

1979

## Book Reviews

Florida Historical Society  
membership@myfloridahistory.org

 Part of the [American Studies Commons](#), and the [United States History Commons](#)

Find similar works at: <https://stars.library.ucf.edu/fhq>

University of Central Florida Libraries <http://library.ucf.edu>

This Book Review is brought to you for free and open access by STARS. It has been accepted for inclusion in Florida Historical Quarterly by an authorized editor of STARS. For more information, please contact [STARS@ucf.edu](mailto:STARS@ucf.edu).

---

### Recommended Citation

Society, Florida Historical (1979) "Book Reviews," *Florida Historical Quarterly*. Vol. 58 : No. 1 , Article 9.  
Available at: <https://stars.library.ucf.edu/fhq/vol58/iss1/9>

## BOOK REVIEWS

*The Awakening of St. Augustine: The Anderson Family and the Oldest City, 1821-1924.* By Thomas Graham. (St. Augustine: St. Augustine Historical Society, 1978. ix, 289 pp. Preface, illustrations, notes, appendices, bibliography, index. \$8.00.)

This is both the story of the city and people of St. Augustine during the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries and an account of the Andrew Andersons, *pere et fils*. The elder Andrew, of Scottish ancestry and a native of New York, came to St. Augustine with his wife and two daughters in 1829. A physician, Anderson would devote his energies almost exclusively to agriculture and commerce until 1839 when, at fifty years of age, he died ministering to victims of a yellow fever epidemic. The younger Andrew, born in the same year as his father's death, studied in Paris, at Princeton, and at New York's College of Physicians and Surgeons, then returned to spend his life promoting the fortunes of both his family and St. Augustine until 1924 when, weighted with many honors and accomplishments, he died in Markland, the family home. The two Andersons depicted here were dominant personalities in St. Augustine during the time period rehearsed in this book. While other works have fastened on the political, military, and ecclesiastical leaders in St. Augustine during the nineteenth century-or on spectacular short-time residents such as Henry Flagler-Dr. Graham has enabled us to see the development of a community through the lives of its most significant family. One is reminded of certain citizens in the various cities of Florida today who, though they may not hold public office, command the respect of all, exercise a salutary leadership through wise counsel, and promote the general welfare by service in numerous civic activities. Such were the Andersons, father and son.

Not every undertaking of the elder Andrew succeeded, but to him must go credit for giving St. Augustine its first significant agricultural and commercial successes in the American period. Beginning with orange groves on twenty acres which he called Markland, Anderson branched out into figs, grapes, peanuts,

beehives, Chinese mulberry trees (in which for a time he greatly prospered); a railroad and canal; and a bank and shipping. All failed in the end, but for reasons that Graham emphasizes again and again: the continued general failure of St. Augustine's economy throughout the century as the result of epidemics, wars, freezes, inaccessibility to ocean-going vessels, other natural impediments to trade, and, it must be said, indolence of the local population.

The younger Andrew came to manhood at a time when St. Augustine was first attracting in large numbers what today are called "tourists" but then were called "strangers." Most of these crowded the town's hotels for health reasons, usually tuberculosis. Graham quotes one hotel resident of the 1850s: "You hear the funereal cough all over the house, and in the parlor they loll at full length on the sofas, and expectorate almost constantly." By the 1870s, however, the visiting winter population had changed, and many came to Florida to escape the northern winters. With the arrival of Flagler in the 1880s and his construction of the Ponce de Leon Hotel (now Flagler College), the winter visitors list represented yet another clientele, that of wealth and sophistication. Dr. Anderson and Flagler were close friends. Graham cites evidence to show that Anderson, as Flagler's personal agent, enjoyed not only the latter's professional confidence and esteem but also his warm friendship. Graham's pages on the Flagler period are, to this reviewer, the most interesting contribution to our knowledge of St. Augustine in the years covered by the volume. As for Anderson's contributions to the city he loved, they are memorialized in part by the bay front statue of Juan Ponce de Leon, which he arranged to have cast from the original in San Juan; the sculptored flagstaff base, which he commissioned, near the east end of the plaza; the two Carrera marble lions, copies from the Loggia dei Lanzi in Florence, which he commissioned and had placed at the east approach to the Bridge of Lions; and Markland, the impressive family home on King Street, which has been added to the National Register of Historic Places.

Much of the story of St. Augustine and Florida contained in these pages has been told elsewhere. The special merit of this book—and it has many merits—is that the writer was able to use the previously untouched Anderson family papers generously made available to him by Mrs. Clarissa Anderson Gibbs, daughter

of the second Andrew Anderson. The writer has skillfully used these papers as a lens through which to view a 100-year period that had not been pulled together before into a continuous narrative. The rich diversity of sources employed, the scholarly thoroughness of both the narrative and the citations, and the quality of the writing, editing, and production make this volume a significant addition to the shelf of Florida history, as they also mark out Thomas Graham as an important new talent in the field.

*University of Florida*

MICHAEL V. GANNON

*Situacion historica de las Floridas en la segunda mitad del siglo XVIII.* By Elena Sanchez-Fabres Mirat. (Madrid: Ministry of Foreign Affairs, 1977. 330 pp. Introduction, notes, bibliography.)

This scholarly study of Florida during the Second Spanish Period (1783-1819), was written as a doctoral dissertation at the University of Madrid by Elena Sanchez-Fabres under the supervision of the eminent historian, Mario Hernandez Sanchez-Barba. It was published by the Spanish Ministry of Foreign Affairs as part of Spain's contribution to the American Bicentennial. Dr. Sanchez-Fabres of Barcelona is presently on the editorial staff of the Spanish edition of *Scientific American*.

The book deals with the various American efforts to absorb Florida after the Treaty of Paris, which ended the American Revolution and extended diplomatic recognition to the United States, was signed in 1783. The treaty returned Florida to Spanish control. The United States eventually succeeded in acquiring Florida as Dr. Sanchez-Fabres points out in her last chapter, "The Treaty of Cessation of 1819." Florida became an American territory in 1821. Prior to the signing of the Adams-Onis Treaty in 1819, four sections of Spanish Florida had already been annexed by the United States. Except for Amelia Island, this retrenchment of Florida's boundaries occurred mainly in West Florida. A major portion of Dr. Sanchez-Fabres's study deals with the area west of the Suwannee and Apalachicola rivers. The author believes that England's duplicity in preparing two separate versions of the

peace treaty in 1783 set the stage for America's advance into Florida. One treaty would apply if the United States should come into possession of Florida; another, if the territory was to be retroceded to Spain, which indeed is what occurred. The American version would have given much more territory to the United States. As a result, according to Sanchez-Fabres, many Americans believed that they were justified in moving into the territory of a peaceful sovereign power, even one who had rendered invaluable aid to the American cause during the Revolution. The Louisiana Purchase in 1803 accelerated the American hunger for more and more territory. Manifest Destiny had become a way of life for many Americans by the beginning of the nineteenth century.

While this study by Sanchez-Fabres does not add much to what Arthur Whitaker and Jack D. L. Holmes have already written, it does detail in excellent fashion the inept and fruitless actions of Spanish authorities who wanted to halt American expansion, or at least to slow it down. The author supplies information about the difficult and often confusing events associated with the Yazoo Strip controversy, that area of land from the thirty-first parallel north to 32° 26' which included the Natchez District. There were perhaps some 45,000 Indians living in Florida-Creeks, Cherokees, Chicachas, and Chapas-at the time. How Spain related to these Indians is explained, along with descriptions of the activities of Pantun, Leslie and Company officials, Alexander McGillivray, William Augustus Bolles, James Wilkinson, Edmund Pendleton Gaines, Andrew Jackson, Aaron Burr, General George Matthews, and Gregor McGregor.

The book has many weaknesses. It includes much material and data, but not all of it has been as well synthesized as this reviewer had hoped. Organization is defective, and the style is a bit pedestrian. It is apparent that the author wrote a dissertation, and it was hurried into print so quickly that there was not enough time for proper revision and rewriting. The absence of an index is annoying. A major defect is the lack of maps. A book such as this needs maps for clarification. One should know where forts, military strongholds, Indian villages, etc., were located. With all of these deficiencies, Dr. Sanchez-Fabres has produced a new and vital work which adds to our knowledge and understanding of the

Second Spanish Period in Florida. She supports her writing with much original documentation from the great archives of Spain.

*University of South Florida*

CHARLES W. ARNADE

*Eighteenth-Century Florida: The Impact of the American Revolution.* Edited by Samuel Proctor. (Gainesville: University of Florida Press, 1978. xvii, 149 pp. Introduction, symposium participants, notes, illustrations. \$9.00.)

The publication of the proceedings of the Fifth (and last) Annual Bicentennial Symposium sponsored by the American Revolution Bicentennial Commission of Florida marks the culmination of a celebratory undertaking of truly heroic proportions. The scholarly productivity inspired and supported by the Florida Bicentennial Commission, the reprints, monographs, and papers so efficiently guided from tentative project to final print by Dr. Samuel Proctor, all deserve the highest praise—and through such volumes as this their accomplishment will long be remembered by all who share an interest in the history of Florida.

The essays gathered here fully reflect “the impact of the American Revolution” on eighteenth-century Florida. Professors J. Leitch Wright and J. Barton Starr, whose recent books have thoroughly destroyed the myth that only thirteen American colonies were involved in the internecine conflict, summarize aspects of their larger works. Wright looks at the remarkably varied population of the “loyalist bastion” and remarks upon the benefits the Revolution brought to East Florida: increased numbers, prosperity, and representative government—all to be surrendered at the war’s end. Starr delineates the military fate of West Florida, a colony doomed to foreign conquest, loyal subjects of George III who went down fighting. George C. Rogers’s commentary goes far toward demonstrating the impact of the Bicentennial itself upon modern scholarship, for he discusses the contents of the James Grant papers and the exciting prospects they open for probing yet deeper into Florida colonial history. Robert A. Rutland provides an overview of “the Southern Contribution” to the War for Independence and notes that American

sectionalism was a very real-if unattractive-facet of the revolutionary impact.

Turning from politics to the people themselves, Theodore G. Corbett analyzes the complex structures of East Florida households in the second Spanish period-a fascinating piece of basic research in what might be termed human archeology. Albert Manucy and Thomas G. Ledford demonstrate what marvels of historical information architecture and the lowly potsherd can still disclose, and Anna C. Eberly delves into the intriguing question of "what our Southern frontier women wore." Michael V. Gannon reviews the sad state of religion in late colonial Florida, both British and Spanish, and Kenneth Coleman comments upon some parallels and dissimilarities between Florida and Georgia.

Apart from their particular content, these essays-and the previous four volumes of Symposium papers-possess considerable historiographic interest. They demonstrate that scholarship has advanced significantly in the generation since Cecil Johnson, Clinton Howard, and Charles L. Mowat virtually created the history of the British and Revolutionary period in the Floridas. That advance has penetrated deeply at certain points and widely across the whole long front from St. Augustine to Manchac. As a result, the history of the Floridas can never again be written as it was in the 1940s. Furthermore, these volumes prove that there is a new corps of scholar-enthusiasts at work, brought together in the comradeship of these Bicentennial Symposia, who are outlining the strategy and doing the spade-work for a better, more stimulating, and a far more enlightening history of the colonial period than our respected predecessors even dared dream of. Thanks to the American Revolution Bicentennial, its generals and its shock-troops, there is today new insight, new knowledge, and there are new sources yet to explore. Let us hasten, in the concluding words of Theodore Corbett, to "make the best of this new learning."

*Auburn University*

ROBERT R. REA

*The Florida Wars.* By Virginia Bergman Peters. (Hamden, Connecticut: Archon Books, 1979. 331 pp. Preface, illustrations, abbreviations, notes, index. \$22.50.)

The author of this book has canvassed the literature of the Second Seminole War effectively. She devotes seventy-seven per cent of the text to retelling the story of that most important of the three Florida Indian wars. She has uncovered a great many interesting new details, and made some significant original generalizations. Her major contribution, in this reviewer's opinion, relates to the role of blacks in the events leading up to the conflict and during the war itself. It was not as much the blacks as the greed of slaveholders which was a primary cause of the war and a primary reason for its duration for seven long years from 1835 to 1842. Ms. Peters establishes this beyond dispute.

Not all of her generalizations concerning the blacks are beyond dispute. There is no evidence to substantiate the degree of miscegenation between red and black which she seems to believe existed. She makes the interesting point that the Battle of Okeechobee, fought on Christmas Day 1837, was the last action in which significant numbers of blacks stood beside their Indian allies. Up to that time Negro men had proved themselves to be as good warriors as the redmen. It has never been clear why the black fighters split away from their Indian allies and became the guides who led the white invaders to hideouts that they could never have found on their own. Peters adds little in that area.

Like every other book written about the Florida Indians in the last fifteen years, this one is sympathetic to the Indians. It is plain that the author regards the Indian fight for their homeland to be as gallant an epic as can be found in the history of the United States. Had the heroes of the conflict been white instead of red, history books would have made as much of this fight as they have, for example, of the battle waged by white Texans to free themselves from Mexican control. The nobility of the Indian's military stand is probably the reason why almost every year during the last decade, a new book has appeared on the subject, whereas for more than a century no historian or writer seemed concerned about this conflict.

The author's treatment of the combat narrative is interesting. Often it contains more detail than I think conveys meaning to an

informed reader. On the other hand she presents useful generalizations. For example, she notes that the Indians would sustain heavy losses, contrary to the slant of their culture, in order to protect their food supply. She ascribes more strategic planning to the red leaders than I think they ever formulated. Also she ascribes to those leaders virtually kingly power, which I do not believe they had. White men found it useful to think of their opponents as great men, so they did such things as fire a one hundred gun salute for Philip, or King Philip as he is known in American literature. This they did when he was being forced to leave his homeland to go west. He died en route to his new home.

Ms. Peters's sympathy for the United States Army is much less than what she shows for the Indians. On p. 119 she refers to the army as the Indians' secret weapon. Also on p. 189 she points out that more than one half of the redmen captured and shipped west were taken not in battle, but while conferring with the commanders, more than once under a flag of truce. She is, however, fair, for she traces the learning process by which the commanders gradually abandoned European forms of warfare and replaced them with methods which enabled them to seek out and destroy small parties of the foe. Also she makes it clear that the ranking officers regretted the plight of their enemy, and thoroughly disliked the task which duty had obliged them to carry out.

There is not much material in this book on the other Florida wars. There are forty-two pages, sixteen per cent of the text, devoted to the First Seminole War, and sixteen pages, seven per cent of the rest to the Third. Since no full history of the Third Seminole War has ever been printed, it is disappointing to find the treatment here so lean.

*University of Florida*

JOHN K. MAHON

*Sources of American Independence: Selected Manuscripts From the Collections of the William L. Clements Library.* Edited by Howard Peckham. 2 vols. (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1978. vii, 622 pp. Preface, notes, editors, index. \$20.00.)

Howard Peckham has assembled a good cross-section of ma-

terial from the William L. Clements Library's revolutionary war collections in this two-volume set, which concludes the Clements Library Bicentennial Studies, published with the financial aid of the Lilly Endowment, Inc. *Sources of American Independence* contains eight selections built around particular issues, such as the Huddy-Lippincott affair, or individuals, such as Edmund Quincy or James Ferguson. Peckham, however, leaves the actual editing to individual scholars, and the result is a work of uneven quality, ranging from the exceptionally good to the barely acceptable.

L. Kinvin Wroth's treatment of the proceedings of the court-martial of Captain Richard Lippincott, a loyalist officer who was tried for the murder of New Jersey's Captain Joshua Huddy, is the most accomplished piece in either volume. Wroth provides penetrating analyses of the technical questions of law (especially the crucial one of jurisdiction) as well as of the difficult political and military problems associated with this case, which so clearly demonstrates the vicious nature of the partisan warfare waged in the New York-New Jersey environs.

Arlene Phillips Shy's compilation of the letters of Edmund Quincy, Boston patriot and father-in-law of John Hancock, is a valuable addition to the available knowledge of Massachusetts revolutionaries and highlights the peculiar melange of political radicalism, mercantilism, and Puritanism that marked notable New England patriot leaders. These well-edited letters reflect painstaking scholarship.

The harshness of the constant guerilla warfare is also demonstrated by Hugh Rankin's section on British Major Patrick Ferguson and Robert G. Mitchell's selection of Anthony Wayne and Nathanael Greene's correspondence. The Wayne-Greene letters for 1782 cover the successful American efforts to regain Georgia. Rankin sympathetically introduces selected 1778-1780 correspondence of Ferguson, an innovative officer who commanded regular and loyalist troops in New York and the Carolinas after the capture of Charleston, South Carolina, until his death at King's Mountain on October 7, 1780.

The war in the South receives further attention in William B. Willcox's presentation of the Clinton-Parker feud over British failures at Charleston, South Carolina, in 1776, and Newport, Rhode Island, in 1780. The exchanges between Sir Henry Clinton

and Sir Peter Parker expose the conflicting aims of the British navy and army in North America and their critical lapses of cooperation. The footnotes with General Clinton's marginalia speak volumes about why Britain was defeated in the war.

An anonymous but very informative journal of the Brunswick corps in Canada from November 7, 1776, to July 10, 1777, has been translated and edited by V. C. Hubbs. The journal provides a fascinating account of troop activities in Canada as the Europeans accommodated themselves to frontier duty. But a lack of biographical information limits its usefulness.

Thomas Gage's correspondence with Viscount Barrington, the British secretary at war, recounts the well-known story of British lack of insight into the revolutionary nature of the American rebellion. And John Shy's editorial deletions distort the perception even further by omitting "political trivia and administrative routine." (vol. I, p. 31, n. 1)

British misunderstandings and blundering programs are also quite visible in the policy papers written by William Knox, British undersecretary of state in the American Department, 1770-1782. Leland J. Bellot presents an informative view of Knox, a key person at a critical point in history. Knox's proposals, including his "Considerations on the Great Question, What is Fit to Be Done with America," should be carefully read by anyone seeking an understanding of British aims in the revolutionary era.

Despite the uneven quality of the introductions and the editorial work, Peckham's two volumes offer non-specialists a golden opportunity to appreciate the breadth of experiences during the rebellion, while reminding specialists of the wide range of revolutionary war collections at the Clements Library of the University of Michigan.

*Library of Congress*

GERARD W. GAWALT

*John Ross, Cherokee Chief.* By Gary F. Moulton. (Athens: University of Georgia Press, 1978. ix, 282 pp. Preface, notes, illustrations, maps, bibliography, index. \$12.00.)

John Ross, described by a Cherokee eulogist as "our greatest chieftain" (p. 195), was not cast in the heroic mold of a Tecumseh

or a Crazy Horse. Slight of build and of relatively small stature, the soft-spoken Ross was descended from the Scots who traded among the Cherokees. A full-blood great-grandmother gave him his only claim to Cherokee ancestry. Although he was born in the heart of the Cherokee Nation in 1790, and lived among them until his death in 1866, he never mastered their language sufficiently to address the Cherokee national councils other than in English. In his only military exploit, he served some months as a second lieutenant with the Cherokee contingent that fought alongside General Andrew Jackson in the Creek War of 1813-1814.

Nevertheless, the full-blood Cherokees came to trust John Ross as they did no other man during his lifetime. He began his political apprenticeship in 1816, was overwhelmingly elected principal chief in 1828, and never afterwards had a serious rival for the post, serving as the true spokesman of the Cherokee majority from the beginning of Andrew Jackson's presidency through that of Abraham Lincoln. The five decades of Ross's service in the Cherokee cause embraced the most famous epoch, and the most critical, in their tragic history, including their remarkable advances of the 1820s, their forced removal in the 1830s, their factional strife during the forties and fifties, and the tribal division during the Civil War.

Throughout his career Ross served his people in a dual capacity, attempting to preserve tribal unity at home on the one hand and to protect tribal interests in Washington on the other. He discovered early that in leading the struggle against removal his efforts were being frustrated as much by disunity among the Cherokee leadership as by the aggressive Georgians and an unrelenting federal government. The chronological narrative clearly reveals this dual role, tracing his movements back and forth between Washington and the Cherokee capital, but a critical breakdown in Cherokee unity was exploited by treaty commissioner John F. Schermerhorn to gain the removal treaty of 1835. The principal chief's strenuous efforts to overturn the treaty very nearly succeeded, keeping him in Washington even as his people were being herded along the Tennessee River for removal to the West. Ross succeeded in securing the contract to conduct the removal, which subsequently gave rise to charges that he profited personally from the Cherokee migration into western exile, but

his biographer could find no concrete evidence in the extant records to substantiate the charges.

Following the removal, the leadership of Ross, "often autocratic and rarely passive" (p. 206), was directed toward the restoration of Cherokee unity, but the depth of bitterness generated by the removal itself, and the factionalism that had contributed to it, precluded a genuine restoration of harmony. Instead, assassinations of pro-removal leaders Boudinot and Ridge widened the gulf between the two factions; internal conflict deepened to a point that approached open warfare, compounded by disputes between the "old settlers" and the more recent arrivals led by Ross; and finally, the opponents of Ross cooperated with the Confederacy during the Civil War, while the faction led by the slave-holding principal chief remained loyal to the Union. The failure of Ross to reunite his people during the post-removal decades was only the crowning disappointment of what was essentially a tragic political career.

The John Ross that emerges in this thoroughly researched and generally well-written political biography is a heroic figure nonetheless, a humane and all too human leader condemned to contend with forces, both from within and from without the Cherokee nation, that no Indian "chieftain," in the circumstances of that epoch could have controlled. The book is an important contribution to the growing body of literature on Indian affairs. Writing with admirable balance and restraint, Moulton displays a sympathy for his subject blended with a scholarly detachment that represents the very best tradition of historical scholarship. If the narrative is less impassioned than some might prefer from such a potentially volatile subject, the solid contribution it makes is more likely to be of enduring value.

*University of Georgia*

CARL VIPPERMAN

*Moral Choices: Memory, Desire, and Imagination in Nineteenth Century American Abolitionism.* By Peter Walker. (Baton Rouge: Louisiana State University Press, 1978. xxi, 387 pp. Acknowledgments, introduction, illustrations, notes, selected bibliography, index. \$24.95.)

This is the first draft of a potentially exciting book. Unfortunately, LSU Press determined to go ahead and publish it without requiring the revisions necessary to make the work fulfill its promise. The subject matter and the approach to it are admirable. Peter Walker provides here biographical sketches of six individuals who were involved in abolitionist activities: Moncure Conway, Jane Swisshelm, Frederick Douglass, Henry Wright, Salmon Chase, and Thomas M. Cooley. His stated goal is "answering the question of *why* these people became abolitionists" (p. xv). He believes that the answers will help to enlarge our understanding of the nature of abolitionism. And he properly believes, and occasionally demonstrates, the value of psychological assessments of private lives in revealing the commitments made to end slavery. He is quite successful here in the case of Conway and Swisshelm. His efforts with Wright are less good, but still intriguing. With Chase he skirts disaster and with Cooley he plummets into it. The essay on Douglass provides revealing insights but is more about the black reformer's encounter with what Walker believes was a white's reform movement.

Walker's methodology is imaginative. He subjects autobiographical material to careful literary analysis. He looks thoughtfully at Conway's autobiography and his attempts at fiction and sees in them dialogues with his parents which uncover the source of the young man's decision for abolition. He carefully and insightfully notes the differences between the three revisions of Douglass's autobiography and sees the changes as evidence of Douglass's growing self-understanding. Swisshelm is primarily revealed through the pages of the newspapers she wrote and edited. Wright and Chase are explored through public and private writings, while Cooley is seen through his work *Constitutional Limitations* and with the occasional help of secondary sources.

All these studies suggest that Walker has adopted a position not recently favored by students of abolition—that anyone who became an abolitionist has some serious explaining to do. The

decision to speak out against human bondage is not seen as a natural, normal response of moral people to an actual evil; some turmoil of conscience, some identity crisis, some unusual personal experiences are assumed necessary to provoke a public outcry. Walker's clinging to this view is useful with Conway and Swiss-helm and Wright, but it becomes rather strained with the others, especially Douglass. If an articulate and intelligent escaped slave wasn't a natural abolitionist, who could be?

While Walker's subject matter and approach are commendable, his execution is not. As a careful work of scholarship, this book is not persuasive. Walker's imagination and his writing skills make us want to believe him. His documentation and research efforts keep shouting, "Don't!" His argument too often rests on reading a sentence or two and then blandly asserting, "He as much as said" (p. 349) or "it may be made out to be" (p. 349), or "might be interpreted" (p. 308) or it "may be read" (pp. 260, 309, 339). This rhetorical style is so pervasive that when Walker says of Douglass that a certain piece of evidence "must not be abused in an effort to make it say too much" (p. 246) the reader is tempted to laugh. Also Walker is given to making sweeping statements about the condition of all of nineteenth-century society and then documenting it with two sources which assume but do not prove what Walker says they prove.

Furthermore, Walker's definition of abolitionism is too broad. To call Cooley an abolitionist because he was a Free Soiler, and "must have had abolition's message . . . drummed into his ears," and in 1884 applauded abolitionists is a triumph of imagination over evidence. But Walker is not overly interested in evidence. His research is so half-hearted that he admits to not having seen a 1967 *Journal of American History* article on Cooley until he had finished writing his chapter. He made no use of the Cooley papers or of Alan Jones's excellent dissertation on him. In a work so concerned with personality this is an unpardonable omission.

His footnoting is based on a non-formula known only to himself. Quoted statements stand unnoted, paragraphs pass, whole sections end without notes at times and with them at others. Perhaps some psychological rage, or split, is the explanation.

Walker himself has more explaining to do. The three sections which begin the book are the most extensive, dealing with Con-

way, Swisshelm, and Douglass. Yet we are consistently left feeling that Walker has dropped them too soon, has not carefully assessed the positions he takes, has failed to relate his discussions to his stated goal. The contrast between Conway's willingness to give up the Civil War if the South would give up slavery with Garrison's and Phillips's rejection of this idea assumes without proof, and without serious research, that the latter two were inconsistent. Swisshelm's "abolitionism" in Minnesota seems opportunistic, not moral, and her actual contributions to postwar struggle for equality are not related to her life, but stuck off in a separate chapter. The same fate is provided to public activities of Conway and Douglass in the postwar period. This material should have been incorporated in the earlier ones to reveal the actual dialogue that exists between public and private life. Walker promises to explain the relevance of Karl Polanyi to abolitionism in chapters on Chase and Cooley, but in fact never does so. He ends the book with a page and a half description of Holmes's *Lochner* dissent which Walker apparently believes will produce some epiphany in the reader. In fact, it produces only confusion linked with amazement that Walker has repeated with Holmes the shallow understanding of legal issues that he revealed in discussing Chase and Cooley.

Overall this book is both interesting and frustrating. Walker knows instinctively that the study of history requires imagination. He is venturing in a field where imagination-is imperative and Walker has plenty of it. His next assignment should be to consider carefully the relationship between acts of imagination and the historian's claim to be telling the truth about the past, a truth that is documentable. Then he should rewrite this book using both his fine imagination and his professional training to make his study an effort in imaginative history, not one in which the reader must choose between them. While I admire this book, too often I find that I cannot trust it.

*University of Kansas*

PHILLIP S. PALUDAN

*The South and the Politics of Slavery, 1828-1856.* By William J. Cooper, Jr. (Baton Rouge: Louisiana State University Press, 1978. xv, 401 pp. Acknowledgments, preface, prologue, notes, epilogue, appendices, bibliography, index. \$22.50.)

For more than a decade, Mr. Cooper has had a place among historians of ability. His *The Conservative Regime: South Carolina, 1877-1890* (1968) is excellent. Now we have the pleasure of studying a more recent book. This time the Cooper range is much wider, the grip on his subject no less firm, and the insight of decided worth to everyone intrigued by the antebellum South.

The author goes into appreciable detail in discussing southern politics from the first triumphant Jackson election through the 1856 presidential contest. There is also some coverage of preliminaries to the 1828 canvass, and of 1856-1860 events; although briefer than other features in the volume, these too make contributions—mainly in connection with perspective. The principal Cooper conclusions are that “the battle for southern votes required the never-ending blaring of the slavery issue” (p. 373), and that southern politicians were “‘dedicated to guarding the interests of the South” (p. 374). If a cynic remarks “What’s new in that?” a justifiable answer is that Professor Cooper’s documentation is at least as thorough and representative as any previously offered.

Cooper, moreover, tells the story in a luminous way. His sentences are trenchant. His paragraphs march. His treatment of men and measures has all the immediacy of their times. On every page, and between the lines as well, there are proofs of months and years of hard digging plus the sandpapering and polishing which make the difference between readability on one hand and slovenly or wooden style on the other.

One of the assets I value most is the manner in which Cooper deals with the works of fellow scholars. Now in notes, now in the text, he refers to their points of view with smoothness and sound sense. Avery Craven, Carl N. Degler, Eugene D. Genovese, and Richard P. McCormick are some he discusses pro and con. Younger ones are likewise there—Chaplain W. Morrison for instance, and Eric Foner, William Freehling, Michael F. Holt, and Joel H. Silbey.

In a particularly useful footnote on p. 53, the author differ-

entiate between opinions of Richard H. Brown and Richard B. Latner on the degree of southern influence in Jackson's White House. Related examples could be mentioned. Cooper explains where he himself stands in controversial zones. And when he disagrees, he does so temperately. Thus specialists and non-specialists are enabled to see Cooper and his predecessors in what he regards as a correct historiographical relationship.

If a demur is in order, it is to the effect that Cooper might have been more careful in providing safeguards for a few statements. One exhibit in this respect appears on p. 88, where he says that after Jackson backed Richard M. Johnson for the vice-presidential nomination in 1836 "never again would southerners rely on assumptions." The context suggests that Cooper may have meant "southern Democrats" instead of "Southerners". Yet the assertion is there. As the author later demonstrates, Southerners did rely on 1848 assumptions *in re* Zachary Taylor.

*The South and the Politics of Slavery* is especially provocative respecting John Tyler who, Cooper says, "had more influence on southern politics than any other southern politician between Andrew Jackson and the demise of the second party system" (p. 176). While I am not entirely satisfied with two assertions concerning the Compromise of 1850, Cooper's coverage of the topic is far superior to most. Minor caveats are of little importance when a book has such overall quality. It is a delight to praise the Cooper achievement, and to recommend it with enthusiasm.

University of Kentucky

HOLMAN HAMILTON

*Medicine and Slavery: The Diseases and Health Care of Blacks in Antebellum Virginia.* By Todd L. Savitt. (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1978. 332 pp. Preface, illustrations, graphs, notes, afterword, note on sources, index. \$15.00.)

*Medicine and Slavery* by Todd Savitt, a University of Florida professor, represents the broadest, deepest, and most perceptive study of its theme that has yet appeared. Earlier treatments have been brief, or localized, or intent on using slave health to prove either the institution's benign or its cruel character, or lacking in an adequate comprehension of antebellum disease and therapy

as understood in their own time or as evaluated from the perspective of current scientific knowledge. For example, the discussion of medicine in Fogel and Engerman's controversial quantitative study of slavery, *Time on the Cross*, Savitt terms (p. 312) "the least statistical part of the book" which "often simply repeats statements from traditional historical and literary sources."

In contrast, Savitt's work possesses many merits. Three perhaps stand out. Foremost is his mastery of setting. His three years of medical school training before shifting to the historical profession and his sophisticated immersion in the sources give Savitt the kind of understanding of eighteenth- and nineteenth-century medicine that prevents his blaming slave-owners invidiously for therapeutic inadequacies shared by everyone, considering the then state of the medical art. Moreover, his knowledge of recent medical research concerned with differences between black and white reactions to a few diseases permits insight from hindsight into slave health. Second, Savitt has exploited every conceivable kind of manuscript and printed primary source pertinent to his theme and region, in all a rich array. These include data from which Savitt seeks, when he can, to quantify trends, always cautioning of risks due to the amount and nature of the evidence. Third, Savitt's interpretive stance deserves commendation. While imbued with human compassion, he has no ideological axe to grind. He fulfills admirably his purpose of revealing, elucidating, explaining.

Except for the first chapter and afterword, where his focus is upon the entire South, Savitt concentrates on Virginia, though maintaining (p. 312) that the situation there "typified conditions throughout the pre-Civil War South." Since the nature of slavery in the frontier South came to differ from that of slavery in Virginia, one might suppose that differences in health dimensions may have developed. Indeed, Savitt recognizes some differences, as in the impact of epidemics. Overall, differences may not have been consequential; nonetheless, a similar study of a frontier South state would be worth making.

The harshness of slavery emerges from the facts presented in Savitt's dispassionate descriptive style. While the major point is that blacks and whites suffered principally from the same diseases, blacks suffered more because of an environment, whether rural or

urban, more conducive to contagion: crowded and dirty, with poor sanitary facilities and a superabundance of rodents and insects. Inadequate clothing led to pneumonia, a scarcity of shoes to worms, which afflicted half of Virginia's blacks at some time during their lives. Diet is hard to evaluate, though it was often inadequate, especially for industrial bondsmen in rural areas. Poor working conditions and punishment added hazards to health.

A few true differences between black and white immunity and susceptibility to diseases have come to be recognized by modern medicine. Perhaps twenty-two per cent of Africans brought to the United States possessed genetic blood defects which, while threatening sickle cell disease, provided protection from the most severe form of malaria. Blacks also possessed a higher tolerance to heat, preserving electrolytes better than whites, and a greater resistance to the yellow fever virus. On the other hand, blacks had less racial immunity than whites to miliary tuberculosis and had a greater tendency to lactase deficiency. Some of these differences were observed during slavery days. Observing them, slavery apologists "capitalized on these conditions to illustrate the inferiority of blacks to whites, to rationalize the use of this 'less fit' racial group as slaves, to justify subjecting Negro slaves to harsh working conditions in extreme dampness and heat in the malarious regions of the South, and to prove to their critics that they recognized the special medical weaknesses of blacks and took these failings into account when providing for their human chattel" (p. 17).

Slaveowners called the tune on treatment, although slaves sought to pursue an alternate therapeutic course by means of self-dosage and conjure doctors. Compassion, concern over cost, fear about the loss of valuable property were among the motives of slaveowners when deciding to give up on their own ministrations and call a doctor. Some contract practice occurred on plantations and in industries employing slaves and free blacks. Therapy differed little as between whites and blacks, although physicians felt freer to try bolder and more experimental procedures on blacks. Medical journal articles reporting such experiments often displayed a callous, flippant, racist tone. The most important medical experiment employing slaves conducted in Virginia was not carried out by a physician but by a President of

the United States, Thomas Jefferson. “. . . [F]ew people today,” says Savitt, “recognize the significant role that blacks played in the introduction and acceptance of vaccination in America” (p. 297).

*Emory University*

JAMES HARVEY YOUNG

*Life and Labor on Argyle Island: Letters and Documents of a Savannah River Rice Plantation, 1833-1867.* Edited by James M. Clifton. (Savannah: The Beehive Press, 1978. xlvii, 365 pp. Introduction, notes, illustrations, maps. \$30.00.)

Within the broad expanse of the South's Cotton Kingdom lay a relatively small province devoted to the culture of rice. Although limited in size, the southern rice region produced abundantly and supported some of the wealthiest and most influential families in the antebellum South. In *Life and Labor on Argyle Island*, editor James M. Clifton and The Beehive Press offer a case study in rice planting by presenting in print materials relating to Gowrie plantation.

Located on Argyle Island in the Savannah River, a short distance above the city of Savannah, Gowrie remained in control of the Manigault family of South Carolina for two generations. Charles Manigault purchased the plantation in 1833, and he and his son, Louis, operated it continuously, either directly or through overseers, through the Civil War era. Editor Clifton terms the records of Gowrie “the most complete surviving records for any rice plantation.” These records include plantation journals, letters, slave lists, overseer contracts and instructions—about 3,000 manuscript pages in all. From this raw material the reader may acquire a rather detailed understanding of the human and economic factors involved in rice planting.

Of interest, for example, are the contrasts between the culture of rice and that of other staple crops. For efficient production in volume, rice required warm climate and fresh water flooding. Because of these factors, rice planters were most successful when they located their fields along southern rivers with strong tidal flows at points near enough to the coast to take advantage of tidal movement, yet far enough from the coast to avoid salt water. The

rice-growing region was thus confined to a narrow strip of bottom land extending from the Cape Fear River southward. Rice flourished, but people fared less well in what was then an unhealthy human environment. Thus, rice planters were often absentee owners during most of the year, and the labor force of slaves required regular augmentation from outside the rice-growing region to maintain stable numbers. Rice demanded some of the hardest labor of any crop and also some of the most skillful attention. Consequently, overseers on rice plantations were severely challenged, and the regimen of slavery was often harsh in circumstances similar to those in sugar-producing regions.

Editor Clifton's thirty-nine page introduction is quite adequate. His research on Gowrie, rice, and the Manigaults is especially good. An index would have improved the book considerably. Nevertheless, for the publication of *Life and Labor on Argyle Island*, Beehive Press deserves thanks and praise from southern historians and interested regional readers.

University of Georgia

EMORY M. THOMAS

*After Secession: Jefferson Davis and the Failure of Confederate Nationalism.* By Paul D. Escott. (Baton Rouge: Louisiana State University Press, 1978. xiv, 295 pp. Preface, acknowledgments, notes, selected bibliography, index. \$17.50.)

Professor Escott has made a significant study of Confederate nationalism during the presidency of Jefferson Davis. In its scope it supersedes Owsley's *State Rights in the Confederacy*. After discussing Davis's very good preparation to serve as President, the author describes the forces before 1861 that made the attainment of Confederate unity very doubtful, among which was the existence of a large minority (possibly even a majority) of Southerners opposed to secession. Davis's task of achieving national unity, therefore, seems almost insuperable, and despite his superior intelligence, strong will, and devotion to the Confederacy he was not the man to do it. His task was rendered more difficult by the lack of a strong cabinet and, extremely important, the frustrations with a Congress composed predominantly of selfish men who placed their own interest and that of their states above the

national welfare. Unfortunately, he did not have the political art to lead them or the charisma to gain the enthusiastic support of the people in the last three years of the war. Escott thinks, and this reviewer agrees, that Davis's fatal error was his neglect of the home front, which led, he maintains, to "The Quiet Rebellion of the Common People." This view is certainly not new, but is forcibly expressed. Although this neglect was true, the author does not take sufficiently into account the theory of laissez-faire widely held in the South and by Davis himself. The President was so absorbed in the desperate task of defending the country, that he had little time or energy to devote to vital economic affairs. Moreover, it was his belief, and that of the leading members of the Confederacy, that it was the duty of the states and counties, and not of the central government, to provide relief for the needs of the people. Such relief as was provided was haphazard and poorly organized.

Davis has been too harshly blamed for many things that went wrong. Inexperienced in devising the first military draft in American history, he and Congress made serious errors in drafting skilled workers needed to keep the economy of the Confederacy going, and, even more so, in the exemption policy, especially in not exempting men needed on small farms to support dependent families. Davis cannot be faulted, however, for the failure of the Confederate Congress to adopt a realistic policy of taxation, but neither he nor Congress made any adequate effort to control inflation, so devastating to the common people. All these factors, fully as much as exaggerated state rights, tremendously lessened the morale of the people and militated against the development of a strong feeling of nationality.

The author makes a good point, in discussing the ideology of the Confederacy, that Davis at first stressed the likeness between the Confederate government and the United States, but later changed to differentiating the Confederates from the Northerners by emphasizing the northern atrocities. He describes the bitter opposition of the planters to following Davis's lead in a policy of drafting slaves. In his last chapter, the author's assessment of Davis as a political leader is intelligent and fair-minded, resisting the tendency of modern scholars to be over-critical of the Confederate President because he was a loser, while failing to take account of the enormous difficulties against which he had to

contend, without the loyal support of an able Congress, or of many of the governors, or the existence of a strong sentiment for nationality among the people. It is time to recognize the notable virtues as well as the faults of Jefferson Davis, even if he and his people were losers.

*University of Kentucky*

CLEMENT EATON

*Freedmen and the Ideology of Free Labor: Louisiana, 1862-1865.*

By William F. Messner. (Lafayette: Center For Louisiana Studies, University of Southwestern Louisiana, 1978. xii, 206 pp. Preface, introduction, notes, conclusion, bibliography, index. \$6.00 paper.)

The author describes the influence of ideology on the implementation of projects for using blacks in aid of the Union Civil War effort. Specifically, he examines the contraband programs carried out by the Union army in Louisiana for evidence of the practical implementation, or lack thereof, of national policy. Messner explains that the military's use of freedmen for plantation labor and the efforts to educate them reflected not only the perception by whites of their needs but a consideration of what they believed was best for the freedmen. He also asserts that the evolution of the policy of using blacks for military service was a means of developing discipline and control in blacks which the Unionists believed was necessary if freedmen were to become productive free laborers. His concern is with the motivation and actions of whites toward blacks and not the actions or reactions of blacks.

Much of Messner's description of black labor policy instituted by the army and the treasury department has been examined elsewhere in Louis Gerteis's *From Contraband to Freedmen* and other works, but he extends the labor discussion with much useful detail. His discussion of the organization and use of the Native Guards and the Corps d'Afrique has been previously described by Peter Ripley in a recent book, by John Blassingame in a series of articles, and by the present reviewer and other students in a series of M.A. theses done at Howard University in the 1960s. None of the theses and only one of the Blassingame articles is cited in the footnotes or bibliography. But Messner has examined the ap-

propriate primary materials used by other scholars in Record Group 94 in the National Archives, as well as manuscript collections elsewhere, in elaborating the motives of policymakers in Louisiana.

The author asserts that historians have largely neglected the limitations imposed by the ideology of free labor in federal reconstruction efforts while complaining about the racism and conservatism of Union officials. He believes that "If these men failed to achieve an effective emancipation of Louisiana blacks, then, the primary reason for their failure lies not in their flawed character, but rather in the fact that the ideology of free labor limited even the most liberal of men to policies which were pathetically unsuited to meet the needs of a population held as a chattel for over two centuries" (p. 186). Messner believes that a publicly financed communitarian economic effort was the best possible option for blacks after the war. But neither federal officials nor their critics in Louisiana seriously considered such an unprecedented notion. He asserts that the ideology of free labor, reliance upon oneself and one's own labor, may have been valid in an earlier period, but social and economic mobility was not an avenue of advancement anymore for blacks or whites. But policymakers trapped by their own traditions, beliefs, and history insisted on this for blacks.

It is not altogether clear what Messner means by the invalidity of the ideology of free labor. Also, it is no more disingenuous intellectually for scholars to blame the absence of policies to advance blacks economically on racism than it is to blame the absence on support of a free labor ideology, especially when Messner's own research proves that policymakers did have negative racial attitudes toward blacks, and that policymakers did believe in the free labor ideology. Perhaps their failure to adopt communitarian solutions stemmed from racism *and* free labor ideology *and* something else, or perhaps from simply not thinking of communitarianism. He offers no evidence that anyone ever thought of such a solution. In any case, even without the overlay of a free labor ideology thesis, Messner has provided us with a carefully detailed history of Union policy implementation toward blacks in Louisiana.

*University of Colorado at Boulder*

MARY F. BERRY

*Amelia Gayle Gorgas: A Biography.* By Mary Tabb Johnston and Elizabeth Johnston Libscomb. (University: University of Alabama Press, 1978. xiv, 168 pp. Genealogy, preface, introduction, illustrations, bibliography, index. \$11.50.)

Amelia Gayle Gorgas was the daughter of John Gayle (1792-1859), who was governor of Alabama from 1831 to 1835. She was also the wife of Confederate General Josiah Gorgas (1818-1883), himself the subject of a 1952 biography by Frank Vandiver, and the mother of William Crawford Gorgas (1854-1920), famed as the eradicator of yellow fever in Cuba and Panama and surgeon-general of the United States Army during World War I.

It is perhaps unjust (and in these days possibly dangerous) to define a woman in terms of the men in her life, but, when all is said and done, Amelia Gayle Gorgas is hardly deserving of a biography in her own right. Born in 1826, she was too young to be involved with her father's terms as governor. When he went to Congress in 1847, she accompanied him to Washington where she was "kissed by the great Senator Clay" and then teasingly warned by John C. Calhoun, "Amelia, don't put your trust in that old man" (p. 16). In 1853 she married Josiah Gorgas, then a young army officer. For the next thirty years her life was swallowed up in his.

Until 1861 the couple moved from one military post to another. The Gorgases spent most of the Civil War in Richmond where Josiah was chief of ordnance for the Confederate Army. After the war he sought unsuccessfully to make a living in the iron business. In 1868 he secured a position at the University of the South where, in 1872, he became vice-chancellor. In 1877 he was forced out of this position, and in the following year he became president of the University of Alabama.

Failing health forced Gorgas to resign the presidency in 1879. The University trustees then appointed him librarian and named his wife hospital matron. As Gorgas's health continued to fail, Mrs. Gorgas assumed the duties of librarian. After his death in May 1883, she became the University librarian, a post she filled admirably until she retired in 1907. She died six years later. She became something of an institution among students in Tuscaloosa, and in 1925 the University library was named for her.

The Gayle and Gorgas families left a large collection of

manuscripts which became the basis for this book. It is clear from these documents that Amelia Gorgas was not the frail, fair, fragile flower of mythical southern womanhood, but a partner whose opinions and intelligence were respected by her husband. Mrs. Gorgas was, as the dust-jacket writers claim, "a most attractive and appealing person indeed," as well as a very intelligent observer of the world in which she lived.

Too much of the book, however, consists of excerpts from letters and diaries in which Mrs. Gorgas describes her world. One cannot escape a strong feeling that this book was published by the University of Alabama Press largely because of Mrs. Gorgas's association with the University. Many of the quoted letters contain fascinating glimpses of the world in which Mrs. Gorgas moved and of the people she knew. For this reason, it probably would have been far better to have edited and published her letters rather than stringing excerpts from them together and calling the result a biography.

*Valdosta State College*

RICHARD M. MCMURRY

*Strangers Within the Gate City: The Jews of Atlanta, 1845-1915.*

By Steven Hertzberg. (Philadelphia: The Jewish Publication Society of America, 1978. 325 pp. Introduction, maps, tables, illustrations, epilogue, appendices, selected bibliography, notes, index. \$12.00.)

In his introduction, Steven Hertzberg promises the reader an in-depth analysis and description of the Jewish experience in Atlanta, beginning with the arrival of Jacob Haas and Henry Levi in the 1840s, and concluding with the lynching of Leo Frank in 1915. The reader, however, will be disappointed if he expects a stirring human drama of impoverished immigrants escaping from persecution and economic hardship in quest of a higher quality of life. Nor will he find a rich personal story of the immigrants' responses to the daily confrontation between the old world which they imported and the new world which they found, for Hertzberg's "new social history" is a quantitative account. He is far more concerned with statistical percentages and numbers of Jewish communal and economic growth and movement than he

is with the daily lives of the Jews themselves. We read about parameters of geographic persistence, structures of economic mobility, demographic patterns, and population cohorts. Little attention is paid to the human side of the Jews within the statistical tables and figure plates. Outside the tables the prominent Jews are little more than names associated with the institutional development of the Jewish community. As for the average Jew, he is ignored and remains anonymous.

Because the data utilized by Hertzberg is concentrated essentially in the 1870 and 1880 federal censuses, as well as in the 1896 Atlanta city census, the story of Atlanta's Jewry receives an uneven treatment. In the opening chapters, Hertzberg's rush to deal with his cache of census data caused him to treat the Jews in Atlanta between 1845 and 1870 in a cursory manner. Indeed, his discussions of Atlanta, Georgia, and the South for the period are given a preeminent position while the Jews are treated as little more than a string of paragraph-length biographical sketches. Never really trying to "flesh out" these pioneering Jews, his attempts to understand their activities and motives are, on two accounts, valiant but futile. First, Hertzberg offers up these Jews too frequently as perfect examples of conclusions reached in other communal, regional, and national studies, few of which took into account Atlanta's Jewry if they considered southern Jewry at all. It is a technique Hertzberg utilizes throughout the book with equally questionable results. Second, Hertzberg is so mesmerized by the data for the post-Civil War period that he ignores the vast document collections that would have provided vital information and penetrating insights into the social, economic, and personal lives of Atlanta's early Jewry.

It is in the period between 1870 and 1896 that Hertzberg concentrates his efforts. Unfortunately, his impressive and valuable statistical analysis of the Jewish community's social and economic profile is hurt by the periodic inundation of confusing and unnecessary verbalization of the statistical tables isolated at the end of the book. Equally important is Hertzberg's discussion of the institutional history of the Jewish community in which he describes Atlanta's reform movement, the establishment of the congregation, the development of Jewish service organizations, and the attitudes that appeared to influence the relationships among the Jews, blacks, and white gentiles. What could have been

an exciting tale, however, is marred by a dry and stiff prose void of color, dimension, sensitivity, and feeling for both the period and the people.

Hertzberg's story begins to fade rapidly after 1900 because of the thinning out of his cherished statistical data: thirty-five of the thirty-nine statistical tables and ten of the twelve figures plates deal with the pre-1900 era. The study concludes with a short "tag along" chapter on the Leo Frank case. It seems the chapter was included because it would have been sacrilege to have omitted Leo Frank in any study of Atlanta's Jewry. In any case, the chapter is little more than meaningless paraphrasing of Leonard Dinnerstein's study.

Hertzberg's book is hardly more than a dissertation hurriedly published. The organization is disjointed with ill-fitting chapters. The footnoting is confused, and the thirteen-page "selected" bibliography is padded. One can excuse Hertzberg for writing an uneven dissertation that took advantage of readily accessible material. One can even excuse his self-promotion by claiming to be using for the first time hitherto ignored records-census, city directories, naturalization papers, etc.-even though such a claim might raise a few eyebrows among historians who have been utilizing these types of records for some time. These technical flaws should have been eliminated in the transition from an imbalanced dissertation to a polished scholarly monograph. It is equally inexcusable that Hertzberg had ignored the 1900 federal census with its wealth of data which had become available for statistical use long before his study had entered the publication process. It would seem that professional considerations would have demanded that he incorporate this new data into his study as a strengthening complement to the admittedly inadequate 1896 Atlanta city census, even at the cost of delaying publication.

It is a shame that Hertzberg did not engage in the additional necessary research, extensive reorganization, and rewriting that would have combined the cold statistics of what the Jews did with the warm heritage of who they were. Hertzberg has at his fingertips the material to write a "southern" version of Irving Howe's *World of Our Fathers*. Such a book would indeed have been a pathbreaking model study. As the book is, Hertzberg provides a skeleton into which one can hope that someday someone will breathe life. Until that time, the Jews of Atlanta between

1845 and 1915 are strangers not only in the Gate City, but in Hertzberg's book as well.

*Valdosta State College*

LOUIS E. SCHMIER

*The Sacred Harp: A Tradition and Its Music.* By Buell E. Cobb, Jr. (Athens: University of Georgia Press, 1978. ix, 245 pp. Preface, illustrations, appendices, selected bibliography, notes, index. \$10.00.)

Numerous singing schools developed in New England during the late eighteenth century and in the southern United States during the early nineteenth century. To aid the teaching and singing of this musical tradition, which was mostly sacred music, many music books were published, some using musical note heads of various shapes (called shape notes or "buckwheat" notes), thereby enabling musically illiterate peoples to read the notes. One of the most interesting of these early publications was entitled *The Sacred Harp*, compiled in 1844 by B. F. White, and E. J. King. This more recent study, by Professor Cobb, attempts to introduce this rich American musical tradition to those unfamiliar with it, as well as to pay tribute to those who were the creative sources, and those who have embellished and continued the tradition through the years. Mr. Cobb includes numerous anecdotes and comments from carriers of the tradition, both young and old, which make his book lively and enjoyable for those interested in southern folkways. He states that his "interest in the music is less with the printed form than with the music as rendered, the living tradition" (p. viii).

Although Cobb also states in his preface that a technical analysis of the music is not given in any depth, he does attempt to discuss it in Chapter 2, "The Music." Unfortunately, this chapter is weak. He begins, for example, by explaining how the Sacred Harp singers do not approve of the term "folk music" to describe their singing, yet he continues to apply it without really understanding the term (the *Journal of the International Folk Music Council*, VII, p. 6, 1955, defines the term as follows: "Folk music is music that has been submitted to the process of oral transmission. It is the product of evolution and is de-

pendent on the circumstances of continuity, variation, and selection"). References are made to historical evidence for what he calls "dancelike melodies" (p. 31) in *The Sacred Harp*, yet no sources are given. In tracing historical sources, numerous song titles of old folk songs that are melodically similar to Sacred Harp songs are mentioned, yet no comparative melodic notations are provided, leaving the musically knowledgeable reader unconvinced. Although forty-one Sacred Harp songs are included in Appendix B, many of those discussed in detail in Chapter 2 are not included in the appendix. One tune, "Greenwich," is even mentioned as being included in the appendix, but is, in fact, not. The author's use of musical terminology is often wrong, such as his reference to "'gapped' modal scales (bare of chromaticism)" on p. 32. He also says that "gapped modal, scales" are "a recurring characteristic of primitive music." Such generalizations reveal Mr. Cobb's unfamiliarity with the music of preindustrial cultures. However, the author often quotes such famous music scholars as George Pullen Jackson, Charles Seeger, and Irving Lowens, who use their terms correctly.

Another shortcoming, especially for the nonmusician reader, is the lack of definitions throughout the book. The term "Sacred Harp," for example, is never really adequately defined. Definitions are also needed for such words as hymn, fusing song, and revival spiritual (p. 22), quartal (p. 35), pitcher, keyer, and leader (p. 55—are these interchangeable?), and many more. The musician would benefit by the inclusion of descriptive notations (notations of the music showing as precisely as possible how it was sung). On p. 43, for example, the author discusses how black singers create blue notes (a microtonal bending of a pitch). A descriptive transcription of a performance employing blue notes, compared to an original notation of the same passage from *The Sacred Harp*, would be much clearer than words (certainly the material in Chapter 2 is intended for readers with a knowledge of music, considering the many musical terms used, and descriptive musical notations would be appropriate), and a recording would be even better. In spite of these deficiencies in musical analysis, the singer's comments themselves are important in understanding the Sacred Harp tradition within its own cultural context.

The great value of the book is in its historical presentation. Much of the author's information is based on oral history, pro-

viding many new data concerning the Sacred Harp tradition. Of importance to the folklorist is Appendix A, which provides a list of performance of the *Sacred Harp* today in Alabama, Florida, Georgia, Mississippi, New Jersey, Tennessee, and Texas. Florida folklorists will be pleased and perhaps surprised to know that the *Sacred Harp* continues to be performed forty-one times a year in the Sunshine State.

This book is highly recommended for historians and others interested in southern traditions, with a great word of caution regarding Chapter 2. To understand the Sacred Harp tradition better, one should supplement this book with various chapters from Gilbert Chase's book *America's Music, From the Pilgrims to the Present*. The music, however, is best understood by carefully listening to live performances, or to recordings of the *Sacred Harp* (a discography would have been an appropriate inclusion in an appendix).

*Florida State University*

DALE A. OLSEN

## BOOK NOTES

*A Tour Through the Southern and Western Territories of the United States of North-America* by John Pope is the twenty-fifth volume and the last in the Bicentennial Floridiana Facsimile Series published by the University of Florida Press under the sponsorship of the Bicentennial Commission of Florida. The series began in 1971, and it includes volumes covering all facets of the economic, political, military, and social history of Florida from the colonial period to the twentieth century. A group of distinguished Florida and American historians were selected by Dr. Samuel Proctor, general editor, to write an introduction to each volume. An index to the introduction and to the original volume, if it did not already include one, was also prepared. The editor of this final volume in the series, Pope's *Tour*, was J. Barton Starr of Troy State University at Fort Rucker, Alabama. Colonel John Pope of Virginia toured the "southern and western territories of the United States" in 1790, when the lands west of the mountains to the Mississippi were being opened for settlement. Pope went south from Pittsburgh and Louisville to New Orleans, and from there to West Florida. His journal, published in 1792, provides information on Pensacola and its inhabitants, the trading firm of Panton, Leslie and Company, and Alexander McGillivray, the Creek Indian chief. Pope also tried to visit East Florida, but the Spanish refused to allow his ship to enter the St. Johns River. Professor Starr's interpretive essay includes biographical data on Pope. This facsimile sells for \$6.50.

*Catholics of Marion County* is by Jane Quinn, also the author of a study of the Minorcans of St. Augustine. Catholic masses were recited in north-central Florida as early as the sixteenth century by the Spanish, but the formation of a Catholic congregation had to wait until the area was settled during the territorial period after 1821. A handful of Catholic settlers moved in before the Civil War, but Miss Quinn notes that it was not until 1883 that the chapel of St. Philip Neri was blessed. Ten years later there was a resident pastor in Ocala. Some 200 Italians were brought into Welshton in 1885 to grow grapes, and

[114]

they built a small wood chapel and started a congregation. An appendix lists the large number of Catholics now in Marion County. Many leading citizens of the community are registered in Blessed Trinity Parish. The book, which sells for \$5.00, may be ordered from Blessed Trinity Church, 5 S.E. 17th Street, Ocala, Florida 32670.

*British West Florida, 1763-1783*, by Cecil Johnson, was first published in 1942, and was long considered the best study of that area west of the Apalachicola River to the Mississippi, acquired by England after the French and Indian War. Professor Johnson used documents in the Public Record Office at London and in various American collections, particularly the state archives of Mississippi and Alabama, to develop his study. The Gage Papers, which had only recently been made available in the Clement Library at the University of Michigan, and the Carleton Papers, then in the possession of Colonial Williamsburg, provided the basis for his military sections. Somewhat outdated now as a result of more recent research and writing, it still stands as a very useful volume. Archon Books (Shoe String Press), Hamden, Connecticut, has reissued it; the price is \$8.00.

*Fort Zachary Taylor* is an illustrated history of this famous Key West fortification. Construction began in 1845, but because of hurricanes, yellow fever, labor problems, and a shortage of materials, the fort was still unfinished when the Civil War began in 1861. It was manned, however, by Federal forces throughout the war. It has been called "Osceola Battery" by Key Westers since 1898, when a two-gun battery of twelve-inch rifles was added. World War II brought anti-aircraft guns. There was no natural supply of fresh water in Key West, and cisterns were built at the fort to collect rain water. There was always the question of whether, during time of war, ships would be able to bring in additional water. In 1861 a small plant for distillation of sea-water into drinking water, some 7,000 gallons of fresh water per day, was put into operation. *Fort Zachary Taylor* is by Howard S. England in collaboration with Ida Barron. It may be ordered from Mr. England, 2801 Flagler Avenue, Key West, Florida 33040, and the price is \$3.50.

*The Fabulous Finn, the Autobiography of Victor Nurmi* was written in collaboration with August Burghard of Fort Lauderdale. The latter is a well-known author whose books, including *Checked Sunshine: The History of Fort Lauderdale*, have been reviewed in the *Florida Historical Quarterly*. Mr. Nurmi, a native of Finland, lives on Fort Lauderdale's Nurmi Isles which he developed. He first started coming to Florida in 1929 as a winter visitor, and then began purchasing property in the Fort Lauderdale area in 1944. Many of the photographs in the book showing the early days are from Mr. Nurmi's personal collection. The book may be ordered from August Burghard, Box 1107, Fort Lauderdale, Florida 33339. The price is \$2.00.

*The Ghost Towns & Side Roads of Florida* is the combined and updated edition of two earlier books by James R. Warnke. He describes different kinds of ghost towns: communities that once flourished but have now disappeared with hardly a trace to show where buildings once stood; once large and prosperous communities which have dwindled over the years into small crossroad settlements; and places which were never more than stops for railroads to take on water and firewood. Included are Magnolia on the St. Marks River, established in 1827 by settlers from Maine; Port Leon on Apalache Bay, which was completely destroyed by a hurricane and tidal wave in 1843; and Old Troy and New Troy on the Suwannee River. Confederate deserters in 1865 burned every building in Old Troy, and it was never rebuilt. Neither was the community on Indian Key, destroyed by the Indians during the Second Seminole War. Pine Level in the Manatee region once had a courthouse, jail, two churches, stores, saloons, and a number of homes, but all have disappeared as population shifted elsewhere. Many pictures, including several color photographs, are included. It was published by Roving Photographers & Assoc., Inc., Boynton Beach, Florida. This book sells for \$5.95.

*Lost Treasure of Florida's Gulf Coast*, by L. Frank Hudson and Gordon R. Prescott, is designed to meet the curiosity of treasure hunters. It includes some of the folklore and mythology that has grown up over the years relating to pirates and treasure

allegedly hidden in Florida. Published by Great Outdoors Publishing Company, St. Petersburg, it sells for \$1.95.

Many associate John Muir, the great naturalist, only with the western part of the United States. Details about his two Florida journeys have not been widely examined. Muir first came to Florida in 1867 as part of a thousand-mile journey that he was making from Louisville, Kentucky, to Florida. He walked along the railroad from Fernandina to Cedar Key and kept a journal that was later published under the title, *A Thousand-Mile Walk to the Gulf*. Muir returned to Florida in 1898, visiting some of the people and returning to places that he had seen on his first trip. The Florida visits are described in *Son of the Wilderness: The Life of John Muir* by Linnie Marsh Wolfe. First published in 1945, this study is republished by the University of Wisconsin Press, Madison. It sells for \$6.95. *Son of the Wilderness* received the Pulitzer Prize for biography in 1946.

*Florida Statistical Abstract 78* includes statistical data on population, education, income, geography, climate, agriculture, construction, manufacturing, wholesale and retail trade, tourism and recreation, education, cultural services, communication, power and energy, vital statistics and health, courts and law enforcement, government and elections, and other pertinent facts about Florida. There is a section dealing with the quality of life, with data on community living conditions, personal achievements, and environmental factors. A guide to the sources on statistics is provided, along with a detailed index and many maps. The *Abstract* was published by the University Presses of Florida for the Bureau of Economic and Business Research, College of Business Administration, University of Florida. Ralph P. Thompson is editor. The paper edition sells for \$10.75.

*Florida by Paddle and Pack*, by Mike Toner and Pat Toner, includes a description of forty-five wilderness trails in central and south Florida with accompanying historical data. There is also practical information on how to treat blisters and ways to ward off mosquitos. Pictures and a number of maps add to the usefulness of this volume. Published by Banyan Books, Miami, this attractive paperback sells for \$5.95.

*Directory of State and Local History Periodicals*, compiled by Milton Crouch and Hans Raum, was published by the American Library Association, Chicago, Illinois. It sells for \$5.50. The Florida section lists twelve publications, including the *Florida Historical Quarterly*, and notes that the *Quarterly* is indexed in *Writings of American History*, *Historical Abstracts*, and *America: History and Life*.

Bell Irvin Wiley's *The Life of Johnny Reb: The Common Soldier of the Confederacy* (published first in 1943), and *The Life of Billy Yank: The Common Soldier of the Union* (1952) have become Civil War classics. They were hailed when they first appeared as the best accounts of Civil War soldiers, and the reputations of these fine studies have not diminished. Professor Wiley used letters, diaries, newspaper accounts, and official records to tell the day-to-day lives of the men who suffered from homesickness, malnutrition, diarrhea, exposure, and wounds and illnesses for which there were often too few remedies or none at all. These two volumes have been reissued by Louisiana State University Press, and they sell for \$7.95 each.

The Gulf Specimen Company of Panacea, Florida, has published its Number Five catalogue which lists fish and marinelife of the Gulf of Mexico. The guide sells for \$2.00, and may be ordered from the Company, Box 237, Panacea, 32346.

The American Association for State and Local History publishes books relating to all aspects of historical preservation, conservation, and interpretation. A recent study, *Re-creating the Historic House Interior*, by William Seale, discusses the restoration of older house interiors to authentic period environments. It covers many topics, from making architectural decisions to judgments about lighting, floors, walls, windows, textiles, upholstery, and furnishings. There are more than 100 photos of recreated settings, many of which are in color. The book sells for \$20.00, \$16.00 to AASLH members.

*Landscapes and Gardens for Historic Buildings*, by Rudy J. Favretti and Joy Putman Favretti, is another of the American Association for State and Local History publications. It is de-

scribed as a handbook for reproducing and recreating authentic landscape settings, and it is directed primarily to house museums and other buildings of historical significance. There is also information for private homeowners, horticulturalists, and others interested in creating period garden settings. Besides drawings, prints, and photographs, there is a list of more than 2,100 plants and flowers grown in early American gardens. There is also a useful bibliography. *Landscapes and Gardens for Historic Buildings* is a paperback, and it sells for \$10.00, \$7.50 to AASLH members.

A number of children's books about Florida have recently appeared. These include *Shark Lady, The Adventures of Eugenie Clark*, by Ann McGovern (Four Winds Press, New York City. \$6.95). *Alligators and Crocodiles* (revised edition) is by Herbert S. Zim with illustrations by Gene Zallinger (William Morrow and Company, New York. \$5.71). *Dolly the Dolphin*, by Margaret Gay Malone, is illustrated with photographs (Julian Messner, New York. \$7.29). *Wonders of Crows* is by Wyatt Blassingame of Anna Maria, Florida, one of our best-known writers of books for young readers (Dodd, Mead and Company, New York, \$5.95). *Florida: The New Enchantment of America*, by Allan Carpenter, is an updated edition of the book first published in 1965. (Childrens Press, Chicago. \$7.95). *Time for the White Egret* is by Natalie Savage Carlson and was illustrated by Charles Robinson (Charles Scribner's Sons, New York. \$7.95).

Since so many of the early Florida settlers came from South Carolina, there has been a special attachment among the citizens of the two states. The relationship was spawned in the bloody battles between the Spanish in Florida and the British in South Carolina and between the Indians living in the two areas. During the American Revolution, St. Augustine became a haven of refuge for South Carolina loyalists, and a group of captured American patriots were imprisoned there. Many of the settlers who moved into territorial Florida after 1821 were South Carolinians. *South Carolina: A Synoptic History for Laymen* is based upon a series of lectures made by Dr. Lewis P. Jones. First published in 1971, the revised edition is now available from the Sandlapper Store, Inc., Box 841, Lexington, South Carolina 29072. The price is \$7.95.

*The Rise of Rawlins Lowndes, 1721-1800*, by Carl J. Vipperman, is a "rags-to-riches" story of one of South Carolina's important eighteenth-century personalities. He served as governing officer of South Carolina during the American Revolution, and later became the state's leading opponent of the ratification of the Constitution. This volume was published by the University of South Carolina Press for its *Tricentennial Studies* series. It sells for \$14.95.

*Blues from the Delta*, a study of southern black music by William Farris, was written first as a dissertation and parts were published in 1970. An enlarged and illustrated edition, which sells for \$4.95, is now available from Anchor Press/Doubleday, Garden City, New York.

*To a Dark Moon* is a collection of poems by Michael O'Brien of Tampa. He is the namesake and great-nephew of one of Henry B. Plant's associates in the development of the Plant System. The volume was published by Valkyrie Press, Inc., St. Petersburg 33712, and it sells for \$3.95.