

Florida Historical Quarterly

Volume 74
Number 3 *Florida Historical Quarterly, Volume
74, Number 3*

Article 10

1995

Book Reviews

Florida Historical Society
membership@myfloridahistory.org



Part of the [American Studies Commons](#), and the [United States History Commons](#)

Find similar works at: <https://stars.library.ucf.edu/fhq>

University of Central Florida Libraries <http://library.ucf.edu>

This Book Review is brought to you for free and open access by STARS. It has been accepted for inclusion in Florida Historical Quarterly by an authorized editor of STARS. For more information, please contact STARS@ucf.edu.

Recommended Citation

Society, Florida Historical (1995) "Book Reviews," *Florida Historical Quarterly*. Vol. 74: No. 3, Article 10.
Available at: <https://stars.library.ucf.edu/fhq/vol74/iss3/10>

BOOK REVIEWS

Situado and Sabana: Spain's Support System for the Presidio and Mission Provinces of Florida. By Amy Turner Bushnell. (New York: American Museum of Natural History, 1994. Anthropological Paper No. 74. 249 pp. Foreword by David Hurst Thomas, abstract, introduction, acknowledgments, notes, appendix, references, index.)

This is the third volume in the series resulting from the archaeological and documentary research concerning Mission Santa Catalina de Guale which began in 1972. Dr. Bushnell did not formally join the team until 1986, but her excellent work on, *The King's Coffer: Proprietors of the Spanish Florida Treasury, 1565-1702*, published in 1981, prepared her well for the research for this volume. As David Hurst Thomas points out in his foreword:

Amy Turner Bushnell's extraordinary volume deals with the Spanish support system for their mission chain, the northward terminus being Mission Santa Catalina de Guale. In order to deal with the Spanish economic structure, the Native American communities, and the struggles between the two, she has expanded the scope of this study to embrace all of Spanish Florida.

Dr. Bushnell's monograph provides a varied spectrum, from narrative and specific illustration to full-blown historiographic analysis. The narrative chapters provide the historical backbone of this monograph, and they constitute the first real attempt to write a general history of the provinces of *La Florida*. The analytical and illustrative sections provide the detail needed by archaeologists encountering the archaeological record of Spanish Florida. (p. 12)

Most historians are well aware of the *situado* by which Spain provided the economic support for *La Florida*. They also know of the major problems associated with the *situado* —that it was often insufficient for a variety of reasons and that on occasion it did not arrive at all.

Less well known was the *sabana* system which Dr. Bushnell defines as the "native institution for public finance." She points out

that the *sabanas*, lands used to support a wide number of persons including the friars, were also known by different names such as *milpas* in other colonies. (p. 111). *Milpas* in Central America and Mexico referred to land used to cultivate corn, the principal crop there.

But the book goes well beyond just the financial support of *La Florida*. It provides detailed information about the relationship of the natives and the Spaniards, services of the church, schools, expansion to the west and north including the founding and demise of Santa Catalina de Gaule, and more. In fact, the book is so full of information that it is difficult to describe in a short review. The documentation, including both primary and secondary materials, is extensive.

For those teaching colonial Florida history, as well as anyone interested in the history of *La Florida* from the mid-1500s to the 1700s, this study will serve as an excellent reference work. It is well-written and contains much "new" information.

University of West Florida, Emeritus

WILLIAM S. COKER

Florida Indians and the Invasion from Europe. By Jerald T. Milanich. (Gainesville: University of Florida Press, 1995. xix, 290 pp. Preface, maps, illustrations, notes, index, about the author. \$29.95 cloth.)

The purpose of this book, the author says, is "To bring to my readers a sense of history and place, to correlate modern towns and places with past events and people." (p. xv) In the first two chapters he notes that the past is everywhere around us. He introduces some of the archaeologists and historians who help explain pre-Columbian America. The balance of the book is organized into three sections: I. The Indigenous People; II. The Invasion; and III. The Aftermath.

Section I summarizes nearly everything known about the indigenous people of Florida. There were as many as 100 discreet groups and at least ten different cultures. To handle so many, Milanich subdivides the peninsula into three sections. He has a chapter on the natives of southern Florida, one on central Florida, and the last on northern Florida. The cultures within each subdivision

have some common characteristics. It is not known how many languages were spoken.

The several cultures are known by the remains that archaeologists have dug up and to some extent by Spanish written records. Since the archaeological relics are scattered and the Spanish reports limited, it is necessary many times to say "It is possible that . . ." or "Perhaps, . . ." Milanich gives full credit to the archaeologists and historians who have supplied pieces of the jigsaw puzzle from which inferences may be drawn.

Section II, *The Invasion*, discusses all the voyages made by Spanish and French explorers to the Florida area. Milanich expends four and a half pages determining whether or not what the Europeans did was invasion. He concludes that it was. When Ponce de Leon made the first deep penetration in 1513 there were an estimated 350,000 Indians in Florida. Diseases carried by the white invaders rapidly decimated this population.

The Spanish felt justified in their invasion because God had given power to the Pope to divide the world, and the Pope in turn had assigned a great part of the Americas to the Spanish monarchs. If the natives refused to accept this abstract of title, and if they refused to accept Christianity, then the document said, "We will take you and your wives and children and make them slaves . . . and we will take your property, and will do you all the harm and evil that we can." (p. 101) Under this authority an astonishing number of Florida Indians were enslaved, many of them sold to plantation owners in the Caribbean islands. Milanich judges the invaders by the European standards of the epoch. "I find it hard," he writes, "to blame anyone for events that occurred hundreds of years ago." (p. 103)

Section III, *the Aftermath*, covers the history of the Spanish missions and their intent to impose Spanish culture on the Indians. The purpose, genuinely held, was to better the living conditions of the natives. Even when a plague swept away thousands, priests saw this as a harvest of souls, since the victims were Christianized. But the end result of the invasion was eradication of the indigenous people.

The writing is classroom style, halting the narrative to note where we have been and where we are going next. We are alerted that we will see later, and often told that we must remember. For a highly specialized course the book would make a fine text. It sympathetically describes the remarkable exploits of the invaders. It is

not emotional about the suffering inflicted on the Indians. The book contains the most comprehensive account of the indigenous Indians of Florida that is to be found.

University of Florida, Emeritus

JOHN K. MAHON

Pedro Menéndez de Avilés. Edited with an Introduction by Eugene Lyon. (New York and London: Garland Publishing, Inc., 1995. xxv, 610 pp. Introduction, bibliography. \$62.00.)

In the context of Latin American settlement, Pedro Menéndez de Avilés was a latecomer; but in the colonization of North America he was a frontrunner, founding in 1565 the first permanent European community of the United States. Menéndez succeeded after seven previous Spanish expeditions to the southeast had failed. Menéndez's focus encompassed far more than just the area where St. Augustine has endured. His "Florida" embraced territory as far as Newfoundland, and his plans were expansive as well, with intentions to open a pathway from the Atlantic seaboard to New Spain.

This 24th volume of the *Spanish Borderlands Sourcebook* series presents the multifaceted Menéndez— his dreams, concerns and frustrations largely through the 16th-century Spaniard's own words. The book features Eugene Lyon's translations of Menéndez's correspondence, most of it previously unpublished. Preceding each translation, an editor's note describes the historical context of the document and assesses the personages involved. In addition, book excerpts and journal articles by Dr. Lyon and other scholars amplify aspects of the explorations, the conquests, the conqueror and the conquered.

The book is divided into seven parts. In "The Man from Asturias" Lyon presents this "least understood of our historic greats" (p. 17) as a loyal subject and churchman, nobleman, clansman, explorer, sailor, and honoree of the southeastern Indians. "Preparation for the Florida Conquest" (Part II) addresses the strategy for settlement, Menéndez's agreements with the king of Spain, and the material needs of expedition. For example, a translated supply list specifies amounts of food (including 400 strings of garlic), armor, religious paraphernalia, hardware and textiles. Part III contains the probably best known elements of Menéndez's activities: the establishment of Spanish Florida and the rout of the French Hugue-

nots. Events are reported in his own letters, a complaint of the French ambassador, a letter from the Pope and Menéndez's reply to the pontiff.

Following the heady founding and confrontation with the French came the outreach and more mundane settlement segments for Menéndez's Spanish Florida as described in Parts IV and VI. The leader of the Florida colony needed to maintain order and sustain material requirements. In this vein Lyon offers the agreements with the soldier-settlers for land allotments, ordinances instituted in the "provinces of Florida," and a listing of each individual at the settlement of Santa Elena (Parris Island) as well as the residents' subsequent complaints. The arrival of the Spaniards brought a clash of two belief systems (Part V): Catholic Christianity and Native American religions. Menéndez's writings describe his encounters with the customs of the native inhabitants and his attempts to secure Jesuit missionaries. His petition (p. 427-30) to enslave recalcitrant Florida Indians was denied by the crown. The final part addresses the "Death of Menéndez and Its Aftermath" and this section is solely Lyon's work. With only debts, daughters and unwise sons-in-law surviving him, Menéndez was not to realize his dream, even in death. Florida became a crown possession rather than the proprietary colony that he had envisioned.

Lyon is renowned as the foremost expert on the founding years of Spanish settlement in the southeast, and he is responsible for our awareness of the broad geographical scope of the 16th-century endeavors. For two decades he has enlarged upon the theme that "Spanish Florida" meant far more than a beach-head at St. Augustine, both in conception and in reality. Now, this volume enables readers to encounter the words of those who experienced the earliest years and by virtue of the many translations to incorporate these primary documents into other research and writing. The translations are true to the originals; yet Lyon has masterfully smoothed the archaic convolutions that could confuse and put off the modern reader. Lyon leaves us with the pathos of Menéndez's own words, dictated from his deathbed, explaining the explorer's goal (p. 573): "it is my end purpose to provide that Florida shall be settled for all time."

Historic St. Augustine Preservation Board

SUSAN R. PARKER

Fort Meade, 1859-1900. By Canter Brown, Jr. (Tuscaloosa: University of Alabama Press, 1995. xvi, 216 pp. Preface, illustrations, photographs, appendices, notes, bibliography, index. \$19.95, paper.)

Canter Brown's *Fort Meade* is the story of a transition beginning with the eviction of seasonally resident Seminole Indians and ending with the advent of a town from which phosphate-bearing boxcars rolled on steel rails where once the Seminoles hunted and tended cattle. Today's Fort Meade is heavily dependent upon citrus, cattle and phosphate mining which is conducted on an immense scale by international corporations. But in 1849 technology was primitive, and that is when the site of an old Indian river town and ford was chosen as a military station for monitoring the Seminole reservation boundaries.

During the third Seminole War, 1855-1858, the post became a "town," a garrisoned place where residents established homes. The newcomers managed herds along the valley of Peas Creek (today's Peace River). Cowhunters followed the old trails and camped on the fertile rises just as the Seminoles had before them. The lower Peas Creek functioned during the mid-1880s as a government-set boundary separating the new settlers from the Seminoles' reservation. The boundary was moved further south in the spring of 1850 because of pressure from the growing numbers of new settlers— a population which acquired private title to land, paid taxes, and elected representatives to public office. Thus, two opposing interests were distinguished by a critical civil difference.

Canter Brown is a talented chronicler of Fort Meade's story, much of which was previously published in his *Florida's Peace River Frontier* (1991). In the preface of this work, Brown declares that "An examination of its [Fort Meade's] early history offers a contribution to our understanding of frontier communities and their significance." He cites Frederick Jackson Turner's 1893 theories of the impact of the frontier environment upon the character and democracy of subsequent industrial-urban America. But, unlike Turner, Brown offers no analytical theory regarding Fort Meade's frontier patterning, no definition of its distinguishing imprint upon the ultimate evolving scenario— land ownership, politics and the emergent phosphate mining industry. He also discusses the 1881 Disston land acquisitions, but offers no analysis of its historic consequences. That is a critical omission, for Disston's far-reaching transactions and those of other corporations conclusively defined

the massive landholding dominance so prevalent in that region from that time forward.

Nor does Brown advance a theory regarding the resultant imprint of the pioneer experience of white settlers and Seminole refugees and their descendants upon later democracy and culture. In his preface, Brown attributes the virtual absence of narrative relative to the pre-1836 Indian town of Talakchopco, near which site Fort Meade was built, because that material also appears in *Florida's Peace River Frontier*: "I felt that its repetition would serve no valid purpose," though "the Indians' former presence continued to be evident throughout the nineteenth century." However, much of the material in *Fort Meade* is repetitive, so why single out this component for exclusion? Why miss the opportunity to reassign its cultural legacy upon subsequent time and space in accordance with the Turner theory?

Brown asserts that Fort Meade is the "oldest town in interior south Florida." If Fort Meade is the "oldest town," then what of Plant City some 30 miles distant? As Ichepucksassa, that settlement was a destination in 1849 when Florida's Governor Moseley sent a company of Tallahassee volunteers to defend the frontier from that place to Sarasota Bay; a Hillsborough County voting precinct by 1850. Ichepucksassa was home to Jacob Summerlin, famed pioneer, who by Christmas of 1851 was described as an important cattleman located there.

Devastated by Union forces during the Civil War, Fort Meade was elevated by the Disston-era boom and the arrival of aristocratic English immigrants. The town was levelled by fire and freezes, but again advanced by discoveries of phosphate and subsequent mining, railroading and commerce during the 1890s. The culturally-diverse town cherished by freedom-loving Cuban tobacco investors and workers was abandoned by them during Cuba's war for liberation and by many residents during the "bust" that followed natural, political and economic disasters. Ultimately, the 1903 Florida legislature abolished Fort Meade as an incorporated municipality during the decade which concludes this work.

The dramatic story of Fort Meade may lie with its subservience to a parade of major corporations from the 1880s through the 1990s rather than its short years as a temporary milestone on a military trail to the Calasooatchee. But, if the point of Brown's monograph is to document a microcosm of the north-to-south migration pattern in 19th century peninsular Florida, *Fort Meade* is a substan-

tial contribution, a straight forward narrative of events by a capable historian, a thoroughly researched and readable monograph of 51 years of pioneering. Few Florida towns, "first" or not, can credibly claim the same.

Sarasota

JANET SNYDER MATTHEWS

The African American Heritage of Florida. Edited by David R. Colburn and Jane L. Landers. (Gainesville: University Press of Florida, 1995. x, 392 pp. Acknowledgments, introduction, photographs, notes, index. \$49.95.)

This book is a useful compendium of twelve essays on the experiences of African-Americans throughout Florida's history. More than any previous collection, this work illuminates the contributions and sufferings of blacks in a state that historically rendered them either invisible or subordinate.

In a helpful introductory essay, David R. Colburn reviews the thematic content of the book and reiterates that few Floridians realize that African-American contributions to the development of Florida began as early as the Spanish era, and that even fewer Floridians acknowledge the breadth and depth of the black contributions to the state since then. The latter thrust is a key element of the book as it adds to a growing body of literature focusing attention on the experiences of an oftentimes neglected group in Florida's past. Analysis of the intersections between inter-racial experiences in Florida has matured to the point where it is now widely recognized as a legitimate subfield of Florida historical studies, indispensable to a critical understanding of the broad experience of the state. In addition to expanding the existing body of knowledge about the state's heritage, new studies such as this one are creating a fundamental redefinition of American history itself. Colburn further suggests that Floridians, many of whom are historically illiterate, have still not come to terms with their racial prejudices. The book, therefore, both illuminates an important and largely heretofore neglected aspect of Florida history and creates a greater appreciation and understanding for the multiracial character of that story.

The work is divided into chapters that trace various aspects of the black experience in Florida from the 1500s through contemporary time. Included in these essays are fresh discussions of such

well-known subjects as the development of a sense of black “community” in Spanish Florida (Jane L. Landers), black religion (Robert L. Hall), British East Florida’s plantation culture (Daniel L. Schafer), master-slave relations (Larry E. Rivers), blacks and the Seminole removal process (George Klos), blacks and the Civil War in northeast Florida (Daniel L. Schafer), Reconstruction in the small town of LaVilla (Patricia L. Kenney), the roots of racial violence in late 19th-century Tampa (Jeffrey S. Adler), black women through the mid-20th century (Maxine D. Jones), mental health care issue for blacks during the same period (Steven Noll), Florida’s “Little Scottsboro Case,” based on the Groveland incident of 1949 (Steven F. Lawson, David R. Colburn, and Darryl Paulson), and the development of interethnic tensions in Miami since the “great boom” era of the 1920s (Raymond A. Mohl).

In general, the essays reflect original research and thinking. The two essays on Florida’s “Scottsboro Case” and the unfolding pattern of race relations in Miami are exceptionally well done. These two essays, like many of the others, leave the reader with a strong sense of historical dissonance: how could a people who have contributed so extensively to the shaping of life in this Southern state continue to be so despised by many of its more powerful white residents?

Thus, this collection of studies suggests an agenda for future analysis of the totality of the black legacy in Florida. The challenge now goes out to historians and other scholars to probe further the past in order to disclose fully and accurately the nature and results of the historical intersection between race and culture in the Sunshine State. Until that occurs, Colburn and Lander’s collection will remain the most useful such work on the sweeping scope of the black experience in Florida.

*University of South Florida,
Ft. Myers Campus*

IRVIN D. SOLOMON

Swamp Song: A Natural History of Florida’s Swamps. By Ron Larson. Gainesville: University Press of Florida, 1995. xviii, 214 pp. Preface, introduction, photographs, illustrations, maps, epilogue, references, index. \$19.95 paper.)

In *Swamp Song*, Ron Larson entices his readers to explore the wonders and diversities of Florida’s swamps and wetlands. He con-

tends that a thorough comprehension of the regions' delicate ecological balance will enhance Floridians' ability to make informed decisions concerning wetland conservation and protection programs. Swamps and wetlands comprise over one-third of Florida's land mass. Between 1955-1975, however, the state lost over 2,000 square miles of wetlands due to building construction and water management projects. Though the loss has slowed to 400 square miles in the last ten years, the delicate ecological system remains in peril.

Professor Larson divides his study into two parts. The first five chapters examine swamp formation, location, composition, and exploration, while the remaining chapters provide specific descriptions of the biotic environment of the swamps. Larson combines secondary scientific studies with first-hand experience to describe Florida's vast collection of swamps and wetlands. His accounts of possible camping expeditions contain practical advice for swamp exploration, ranging from evaluating guide books to recommending specific mosquito repellents. As an aid for non-naturalist readers, common names for species appear in the text, with their scientific equivalent listed in the index. Thirty-two color photographs vividly depict many of the plants and animals that inhabit swamps and wetlands.

Swamp Song also explores the historical context of Florida's wetlands. The author declares the Swamp Lands Acts of 1849, which allowed the federal government to deed millions of acres of wetlands to individual states, the first round of ecological manipulation. From 1882 to the present, Florida's water management programs have included drainage projects and canal construction. Rather than controlling the state's water supply, these programs eroded those natural ecological systems that had moderated the vagaries and extremes of Florida's weather patterns. The result was the severe droughts and floods of the 20th century.

The author also blames human encroachment for disrupting the intricate relationship between the animals, flora, and fauna of the swamp. Historical accounts by famed naturalists William Brewster, William Bartram, and John J. Audubon depict a far different environment from that of present-day Florida. Many of the birds, trees, and flowers which they described were decimated by the logging and plumage industries during the early 1900s. By 1970, the hunting of alligators for sport and food had nearly eliminated the entire species. Larson argues that the extinction of even one species disturbs the entire environmental balance.

While focusing on Florida's ecology environment, *Swamp Song* nevertheless paints a sad historical picture of human manipulation gone awry. Throughout their history, Floridians have attempted to dominate and control their environment. Ron Larson's study describes the environment Floridians have confronted and the changes they have enforced. Larson's enthusiastic and descriptive writing style, along with an elementary explanation of scientific terms, numerous color photos and ink sketches, makes this study accessible to any reader interested in Florida's natural environment.

Mississippi State University

PATRICIA G. DILLON

Jump at the Sun: Zora Neale Hurston's Cosmic Comedy. By John Lowe. (Champaign: University of Illinois Press, 1995. xiv, 373 pp. Acknowledgments introduction, works cited, index. \$19.95.)

Focusing on Zora Neale Hurston's "mask of comedy" in her major fiction, John Lowe traces the influences of Hurston's concept of comedy. Specifically, he identifies its origins in African and African-American traditions. Historians and students of culture will find Lowe's summaries of the African traditions of humor, of the griot, and of the Esu figures in Hurston's work to be quite solid. Lowe asserts that this tradition offers Hurston double perspective on life which she used in her storytelling and which influenced her understanding of irony. In addition, he traces the traditions of African-American humor including its use of stereotyping, beast fables, and witty word play. These traditions converge in her selection of Florida as her favorite setting.

Lowe writes persuasively that Hurston's identity as a writer is with the South and the state that produced her. The Florida she presents in her work is a prelapsarian frontier. Lowe asserts that Hurston's 18 months with the Florida Federal Writers Project only underscored her love of her Florida roots. Throughout her work, the flora, fauna and weather of Florida are meticulously described. She has an ear for the dialects of African-Americans, Florida crackers, and other Florida whites during the period of the 1920s and 1930s. Lowe identifies her Floridian characters as jokesters, often innovative, ambitious and energetic, in keeping with the Florida frontier population of the early 20th century. Many of her observations, when writing for the team-written, *The Florida Negro* and *The Florida Guide*, find their way into her novel, *Saraph on the Suwanee*. In

fact, Lowe points out that it was Hurston who observed that Stephen Foster wrote his famous songs without ever having seen the Suwanee River.

Literary critics and cultural historians will note Lowe's use of the insights of Mikhail Bakhtin which afford Lowe a useful theoretical description of Hurston's world view. Bakhtin's idea of the carnival, the cosmic comedy, emphasizes comic forms such as parody, anti-ritual, rebellion, transformation, loss of control, and pleasure. Lowe identifies these attributes in Hurston's work and also in her own life. She adopted the comic role of the trickster and verbal dual/list, the uncorrect, wanton, offensive, and unapologetic person.

Lowe grounds his close readings of her work in a multi-cultural and historical perspective. This approach succeeds well in allowing perceptive readings of her major work. For example, in *Jonah's Gourd Vine*, Lowe is able to use analysis to point out the dualism of the black preacher's cosmic and comic dimensions. Lowe identifies John Pearson as half Christian and half griot.

Lowe's analysis of *Their Eyes Were Watching God* is especially well done. Since most readers are familiar with this novel, they will recognize the argument derived from Henry Louis Gates, that Janie is a trickster figure who learns to see from a dual perspective. Lowe's analysis of this novel is particularly perceptive in describing the relationship between Teacake and Janie as being ultimately comic since the relationship is based on play, laughter, pleasure, and a sense of the present.

Students of literature, history and culture will recognize Lowe's study as an important contribution to Hurston's scholarship. His study is a good example of the second wave of contemporary Hurston scholarship that continues to recognize her uniqueness in American literature and at the same time, appreciates that her genius exists within a context of cultural diversity and individual innovation.

University of Central Florida

KATHRYN LEE SEIDEL

Foraging and Farming in the Eastern Woodlands. Edited by C. Margaret Scarry. (Gainesville: University Press of Florida, 1993. xiii, 352 pp. Introduction, acknowledgments, figures, tables, references cited, contributors, index. \$49.95.)

This volume is a compilation of papers presented in two paleo-ethnobotany symposia at professional archaeology meetings held in 1988. Topics include prehistoric and early historic chronological syntheses and specific case studies based on current paleoethnobotanical research in the Eastern Woodlands of North America.

In the introduction, Scarry briefly outlines the focus, intent, relevant terminology, and organization of the chapters. Although some may consider the terminology review a belaboring point, given the continued use of similar terms for different human/plant interrelationships and concomitant practices, the definitions are needed.

The book is divided into three sections. The first section provides a chronological synthesis of archaeobotanical data for the Eastern Woodlands. Six authors (Yarnell, Chapman, Watson, Fritz, Johannessen, and Scarry) provide a comprehensive review of current paleoethnobotanical knowledge spanning the Late Archaic through Mississippian time periods. Native and introduced plants are traced from their earliest appearance in the archaeobotanical record and tracked through time. With each temporal chapter, authors discuss geographical locations of key plant resources utilized and review the evidence for changing interrelationships from plant husbandry to domestication.

The second section is composed of three chapters focused on new perspectives and methods for interpreting specific archaeobotanical datasets. Decker-Walters summarizes her studies of *Cucurbita pepo* using allozyme and image analysis, while Dunavan presents the results of her reanalysis of a Late Woodland assemblage providing new perspectives with the aid of morphological analyses, and Newsom's innovative study of three different wood assemblages advances our understanding of human ecology and resource utilization.

The final section is a compilation of case studies. Five chapters present specific temporal/spatial case studies of subsistence practices, changes, and social behavior: Wymer describes the similarities in Middle and Late Woodland subsistence patterns in Ohio, Scarry presents her work on the Mississippian Moundville assem-

blage and examines socioeconomic behavior in terms of agricultural risk, Johannessen addresses changes in food production and consumption in the American Bottom region spanning the Late Woodland to Mississippian periods, King analyzes an Oneota component in Illinois emphasizing the relationship between social change and climatic factors, and Ruhl describes a series of 16th and 17th century archaeobotanical assemblages from *La Florida*. Lopinot and Wood's chapter focuses on the collapse of Cahokia by examining wood resource utilization, procurement, and overexploitation. Clearly exemplified in these chapters, critical, paleoethnobotanical perspectives can bring a heightened understanding to questions regarding the manifestation of social behavior and causal factors relating to changes in Eastern Woodland cultures.

For readers especially interested in the protohistory of the lower Southeast, Ruhl's chapter on *La Florida* brings together ethnohistorical documentation and archaeobotanical data to identify patterns in plant use during the 16th and 17th centuries. Ruhl explores the interactions between three Native American tribes (Guale, Timucua, and Apalachee) and the Spanish to determine changes in traditional foodways experienced by each. Although the archaeobotanical data is presented in a rudimentary presence/absent format, gross generalities are gleaned from the analysis. Ruhl successfully identifies changes in subsistence strategies practiced by both groups.

Margaret Scarry has brought together a fine example of current research by some of the leading paleoethnobotanists conducting analytical studies on diet and subsistence in the Eastern Woodlands. After years of compiling, analyzing, and synthesizing archaeobotanical data, the authors have interwoven a volume that stands as an excellent contribution to our understanding of prehistoric and early historic foodways of Eastern Woodlands cultures. I would certainly concur with Deborah M. Pearsall that "[this is] a volume which belongs on the bookshelf of every archaeologist and paleoethnobotanist who is concerned with plants and culture in North America."

Northern Arizona University

ANDREA A. HUNTER

The Economy and Material Culture of Slaves: Goods and Chattels on the Sugar Plantations of Jamaica and Louisiana. By Roderick A. McDonald. (Baton Rouge: Louisiana State University Press, 1993. xiv, 339 pp. Acknowledgments, introduction, figures, maps, tables, conclusion, appendices, essay on bibliography and historiography, sources, index. \$39.95.)

Roderick McDonald has written a tremendously valuable study of the economy and material possessions of sugar plantation slaves in Jamaica and Louisiana. The extent of the so-called internal economy, the production, exchange and consumption of goods by and for slaves, is not well known for the United States. Readers will find several of McDonald's conclusions startling. For example, by selling corn, wood, poultry, hogs, and Spanish moss, Louisiana slaves earned upwards of \$20 each per year, more than the expense to masters for clothing and feeding them. On one plantation, slaves made as much as \$170 in a year. Moreover, these figures, because they are calculated from accounts kept by masters, do not include hidden earnings from forbidden sales off the plantation, the trade in stolen goods, and so forth. The more extensive internal economy of Jamaica has long been known to scholars. After all, it was a contemporary, planter-historian Edward Long, who observed in 1774 that slaves held perhaps 20 percent of Jamaica's coin, and that 10,000 slaves attended market every Sunday in Kingston. Nevertheless, by comparing the island to Louisiana, McDonald sheds new light on this familiar subject as well. The material goods slaves acquired through their internal economy in Jamaica came to them in lieu of provisions that might have been provided by slaveowners. In contrast, Louisiana slaves used their internal economy to supplement the provisions they received from masters. In both places slaves sought to improve their material well-being. They shared certain priorities, desiring cash or commodities that they could exchange for, first, food, clothing, housing, tobacco and liquor, and second, housewares, tools, and luxuries. What is perhaps more remarkable, they developed a sense of proprietary rights for the goods they traded and accumulated, keeping them secured under lock and key. In Louisiana, however, where masters provided more basic necessities, slaves were able to devote more of their earnings to satisfy their desire for less essential luxury purchases, such as watches.

McDonald's findings bear on the complex matter of the master-slave relationship and its consequences for the slaves. Island slaves enjoyed much more autonomy through their more extensive economy than did their mainland counterparts. As a result, they held on to more of their African heritage. They built their own housing in African style, and made and exchanged African style clothing. But their material well-being suffered— the death rate remained high, the fertility rate low— in part because masters left their slaves to fend for themselves. Louisiana masters interfered more directly in the lives of their slaves by providing housing and clothing, but of course in Anglo-American fashion. Materially, Louisiana slaves were much better off, and their rate of natural increase demonstrated as much. There was, in short, no positive relationship between the extent of the slaves' economy and the harshness of slavery as measured in its toll on human life.

It is disappointing that McDonald never explores the relationship between the slaves' economy and their rate of natural increase. Perhaps there was none. Still, the matter ought to have been considered because McDonald's comparative perspective is well-suited to it, and because it speaks so directly to the significance of the slaves' economy for the slaves themselves.

Although the subject of the book may seem narrow in scope, the implications of the author's painstaking research are large indeed. Moreover, data presented in 90 pages of appendices will doubtless prove useful to scholars long after McDonald's own very significant findings have been digested. There would appear to be a growing trend toward more sophisticated quantitative studies of historical research that show some disdain for number-crunching. May these studies not be ignored as a consequence.

University of Texas at Arlington

CHRISTOPHER MORRIS

The Work of Reconstruction: From Slave to Wage Labor in South Carolina, 1860-1870. By Julie Saville. (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1994. xiv, 221 pp. Acknowledgments, abbreviations, map, photographs, bibliography, index.)

Julie Saville's monograph, *The Work of Reconstruction*, probes deeply into one of the most important decades in American history— the 1860s, when millions of slaves became free men and women. Drawing on a wealth of archival sources and secondary lit-

erature, especially U.S. Army and Freedmen's Bureau records in the National archives, Saville presents a penetrating portrait of the emancipation experience in South Carolina. Saville argues that, for many newly freed African Americans, emancipation was more than a physical struggle for the liberation of their bodies from bondage. Emancipation was an economic, political, and cultural process of defining freedom as something more than selling labor on the free market; the ideal that free black people should possess their own land was the material foundation for emancipation.

Saville's study begins with a brief discussion of how slaves attempted to gain some control over their labor when they tended their own kitchen gardens and fields. In the immediate aftermath of emancipation, freedmen and women tried to establish on a permanent legal basis these practices of working their own land with their own families. Meanwhile, plantation owners and Northern officials often forced ex-slaves off land claims; and sent those displaced back to work the property recently restored to the planters, using wage or share contracts to keep the newly freed black population under a system of white control. At the same time, poor whites, fearful of competition from the freedmen and women, engaged in terrorist attacks on black land holdings and trade networks.

Much of Saville's recounting of the initial emancipation experience and the origins of sharecropping echoes the work of previous scholars such as Willie Lee Rose, Leon Litwack, and Gerald Jaynes. Saville does add some important observations about how age shaped the response of freedmen and women to new forms of wage labor—older workers were often more adaptable to new rules, while piece rates were set to the pace of younger, stronger workers. She also demonstrates how recalcitrant workers could be set adrift if they protested the new labor regimes.

Saville's later chapters contain tantalizing glimpses into the political organizations and cultural practices of ex-slaves. But the material on festivals, work drills, militias, and mass political meetings is sometimes awkwardly analyzed and not always completely connected with the book's major themes about slave and wage labor. Perhaps if Saville had extended her study to the traditional boundary of this period—1877—she might have drawn together more of her rich material on both the physical “reconstruction of work” and the political “work of reconstruction.”

In the end, Saville has written a meticulously detailed reconstruction of the ex-slaves' economic and political condition in the years immediately following emancipation. But she has embedded much of her extensive and primary material in a presentation which is often rhetorically dense and analytically obtuse. Had she conveyed more directly the emotional passion, physical struggle, and political calculation at the heart of the ex-slaves' experiences, an important piece of historical research might have become an even more valuable contribution to the historical literature on the post-bellum South.

North Carolina State University

DAVID A. ZONDERMAN

Race, Class, and Community in Southern Labor History. Edited by Gary M. Fink and Merl E. Reed. (Tuscaloosa: University of Alabama Press, 1994. xvii, 297 pp. Preface, introduction, tables, notes, editors and contributors, index \$39.95, cloth.)

Drawn from the 1991 Southern Labor Studies Conference, these 13 essays showcase the historiographical richness of the latest work in southern labor history. As the title suggests, the sources and research agenda of social history inform much of the work in *Race, Class, and Community in Southern Labor History*. The collection casts a wide net to include the working lives of urban slaves, antebellum overseers, convict laborers, African-American factory workers, and the men and women of southern mill villages. No volume of labor history would be complete, of course, without a dramatic narrative of a strike or two, and this book offers several essays that account for the region's abysmal record for organizing labor. With a well-developed sense for nuance and complexity, these essays underscore the importance of individual agency and historical contingency in trying to explain the course of southern labor history.

The first part of the book examines the historical development of the textile industry. David Carlton's thoughtful analysis of the literature on village paternalism reminds historians that while the system allowed for a degree of employee resistance and autonomy, paternalism was part of a larger historical process that left southerners with few choices and even fewer chances for "institutionalized worker power" (p. 23). Gary Freeze complements Carlton's work with a study of the psychological toll of paternalism on the al-

ready diminished status of the former agrarian patriarchs. Emphasizing the much neglected but important political behavior of southern textile workers, Bryant Simon suggests that the layoffs, wage-cuts, and stretch-out of the late 1920s forced laborers to reexamine their antistatist assumptions and turn toward the promises of the New Deal. Taken as a whole, these and the remaining essays offer a comprehensive review of the literature and issues on one of the region's most important industries.

The second part places black workers within the broader context of southern society from slavery to industrial unionism in the era of Jim Crow. Suzanne Schnittman offers an interesting essay that traces the origins of African-American working class formation to the experience of Richmond's tobacco factory slaves in the 1840s and 1850s. Even within the constraints of industrial slavery, Richmond's tobacco workers, frequently hired by agents or employers, could secure considerable autonomy with access to cash wages and independent living arrangements. Working from oral interviews, Michael Honey also points to an ambiguous legacy of African-American labor history with an account of trade unionism in Memphis nearly a century later. Despite the industrial discrimination of the CIO in the 1930s and 1940s black unionists used the organization to improve working conditions and fight for civil rights both inside and outside the factory gate.

The book concludes with a set of essays that addresses the relationship between labor and politics in the New South. Alex Lichtenstein dismisses simplistic generalizations about the power of the state with a sophisticated understanding of the conflicts and limitations of Georgia's convict lease system. Although state and industry officials may have shared attitudes about race, labor, and punishment for criminal behavior, conflict over the level of exploitation of prison labor consistently forced the state to grapple with its contradictory position as the final enforcer of discipline and protector of "state-created slaves" (p. 164). Michael Goldfield and Douglas Flamming's essays challenge traditional assumptions concerning southern exceptionalism in American labor history. Their work suggests that a cautious bid for mainstream respectability by national union leadership may have been more responsible for squelching conservatism during the late 1940s and 1950s.

This volume represents the variety and originality of the latest research in southern labor history. With summary reviews of the literature to each part of the book, *Race, Class, and Community in*

Southern Labor History stands as an important introduction to the major debates and issues of an expanding field of scholarship.

University of Florida

MICHAEL DAVID TEGEDER

The Last Voyage of El Nuevo Constante: The Wreck and Recovery of an Eighteenth-Century Spanish Ship off the Louisiana Coast. By Charles E. Pearson and Paul E. Hoffman. (Baton Rouge: Louisiana State University Press, 1995. xix, 245 pp. Preface, abbreviations, tables, bibliography, index, \$29.95.)

This fascinating book is both a compelling historical account of an 18th century Spanish merchantman's loss and an intriguing archaeological report of its recent discovery and excavation. Many books have chronicled the discovery of treasure-laden Spanish galleons in America waters, but this is the first that thoroughly documents historical background and excavation of an ordinary merchant ship. Pearson, a meticulous archaeologist, and Hoffman, a noted historian, enlisted the assistance of other scholars, scientists and technicians and were able fully to describe the physical features of the wreck, surmise how the hull was constructed, and where and how the cargo was stowed. Archival research in Spain, Mexico and Louisiana enabled the authors to trace the history of the ship from its purchase by a mercantile family in Cádiz from its owners in England to the final disposal of the salvaged cargo after the disaster in 1766.

On February 27, 1766, *El Nuevo Constante* reached Veracruz with a cargo of 100 tons of mercury and after being unloaded was incorporated into the *Flota de Nueve España*, commanded by Captain General Augustín de Idiaguez which was preparing to return to Spain. The registered cargo of the entire fleet was valued at 15,622, 284 pesos of which over 13 million was in silver coin, but the *El Nuevo Constante* only carried about 22,000 pesos in specie. The bulk of her cargo consisted of indigo, vanilla beans, leather hides, copal paste, logwood and other products of the land. Numerous delays ensued and the convoy finally set sail on August 21, 1766. The first ten days of the voyage were uneventful. Then on September 2, a hurricane struck and the ships were scattered off the coast of Louisiana. After three days of trying to keep the leaky ship afloat, the captain finally decided to run her aground to save

her cargo and people. Further to the west another ship of the convoy, *El Corazon de Jesus y Santa Barbara* was also run aground.

Immediately upon hearing word of the disaster, the first governor of the new Spanish colony of Louisiana, Don Antonio de Ulloa y de la Torre Guiral, undertook salvage operations on both wrecks. Over a period of two months, six different salvage vessels worked on the *El Nuevo Constante* and most of her cargo was recovered. An entire chapter of this book is dedicated to this contemporary salvage effort. Then for 213 years the wreck was forgotten.

Then in November 1979, a shrimp boat out of Port Bolivar, Texas, *The Lady Barbara*, skippered by Captain Curtis Blume, snagged into a portion of the wreck. Pulling their nets up they discovered three large copper disks weighing 70 to 80 pounds each. Later when Blume determined that he had found a shipwreck, he decided to salvage the site and he formed a company named Free Enterprise Salvage, Inc. Several dives resulted in an unknown number of gold and silver ingots being discovered—most likely contraband treasure on the wreck. Then they used a barge—mounted dredge bucket and recovered a large quantity of artifacts, including more gold and silver ingots, ballast, ship's timbers, pottery, turtle shell, cannon balls and ship's fittings. Many of the artifacts were damaged and by removing them from the wreck they made the work more difficult for the authors to interpret the wreck.

Realizing the wreck might have historical significance and that they were probably in legal peril because the wreck lay in state waters, some of Blume's associates convinced him to notify the Louisiana Department of Culture, Recreation and Tourism. The state then entered into a contract with the salvors in which the salvage would be undertaken under the supervision of professional archaeologists. All the materials recovered would remain with the state and the salvors would be compensated for their discovery and further work by receiving 75 percent of the value of the precious metals discovered.

This result is one of the best documented underwater archaeological excavations accomplished on a shipwreck in recent times. Half of the book deals with an analysis of the artifacts recovered from this site. With its abundance of maps and photographs, diagrams and tables, this important book is a good example of how all shipwreck excavations should be conducted and documented.

Marching With Sherman. By Henry Hitchcock. Edited by M. A. DeWolfe Howe, with an introduction by Brooks D. Simpson. (Lincoln and London: University of Nebraska Press, 1995. xiii, 332 pp. Photos, maps, illustrations, index, \$12.95.)

Edmund Wilson once wrote that the “‘American Civil War was not one in which belles letters flourished, but it did produce a remarkable literature which mostly consists of speeches and pamphlets, private letters and diaries, personal memoirs and journalistic reports.” Henry Hitchcock, an aide assigned to General William T. Sherman from October, 1864, until the end of the war, created a fair example of this literature.

In a series of letters written to his wife and in a campaign diary he kept at times when mail service was interrupted, Hitchcock penned a humane, fascinating account of his experiences in the midst of “mass war” waged against rebel homelands in Georgia and the Carolinas. His account, not written for publication, offers the story of a novice soldier’s effort to understand why the tactics of “mass war” became tolerable, even justifiable, in the cause of preserving the Union.

Although he was born near Mobile, Alabama, Henry Hitchcock was hardly a typical white southerner of his time. Yale educated, selfconsciously tied to his New England ancestry, he established a prominent law office in St. Louis during the early 1850s. He was elected to the Missouri state convention of 1861 as a Republican, helped to block the passage of an ordinance of secession, and later, joined a majority of delegates in forming a provisional state government that was loyal to the Union. In the post war years, Hitchcock returned to his stellar legal practice, taking part in founding the American Bar Association.

The young Hitchcock began his military service at a camp near Rome, Georgia, on October 31, 1864, after having petitioned for an appointment through secretary of War Edwin M. Stanton and his uncle, Ethan Allen Hitchcock, Major General of volunteers and a friend of General Sherman. In the first few weeks of his duty, the new aide recoiled at the degree of destruction he witnessed as the Union army ground its way through the hills of Central Georgia.

Gradually, if reluctantly, he came to accept the demolition of property used by rebel military forces and the routine seizure of cattle, hogs, work animals, grains and other items as sure ways to defeat the Confederate army. A December 1, 1864, diary entry is il-

lustrative: "It is a terrible thing to consume and destroy the sustenance of thousands of people, and most saddening and distressing in itself to see and hear the terror and grief of these women and children. But . . . if that terror and grief and even want shall help paralyze their husbands and fathers who are fighting against us . . . it is mercy in the end."

Originally published in 1927 and edited by Pulitzer Prize-winning historian Mark DeWolfe Howe, Hitchcock's account immediately became a standard source for investigations into Sherman's most famous campaign. Scholars ranging from Lloyd Lewis (*Sherman, Fighting Prophet*: 1932) to James M. McPherson (*Ordeal By Fire*: 1982), among many others, have utilized *Marching With Sherman* as reliable testimony. Hitchcock's honest criticism of what he believed to be excessive, unauthorized actions by soldiers under the general's command has made the document particularly valuable for appraisals of what Sherman and his men attempted to do, and what they actually did.

Thanks to the University of Nebraska Press, this long out of print source is now available in a paperback edition. Other publishing houses, please take note.

Florida Farm Bureau, Gainesville

G. B. CRAWFORD

New South - New Law. The Legal Foundations of Credit and Labor Relations in the Postbellum Agricultural South. By Harold D. Woodman. (Baton Rouge: Louisiana State University Press, 1995. x, 124 pp. Acknowledgments, introduction, cases cited. \$19.95.)

There will always be a need for a writer who can discuss the law in a way which laymen can understand. Dr. Woodman accomplishes this in his exploration of postbellum southern credit law as it affected share croppers, tenant farmers, and landowners.

He begins with the post-war plight of southern plantation owners who sought ways to make their land productive without slave labor. They attacked the problem by subdividing and renting it for a share of the crop, or granting workers a share in exchange for their labor. Problems arose when creditors claiming lien rights competed for the crop or its proceeds.

By 1868, state statutes provided three bases for the creation of crop liens: rent and the cost of supplies or wage advances owed by

the tenant to the landlord, the amount owed by the tenant to a merchant for supplies, and wages owed by the landowner to the laborer. Depending on how the lien was created, a lienholder might seek satisfaction from the landlord's interest in the land, the tenant's interest in the crop, or the sharecropper's share of net crop proceeds. The chief legal problems were those which dealt with issues of priority. By 1837, states led by Georgia had adopted laws which gave the landlord a superior lien for rent and supplies advanced. These laws were upheld by the state courts.

To accomplish this, the courts distinguished between a tenant and a sharecropper, and in the process, gave landlords enormous power. A tenant had an interest in the land and the crop. A cropper was a contract laborer, whose only right was to receive his wages *from net crop proceeds*. Thus, he could not give a crop lien. Needless to say, landlords tended to argue in court that their farm workers were "croppers," not tenants. Understandably, merchants often refused to give credit to a cropper, and croppers were forced to resort to the landlord's plantation store. In such an environment, the cropper found it most difficult to get out of debt to his landlord.

Woodman's analysis provides a readable and informative discourse on the legal underpinnings for the failure of southern Reconstruction. Lawyers, and those who are interested in the evolution of the law, will find this a very useful book. The historical value is somewhat limited. This is neither a social nor economic history, and no new interpretations are presented. The relationship, if any, between crop lien laws and the Black Codes is not addressed. Rather, it is an explanation bordering on an apology for the way the legal system enabled the benighting of the redeemed South. There is even a suggestion that a different result might have obtained if the federal government had adopted laws which protected southern farm workers when their rights were in conflict with those of landowners.

An intriguing statement is found in the closing passages where the author deals with the politics of jurisprudence, which he argues is not an oxymoron. In the postbellum South, the immediate goal of the most influential constituents (white plantation owners) was to replace slavery with a free labor system while still maintaining control over the work force. In the process of achieving this, they created a rural proletariat consisting mostly of poor black farmers who could not escape from the resulting repression. While alternatives to tenant farming and sharecropping existed, they were not

used because ultimately, the politics of redemption prevailed. Those politics sought to shift any risk of loss so as to protect the ownership and control of the land and its produce. Court decisions supported this. Those who are familiar with southern history will find a nice consistency in this.

University of Central Florida

MICHAEL WOODS

Country People in the New South. By Jeanette Keith. (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 1995. xi, 293 pp. Acknowledgments, tables, figures, maps, notes, bibliography, index. \$45.00 hardcover, \$18.95 paper.)

Professor Keith has written a valuable regional study that reinvigorates the traditional picture of the southern rural uplands. Using a variety of sources including federal census reports, state government documents, church records, and newspapers, she analyzes social and economic developments between 1890 and 1925 in ten counties in the Cumberland highlands of East and Middle Tennessee. As a native of the region, she is aware of many significant differences in what appears to be a homogenous society, and she is, therefore, able to provide her readers with a nuanced description of the life of the people she studies.

Keith's thesis is clear and unapologetic: the Upper Cumberland region was one place where the traditional picture of the small landowner as the dominant social and political figure was accurate. While recognizing that a small elite existed and often held political office in the county seats, she convincingly argues that they were unable to dominate county politics and force a more progressive agenda on their rural neighbors. Keith also notes a fairly numerous dependent population in the rural areas—tenant farmers primarily— but she dismisses them as sons who will soon join the landowning class. This analysis may not be convincing to other scholars, but Keith offers considerable evidence to support her interpretation.

The majority of the population, however, lived on independent farms. Practicing a "safety first" approach to farming, most families produced food and other necessities for themselves. Few of the region's farmers grew commercial crops and even fewer of them borrowed money or supplies— there were virtually no share-

croppers in the ten counties. This economic conservatism was matched by a companion political, fiscal, and religious conservatism. The adult male in the household was the dominant figure in the family, although the adult women and children made significant financial contributions. While the Baptists, Methodists, Presbyterians, and Christians disagreed vehemently on matters of doctrine, they all believed that individuals and the society should follow certain patterns of behavior.

This insulated world was challenged by the national emergency created by America's entry into World War I. Despite a strong pacifist tradition among some of the local congregations, most young men signed up for the draft and served when called—the famous Alvin York came from this region. At home, the progressives in the county seats suddenly found themselves in positions of power. They directed the draft boards, local councils of defense, food administration, war bond sales, and enforcement of the Sedition Act. The state and local governments greatly increased taxes to pay for the expanded services, and, in 1920, the overburdened farmers of this region voted Republican in much greater numbers than they had previously. The Republicans reduced expenditures, and control of local politics returned to the more rural parts of the Upper Cumberland. One expression of the returning conservatism in the region's politics was the anti-evolution law introduced by John Washington Butler of Macon County. The law was the central issue in the famous Scopes trial in Dayton. Keith concludes the book with a brief description of the ten counties today.

The study of rural society in the South describes a lifestyle once common from Kentucky to Florida. What distinguishes the Upper Cumberland is that the region remained largely unchanged until the middle of the 20th century. Keith's research is impressive; her writing is clear; and the breadth of her coverage of all aspects of Upper Cumberland society is impressive. This volume is an important addition to the growing literature about the rural South during the Progressive period.

Berea College

GORDON B. MCKINNEY

Remembering the Maine. By Peggy and Harold Samuels. (Washington and London: Smithsonian Institution Press, 1995. 358 pp. Acknowledgment, photographs, notes, bibliography, index. \$29.95.)

There is merit in the thought of Wallace Stevens that "it is the unknown that excites the ardor of scholars, who, in the known alone, would shrivel up with boredom." The question of who and what sank the *U.S.S. Maine* in Havana harbor on the night of February 15, 1898 has played a lasting role in fighting off scholarly boredom and preserving the intellectual apparatus from atrophy. With varying degrees of analysis and emphasis, historians seasonally return to the question in a perennial shuffling of the evidence.

In 1958 John Edward Weems published *The Fate of the Maine* (republished in 1992) and concluded that there was no way to answer the question of external versus internal explosions: "too many other possibilities suggest themselves." Admiral Hyman G. Rickover entered the lists in 1976 with *How the Battleship Maine Was Destroyed*. With characteristic surety and certainty, Rickover concluded (basing his analysis on the work of Hansen and Price) that a fire in coal bunker A-16 set off the 6-inch reserve magazine. There was no evidence that a mine destroyed the *Maine*. Michael Blow in his *A Ship to Remember: The Maine and the Spanish-American War* (1992) did solid work in establishing that far from being the final and definitive answer to the enigma of the *Maine*, Rickover's work was "conjectural and inconclusive." Blow went further and cited the evidence (from the 1898 Sampson board of inquiry) that "the sinking of the Maine had been arranged by Spanish military officers" - evidence that the court did not follow up.

Now we have Peggy and Harold Samuels with *Remembering the Maine*. This is quite simply the most thorough, the best reasoned, and the most persuasive treatment that we have ever had on the question of the *Maine* and its demise. Not only do the authors make a strong and believable case for the physical causes of the explosions, but they answer the forever intriguing question of "who dunnit."

Since this is a book to read and not just read about, no effort at resume will be attempted here. The Samuels make the case that the *Maine* was destroyed by the fanatical supporters of General Valeriano Weyler. The destruction was initiated by the explosion of a small mine, most likely containing black powder. They substanti-

ate their thesis through the twists and turns of the naval inquiry in 1898, the international arguments concerning cause, and the raising of the *Maine* and subsequent investigation in 1911. They are particularly thorough on the 1911 investigation and correctly report that the evidence of the Vreeland Board has never received the weight and credibility that it deserved. It was not a rehash and a confirmation of the earlier Sampson inquiry, and the citations to historians who reported otherwise shed no luster on our profession.

Those who enjoy the cut and thrust of rational argument will smile their way through the fine analysis and rebuttal of the Rickover findings. While there are minor objections and queries along the way, they in no way detract from the achievement of these authors. This is a splendid study and a major contribution to almost 100 years of *Maine* scholarship.

Georgia Southern University, Emeritus

ROBERT DAVID WARD

Code-Name *DOWNFALL: The Secret Plan to Invade Japan— And Why Truman Dropped the Bomb*. By Thomas B. Allen and Norman Polmar. (New York: Simon and Schuster, 1995. 350 pp. Prologue, photographs, map, notes, bibliography, index, picture credits. \$25.00.)

The great difficulty in understanding World War II in the Pacific lies in the disjunction of the realities of 1945 and 1995. Today, academic specialists ensconced in their antiseptic, air conditioned offices explain why Harry Truman should not have employed the atomic bomb against the gentle, civilized Japanese. About the only risk these scholars run is being denounced in letters-to-the-editor.

By contrast, in 1945 hundreds of thousands of American soldiers, sailors, and marines found themselves in rather different circumstances. Caught up in a sickening blood letting on faraway islands against an enemy who preferred death to surrender, these men simply wanted to survive. Thousands, of course, did not.

The greatest compliment that can be paid any book on World War II in the Pacific is that it conveys something of this reality of 1945. *Code-Name DOWNFALL* meets this test. Based on sources in the National Archives, the U.S. Army's Center of Military History, the MacArthur Archives, the Japanese National Institute for De-

fense Studies and the Japanese Historical Research Institute, the book starts slowly. The prologue and the first five and a half chapters (of a total of twelve) recite the military history of the Pacific war from the evolution of Plan ORANGE in the late 19th century through the Battle of Okinawa. Those familiar with these subjects will find little new here.

Midway through Chapter 6, though, this book becomes vastly more interesting. The authors provide a fascinating description of DOWNFALL (the name given to the invasion of Japan) that included OLYMPIC (scheduled for November 1945 against Kyushu) and CORONET (set for March 1946 against Honshu). They also discuss Japanese defense plans and offer an analysis of the likely outcome had OLYMPIC been launched. The book is enhanced by maps of the projected landings and appendices that outline the American and Japanese forces that would have opposed each other.

Intertwined with this is a far less detailed account of Truman's decision to use the atomic weapon. This decision Allen and Polmar find fully justified and attribute it to the fanatical Japanese resistance on Iwo Jima and Okinawa, the expectations of large casualties in any invasion of the home islands, and the conviction that the Japanese had no intention of surrendering.

The portrayal of what the invasion of Kyushu would have been like is a horrifying one. Japanese intelligence correctly predicted the location of the American landings, so there would have been no surprise. Both sides were prepared to unleash chemical and bacteriological weapons and hundreds of thousands of Japanese were committed to suicide attacks. George C. Marshall spoke of the use of atomic bombs to support the invasion. Kyushu would have become a slaughterhouse beyond imagination for both Americans and Japanese.

Of course, the subject of casualties in any invasion has become central to the controversy over the use of the atomic bomb. Part of the argument against the bomb is that it was unnecessary because an invasion of Japan would have been far less costly than later advertised by Truman with substantially less than 100,00 casualties, according to critics of the president.

On this sensitive subject, Allen and Polmar emphatically rebut the revisionists. They estimate American losses for OLYMPIC at 147,500 deaths and 343,000 wounded and contend numbers would have been much greater in CORONET. Needless to say, even larger

numbers of Japanese would have perished. But the most intriguing aspect of their examination of this issue is their suggestion that at least some of the casualty estimates of 1945 were manipulated downward in order to try and influence Truman's decision.

Code-Name DOWNFALL makes a compelling case but because it deals with a hypothetical event, its central thesis (that the invasion would have been a bloodbath for both Americans and Japanese) is unprovable. Those interested in this subject should also read John Ray Skates, *The Invasion of Japan: Alternative to the Bomb* (1994) which presents a very different scenario. The one certainty in all this speculation is that the American troops scheduled to participate in the invasion were most thankful that they did not have to test the hypotheses advanced with so much fervor (and in so much safety) by historians fifty years later.

University of Central Florida

EDMUND F. KALLINA, JR.

BOOK NOTES

Marjorie Kinnan Rawlings and the Florida Cracker by Sandra Wallus Sammons and Nina McGuire was released in October 1995 by Tailored Tours Publications of Lake Buena Vista, Florida. Sandra Wallus Sammons, a former elementary school librarian, and Nina McGuire, a historian and author of several Florida books, spent several years on the manuscript for a children's book commemorating Marjorie Kinnan Rawlings, her life and her writings. *Marjorie Kinnan Rawlings and the Florida Cracker*, published in a large print and illustrated with more than 20 photographs, is the result of their effort. Although intended for younger folk, the book provides a thoughtful introduction to Rawlings and her life at Cross Creek for readers of all ages. It is available from local booksellers, or may be ordered from Tailored Tours Publications, Box 22861, Lake Buena Vista, Florida, for \$14.95 plus \$2 for postage and handling.

Pineapple Press has just published David Nolan's *The Houses of St. Augustine*, a comprehensive survey of the city's architecture from the mid-1500s to the 1960s. The handsome book is illustrated by the paintings of Jean Ellen Fitzpatrick and photographs by Ken Barrett, Jr. Nolan makes it clear that the nation's oldest continuous settlement has weathered Spanish, British, and American governments, a number of wars, and many changes in architectural fashion. Each chapter in the book addresses a distinctive era in St. Augustine's development with a historical summary and photo essays which illustrate representative styles and forms. A good example is the treatment of the Colonial Period with its distinctive coquina stone houses and overhanging balconies. Another is the chapter dealing with the Victorian Age with its easily recognizable buildings trimmed in lacy gingerbread. The book also features the influences of major personalities. Henry Flagler's reintroduction of Spanish-style architecture is unquestionably the most striking example of the influence of an individual. The advent of the automobile was a national trend which had an impact on St. Augustine because it allowed the city to expand quickly. Throughout the work, David Nolan offers insight into the continuing struggle for preservation of older structures as successive generations have imposed their ideas on the city's future. To celebrate the publication

of *The Houses of St. Augustine*, as well as the 150th birthday of the state, the St. Augustine Historical Society has opened a new exhibit, "The Way We Looked." Featuring photographs by Ken Barrett, Jr., and watercolors by Jean Ellen Fitzpatrick, the exhibit will run through January 1996.

Stonewall Jackson's Surgeon, Hunter Holmes McGuire: A Biography is the outgrowth of Maurice F. Shaw's master's thesis which was completed in 1970 at Texas Christian University when Don E. Worcester— a longtime professor of history at the University of Florida— was chairman of the TCU history department. Urged on by both Worcester and his major professor, W. C. Nunn, Shaw continued his research and this book is the result of his efforts. *Stonewall Jackson's Surgeon* traces the life and career of the medical director of General Thomas Jonathan Jackson's Corps. Dr. McGuire attended General Jackson after he was wounded at the Battle of Chancellorsville. After Jackson's death, the physician continued his duties under the command of General Richard Ewell. Married almost immediately after the Civil War, Dr. McGuire opened a medical practice in war-torn Richmond. During the next 35 years he practiced medicine, built a hospital, and became a renowned surgeon. The book was published in 1993 by H. E. Howard, Inc., Lynchburg, VA. Complete with illustrations, it is available from that publisher for \$19.95 plus \$2.50 postage.

John Egerton's widely acclaimed, prize-winning *Speak Now Against the Day: The Generation Before the Civil Rights Movement in the South* focuses on the ministers, writers, educators, journalists, social activists, union members, and politicians who "pointed the way to higher ground." Among them were Will Alexander who founded the Commission on Interracial Cooperation, Miles Horton of the Highlander Folk School, Osceola McKaine, a black political sage who helped establish the South Carolina Progressive Democratic Party in 1944, and Lucy Randolph Mason, a Virginia gentlewoman who became the "advance man" for the CIO's urban organizers. Florida readers will be especially interested in his treatment of Mary McLeod Bethune who, "after starting a 'school for Negro girls' in Florida," became a deputy director of the National Youth Administration, the first black woman to hold an executive position in the federal government. At the same time, Egerton also reminds his readers of South Carolina's "Cotton Ed" Smith,

Georgia's Herman Talmadge, and Mississippi's Theodore G. Bilbo, James O. Eastland, and John E. Rankin. Winner of the 1995 Robert F. Kennedy book award, the 1995 Ambassador book award in American Studies of the English-Speaking Union of the United States, and the 1995 Southern Book Critics Circle Award for Non-fiction, *Speak Now Against the Day* is now available in paperback from the University of North Carolina Press. The price of this 768-page, illustrated book is \$18.95.