019): 392-408. This article looks at stress the importance of teachers obtaining education and materials from historic sites to use in their classrooms. While it is not specific to class field trips to the site, it does support the argument that educators have a stake in the educational implementation at historic sites.

#### **Site Outreach to Respective Communities**

Historic sites should include the interpretation of difficult history topics into the narrative presented and work to cultivate a relationship with their respective communities. Representing stakeholders in the narrative can have a lasting impact on the people who relate to the topics of difficult history. Brent Leggs argues that the "preservation of African American historic sites can also empower Black youth, and all Americans, through the intersection of heritage conservation with culture, social justice, and entrepreneurship." While Legg's argument specifically discusses the impact of including African American history in site interpretation, it highlights the power a site holds to influence its community, and one of the reasons that these voices should be included in the site.

### Geographic Location/Neighbors

Stenton has a very strong relationship with its community which is focused on those living primarily within Germantown, the neighborhood outside of center city Philadelphia where it is located. The Dinah Memorial project and its inclusion in the site's narrative provides an excellent example of community outreach. The area surrounding Stenton was once predominantly white and has changed substantially over the years to a now predominantly African American neighborhood. The site is also removed from other colonial houses in Philadelphia, so it does not have the same support system in terms of tourism. Because of this, in the early 2000s, Stenton administrators began inviting their local community to participate in designing their exhibitions and helping update their interpretations to provide a more inclusive

10

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>196</sup> Brent Leggs, "Growth of Historic Sites: Teaching Public Historians to Advance Preservation Practice," *The Public Historian* 40, no. 3 (2018): 93.

historical approach. <sup>197</sup> This involved telling the history of African Americans who once lived at the site. The most notable example was an enslaved woman named Dinah, who was owned and eventually freed by the Logan family. Her name is now mentioned continually throughout Stenton's website, pamphlets, and tour materials. The Dinah Memorial Project first began as a local attempt to address the racial disparities in America's society and the absence of memorials to enslaved African Americans. <sup>198</sup> The project eventually expanded into a collaboration between the Stenton site's management and its neighbors to provide an inclusive narrative that highlights the history of the African American community. Stenton's outreach and relationship with its neighbors are demonstrated by the many newsletters, fliers, events, lectures, and social media posts that the site produces to communicate both physically and virtually with its community.

Stenton's outreach to the local community begins by educating neighbors about the stories of the people who lived at Stenton—stories that have not previously been told. One of the site's fliers, which was provided to the public throughout 2020 and 2021, is titled "The Dinah Memorial Project: Who Was Dinah?" It includes a detailed description of who Dinah was, her significance to the Logan family and the Stenton mansion, and the purpose of the Dinah Memorial Project. 199 Part of the memorial is a plaque for Dinah which was created by the Library Company of Philadelphia, that pays tribute to how she, a "faithful colored caretaker of Stenton", saved it from being burned by British soldiers in 1777. 200 The memorial is an

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>197</sup> "Dinah," Stenton, accessed May 8, 2023, https://www.stenton.org/dinah.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>198</sup> "Dinah," Stenton.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>199</sup> Stenton, Who Was Dinah? The Dinah Memorial Project, (Philadelphia, PA: Stenton, n.d).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>200</sup> "Memorial Plans," Stenton, accessed July 13, 2023,

https://www.stenton.org/\_files/ugd/29e2a6\_185a275a412149dea7dfc7e6708f7639.pdf.

important part of the narrative presented at Stenton and the brochure discussing it shows how the site seeks to include the interpretation of difficult history topics in the stories they tell.<sup>201</sup>

Stenton also invites active participation in tackling the erasure of difficult history which is seen through a flier titled "Address the Absence of Memorials to Millions of Enslaved Africans & African Americans Whose Contributions to Our History Remain Ignored or Silenced in Public Spaces" which explicitly addresses the issue of difficult history. Site managers invited the community to participate in the discussion by attending an event with Karyn Olivier, a local artist that won the community's competition to create the new Dinah memorial. Neighbors had the chance to address missing pieces of history by discussing her plans for the memorial.<sup>202</sup> In addition to lending their voices to the project, Stenton asked them to contribute financially. The flier was also created to encourage the public to donate money to the Dinah Memorial Project. As the title suggests when referring to "our history," the site is trying to reach those within the African American community to encourage their support and participation in the project. The invitation for neighbors to participate in a conversation and invest money via donations in the memorial allowed for participants to become literal stakeholders at a very personal level furthering the local community's investment in the site. Although the flier does not mention the meaning behind "[addressing] the absences of memorials to enslaved Africans...", it is likely that this was discussed at the event itself. <sup>203</sup> Through this outreach event, the Stenton staff were actively engaging the people in their neighborhood and asking them to participate directly in the interpretation of the site and the difficult past it encompasses.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>201</sup> "Dinah," Stenton; Stenton, Social Media Post on Facebook Official Page, September 30, 2022.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>202</sup> Stenton, "Address the Absence of Memorials to Millions of Enslaved Africans & African Americans Whose Contributions to Our History Remain Ignored or Silenced in Public Spaces," Philadelphia, PA: Stenton, Acquired Fall 2021.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>203</sup> Stenton, "Address the Absence of Memorials."

Furthermore, Stenton has an ongoing, continuous relationship with its local community. Site staff have developed a newsletter, titled "Friends of Stenton," that is free to the public and provides updates on the site, upcoming events, and how the community can get involved. The fall 2020 issue of the newsletter provided an update on the Dinah Memorial.<sup>204</sup> The newsletter demonstrates a regular method of communication from Stenton to its community.

Stenton is also working to incorporate its local community in interpreting difficult history through social media. A post on Stenton's official Facebook page posted on September 30, 2022 begins with: "Last night was a true testament to the power of community, collective work, and hyperlocal history." The post details the Nicetown-Tioga Community's (Stenton's immediate neighborhood) fight to commemorate Dinah's legacy, and how their efforts have come to fruition with a mural of Dinah provided by Mural Arts Philadelphia. The post continues: "In a time when museums across the country are reckoning with their duty to not only tell broader stories, but also engage the community, Thursday's event was a testament to the strides being made here at Stenton." This post encapsulates the efforts being made at Stenton to include difficult history topics in their narrative and to illuminate African American history through the incorporation of community voices and desires.

Stenton clearly has a strong relationship with its geographic community—its neighbors. The site's staff and management have integrated local stakeholders in the interpretive process of telling Dinah's story and in creating the memorial to her. They are continually working to foster and grow that relationship and to incorporate community voices into the interpretations whenever possible.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>204</sup> Stenton, Friends of Stenton Newsletter and Appeal, (Philadelphia, PA: Stenton, Fall 2020).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>205</sup> Stenton, Facebook Post, September 30, 2022.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>206</sup> Stenton, Facebook Post.

The Daniel Boone Homestead also has a relatively strong connection with its local community. Their eNewsletter is the most updated and frequent mode of communication between the site and its community. Titled *Homestead Happenings*, this eNewsletter is sent out on a quarterly basis to those on the distribution list and helps to keep the virtual community up to date on events at the Homestead. The summer 2022 issue included an invitation to a local event called Heritage Wool and Textile Day, a Trails of History run to fundraise for the Homestead, advertisements for community cleanup days at the site, and an opening for a student volunteer position. The site is working to involve the community through local events, fundraising efforts, and even the maintenance of the site. However, there is not any evidence that shows engagement with difficult history topics. Although the Homestead has a strong outreach to its community, its staff are not necessarily involving the community in their interpretive decisions.

Elfreth's Alley is another site that has engaged with its local geographic community to interpret topics of difficult history. In 2020, Ted Maust, the director of Elfreth's Alley, and several graduate students from Temple University worked together to create a podcast discussing the unique history of the site as a way to include community voices during the COVID-19 pandemic when in-person interactions were limited. <sup>208</sup> The efforts to work with Temple University, a college located in Philadelphia near Elfreth's Alley, demonstrates how the site is both collaborating with its community to create interpretation and working to reach their stakeholders via safe methods of interaction. Elfreth's Alley has a strong relationship with its neighbors, and its staff are able to work together to present topics of difficult history at the site.

2

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>207</sup> The Daniel Boone Homestead, "Homestead Happenings," eNewsletter, May 1, 2021.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>208</sup> "Owls Join Forces to Tell the Story of Philly's Famed Elfreth's Alley," Temple Now, April 26, 2021, https://news.temple.edu/news/2021-04-26/owls-join-forces-tell-story-philly-s-famed-elfreth-s-alley.

#### **Tourists**

While both Elfreth's Alley and the Daniel Boone Homestead engage their local neighbors at their sites, tourists are their primary communities. Elfreth's Alley has a fairly strong relationship with this set of stakeholders. Site managers focus on reaching tourists who are interested in colonial history and those who visit the site repeatedly, either physically during events to view new exhibits, or virtually through the podcast or blog. As Elfreth's Alley is situated right in the heart of Philadelphia just a short walk from Independence Hall, the National Constitution Center, Benjamin Franklin's gravesite, and Betsy Ross' house, there are many tourists within the area daily who are looking to explore more sites of colonial history. The site has a blog, podcast, and onsite archives for curious visitors to explore and return to in order to continue learning about Elfreth's Alley and its colonial inhabitants.<sup>209</sup> The blog and podcast show a connection to the younger generation and how the site is moving towards providing information using new technologies.

Elfreth's Alley also provides visitors with useful information regarding their visit to Philadelphia in addition to educating them about the people who lived on the alley. Materials provided, such as guidebooks, include stories about previous residents who lived on the alley from the 1700s to the 1900s, as well as advertisements for local vendors, restaurants, and upcoming living history events. <sup>210</sup> One of these living history events is the site's Annual Fete Day. It is hosted on the first Saturday of June and is described as a "family festival celebrating Elfreth's Alley, including tours of private homes and gardens, living history demonstrations and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>209</sup> Elfreth's Alley Museum, accessed May 9, 2023, https://www.elfrethsalley.org/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>210</sup> "Elfreth's Alley: A Guidebook to Our Nation's Oldest Residential Street," 2010, Collection Box: Ephemera, Folder 15, Item 1, Elfreth's Alley Archive, Philadelphia, PA; "Inside These Doors: A Historic Guidebook of the Home of Elfreth's Alley: A National Historic Landmark," 2004, Collection Box: Ephemera, Folder 17, Item 1, Elfreth's Alley Archives, Philadelphia, PA.

hands-on history activities."<sup>211</sup> Fete Day allows tourists to pay a fee and enter the private homes of families on the alley to view the inside of the historic buildings. Annual Fete Day is a fundraiser for the alley and allows the community into the history of the site on a deeper level. Visitors are provided with guidebooks that tell a short history of each of the houses in the alley for them to review as they visit each one.<sup>212</sup> While all are invited to attend such events, they are typically attended by repeat tourist visitors and those who are participating in the events (such as the vendors and living history re-enactors).

Elfreth's Alley uses its website and blog posts as its primary point of community engagement. This is where the staff post the most up-to-date information regarding the site, fundraising efforts, volunteer and paid position openings, new information discovered about previous residents, or architectural findings. <sup>213</sup> Clearly visitors return to the website and its blog posts regularly. For visitors who want to deepen their knowledge, Elfreth's Alley's podcast expands with stories about the new information interpreters discover. However, the podcast is not updated as frequently as the blog site since the podcast was created three years ago in the midst of the pandemic and there are fewer than 20 full episodes. The podcast discusses many topics of difficult history including lesbians and transgender people who once lived on the Alley. <sup>214</sup> Nevertheless, volunteers continue to engage the public about the stories they told in the podcasts. Isabel Steven, one of the contributors to the podcast, wrote a blog post in which she issues an apology for the language she used in the third episode regarding the Public Universal

2

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>211</sup> "Elfreth's Alley: Located Between First and Second Streets, North of Arch Street," 1950, Collection Box: Ephemera, Folder #13, Item 4, Elfreth's Alley Archive, Philadelphia, PA; "Elfreth's Alley: A Guidebook to Our Nation's Oldest Residential Street," 2010.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>212</sup> "Elfreth's Alley: A Guidebook to Our Nation's Oldest Residential Street," 2010.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>213</sup> Elfreth's Alley Museum and Elfreth's Alley, "Blog," *Elfreth's Alley Museum*, August 5, 2022, https://www.eflrethsalley.org/blog.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>214</sup> "The Alley Cast," Elfreth's Alley Museum, accessed January 3, 2023, https://www.elfrethsalley.org/thealleycast.

Friend. As she notes, she used the PUF's deadname and described the PUF as "born a woman." Members of the audience did not receive her language well as listeners provided their constructive feedback to the site. Steven took this as a learning opportunity and issued an apology to anyone she may have offended or hurt. Elfreth's Alley is working to reach its community in a twenty-first century method while touching on topics of difficult history and listening to the community's feedback on how the site is interpreting those topics.

The Daniel Boone Homestead also focuses primarily on tourists as its primary community outreach stakeholders. Recently, staff have been working to create a positive relationship with tourists through their participation in the Pennsylvania Trails of History historic trail guide. The guide is published by the Pennsylvania Historical and Museum Commission and provides a list of "special-interest trails leading to some of Pennsylvania's most historic sites."<sup>216</sup> The trail invites guests from anywhere to travel to the sites and gather as much Pennsylvania history as possible. This encourages the tourists and the local community to visit the Homestead. In 2021, when I visited sites from the trail including the Daniel Boone Homestead, the Conrad Weiser Homestead, Hope Lodge, and Ephrata Cloister, I encountered many tourists who were taking time to visit each site listed on the trail. Some of them had been to several of the sites multiple times to see what had changed or to view new exhibits.<sup>217</sup> For the Daniel Boone

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>215</sup> Elfreth's Alley Museum, "A Commentary on Episode 3 of the Alley Cast," Elfreth's Alley Museum, December 31, 2020, https://www.elfrethsalley.org/blog/2020/7/28/a-commentary-on-episode-3-of-the-alley-cast.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>216</sup> Pennsylvania Historical and Museum Commission, "Pennsylvania Trails of History," *Pennsylvania Historical and Museum Commission*, October 216, acquired fall 2021. Although this pamphlet is from 2016, the Pennsylvania Trails of History has existed at least since 2013 as the state's site "Visit PA" posted an article regarding the trail in February 2013; see: "Pennsylvania's Trails of History," VisitPA, February 29, 2013, https://www.visitpa.com/article/pennsylvanias-trails-history.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>217</sup> Conversations with Visitors, Daniel Boone Homestead, October 2, 2021, Conversations with Visitors, Conrad Weiser Homestead, October 3, 2021. Conversations with Visitors, Ephrata Cloister, September 30, 2021. Conversations with Visitors, Hope Lodge, October 3, 2021.

Homestead, tourism plays an important role and the staff seek to foster a strong ongoing relationship with its community of tourists.

Heritage: Genealogy/Religion

Although outreach to new visitors such as tourists is imperative for any historic site, the prolonged relationship with those who have heritage ties to the site can also have an impact on the interpretations presented. The 1719 Museum demonstrates this by having a strong relationship with part of its community. This site focuses on reaching those who have personal ties to the history of the site, whether it is through genealogical ties to the family who lived there, religious ties to Mennonite history, or Indigenous ancestry ties to the Conestogas or other local Native Americans. The outreach to the site's community is evident by the newsletters provided both by the site and its institution, Mennonite Life, the events held on-site for local communities, encouragement of school field trips, and involvement with the institution's archives, visitor center, and museum. <sup>218</sup> The 1719 Museum also has strong ties in the community to Mennonite descendants which aids in its outreach.

One way that the 1719 Museum reaches this community is through a quarterly newsletter, titled *The Mirror*, which is only available to those who subscribe to it through becoming a member of Mennonite Life. The membership includes subscriptions to the institution's quarterly magazine as well as the newsletter, members-only access to research materials and the archives, and other exclusive benefits. <sup>219</sup> The existence of this membership indicates an insider community as only those who are members have access to certain information and parts of Mennonite Life

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>218</sup> Mennonite Life, 1719 Museum: Experience Early American Life (Lancaster, PA: Mennonite Life, 2022); The Lancaster Mennonite Historical Society, "The Mirror," Vol. 53, No. 2, June 2021, acquired Fall 2021.

219 "Become A Member," Mennonite Life, October 17, 2022, https://mennonitelife.org/get-incolved/become-a-

member/.

including records and archives. The relationship between the site and its community is a unique one as part of the community is paying to be included. Although Mennonite Life does offer membership opportunities, people can still gain access to some of the materials without being a member. The quarterly newsletter is also accessible to anyone who visits Mennonite Life's sites as they are available for free at the welcome desks at the Historical Society, the Lancaster Mennonite Historical Society Museum, and the 1719 Museum. The newsletters provide updates from the Historical Society and the 1719 Museum, as well as job postings, memorial announcements, and upcoming community events which are beneficial for both members and non-members to know about. <sup>220</sup> Including memorial announcements of previous staff and members, and other community events illustrates the closeness of the site to its community and indicates that they likely know each other or know each other's families/histories.

Furthermore, the 1719 Museum also maintains regular communication with its members and subscription list through its own quarterly newsletter. This newsletter, titled *The Central Hearth*, is provided directly by the 1719 Museum (as opposed to *The Mirror* which is provided by Mennonite Life, the institution that operates the museum). This newsletter provides updates and information solely about the Herr House which targets descendants who have a personal interest in the site.<sup>221</sup> Within this newsletter are progress updates about ongoing research projects with the 1719 Museum, one of which is a partnership with Millersville University for an archaeology dig that happened at the site in 2020 and updates on the categorizing of the collection of artifacts discovered which can be traced back to the Susquehannock, Pequea, and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>220</sup> "The Mirror," *Mennonite Life*, Lancaster, PA, vol. 54, no. 1, March 2022.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>221</sup> The 1719 Hans Herr House, "The Central Hearth: A Quarterly Newsletter of the 1719 Herr House," *1719 Herr House & Museum*, Willow Street, PA, Summer 2021.

Shenks Ferry tribes within the region.<sup>222</sup> Both the project and the ongoing updates demonstrate a prolonged relationship with the museum's heritage community, in contrast to tourists, who would typically not keep up with quarterly updates regarding research on historic sites.

Another way the 1719 Museum interacts with its heritage community is through events. A flier for the event of the Maize and Snitz Market Fair in October 2021 notes that the event provides a chance for those interested in the history of the site (such as those with genealogical or heritage connections to Mennonites or Indigenous people) to "immerse [themselves] in the cultures of early European and indigenous people of Lancaster County."223 Vendors in attendance to the event in fall 2021 were local artisans, bakers, crafters, and more. The local community was invited to attend, and it was heavily attended by people of all ages, gender, races, and ethnicities. Although the local community was encouraged to attend, the targeted community was those with heritage ties to the site. At the event was an Indigenous interpreter with artifacts who provided information on local Indigenous groups' history, music, rituals, and cuisine. Other people descended from Eastern Woodland Indian groups attended the event to provide more background and context to those in attendance, including members of the historical society who wanted to learn more regarding the history of Indigenous groups and why the site decided to add a longhouse on the property. 224 The Maize and Snitz Market Fair shows how the site is working to engage multiple ethnic and religious groups and to actively include Indigenous people to educate visitors and clarify any questions they may have. By bringing together multiple heritage groups on the site, the event created an open environment for discussion.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>222</sup> The 1719 Hans Herr House, "The Central Hearth."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>223</sup> The 1719 Hans Herr House, *Maize & Snitz Market Fair*, Willow Street, PA: The 1719 Hans Herr House, Fall 2021.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>224</sup> Cassidy Michonski, in attendance of the Maize & Snitz Event, The 1719 Hans Herr House, October 2, 2021.

The newsletters and fliers provided by either the 1719 Museum or Mennonite Life show repetitive communication with their Mennonite and genealogically interested community about events, news, and updates happening within the organization and historic site. This allows for open communication between the site and its community regarding topics of difficult history including the interpretation of local Indigenous groups' history. It also provides evidence of a long-term relationship between the organization and the descendants of the Herr family and Mennonite practitioners, however, there seems to be a lack of regular communication with local Indigenous groups.

#### Education

Of the four sites studied here, the 1719 Museum is the one with the strongest community engagement with educators, which is evidenced by their teacher educational resources. I have seen their outreach to the educational community firsthand as the previous administrator for the site, Tiffany Fisk, reached out to me in fall 2021 to design a new field trip curriculum for the site. The 1719 Museum was already offering field trips, but they consisted of an average visitor tour with no educational activities or the incorporation of learning objectives and state standards. I worked with Fisk over a three-month period to develop a curriculum aligned to Pennsylvania state standards for grades one through eight. This curriculum was centered around the three main themes of the 1719 Museum site which are immigration, cultural relations, and economics/agriculture. The materials created include lesson plans, docent scripts, on-site activities, and pre- and post-field trip worksheets. The field trip curriculum and all materials were closely reviewed by Fisk to ensure alignment with the site objectives and themes. 225 The

2

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>225</sup> Cassidy Michonski, *1719 Museum Educational Materials*, (Willow Street, PA: 1719 Museum, 2022); Tiffany Fisk, Email Message to Author, March 3, 2022.

site's staff is dedicated to working with and reaching out to their second community which is educators. Although the new curriculum has only been implemented for just over a year, the site's commitment to reaching this community will hopefully lead to a long-lasting and flourishing relationship.

#### **Conclusion**

Each of the sites studied here demonstrate active outreach with their respective communities, although some are more successful in engaging their communities with difficult history. The sites of Stenton, Elfreth's Alley, and the 1719 Museum all have very strong relationships with their communities and have multiple sources that show the inclusion of community voices when deciding on interpretations of difficult history. Stenton's Dinah Memorial Project and the community's active engagement with it prove to show an open and ongoing relationship between the two entities. Elfreth's Alley's strong relationship with tourists and local university students demonstrates multiple efforts conducted by the site to provide their targeted audiences with difficult history interpretations. These same efforts are seen with the 1719 Museum and its communities of educators and those with heritage ties. Lastly, the Daniel Boone Homestead does have a fairly strong relationship with its community, however, there is no evidence to show that the community has any role in deciding what subjects are portrayed at the site. Of the historic sites examined, those that have a stronger relationship with their communities are Stenton, Elfreth's Alley, and the 1719 Museum. The Daniel Boone Homestead seems to be the outlier here due to the lack of support and involvement from the parent institution. As the Pennsylvania Historical and Museum Commission operates many other historic sites and museums, it is apparent that they are not able give as much focus to the Daniel

Boone site as the other home institutions are able to provide for their sites. This results in the lack of resources and funds available for the Homestead to interact with and involve their communities in interpretive decisions.

As David W. Young, Stephen G. Hague, George W. McDaniel, and Sandra Smith claim, historic houses are "places where profound personal connections to history" can be made and "they [historic houses] are carriers of great stories that show people the meaning of where they live" which helps to promote positive relationships between the two groups of historic sites and their respective communities. <sup>226</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>226</sup> David W. Young, et. al., "Not Dead Yet", 15.

# Rubrics

Table 12: Community Outreach—Stenton

	Excellent	Fair	Needs Work
Site Outreach to their Respective Community	Site actively reaches out to the community to participate in site activities, fundraisers, etc., and is open to suggestions from the public.	Site somewhat invites the community to participate in site activities, fundraisers, and is sometimes open to suggestions from the public.	Site does not invite the community to participate in site activities, fundraisers, and is not open to suggestions from the public.
Status of Relationship Between Site and the Community	The relationship between the site and the community is a positive one.	The relationship between the site and the community is a somewhat positive one.	The relationship between the site and the community is either a negative one or does not exist.
Inclusivity Within Site to Community Communications	The communications between the site and community are inclusive of the history and welcoming to all people.	The communications between the site and community are somewhat inclusive of the history and are generally welcoming.	The communications between the site and the community are not inclusive of the history and/or are not welcoming.

Table 13: Community Outreach—1719 Museum

	Excellent	Fair	Needs Work
Site Outreach to their Respective Community	Site actively reaches out to the community to participate in site activities, fundraisers, etc., and is open to suggestions from the public.	Site somewhat invites the community to participate in site activities, fundraisers, and is sometimes open to suggestions from the public.	Site does not invite the community to participate in site activities, fundraisers, and is not open to suggestions from the public.
Status of Relationship Between Site and the Community	The relationship between the site and the community is a positive one.	The relationship between the site and the community is a somewhat positive one.	The relationship between the site and the community is either a negative one or does not exist.
Inclusivity Within Site to Community Communications	The communications between the site and community are inclusive of the history and welcoming to all people.	The communications between the site and community are somewhat inclusive of the history and are generally welcoming.	The communications between the site and the community are not inclusive of the history and/or are not welcoming.

Table 14: Community Outreach—The Daniel Boone Homestead

	Excellent	Fair	Needs Work
Site Outreach to their Respective Community	Site actively reaches out to the community to participate in site activities, fundraisers, etc., and is open to suggestions from the public.	Site somewhat invites the community to participate in site activities, fundraisers, and is sometimes open to suggestions from the public.	Site does not invite the community to participate in site activities, fundraisers, and is not open to suggestions from the public.
Status of Relationship Between Site and the Community	The relationship between the site and the community is a positive one.	The relationship between the site and the community is a somewhat positive one.	The relationship between the site and the community is either a negative one or does not exist.
Inclusivity Within Site to Community Communications	The communications between the site and community are inclusive of the history and welcoming to all people.	The communications between the site and community are somewhat inclusive of the history and are generally welcoming.	The communications between the site and the community are not inclusive of the history and/or are not welcoming.

Table 15: Community Outreach—Elfreth's Alley

	Excellent	Fair	Needs Work
Site Outreach to their Respective Community	Site actively reaches out to the community to participate in site activities, fundraisers, etc., and is open to suggestions from the public.	Site somewhat invites the community to participate in site activities, fundraisers, and is sometimes open to suggestions from the public.	Site does not invite the community to participate in site activities, fundraisers, and is not open to suggestions from the public.
Status of Relationship Between Site and the Community	The relationship between the site and the community is a positive one.	The relationship between the site and the community is a somewhat positive one.	The relationship between the site and the community is either a negative one or does not exist.
Inclusivity Within Site to Community Communications	The communications between the site and community are inclusive of the history and welcoming to all people.	The communications between the site and community are somewhat inclusive of the history and are generally welcoming.	The communications between the site and the community are not inclusive of the history and/or are not welcoming.

### **CONCLUSION**

Analysis of materials from each site demonstrates that these four sites—the Daniel Boone Homestead, Elfreth's Alley, Stenton, and the 1719 Museum—have changed their overall interpretations of difficult history over time in accordance with social changes, the development of history as a profession, and community voices. The adjustments they have made, some minor and some more significant, and the intentions behind them, have largely been positive.

This study evaluated each site's institutional investment and staff training, content of interpretive materials, and community outreach. Institutional investment and staff training have shown different levels of change over time regarding support for interpreting difficult history. Institutional investment was determined by the extent to which the site's owning and operating institution is involved in the interpretations presented. Staff and volunteer training efforts were evaluated through the training materials used at each site and how well they incorporated interpretations of difficult history. The 1719 Museum and Stenton witnessed the most improvement in this category. In 2022, the 1719 Museum was rebranded and updated its Docent Interpretive Guide from 2017 which included more detailed background information for docents to aid in the interpretations they present to visitors. Stenton's interpretive guide for docents was last updated in 2003 but it still holds accurate and fairly comprehensive information regarding the history of the site. Stenton has also embedded videos in its website for docents to use until the staff can update the interpretive guide again. The Daniel Boone Homestead does provide training materials for its staff and docents, although they have not been updated since 2012. Additionally, they do not provide entirely accurate information as they omit key details about Boone's slave ownership. Each of these site's does have a very active and involved

administrative and operating institution; however, it's important to compare sites like the 1719 Museum and Elfreth's Alley who are the only historic sites their institutions manage, to those of Stenton and the Daniel Boone Homestead whose institutions operate many other sites. When comparing the different kinds of operating institutions, it is evident that those that run only one site have a deeper investment in the site and a greater alignment of mission statements. This can be connected to why some of the sites have made more progress that others in developing comprehensive content, using appropriate language, and/or engaging the site's community more successfully.

This study also analyzed how comprehensive the interpretive content was by assessing the language used at each site in the written and online materials, the extent to which they included the stories of all people who lived at the site during the period interpreted, and how shifts in interpretive content correlated with social changes over time. Contemporary social changes include the Civil Rights Movement, the American Indian Movement, the rise of LGBTQIA+ representation, and the Black Lives Matter movement. In this category, Stenton's interpretive content witnessed the most change over time with its incorporation of Dinah throughout the site's narrative, including the insertion of her story into the onsite tour, a page on the website dedicated to her, a memorial onsite for her, and repeated communication with the local community on how best to interpret her life. These changes can be attributed to the site's efforts to include community voices and concerns in the interpretations presented. Elfreth's Alley and the 1719 Museum were about the same as they exhibited some change over time, but not as much as Stenton. A majority of the content changes at Elfreth's Alley have been made through digital forms as demonstrated by the website, blog, and podcast. The changes being primarily done via digital formats are likely due to the authors of the podcast as they are from a

younger generation, of which tends to be more digitally-oriented. The 1719 Museum's inclusive content has been exhibited through the telling of local Indigenous tribes' history and the desire to accomplish this in the most appropriate way. This desire was attained through the site's discussions and interactions with local Indigenous groups and choosing to incorporate a more thorough history interpretation. The Daniel Boone Homestead is the site that has had the least change over time; it continues to exhibit a large omission of historical information pertaining to Daniel Boone, the enslaved people he once owned, and the Indigenous people he encountered on his westward travels. The lack of changes is presumably due to the lack of funding that the site has been provided by the Pennsylvania Historical and Museum Commission.

There have also been significant changes within community outreach which was defined as the historic site's efforts to communicate with its respective audiences. The four types of stakeholders examined were those within the geographic location, tourists, those with heritage connections, and educators. The first step was to determine which group of people each site most interacts and communicates with. Community outreach was evaluated through the efforts of each site's staff to communicate with and listen to its community's voices. This was measured by determining first who counted as each site's community and then assessing how the site communicated and interacted with that community. Different types of outreach were exhibited by each site over time as they have worked to better include their communities both physically, such as Stenton involving members of its local neighborhood, and digitally, such as Elfreth's Alley creating its podcast.

Stenton's community is its geographic neighborhood located within the outskirts of Philadelphia; it is in a predominantly African American neighborhood. Stenton has the strongest relationship with its community; it invited and encouraged residents to attend meetings to discuss

the incorporation of the story of Dinah. Elfreth's Alley's community is tourists as its location is in the heart of center city Philadelphia, just a short walk from sites like Independence Hall. The site has a blog and podcast for those curious about history to follow and it also allows visitors to browse the archives online. They also participate in many vendor and living history events and encourage their community to attend through blog posts and physical brochures. The Daniel Boone Homestead participates in a community of tourists. Its staff and volunteers communicate with their tourist community through eNewsletters and pamphlets distributed to many locations across southeast Pennsylvania. They also participate in vendor events and celebrations, fundraising efforts, community site clean-ups, and volunteer participation, as well as the Pennsylvania Trails of History. The 1719 Museum's community is focused on those with genealogical and heritage ties to the Mennonites, and with Indigenous people. This is seen through the repeated communication between those with genealogical ties and the operating institution of the 1719 Museum which is Mennonite Life. Those who are distant relatives of the Herrs and other Mennonite families in the Lancaster area are very involved in the 1719 Museum site through expressing their vision for the direction of the site. Indigenous groups are also a part of this community and participate in events hosted by the site to help educate visitors on the local tribes and the history of them.

This thesis has shown that each of the sites examined have made progress in all of categories measured; however, some have had greater and more noticeable changes over time.

This can be attributed to the operating institutions of the sites, the amount of funding available, the communities for each site, and the willingness of administrators, staff, and site communities to embrace these changes.

In the future, research focused on the visitors and their understanding of interpretation at the sites could provide for a greater understanding of how holistic, comprehensive interpretation of difficult history shapes visitors' knowledge about the past. Institutions are listening to what is going on within social movements and what visitors want to see, so it is likely that the sites will continue to keep up with best practices for interpreting difficult history with a focus on visitor expectations. As the field progresses with new interpretations coming to the fore, we can ensure that volunteers are on the same page as professional historians by establishing programs for properly training docents. Such programs will include in-depth training sessions, the promotion of best teaching practices, observations of docents' tours and interpretations, and a formal system of evaluation. These training programs would need to be supported by the site's parent organizations as they would need to aid in the provision of resources. It would also include both a commitment to the mission of the site and an investment in the staff and volunteers.

Unfortunately, this is easier to propose than it is to enact as the actual installation of training programs systems will require a commitment on part of the parent institution and investment of resources into the site, as well as an appropriate amount of staff and docents to be working at the site. It also requires institutions to value professionalization of docent interpretation and training with a focus on the way the narrative is being provided to the public. While smaller and more locally operated historic sites can be more responsive in these situations, they typically do not have the staff capacity to initiate a training system like this. This is due to the lack of the appropriate number of employees or docents, or enough time in their schedule to dedicate to professional trainings. As demonstrated in the conversations with Heather Hicks, the curator of the Daniel Boone Homestead, she wishes that the site was able to update the narrative

to provide greater inclusivity of marginalized groups and to have more docents and staff trained, but there is just not enough funding or time available to do so.<sup>227</sup>

As the field continues to grow, as does the importance of narrative interpretation, it is hopeful that soon these systems will be put in place and will become more common throughout historic sites. Through this research, the need for future scholarship on appropriate interpretive training at historic sites has become evident as this will help guide institutions toward instituting more holistic and inclusive interpretations at their sites that will represent all of the people who once lived there.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>227</sup> Author interview with Heather Hicks, Daniel Boone Homestead, Birdsboro, PA, October 2, 2021.

## REFERENCES

# **Primary Sources**

- "About." Elfreth's Alley Museum. *Elfreth's Alley Association*. Accessed September 5, 2022. https://www.elfrethsalley.org/about.
- "About: NSCDA—PA." The National Society of the Colonial Dames of America in the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania. Accessed September 2021 and April 2023. https://www.nscdapa.org/about.
- "About PHMC." Pennsylvania Historical and Museum Commission. *Commonwealth of Pennsylvania Government*. Accessed September 5, 2022. https://www.phmc.pa.gov/About/Pages/default.aspx.
- "About Us: The Daniel Boone Homestead." Daniel Boone Home. Accessed April 22, 2023. https://www.thedanielboonehomestead.org/about-us.
- Administrative Interview with Tiffany Fisk, 1719 Museum, March 11, 2022.
- "The Alley Cast." *Elfreth's Alley Museum*. Accessed January 3, 2023. https://www.elfrethsalley.org/thealleycast.
- "Become a Member." Mennonite Life, October 17, 2022. https://mennonitelife.org/get-involved/become-a-member/.
- Conversations with Visitors. Conrad Weiser Homestead. October, 2021.
- Conversations with Visitors. Daniel Boone Homestead. October 2, 2021.
- Conversations with Visitors. Ephrata Cloister. September 30, 2021.
- Conversations with Visitors. Hope Lodge. October 3, 2021.
- Daniel Boone Home. "Historic Site: The Daniel Boone Homestead." Accessed September 2021. https://www.thedanielboonehomestead.org/.
- The Daniel Boone Homestead. "Homestead Happenings," May 1, 2021.
- Daniel Boone Homestead. Site Tour. Birdsboro, PA, October 2021.
- Daniel Boone Homestead Staff. "Docent Exhibition Script." *Daniel Boone Homestead*, (August 25, 2012): 1-10. Accessed September 2021.

- "Dinah." Stenton. Accessed May 8, 2023. https://www.stenton.org/dinah.
- "Elfreth's Alley: A Guidebook to Our Nation's Oldest Residential Street", 2010, Collection Box: Ephemera, Folder 15, Item 1, Elfreth's Alley Archive, Philadelphia, PA.
- "Elfreth's Alley: A Residential Street Where People Have Lived in Harmony Since 1713," 1964, Box 15: Series VII: Sales and Promotion, Guidebooks, Promotional Materials, Folder 3: EAA: Sales and Promotion, Guidebooks, General Guide 1964, Item 1, Elfreth's Alley Archive, Philadelphia, Pennsylvania.
- Elfreth's Alley Association. *Volunteer Manual*. Philadelphia, PA: Elfreth's Alley Association, 2022.
- Elfreth's Alley Museum. "A Commentary on Episode 3 of the Alley Cast." Elfreth's Alley Museum, December 31, 2020. https://www.elfrethsalley.org/blog/2020/7/28/a-commentary-on-episode-3-of-the-alley-cast.
- Elfreth's Alley Museum and Elfreth's Alley. "Blog." *Elfreth's Alley Museum*, August 5, 2022. https://www.elfrethsalley.org/blog.
- Elfreth's Alley Museum. "Elfreth's Alley Museum." Accessed October 2021 and May 2023. http://www.elfrethsalley.org/.
- "Elfreth's Alley Pamphlet," Box 15: Series VII: Sales and Promotion, Guidebooks, Promotional Materials, Folder 10: EAA: Sales and Promotion, Promotional Materials, Rackard, Bicentennial, 1976, Item 1, Elfreth's Alley Archives, Philadelphia Pennsylvania.
- Engle, Reed Laurence. *Historic Structure Report: Stenton*. November 1982. Box 1, Bound Volume. F.4 Bound Volumes: Publicity and Events, Stenton Archives, Philadelphia, PA. 1 October 2021.
- Fisk, Tiffany. Email Message to Author. March 3, 2022.
- Friesen, Steve. A Modest Mennonite Home: The Story of the 1719 Hans Herr House, An Early Colonial Landmark. Intercourse, PA: Good Books, 1990.
- Hicks, Heather. In-Person Conversation, Daniel Boone Homestead. October 2, 2021.
- "History & Mission." Stenton. *The National Society of The Colonial Dames of America:*Pennsylvania. Accessed September 5, 2022. https://www.stenton.org/history-mission.
- Kalman, Bobbie. *Life in a Longhouse Village*. New York, NY: Crabtree Publishing Company, 2001.

- Keim, Laura C. *Stenton: A Visitor's Guide to the Site, History, and Collections*. Philadelphia, PA: The National Society of the Colonial Dames of America in the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, 2014.
- "Lancaster Mennonite Conference Historical Society." Lancaster Mennonite Conference Historical Society GuideStar Profile. Accessed April 15, 2023. https://www.guidestar.org/profile/23-6050885.
- The Lancaster Mennonite Conference Historical Society. *Visit the Historic Hans Herr House: Built in 1719.* Lancaster, PA: Lancaster Mennonite Conference Historical Society, 1970.
- The Lancaster Mennonite Historical Society. "The Mirror," Vol. 53, no.2, June 2021. Acquired Fall 2021.
- Maust, Ted and Isabel Steven. "Episode 1: The Dressmakers." June 24, 2020. *The Alley Cast*, 20:51. https://www.elfrethsalley.org/podcast/2020/6/23/episode-1-the-dressmakers.
- Maust, Ted and Isabel Steven. "Episode 2: Spinsters, Runaway Wives, and Widows." July 1, 2020. *The Alley* Cast, 24:54. https://www.elfrethsalley.org/podcast/2020/7/1/episode-2-spinsters-runaway-wives-and-widows.
- Maust, Ted and Isabel Steven. "Episode 3: The Public Universal Friend in Philadelphia." July 8, 2020. *The Alley Cast*, 23:15. https://www.elfrethsalley.org/podcast/2020/7/7/episode-3-the-public-universal-friend-in-philadelphia.
- Michonski, Cassidy. In attendance of the Maize & Snitz Event. The 1719 Hans Herr House, October 2, 2021.
- Michonski, Cassidy. 1719 Museum Educational Materials. Willow Street, PA: 1719 Museum, 2022.
- "Memorial Plans." Stenton. Accessed July 13, 2023. https://www.stenton.org/\_files/ugd/29e2a6\_185a275a412149dea7dfc7e6708f7639.pdf.
- Mennonite Life. 1719 Museum: Experience Early American Life. Lancaster, PA: Mennonite Life, 2022.
- "Museum Properties: NSCDAPA." *The National Society of The Colonial Dames of America*. Accessed September 5, 2022. https://www.nscdapa.org/museum-properties.
- Nyce, Florence S. Jones. *Yesterday in Elfreth's Alley*. 1942. Box 15, Folder 1. Series VIII: Sales and Promotion, Guidebookes. Elfreth's Alley Association Archives, Elfreth's Alley Association, Philadelphia, PA. March 7, 2022.

- Pennsylvania Historical & Museum Commission. "About PHMC." Accessed October 2021. https://www.phmc.gov/About/Pages/default.aspx.
- Pennsylvania Historical and Museum Commission. *Daniel Boone Homestead on the Pennsylvania Trail of History*. Harrisburg, PA: Pennsylvania Historical and Museum Commission. 1962.
- Pennsylvania Historical and Museum Commission. *Daniel Boone Homestead: Visitor Guide*. Pennsylvania: Pennsylvania Historical and Museum Commission, May 2018. Accessed September 2021.
- Pennsylvania Historical and Museum Commission. "The Pennsylvania Trails of History," Pennsylvania Historical and Museum Commission. October 2016. Acquired Fall 2021.
- Price and Dickey. Master Plan: Daniel Boone Historic Site. Daniel Boone Homestead, 1968.
- "Programs." Stenton. *NSCDAPA*. Accessed September 5, 2022. https://www.stenton.org/programs.
- "Society Flocks to the Re-Opening of the Logan House." *North American*. 24 May 1900. Box 1, Bound Volume. F.4 Bound Volumes: Publicity and Events, Stenton Archives, Philadelphia, PA. 1 October 2021.
- Stenton, "Address the Absence of Memorials to Millions of Enslaved Africans & African Americans Whose Contributions to Our History Remain Ignored or Silenced in Public Spaces." Acquired Fall 2021.
- Stenton: A House of Learning, Past and Present. Philadelphia, PA: Great American Treasure, n.d.
- Stenton. Community Meeting Flier. Philadelphia, PA: Stenton, 2019.
- Stenton. Facebook Post, September 30th, 2022.
- Stenton. "Facts About Stenton," Stenton, n.d.
- Stenton, Friends of Stenton Newsletter, Fall 2020 edition. Acquired Fall 2021.
- Stenton. *Interpretive Plan*, NSCDAPA, 2003. Accessed September 5, 2022. https://www.stenton.org/\_files/ugd/29e2a6\_d901cacba4cc46bda13fd622dd8632fb.pdf.
- Stenton: "Stenton: A House of Learning: Past and Present." Accessed September 2021. https://www.stenton.org/.

- Stenton Staff. Friends of Stenton: Newsletter and Appeal. Philadelphia, PA: Stenton, Fall 2020.
- Stenton Staff. Guides Training Info. Philadelphia, PA: Stenton, 1985.
- Stenton. Who Was Dinah? The Dinah Memorial Project. Philadelphia, PA: Stenton, n.d.
- "Vision, Mission and Core Values." Mennonite Life. *Mennonite Life*. October 27, 2022. https://mennonitelife.org/about/vision-mission-core-values/.
- The 1719 Hans Herr House. "The Central Hearth: A Quarterly Newsletter of the 1719 Herr House." Lancaster, PA: The 1719 Hans Herr House, Summer 2021. Acquired Fall 2021.
- The 1719 Hans Herr House. "Maize & Snitz Market Fair." Willow Street, PA: The 1719 Hans Herr House, October 2, 2021.
- 1719 Hans Herr House Museum and Tours. "About." *The 1719 Herr House*. https://www.hansherr.org/about. Accessed September 2021; site inactive in March 2022.
- The 1719 Herr House and Native American Longhouse Staff. 1719 Herr House, Native American Longhouse: Volunteer Guide Handbook. Willow Street, PA: The 1719 Hans Herr House, 2018.
- The 1719 Hans Herr House. "The Oldest Homestead in Lancaster County." Accessed October 2021. https://hansherr.org/. Site Inactive in 2022.
- The 1719 Museum Staff, 1719 Museum: Interpretation Manual, Mennonite Life, 2022

### **Secondary Sources**

- Adams, Marianna, and Judy Koke. "Comprehensive Interpretive Plans: A Framework of Questions." *The Journal of Museum Education* 33, no. 3 (2008): 293–99. http://www.jstor.org/stable/40479684.
- Alderson, William T., and Shirley Payne Low. *Interpretation of Historic Sites*. Walnut Creek, CA: AltaMira Press, 1996.
- Ambrose, Timothy, and Crispin Paine. *Museum Basics: The International Handbook*. London, UK: Routledge, 2018.
- Armour, Stephanie. "Trump Administration Issues Rule to Roll Back Transgender Protections in the Affordable Care Act." The Wall Street Journal. Dow Jones & Company, June 13, 2020. https://www.wsj.com/articles/trump-administration-issues-rule-to-roll-back-transgender-protections-in-the-affordable-care-act-11591992461.

- Bancroft, Dick, Laura Waterman Wittstock, and Rigoberto Menchu Tum. We Are Still Here: A Photographic History of the American Indian Movement. Minnesota: Borealis Books, 2013.
- Baptist, Edward E. *Half Has Never Been Told: Slavery and the Making of American Capitalism*. New York, NY: Basic Books, 2016.
- Baron, Christine, Sherri Sklarwitz, Hyeyoung Bang, and Hanadi Shatara. "What Teachers Retain from Historic Site-Based Professional Development." *Journal of Teacher Education* 71, no. 4 (2019): 392–408. https://doi.org/10.1177/0022487119841889.
- Bergman, Teresa. *Exhibiting Patriotism: Creating and Contesting Interpretations of American Historic Sites*. Walnut Creek, CA: Left Coast Press, 2013.
- Bird, Michael Yellow. "What We Want to Be Called: Indigenous Peoples' Perspectives on Racial and Ethnic Identity Labels." *American Indian Quarterly* 23, no. 2 (1999): 1–21. https://doi.org/10.2307/1185964.
- Bruku, Sandra. "Community Engagement in Historical Site Protection: Lessons from the Elmina Castle Project in Ghana." *Conservation and Management of Archaeological Sites* 17, no. 1 (2015): 67–76.
- Burson, George. "The Black Civil Rights Movement." *OAH Magazine of History* 2, no.1 (1986): 35-40.
- Carter, David. Stonewall: The Riots That Sparked the Gay Revolution, 1-3. New York, NY: Griffin, 2011.
- Casper, Scott E. Sarah Johnson's Mount Vernon: The Forgotten History of an American Shrine. New York, NY: Hill & Wang, 2009.
- Cauvin, Thomas. Public History: A Textbook of Practice. New York, NY: Routledge, 2016.
- Clark, Kenneth B. "The Civil Rights Movement: Momentum and Organization." Daedalus 95, no.1 (1966): 239-67. http://www.jstor.org/stable/20026973.
- Cornell, Stephen. "Crisis and Response in Indian-White Relations: 1960-1984." *Social Problems* 32, no. 1 (1984): 44–59. https://doi.org/10.2307/800261.
- Cunningham, Mary Kay. *The Interpreter's Training Manual for Museums*. Washington, DC: American Association of Museums, 2004.
- Edson, Gary. "The Quandaries of Museum Training." *The Journal of Museum Education* 20, no. 1 (1995): 12–14. http://www.jstor.org/stable/40479485.

- Eichstedt, Jennifer L. and Stephen Small. *Representations of Slavery: Race and Ideology in the Southern Plantation Museum.* Washington, DC: Smithsonian Institution Press, 2002.
- Ellis, S. Peyton. "Historic Preservation as a Tool for Sustainable Community Development." *Consilience*, no. 21 (2019): 1–16. https://www.jstor.org/stable/26775080.
- Engelhardt, Tom and Edward Linenthal. *History Wars: The Enola Gay and Other Battles for the American Past*. New York, NY: Holt, 2006.
- Faragher, John Mack. *Daniel Boone: The Life and Legend of an American Pioneer*. Norwalk, CT: Easton Press, 1995.
- Gallas, Kristin, and James DeWolf Perry. "Developing Comprehensive and Conscientious Interpretation of Slavery at Historic Sites and Museums." *American Association for State and Local History* 69, no. 2 (2014): 1–8.
- Gordon, Tammy S. *Private History in Public: Exhibition and the Settings of Everyday Life*. Lanham, MD: AltaMira Press, 2010.
- Gross, Magdalena H. and Luke Terra. "What Makes Difficult History Difficult?" *Phi Delta Kappan* 99, no. 8 (2018): 51-56.
- Hammon, Neal O. and James Russell Harris. "Daniel Boone the Businessman: Revising the Myth of Failure." *Register of the Kentucky Historical Society* 112, no.1 (2014): 5-50.
- Hayden, Dolores. *The Power of Place: Urban Landscapes as Public History*. Cambridge, MA: The MIT Press, 1995.
- Herman, Daniel J. "The Other Daniel Boone: The Nascence of a Middle-Class Hunter Hero, 1784-1860." *Journal of the Early Republic* (1998): 429-457.
- Holden, Vanessa M. ""I was born a slave": Language, Sources, and Considering Descendant Communities." *Journal of the Early Republic* 43, no. 1 (2023): 75-83. doi:10.1353/jer.2023.0004.
- Horton, James O. and Lois E. Horton, eds. *Slavery and Public History: The Tough Stuff of American Memory*. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2009.
- Horton, James O. "Slavery in American History: An Uncomfortable National Dialogue." In *Slavery and Public History: The Tough Stuff of American Memory*, edited by James O. Horton and Lois Horton, 35-56. Chapel Hill, NC: University of North Carolina Press, 2006.
- Hyuck, Heather A. *Doing Women's History in Public: A Handbook for Interpretation at Museums and Historic Sites*. S.I.: Rowman & Littlefield, 2020.

- Jensen, Nina, and Mary Ellen Munley. "Training for Museum Education Professionals." *The Journal of Museum Education* 10, no. 4 (1985): 12–15. http://www.jstor.org/stable/40478673.
- Jim Crow Museum, "When Did the Word Negro Become Socially Unacceptable?" Ferris State University: Jim Crow Museum, October 2010. https://www.ferris.edu/HTMLS/news/jimcrow/question/2010/october.htm
- Kendall, Brent and Nancy A. Youseff. "Supreme Court Allows Trump Administration to Implement Transgender Restrictions in Military." *The Wall Street Journal*. Dow Jones & Company, January 22, 2019. https://www.wsj.com/articles/supreme-court-allows-trump-restrictions-on-transgender-military-service-for-now-11548168481.
- Lanier, Gabrielle M. "Review." *The Pennsylvania Magazine of History and Biography* 121, no. 1/2 (1997): 139–41. http://www.jstor.org/stable/20093116.
- Leggs, Brent. "Growth of Historic Sites: Teaching Public Historians to Advance Preservation Practice." The Public Historian 40, no. 3 (2018): 90–106. https://www.jstor.org/stable/26504425.
- Levine, Mary Ann, Kelly M. Britt, and James A. Delle. "Heritage Tourism and Community Outreach: Public Archaeology at the Thaddeus Stevens and Lydia Hamilton Smith Site in Lancaster, Pennsylvania, USA." *International Journal of Heritage Studies* 11, no. 5 (2005): 399–414. https://doi.org/10.1080/13527250500337447.
- Lindsay, Anne. *Reconsidering Interpretation of Heritage Sites*. New York, NY: Routledge, 2020.
- Loewen, James W. *Lies Across America: What Our Historic Sites Get Wrong*. New York, NY: The New Press, 2019.
- Low, Shirley P. "Historic Site Interpretation: The Human Approach." *History News* 20, no. 11 (1965): 233–44. http://www.jstor.org/stable/42645833.
- "Mission Statements & Strategic Planning." Sustaining Places: An Encyclopedia of Resources for Small Historical Organizations, March 10, 2023. https://sustainingplaces.com/collaboration-2/.
- Mooney-Melvin, Patricia. "Beyond the Book" Historians and the Interpretive Challenge," *The Public Historian* 17, no.4 (1995): 75-82.
- Mooney-Melvin, Patricia. "Professional Historians and the Challenge of Redefinition," *Public History: Essays From the Field*, 1999.

- Morphew, Christopher C., and Matthew Hartley. "Mission Statements: A Thematic Analysis of Rhetoric across Institutional Type." *The Journal of Higher Education* 77, no. 3 (2006): 456–71. http://www.jstor.org/stable/3838697.
- "Owls Join Forces to Tell the Story of Philly's Famed Elfreth's Alley." Temple Now | news.temple.edu, April 26, 2021. https://news.temple.edu/news/2021-04-26/owls-join-forces-tell-story-philly-s-famed-elfreth-s-alley.
- "Pennsylvania's Trails of History." VisitPA, February 28, 2013. https://www.visitpa.com/article/pennsylvanias-trails-history.
- "Professional Standards for Museum Educators." *The Journal of Museum Education* 14, no. 3 (1989): 11–13. http://www.jstor.org/stable/40478822.
- Richter, Daniel K. "A Framework for Pennsylvania Indian History." *Pennsylvania History: A Journal of Mid-Atlantic Studies* 57, no. 3 (1990): 236–61. http://www.jstor.org/stable/27773387.
- Rickford, Russell. "Black Lives Matter: Toward a Modern Practice of Mass Struggle." New Labor Forum 25, no.1 (2016): 34-42. https://www.jstor.org/stable/26419959.
- Rose, Julia. *Interpreting Difficult history at Museums and Historic Sites*. Lanham, MD: Rowman and Littlefield, 2016.
- "Sarah Johnson's Mount Vernon." C-SPAN, March 25, 2008. https://www.c-span.org/video/?204093-1%2Fsarah-johnsons-mount-vernon.
- Schell, Suzanne B. "On Interpretation and Historic Sites." *The Journal of Museum Education* 10, no.3 (1985): 6-10.
- Sheldon, Amy. "Gender, Language, and Historical Interpretation." *The Oral History Review* 17, no. 2 (1989): 92–96.
- Sloan, Pamela. "Redefining Stakeholder Engagement: From Control to Collaboration." The Journal of Corporate Citizenship, no. 36 (2009): 25–40. http://www.jstor.org/stable/jcorpciti.36.25.
- Slonimsky, Nora, Jessica Choppin Roney, and Andrew Shankman. "Introduction: "What's in a Name?"." *Journal of the Early Republic* 43, no. 1 (2023): 59-60. doi:10.1353/jer.2023.0002.
- Smith, Melanie K. *Cultural Tourism in a Changing World: Politics, Participation and* (*Re*)presentation. Edited by Mike Robinson. Clevedon, UK: Channel View Publications, 2010.

- Stevens, S.K. "The Pennsylvania Historical and Museum Commission." *History News* 20, no.7 (1965): 146-48. http://www.jstor.org/stable/42645784.
- Titus, Jill Ogline. "An Unfinished Struggle: Sesquicentennial Interpretations of Slavery and Emancipation." *Journal of the Civil War Era* 4, no.2 (June 2014): 338-47.
- "U.S. Census Bureau Quickfacts: Philadelphia City, Pennsylvania; United ..." Accessed March 26, 2023. https://www.census.gov/quickfacts/fact/table/philadelphiacitypennsylvania,US/PST0452 21.
- Vagnone, Franklin, Deborah Ryan, and Olivia Cothren. "The Anarchist Guide to Historic House Museums: Evaluation Methodology for Historic House Museums." The Public Historian 37, no. 2 (2015): 97–111. https://doi.org/10.1525/tph.2015.37.2.97
- Weyeneth, Robert R., and Daniel J. Vivian. "Public History Pedagogy: Charting the Course: Challenges in Public History Education, Guidance for Developing Strong Public History Programs." *The Public Historian* 38, no. 3 (2016): 25–49. https://www.jstor.org/stable/26420839.
- Walsh, Margaret. "Women's Place on the American Frontier." *Journal of American Studies* 29, no. 2 (1995): 241–55. http://www.jstor.org/stable/27555925.
- "Welcome to the Circle Legacy Center." Circle Legacy Center. Accessed July 12, 2023. http://circlelegacycenter.com/.
- Wiley, Terry G. Handbook of Heritage, Community, and Native American Languages in the United States: Research, Policy, and Educational Practice. New York, NY: Routledge, 2014.
- Witt, Lara. "Letters to Trayvon." *The Philadelphia Inquirer*, February 27, 2015. https://www.inquirer.com/philly/news/20150227\_Letters\_to\_Trayvon.html.
- Young, David W., Stephen G. Hague, George W. McDaniel, and Sandra Smith. "Not Dead Yet: Historic Sites Providing Community Leadership." *History News* 64, no. 3 (2009): 15–20. http://www.jstor.org/stable/42654222.