Spark a Conversation on Metadata Inclusiveness

Sai Deng
University of Central Florida, sai.deng@ucf.edu

Part of the Archival Science Commons, Cataloging and Metadata Commons, Scholarly Communication Commons, and the Social Justice Commons
Find similar works at: https://stars.library.ucf.edu/ucfscholar
University of Central Florida Libraries http://library.ucf.edu

This Other Presentation is brought to you for free and open access by STARS. It has been accepted for inclusion in Faculty Scholarship and Creative Works by an authorized administrator of STARS. For more information, please contact STARS@ucf.edu.

STARS Citation
https://stars.library.ucf.edu/ucfscholar/953
Spark a Conversation on Metadata Inclusiveness

Sai Deng
University of Central Florida Libraries
The Libraries’ Responses to Inclusiveness

- **Context: Social and political context**
- **Biases in Cataloging & Classification**
  - DDC, LCSH: principles favored white, Christian, American/Western/European, heterosexual males
- **Not One Man’s Fight Anymore**
  - Changes made to LCSH since the publication of *Prejudice and Antipathies*
    - Jewish question (deleted, use Jews – [place])
    - Yellow peril (deleted)
    - Chinese (/Japanese/Mexican) in the U.S. (changed to “Chinese Americans,” “Japanese Americans,” “Mexican Americans”)
    - Negroes, Negro art, etc (changed to “African Americans,” “Blacks” for those who temporarily reside in the US)
    - Genocide (“Race problems” cross-refs deleted)
    - Lynching (“criminal justice, administration of” cross-refs deleted)
    - Native races (changed to “Indigenous people”)
The Libraries’ Responses to Inclusiveness

- **Libraries:** Provide safe, supportive environments and diverse, inclusive collections

- **Community voices:** [Change the Subject](#), [Canadian Subject Headings for Indigenous Peoples](#)...

- **Initiatives in Libraries and Communities, e.g.,**
  - ALCTS CaMMS SAC Working Group
  - NYU Libraries: Inclusion, Diversity, Belonging, Equity and Accessibility (IDBEA) Steering Committee
  - OSU Libraries: EDI CV (Equity, Diversity and Inclusion Controlled Vocabulary) & Description Working Group

- **Outcomes and Deliverables:**
  - Bibliographies, resource lists
  - Library-wide and community activities, discussions
  - Strategies, policies, recommendations, tools
  - Inclusive metadata practice (in cataloging and archival description etc.)

- **Spark a Conversation in the Library**
  - Cases, examples and resources are compiled from:
    - [Inclusive Metadata & Conscious Editing Resources List](#) (SSDN Metadata Working Group)
    - [Embracing Equity, Diversity and Inclusion (EDI) in Library Cataloging](#), Presented by the Role of the Professional Librarian in Technical Services Interest Group)
Cases & Examples
Ethical and Cultural Considerations
“Be more precise, less prejudicial”

Gender Considerations
Respect (gender) identity

- Lady Chablis
- Female impersonators
- Knox, Brenda
- Performance artists

Racial Considerations
“Identifying & dismantling white supremacy”

This slide is from:
Bolding, Kelly. “Reparative Processing: A Case Study in Auditing Legacy Archival Description for Racism”
https://docs.google.com/presentation/d/1MhOXx5ZlVjb_8pfvvFquMqLsUUlOHFFMT4js5EP4qnA/edit?usp=sharing

Michelle Caswell
“Archives, Records, and Memory” class @ UCLA (Fall 2016)

graphic design by Gracen Brilmyer
Racial Considerations
“Describing whiteness”

Examples from early American history collections

- Reparative Processing (Bolding)
  - Describe white ethnicities (ex. Scottish American)
  - Call it like it is (settlers, colonists)
  - “The first white” ≠ “The first”
  - Use active voice to describe oppressive relationships
  - Denormalize colonial place names

Bolding, Kelly. “Reparative Processing: A Case Study in Auditing Legacy Archival Description for Racism”
https://docs.google.com/presentation/d/1MhUX4s2VjZ_b8tv7Ss5vqMqGd0H1OlYFMT4jpsJ4ghA/edit?usp=sharing
Racial Considerations
“Include racial identities for all people”

“whiteness is no longer the presumed default”
Example: Julian Shakespeare Carr Papers

- **Legacy description:** Julian Shakespeare Carr (1845-1924) of Chapel Hill and Durham, N.C., was a manufacturer of tobacco products with interests in a wide range of other businesses, including banking and textiles. Carr was also active in the Methodist Church, the Democratic 45 Party, and several Confederate veterans' organizations, including the North Carolina branch of the United Confederate Veterans, which he served as commander. He was also a strong supporter of various institutions of higher education in the state. The collection includes letters, telegrams, printed announcements, programs, and pamphlets, business and legal documents, maps, and newspaper clippings pertaining to Carr's business and personal affairs. The letters chiefly concern banking, farming, and family matters, but also reflect Carr’s interests in the Civil War and the United Confederate Veterans and in the Methodist Church. Also included are printed and manuscript addresses and Sunday School lessons given by Carr. Of special note is a series of speeches discussing the race problem in North Carolina and throughout the South. One address, 2 June 1913, given at the dedication of the monument later known as "Silent Sam" on the University of North Carolina campus. Business topics are also represented. Included are seven volumes of Carr’s diary containing brief entries, 1907-1917, and letter books, 1919-1922. These volumes chiefly document Carr's personal life, particularly his travels and family associations. Also included are a wedding album, 1895, of Carr's daughter Eliza, and a family history, 1991, by Joseph Julian Carr. Photographs are chiefly of Julian S. Carr.

Racial Considerations
Include racial identities for all people

“whiteness is no longer the presumed default”
Example: Julian Shakespeare Carr Papers
"conscious editing"

- 2018 revision: The papers of white businessman and public figure Julian Shakespeare Carr (1845-1924) of Chapel Hill and Durham, N.C., document his financial interests in tobacco, textiles, and banking; affiliations with the Methodist Church, the Democratic Party in North Carolina, and organizations commemorating the Confederacy; and philanthropic support of institutions of higher education, particularly the University of North Carolina (UNC). Papers include letters, printed items, business records, legal documents, diaries, photographs, lessons for Sunday school, and addresses written and delivered by Carr. The rhetoric in many addresses reflects Carr’s positions on what he and his contemporaries called "the race problem." In keeping with white supremacy movements in North Carolina at the turn of the twentieth century, Carr defended the institution of slavery, claiming it had been beneficial to the enslaved, and argued for denying full citizenship rights to African Americans. Included are Carr's 1899 speech supporting an amendment to the North Carolina constitution that disenfranchised African Americans and his address at the 1913 dedication of the Confederate monument later known as "Silent Sam" on the UNC campus.

Radical Cataloging
“Alien” vs. “Noncitizens” etc.

- **Survey:** ALA/ALCTS/CaMMS Subject Analysis Committee
  - September-Oct 2019, 40 responses
- **Trend:** Those who made revisions mostly changed their heading to “Undocumented immigrants”
- **Primary approaches:**
  - Keep authorized LCSH and add new term(s)
  - Replace authorized LCSH with new term(s)
  - Keep authorized LCSH, but display new term(s)

---

**Appendix 1: Terms from non-LCSH controlled vocabularies as of March 2020**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>LCSH term</th>
<th>Alternate term suggestion</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Aliens</td>
<td>Noncitizens $2 sears</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illegal aliens</td>
<td>Unauthorized immigrants $2 sears</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illegal aliens—Canada</td>
<td>Unauthorized immigrants—Canada $2 sears</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illegal aliens—United States</td>
<td>Unauthorized immigrants—United States $2 sears</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Fox, Violet; Bennyhoff, Nick; George, Kelsey; Grant, Erin; Gross, Tina; Kellett, Cate; Kirkland, Arden; Jurgemeyer, Karla; Perera, Treshani; Pettitt, Karl; Piascik, Jeanne; Robinson, Lisa; Tomaras, Deborah. Report of the SAC Working Group on Alternatives to LCSH “Illegal aliens.” June 2020.

http://hdl.handle.net/11213/14582
Radical Cataloging: “Alien” vs. “Noncitizens” etc.

- **Radical Cataloging**: “…refers to addressing the root–systemic, or structural–issues behind social problems. Radical cataloging, in this way, is not necessarily an attempt to do away with or subvert cataloging altogether, but is rather intended to address the root issues that can make access to information problematic.”

- **CU Boulder Libraries**: added “undocumented immigrants” (and six variants) to over 5,000 bib records

1. Aliens >> Noncitizens
2. Illegal Aliens >> Undocumented Immigrants
3. Alien detention centers >> Immigrant detention centers
4. Children of illegal aliens >> Children of undocumented immigrants
5. Illegal alien children >> Undocumented immigrant children
6. Illegal aliens in literature >> Undocumented immigrants in literature
7. Women illegal aliens >> Women undocumented immigrants
Multilingual Metadata & Access

- **Tse-Tsung Chow Collection of Chinese Scrolls and Fan Paintings**

---

**Title/標題**: Scroll prints of a gallant horse with a bluish white and mixed color - 青驄

**Artist**: Unknown

**Date of Creation**: Unknown

**Period**: Unknown

**Collector**: Zhou, Cezong, 1916-2007

**Main Text**

In front of Zhao Mausoleum (the mausoleum of Emperor Taizong of Tang (599-649)), this horse is the second from the east. It has a bluish white and mixed color and was struck with five arrows. This is the horse that Shihin Li (an emperor of the Tang dynasty, 597-649) rode when he conquered Jiande Dou (573-621) (a leader of rebels in Sui dynasty). The horse moves as fast as a flash. It runs so swiftly as if there were god's blessings on its hoofs. Riding on this horse, a flying-white-cloth-like steed, will guarantee victory of a war.

**释文**

東第二，鶴白駄色，卽中五箭，平寶懸轡時榮。足跡蹤影，神駟天縱。策茲飛驄，定擒逆臣。

**Language**: Chinese

**Subject AAT**

- Prints (visual works)
- Calligraphy (visual work)
- Hanging scrolls
- Poetry
- Rubbings (visual works)

**Subject AAT-Taiwan**

- 習畫 (現藏作品)
- 書法 (現藏作品)
- 立軸
- 詩
- 印 (現藏作品)

**TGM**

- Horses

**Coverage**: China

---


Describing Disability

- “respects the preferences of living communities”

- Disability Museum: Use “short stature” “physical disability” to describe disability, added “entertainment,” “family,” “popular culture”; not use “dwarfism”


https://elischolar.library.yale.edu/jcas/vol5/iss1/1

Visual Still Information

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title:</th>
<th>Lavinia And Minnie Warren</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Original caption:</td>
<td>Misses Lavinia &amp; Minnie Warren</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Creator:</td>
<td>Brady (photographer)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Date:</td>
<td>Circa 1865</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Format:</td>
<td>Photograph</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Source:</td>
<td>Syracuse Univ. Library, Special Collections</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Control no.:</td>
<td>Ronald G. Becker Collection of Chas. Eisenmann Photographs, Box 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Location:</td>
<td>No.663</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Keywords:</td>
<td>Entertainment; Family; Lavinia Warren; Minnie Warren; Physical Disability; Popular Culture; Portrait; Short Stature</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

https://www.disabilitymuseum.org/dhm/lib/catcard.html?id=919
Applying Cultural Competencies in Archival Description
Describe African American History

- Lack of context
- Neutrality: “Assumptions of Neutrality Create Biases in Favor of Historical Racism”


https://www.umbrasearch.org/catalog/e0bda72a7dad74880ad738f0528b81c923e16bbd
Applying Cultural Competencies in Archival Description
Describe African American History

- www.umbrasearch.org
  African American History

- 730,561 items from more than 1,000 U.S. archives, libraries, and museums

https://digitalcommons.chapman.edu/library_presentations/23

Local Armed Service Associations. Bremerton, Washington: Negro, 1943-1946. (Box 55, Folder 37)

National Board of the Young Men’s Christian Associations. Armed Services Dept

Description
This folder contains materials created/collection by the administration of the YMCA’s Army and Navy Department, later known as the Armed Services Department. This department worked to meet the recreational, spiritual, educational, and other welfare needs of individuals serving in or associated with the United States armed services. This folder specifically contains service to a Bremerton, Washington YMCA club which was segregated and open only to African Americans.

https://www.umbrasearch.org/catalog/e9666fe5f69a2ce0a5b41d99105c69a4e4ba1e6e
Acknowledging Humanity
Identify slave holders and enslaved person

Example from:
Bolding, Kelly. "Reparative Processing: A Case Study in Auditing Legacy Archival Description for Racism"
https://docs.google.com/presentation/d/1MhOx5WVh_yxtrFroMld4IUO8YMT64U5EP4quA/edit?usp=sharing
Sites Incorporating Inclusive Description
Anti-racism Digital Library and Thesaurus

- https://sacred.omeka.net/
- “a clearinghouse for information resources about people, groups, and projects who are building inclusive and caring communities”
- Collaborate on developing the Collections, Glossary and Thesaurus

Core concept: Anti-racism

Preliminary Facets:

Beliefs/Values (e.g. Community, Cosmopolitanism, Diversity, Equality, Equity, Faith, Hospitality, Human Rights, Humanism, Inclusion, Justice, Non-violence, Peace, Spirituality, Tolerance, Unity);

Actions - Practices - Strategies (e.g. Advocacy, Anti-racism training, Anti-violence training, Awareness training, Community building, Conflict resolution, Cultural action, Cultural democracy, Cultural transformation, Dialog/discussions, Education/Educational events, Empathy, Non-violence, Organizational change, Youth activities, Skill-building training); Political participation; Identity politics; Reparation, Investment

Movements (e.g. Civil Rights movement; Interfaith movement)

Policies (affirmative action; includes laws too, e.g. Universal Declaration of Human Rights, Genetic Information Non-discrimination Act of 2008 (GINA) USA):

https://sacred.omeka.net/thesaurus
Sites Incorporating Inclusive Description

- **Digital Transgender Archive**
  - [https://www.digitaltransgenderarchive.net/](https://www.digitaltransgenderarchive.net/)
  - “increase the accessibility of transgender history”

- **LGBTQ+ Library, Indiana University Bloomington**
  - [https://lgbtq.indiana.edu/programs-services/library/index.html](https://lgbtq.indiana.edu/programs-services/library/index.html)

- See printscreen (right)

---

**Fake, Vol. 1**
by Sanami Matoh
Paperback, 2003

- Tags: bisexual, graphic novel
- Collection: Graphic Novels
- Series: Fake (1)
- Status: AVAILABLE
- Call number: 9.852 MATfa 2003 v.1

**Yuri Monogatari Volume 3**
by Various
Paperback, 2006

- Tags: graphic novel, lesbians, yuri
- Collection: Graphic Novels
- Series: Yuri Monogatari (3)
- Status: AVAILABLE
- Call number: 9.856 ALCyu 2006 v.3

**Love is Love**
by Marc Andreyko

Sites Incorporating Inclusive Description

- LibraryThing [https://www.librarything.com/](https://www.librarything.com/)
  - Includes user-contributed inclusive terms

- Temple University Library. “SCRC Statement on Potentially Harmful Language in Archival Description and Cataloging” [https://library.temple.edu/policies/14](https://library.temple.edu/policies/14)
  - Actively weighing whether the efficiency or preservation of context from re-using or not remediating problematic and potentially offensive description is worth the affect it may have on users encountering that description.
  - Clearly indicating (through use of quotation marks, notes, or other explanation) what language comes from an external source or is legacy/older description, and which was written by SCRC staff.
  - Researching how the community describes itself and its own histories, finding other institutions that have grappled with similar collections, and/or discussing the issue directly with the people or organizations who created or are described by the materials.
Tools

- Includes thesauri, subject heading lists, best practice guides
- American Folklore Society. “American Folklore Society Ethnographic Thesaurus.”
  https://id.loc.gov/vocabulary/ethnographicTerms.html
  - Created by the Association of Manitoba Archives
  http://www.worldcat.org/oclc/882509758
  - “A project of the National Council for Research on Women and the Business and Professional Women's Foundation.”


- up-to-date and comprehensive subject heading guide for queer folks in the LCSH/LCGFT/LCDGT
- Search results of sexual minorities (and minority), queer, lesbian, gay, gender, orientation, intersex, transgender, transexual, and bisexual.
- Example:

  Queer comic books, strips, etc (May Subd Geog)
  UF GLBTQ+ comic books, strips, etc
  UF LGBTQ+ comic books, strips, etc
  UF Sexual minority comic books, strips, etc
  BT Comic books, strips, etc

“These Protocols are presented to guide libraries and archives in engaging in culturally responsive care of Native American archival materials and in providing culturally appropriate service to communities. Librarians and archivists should be aware that each tribe, band, and community is unique.”

Table of Contents

- Building Relationships of Mutual Respect
- Striving for Balance in Content and Perspectives
- Accessibility and Use
- Culturally Sensitive Materials
- Providing Context
- Native American Intellectual Property Issues
- Copying and Repatriation of Records to Native American Communities
- Native American Research Protocols
- Reciprocal Education and Training
- Awareness of Native American Communities and Issues
Tools

  - Example: Accessible web design: Creating web pages according to universal design principles to eliminate or reduce barriers, including those that affect people with disabilities. Ideally, all websites should conform to Level AAA of the Web Content Accessibility Guidelines 2.0. For more information about these guidelines, please see the W3C Web Accessibility Initiative website at [http://www.w3.org/WAI/WCAG2AAA-Conformance](http://www.w3.org/WAI/WCAG2AAA-Conformance)

  - Companion to broad subject term vocabularies (e.g., LCSH)
Tools

Homosaurus

Tree View:

http://homosaurus.org/tree
Pervasive developmental disorders

Behavioural and emotional disorders with onset usually occurring in childhood and adolescence

F90 Hyperkinetic disorders
F91 Conduct disorders
F92 Mixed disorders of conduct and emotions
F93 Emotional disorders with onset specific to childhood
F94 Disorders of social functioning with onset specific to childhood and adolescence
F95 Tic disorders
F98 Other behavioural and emotional disorders with onset usually occurring in childhood and adolescence
https://institute-genderequality.org/library-archive/thesaurus/

Description
1. general term for both a political, social movement and a philosophy which criticizes and opposes the inequality between women and men; feminism thus constitutes a source of inspiration for women's studies
2. the word 'feminism' was introduced at the end of the nineteenth century and its meaning is not the same in different periods of history; revaluation of the experiences and culture of women is common to all meanings

Category
- politics/policy
- social relations
- women's studies

More general term
- political movements
- social movements
- theories
- world views

Feminism

Used for

More specific
- anarcha feminism
- Christian feminism
- cultural feminism
- cyber-feminism
- ecofeminism

- anti-feminism
- anti-racism
- black feminism
- deconstruction
- emancipation
- lesbian movements
- women's movements
- women's studies

Resource Lists


- Metadata recommendations:

  - Voice and Style
    - Decenter “neutrality” and “objectivity” in favor of “respect” and “care.”
    - Avoid passive voice when describing oppressive relationships
      - “Four Kent State University students were killed on May 4, 1970, during a clash between the Ohio National Guard and a crowd gathered to protest the Vietnam War.”
      - “Members of the Ohio National Guard killed four Kent State University students during a mass protest against the Vietnam War.”
    - Focus on the humanity of an individual before their identity/ies
      - “documents the business dealings of a Black woman named Maria in 18th century Mexico”
      - “documents the business dealings of Maria, a Black woman in 18th century Mexico”
Resource Lists

- Refrain from writing flowery, valorizing biographical notes for collection creators.
  - Remove and refrain from including evaluative terms like “preeminent,” “renowned,” “genius,” or “seminal” that serve to praise collection creators.

- Use accurate and strong language such as lynching, rape, murder, and hate mail when they are appropriate. Do not let your discomfort with the terms censor the material.

- Describe relationships of power when they are important for understanding the context of records (e.g., Racism, slurs, white supremacy, colonialism, and histories of oppression).
  - “Thomas Jefferson was a known enslaver despite his legacy as a supporter of individual rights.”

- Handling Racist Folder Titles and Creator-Sourced Description
  - preserve but contextualize creator-sourced original description
  - draw a distinction between the creator-supplied description and archivist-supplied description via quotation marks, processing information note, scope and content note, and/or another method.
  - replace offensive language in primary user-facing description
  - Make a distinction between the institutional voice/archivist’s voice and the voice of the collection creator
  - Research how the community being described feels about certain terms from [https://archivesforblacklives.files.wordpress.com/2019/10/ardr_final.pdf](https://archivesforblacklives.files.wordpress.com/2019/10/ardr_final.pdf)
Resource Lists

Describing Slavery Records

- Use “enslaved” or “captive” [person/woman/man/child/laborer] rather than “slave” when describing people held in bondage.
- Use “free [person|man|woman] of color” “freed[person|man|woman],” or another term to describe those who were not enslaved during a period when slavery existed in that society.
- Humanize documents from all sides (e.g., include the seller and purchaser’s names for deeds).
- Use available information to name enslaved people.
- Use enslaved or formerly enslaved people as primary entry......

from https://archivesforblacklives.files.wordpress.com/2019/10/ardr_final.pdf

- Society of American Archivists, Description Section. “Inclusive Description resources.”
  https://www2.archivists.org/groups/description-section/inclusive-description

  https://www.library.wisc.edu/gwslibrarian/bibliographies/disrupting-whiteness-in-libraries/
Research- and Theory-Oriented Works


from Inclusive Metadata & Conscious Editing Resources List
Embracing Equity, Diversity and Inclusion (EDI) in Library Cataloging

Program information, Role of the Professional Librarian in Technical Services Interest Group, ALA Core IG Week 2021

Programs:

A Holistic Approach to the Planning and Implementation of Metadata Inclusiveness
Charlene Chou, Head of Knowledge Access, New York University Libraries

Creating the SSDN Inclusive Metadata & Conscious Editing Resources List
Elliot Williams, Digital Initiatives Metadata Librarian, University of Miami Libraries

Forming a Working Group to Address EDI Issues in the Library
Annamarie C. Klose, Metadata Initiatives Librarian, The Ohio State University Libraries

The Creation, Enrichment and Exchange of Public-Domain Bibliographic Records Between Public Libraries
Tris Shores, Founder of the Open Bibliographic Exchange project

Classification and Cataloging of LGBTQAI+ Material in the Elementary School Library
Linda Garrison, Doctoral Candidate, Texts and Technology, University of Central Florida

Thinking Outside the Book: Research on Non-traditional Cataloging & Classification

Program information, ALA ALCTS CaMMS Cataloging & Classification Research Interest Group, 2019 ALA Annual Conference

Light Talk

“An astronaut, a nurse, and a prostitute walk into a library...”
: How to Effectively Explain Our Value to Non-Catalogers
Amanda Ros, Coordinator of Monograph Copy Cataloging, Texas A&M University
Acknowledgement

- **SSDN Metadata Working Group:**
  Alejandra Barbon, Sai Deng, Carady De Simone, Patricia Fiorillo, Rory Grennan, Karlen Harrison-Kane, Xiying Mi, Matthew Miguez, Marina Morgan, Wilhelmina Randtke, Kaleena Rivera, Madeline Sims, Ximena Valdivia, José Vila, Elliot Williams (Chair), Gabriella Williams, and Keila Zayas-Ruiz.
Contact

- Sai Deng, sai.deng@ucf.edu
  - Metadata Librarian
    University of Central Florida

Thank you!