

1997

Book Reviews

Florida Historical Society
membership@myfloridahistory.org

 Part of the [American Studies Commons](#), and the [United States History Commons](#)

Find similar works at: <https://stars.library.ucf.edu/fhq>

University of Central Florida Libraries <http://library.ucf.edu>

This Book Review is brought to you for free and open access by STARS. It has been accepted for inclusion in Florida Historical Quarterly by an authorized editor of STARS. For more information, please contact STARS@ucf.edu.

Recommended Citation

Society, Florida Historical (1997) "Book Reviews," *Florida Historical Quarterly*. Vol. 76 : No. 3 , Article 8.
Available at: <https://stars.library.ucf.edu/fhq/vol76/iss3/8>

BOOK REVIEWS

A History of Florida Through New World Maps: Borden of Paradise. Edited by Dana Ste. Claire. (Gainesville: University Press of Florida, 1997. 64 pp. Preface, introduction, glossary, suggested reading, bibliography. \$12.95 paper.)

Nearly five hundred years ago Juan Ponce de Leon and his fellow sailors stepped ashore on the southeastern coast of North America. Renaming the land they encountered *La Florida*, this early explorer of the New World and his crew immediately claimed their "discovery" for King Ferdinand of Spain. Perhaps the first European to declare possession of territory in North America, Juan Ponce inaugurated a three-century contest between empires and individuals for control of the continent. In *A History of Florida Through New World Maps: Borders of Paradise*, Dana Ste. Claire and Peter A. Cowdrey Jr. narrate and illustrate the course of this contest in the Southeast using cartographic and other images created by contemporaries. In writing for "Florida history enthusiasts" and "explorers," these author-editors assert that "[t]he rich and varied historical development of the Florida territory into an American state is a colorful compendium that can be read chapter by chapter through the rich repository of New World maps and drawings" (9). Regrettably, the book's structure and organization prevent readers from appreciating fully the breadth and depth of Florida history apparent in its early cartography.

In an opening section titled "A History of Paradise," Ste. Claire discusses the main themes and events in Florida history including the pre-contact culture of native Americans, various European colonization efforts, the American Revolution, nineteenth-century Indian wars, the quest for statehood, and New World mapmaking technology. His selection of subjects clearly reinforces his belief that "the story of Florida is a fascinating and lengthy tale of multiculturalism and determination" (9). He mentions all the major historical figures (Indian, European, and American) and the transfers of political authority between Spain, France, Britain, and the United States. However, Ste. Claire never seems quite sure of the

scope of his topic. The “borders” of his “paradise” changed frequently and consistently diminished the size of the territory called Florida. At one point the reader learns that Florida “was not completely uninvolved in the [American] revolution” because Paul Revere finished engraving Florida maps just before his midnight ride (17). Given the text’s focus on maps, including a description of the region’s geography would have improved this section tremendously.

The most interesting part of this volume is Cowdrey’s annotated catalog of sixteen maps and charts in the collections of the Florida Museum of Arts and Sciences. These maps, which date from 1540 to 1846, beautifully depict the changing conception of Florida’s topography and importance in the minds of Europeans and Americans. Cowdrey is careful to describe the origins of each map and to provide brief biographies of the artists. In pictures and words, he shows how the advances in nautical and cartographic technology, the changing nature of colonial settlements, and the competition between various European powers for hegemony in the Southeast are all evident on the mapface. Unlike in the beginning historical section, full citations accompany each annotation. Most important, Cowdrey pays attention to both the perceived “accuracy” of the maps (the location of lines and the shape of territories) and the symbolism inherent in geographic placenames and decorative cartouches. In his summary essay on the navigator as mapmaker called “Distant Shores of Foreign Lands,” Cowdrey describes the invention and use of nautical instruments which made possible the “cartographic evolution of Florida” (58). A timeline of Florida history, glossary, suggestions for further reading, and bibliography complete the volume.

A History of Florida Through New World Maps is a welcome addition to the historical cartography of early America. While its two main chapters could have been better integrated into a single section tracing the history of Florida through maps and images, Ste. Claire and Cowdrey have produced a valuable resource which will appeal to both academic and general audiences alike.

The College of William & Mary

MEAGHAN N. DUFF

The Black Seminoles: History of a Freedom-Seeking People. Kenneth W. Porter. Revised and edited by Alcione M. Amos and Thomas P. Senter. (Gainesville: University Press of Florida, 1996. xii, 284 pp. Preface, photographs, notes, bibliography, index. \$29.95 cloth.)

This story of the Black Seminoles was the lifetime work of Professor Kenneth W. Porter who taught for many years at the University of Oregon. Begun in the 1930s it had not yet been published at his death in 1981, although portions of his research appeared in the *Journal of Negro History* and perhaps elsewhere before then. The book was edited down from its original seven hundred or so pages and brought up to date by Thomas P. Senter, an Alaskan writer-dermatologist who stumbled upon the subject while doing research for a biography of General John L. Bullis, who once led a troop of Seminole Negro Indian Scouts for the U.S. Army, and Alcione M. Amos, a World Bank librarian who came to the topic independently. Their success is suggested by the seamless nature of the narration, which provides no evidence of truncation. If there are things we wish to know more about, the fault cannot confidently be laid to them.

The book tells the tale of the Black Seminoles' origins in Florida as refugees sheltered by break-away members of the Lower Creeks, who became known as Seminoles, and follows their movement to settlements in Indian Territory and Mexico. It traces their transformation from fearsome foes to faithful friends in their relations with the American government, though their services were not properly rewarded. They were equally useful to the Mexicans and while relations between the two were not always ideal, they were treated somewhat better. A few of their descendants still have land south of the border. In the United States their history was different. Although their contribution to the pacification of the American West was invaluable, and they were promised land and protection for their services and submission, ultimately they were doomed by disagreements over whether they should be regarded as blacks or Indians, and whether those recognized as slaves could legally be emancipated by military authorities in return for their allegiance. In an ironic turn of events, although they "struggled unsuccessfully to be formally recognized as Indians, [they] were finally treated as such" (214): Their homes were taken, promises made to them were not honored, and their justifiable claims were dismissed.

Their relationship with the Seminoles, though not untroubled, was more successful. The Seminoles also bought blacks but held them in more a tributary than a servile relationship. The two groups generally lived separately, but blacks sometimes rose to considerable influence among their Native American friends and owners. Occasionally, they intermarried. Whether acquired as slaves or protected as runaways, blacks were useful allies, serving as exemplary cultivators, necessary mediators in negotiations between red and white people, and formidable military companions. General Thomas S. Jesup, for example, who helped to bring the Second Seminole War (1835-42) to a successful conclusion, called it "a negro, not an Indian war" (67), and forecast disastrous consequences for the slave South if it were not speedily ended. The blacks were cultural as well as linguistic go-betweens and proved to be trusted advisors who could report subtle meaning equally with strict phraseology in their role as translators, based on their intimate knowledge of white people. Unfortunately, when treaty obligations were disregarded— a common occurrence in the United States' relations with native peoples— the Seminoles sometimes blamed the blacks for having deluded them rather than the whites for being unfaithful. Many black scouts and interpreters were assassinated after the move to the reservation.

Porter's story focuses on John Horse, or Juan Cavallo, who was born during an early period of conflict between Americans and Seminoles. It uses the Black Seminoles' position in an international struggle between Americans, Spaniards and British over who would control Florida and best use blacks and Indians in pursuit of their aims as a backdrop to John Horse's upbringing, though much about his early life goes unremarked. He comes into focus after the United States has achieved hegemony in the region, and his relations with the U.S. Army were marked by pragmatic shrewdness. If, as is possible, he participated in some of the attritional battles of the Second Seminole War, he proved to be a frustrating enemy. But he became a courageous and dependable scout for the army and a respected leader of his people after an accommodation became inevitable.

Porter eschews the kind of linguistic and ethnological discussion to be found in Kevin Mulroy's recent *Freedom on the Border* (1993). Mulroy regards the Black Seminoles as maroons and his work is informed, among others, by the studies of anthropologist Richard Price, particularly *Maroon Societies* (1973). Porter is of a different generation, and he tends more often to assume rather than

question Seminole identity, either red or black. Yet he used oral history before that practice became as fashionable among American historians as it may now be, and recorded information from informants no longer alive and whose knowledge would otherwise have been lost. He evinces a strong interest in the genealogical background of individuals, though its meaning is sometimes lost on the general reader. A lamentable shortcoming is exhibited in the passing references he makes to cultural attitudes and practices of the Black Seminoles, such as their religious beliefs, and marriage and naming patterns, where one could earnestly desire further elaboration. It is barely possible that some facts of this kind were deleted by the editors but, in context, it seems unlikely. It is difficult to imagine that they, or anybody else who picked up this book, could view these attributes with disinterest. But the book's narrative power is unexcelled. There are exciting battle scenes and heartrending personal stories. The Black Seminoles survived slave catchers, government betrayal, and attempts at extermination as they asserted their humanity and expressed their love of freedom. This book is a worthy monument to them and to Kenneth Porter's lifelong quest.

University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign DANIEL C. LITTLEFIELD

Baseball in Florida. By Kevin M. McCarthy. (Sarasota: Pineapple Press, Inc., 1996. ix, 272 pp. Introduction, photographs, appendices, quotation sources, bibliography, index. \$21.95 hardcover, \$14.95 paper.)

The title of Kevin M. McCarthy's publication, *Baseball in Florida*, is broad for a work even more ambitious than the label suggests. McCarthy not only discusses just about every type of baseball played in the Sunshine State, but he also attempts to deal with women and African Americans who have played the game. This attempt to cover a great deal of ground is both the strength and weakness of the work.

While reading *Baseball in Florida* it becomes difficult for the reader to decide whether this is a work of history or a sports book written for the baseball enthusiast. In attempting to write for both the historically inclined and the baseball reader, McCarthy whets the appetite of each and yet frustrates both.

Perhaps his strongest appeal to the general reader is the chapter which focuses on women in baseball, but this section is not without flaws. McCarthy begins with the decision in 1931 by Baseball Commissioner Kenesaw Mountain Landis to ban women from playing in professional baseball's minor leagues. This ruling leads one to the supposition that there must have been at least one woman who was a threat to do so; but we are left in the dark concerning the event that prompted baseball's first czar to so rule,

McCarthy then jumps to a profile of the All-American Girls Professional Baseball League (AAGPBL), a midwestern circuit started by Chicago Cubs owner Philip K. Wrigley during World War II. Capitalizing on the recent popular movie "A League of Their Own," McCarthy strains to connect the AAGPBL to Florida baseball and further to the continuance of baseball during and after the war. The connections are tenuous at best. McCarthy mentions only four Floridians who played in the league and then ties in star player Dottie Kamenshek to Florida. Kamenshek's only connection to Florida is that she turned down an offer to try out with a minor league men's team in the state.

The author's assertion that "the women who played in that league succeeded in keeping baseball alive during and after World War II" is a statement that, while many of us may wish it were true, is most clearly not in view of the facts that McCarthy himself provides. For more than a decade each team in the ten-team league played a schedule of 108 games per year. McCarthy states that "more than a million" fans flocked to see the high calibre baseball played by the league. However an average of approximately 10,000 fans paid to watch the 54 home games of each team each year, an average attendance of 185 fans per game. "More than a million" certainly sounds much better without the calculator. The AAGPBL is a very interesting piece of history, but it is not a league that saved baseball during World War II, and it had almost nothing to do with Florida. It's unfortunate that McCarthy did not delve into the treatment of the women who played, the conditions they endured, the excessive discipline to which they were subjected and the grueling schedule they were forced to play for their \$65 to \$125 per month. But to do so, he would have had to retitle the book.

Far and away the best part of the work is the chapter on African Americans in baseball. McCarthy combines a generally accurate overview of the low status of African Americans in pre-civil-rights-era Florida and in baseball with informative and moving descriptions of

individual players. His brief account of the Flagler hotel teams is most interesting, but his sketches of baseball greats John Henry "Pop" Lloyd and Buck O'Neil are compelling. Lloyd's experience with the great Ty Cobb puts the era in focus. Lloyd had just handily outit the Georgia Peach in a five-game exhibition series in Cuba. Further, Cobb had been tagged out three times by Lloyd, in spite of Cobb's threatening high-spikes lunges at the African American shortstop. At the end of the series Cobb refused even to shake the hand of the man who had bested him. In this tale, and in the rest of the chapter, McCarthy does well by those athletes who were so unfairly kept from participating in major league baseball simply because of their color.

It is unfortunate that McCarthy tried to include so much in such a short book. His chapters on college, high school and youth baseball are collections of trivia not important to the general baseball fan, nor of interest to historians. The other chapters suffer from the same sort of pedestrian, disjointed treatment sprinkled with occasional facts connected to very little except that they occurred in Florida, or that someone connected to an occurrence was born in or eventually moved to Florida. For these reasons *Baseball in Florida* will unfortunately not be of interest to general readers, historians or baseball fans, except for that occasional researcher who wants to know who won the American Legion Championship in 1979, or what school won the Florida Junior College crown the greatest number of times.

University of Central Florida

DANIEL GILMARTIN

Commitment to a Community: A History of Sacred Heart Hospital. By William S. Coker and Nathan F. Woolsey. (Pensacola: Sacred Heart Hospital, 1996. xiv, 177 pp. List of abbreviations and illustrations, foreword, acknowledgments, photographs, appendices, bibliography, index, about the authors. \$12.00 includes tax and postage. Paperback. Book available from The Guild Gift Shop, Sacred Heart Health System, 5151 N. 9th Avenue, Pensacola, FL 32504).

This small volume details the building of the Sacred Heart Hospital, the first "modern" hospital in Pensacola, Florida, and the faithful service it has rendered the community over the past eighty-two years. Built on land donated by the Catholic Diocese of Mobile and financed by the Daughters of Charity of Emmitsburg, Maryland, and

citizens of all faiths in the community, it opened its doors on September 1, 1915. The administrative and nursing staff, and soon a nursing training school, were provided by the Daughters of Charity.

Throughout subsequent years, with the support of the church and community, the hospital weathered the onslaughts of hurricanes, World Wars I and II, the devastating Spanish flu epidemic of 1918, the Great Depression, economic inflation and a constant struggle for development, as well as chronic maintenance and operating problems. For many of these years Sacred Heart Hospital was the chief dispenser of medical charity in the community. Despite these and other obstacles it has remained in the vanguard of modern medicine.

The authors, both distinguished Florida historians, have relied on personal interviews, relevant secondary literature, booklets, manuscripts, church records, current newspaper accounts, and medical journal articles to make their narrative come alive. They also have provided careful documentation for the reader who wants to investigate a point in more detail.

The book includes forty-four illustrations of hospital benefactors, administrators, patients, medical staff, buildings and a current diagram of the hospital campus. The appendix lists the names of the administrators, presidents, chief executive officers, and chaplains, as well as a schedule of the growth of the hospital as illustrated by the number of beds and the number of patients every fifth year from 1915 to 1996.

This volume is recommended to all who have an interest in the colorful history of Pensacola. Religious, medical and lay persons will find it an invaluable source for details of the establishment and growth of the first "modern" hospital in Pensacola.

Miami, Florida

WILLIAM M. STRAIGHT

Creoles of Color of the Gulf South. Edited by James J. Dormon. (Knoxville: University of Tennessee Press, 1996. xv, 190 pp. Preface, illustrations, tables, bibliography, contributors, index. \$30.00 cloth, \$15.00 paper.)

Historians who address this subject habitually use certain *terms*— *new people*, *metamorphosis*, and *ambiguity*— probably more than any others. Editor Dormon and his colleagues who penned this collection of original essays have striven to cast such terms in a

clearer light. They succeed, for the most part, viewing the subject through wide-ranging prisms. Dormon's introduction launches the analysis by ably explaining the term *Creole*, a task complicated by the fact that the word has different meanings across place and time. Within this study, *Creole of color* is defined as racially mixed offspring of Louisiana's colonial population "who occupied a special, intermediate place in the racial and social order" of the Gulf South.

In the first essay, Kimberly Hanger offers a pivotal discussion of the ways and means of acquiring freedom, beginning with New Orleans' Louis Congo who earned manumission in the 1720s through service as the colony's executioner. Virginia Gould takes the study beyond the traditional confines of Louisiana to include Mobile and Pensacola. According to Gould, by the close of the century the formulation of a "cohesive community" of free people of color had begun. Loren Schweninger expands temporally by tracing the economic progress of this class through the Civil War years, offering perceptive discussions of the role of women, nonwhite support of the Confederacy, and postwar economic and social decline.

The focus returns to Louisiana in the second trio of chapters. Carl Brasseaux, today's premiere Acadian scholar, juxtaposes that ethnic group against the Creoles *de couleur* who emerged among them. There in the bayou country, as elsewhere in Louisiana, free nonwhites grew in number, prosperity, and status—perhaps too much so. In the 1850s according to Brasseaux, they were viewed as a threat by their white neighbors. The resulting racial friction continued after Reconstruction and greatly diminished nonwhite status and opportunity until the advent of the civil rights movement. Nicholas Spitzer contributes an unorthodox view of the Acadian fringe, focusing upon the Mardi Gras celebration at Black Cyprien's Cove, a nonwhite community dating from the 1830s. Barry Ancelet ventures into an increasingly popular cultural arena in modern society, explaining the *zydeco-zarico* musical tradition as a melange of French, African, and Indian Ocean influences. Amid this set of readings, Albert Valdman's linguistic essay strikes an incongruent note; though informative and useful, its content and style are much too technical for the work his colleagues have composed.

The editor's concluding essay almost becomes definitive. Early manumission, ethnic mixture, group identity, self-awareness, and an exceptional work ethic became integral components of the group character of Creoles of color—a heritage that held them together during their nadir in the Jim Crow era and continued to

bind them, separate and apart from blacks, through modern America's emphasis on "black brotherhood." Unfortunately, the perspectives Dormon attempts to leave his readers with are greatly outdone by the cover design that celebrates the bizarre nature of the Gulfs Carnival Season. This ethnic group deserves a better visual image than ghoulishness.

Creoles of Color of the Gulf South has multifaceted value. This cultural class tells us more of race relations than do slaves—being neither slave nor white, and spanning the economic spectrum as they did. Dormon's collection illustrates *real*, rather than *political*, multiculturalism.

University of Alabama

GARY B. MILLS

John Stuart and the Struggle for Empire on the Southern Frontier. By J. Russell Snapp. (Baton Rouge: Louisiana State University Press, 1996. xiv, 238 pp. Acknowledgments, abbreviations used in notes, introduction, illustrations, map, bibliography, index. \$42.50 hardcover.)

J. Russell Snapp argues that John Stuart's Indian policies confirmed the conspiratorial fears of southern colonists and helped lead them to revolution. As British superintendent of Indian affairs for the southern district of North America from 1762 until 1779, Stuart advocated absolute imperial control. To the colonists, this seemed to be part of the British Crown's larger scheme to replace individualism and personal freedom with a centralized and hostile authority. Even more importantly, he threatened to place the concerns of disfranchised Indians above those of the colonists. Thus, Snapp avers that Stuart's heavy-handed policy alienated potential loyalist allies and converted them into revolutionaries.

Stuart's policies addressed what he saw as rampant disorder. The stability in Indian trade and diplomacy of the 1740s and 1750s no longer existed when Stuart took office. Land speculation and development increasingly replaced the earlier trade-based economy, disrupting the old order. Stuart understood these changes in straightforward terms. Renegade white colonists, he believed, created unrest with the Indian nations through deceitful trading practices and land incursions. Rather than towing the imperial line like the Augusta traders of the earlier period, these new participants on the frontier pursued what Stuart feared most—private interest. This

led Stuart to promote a strict system of licenses, centralize control of the deerskin trade participation, and define rigid geographic borders between the Indian nations and the colonies. Although Stuart pursued these strategies throughout his career, he did not get an opportunity to implement them until the Revolutionary War.

Snapp successfully redirects our conception of Revolutionary frontier politics away from the paradigm applied by John Richard Alden. Rather than seeing a contest between European nations for imperial control, Snapp emphasizes the importance of division "among the Crown's subjects." British insiders and outsiders, native-born and English-born colonists, held different conceptions of society and order. Stuart and other outsiders saw class as the fundamental divide in colonial society, had a "nonracial view of Indians," and saw Indians as potential subjects to the Crown. Provincial insiders, however, saw race as the central trait and believed Indians hindered their private ambitions. Stuart's insensitivity to the concerns and assumptions of southern colonists exacerbated tensions over how to govern the Indian trade and over imperial rule in general.

Unfortunately, Snapp does not address similar divisions among the Indians. Occasionally he conflates the concerns of Cherokees, Chickasaws and Creeks. More importantly, he treats each southeastern Indian nation as a cohesive entity and then ignores the diversity of opinions within it. For example, Snapp recognizes the dissent between "accommodationist" and "nativist" Indians, but then dismisses the concerns of the nativists. Snapp's contribution would be greater had he recognized the diversity among the Indians.

Finally, Snapp could have given a closer treatment of how Stuart's policies affected the colonists as southerners. Snapp's attempts in this domain falter. For example, he writes that Stuart's policies exacerbated southerners' fears of an Indian-slave-British alliance. Southerners, he claimed, knew the gravity of the problem because they recognized "that they lived on the periphery of the 'civilized' world and that their economy depended on exploiting people [Indian and slaves] who had strong reasons for resisting such control." This seems far-fetched. Few southerners in the 1770s had such a self-conscious understanding of slavery, a modern view of "civilization," or a guilty conscience due to slave ownership of Indian exploitation.

Nevertheless, Snapp provides a vivid recasting of Stuart's role in shaping Indian policy in Revolutionary America. His interpretation takes into account the entire range of actors on the southern frontier and connects Indian policy with the Revolution in an inno-

vative and convincing manner. Such interpretive breadth should be commended.

University of Florida

ANDREW FRANK

The Strength of a People: The Idea of an Informed Citizenry in America, 1650-1870. By Richard D. Brown. (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 1996. xvii, 252 pp. Acknowledgments, introduction, illustrations, notes, index. \$29.95 cloth.)

The belief “that citizens should be informed in order to be able to exercise their civic responsibilities wisely” (xiii) has provided the bedrock of the nation’s political culture. In *The Strength of a People*, Richard D. Brown examines that idea from its inception in Tudor and Stuart England to its evolution in America from the colonial era through the Civil War. This rich and enormously complex book is timely, demonstrating that the current national fear that citizens lack the knowledge necessary to sustain the polity and compete successfully in a global economy has a history, marked by conflict, that is at least as old as the republic. Brown shows that, historically, just who should be included within the informed citizenry, the relationship between knowledge, citizenship, and political participation, what kinds of information citizens ought to have, and who should disseminate it have been at the heart of this conflict.

An intellectual history in the broadest sense, Brown’s book focuses primarily on how the idea of an informed citizenry gained legitimacy in Revolutionary America and on the difficulty Americans had in implementing that idea in the nineteenth century. The Revolution convinced American leaders that all citizens must be informed to resist the encroachment of tyranny. Following independence, however, Americans could not agree on how they should become informed. Because of popular resistance to a uniform, centralized system of public education, the most significant developments in the dissemination of knowledge occurred in the private sector, as a plethora of commercial enterprises and voluntary organizations competed in the marketplace of ideas. In the process, the republican concept that a virtuous citizenry must be informed to resist tyranny gave way to the individualistic idea that education was the means to personal fulfillment and upward social mobility. Simultaneously, white men claimed their right to vote as part of the prerogative of citizenship, leaving the status of Native

Americans, African Americans, and women problematic. If Native Americans were never considered to be citizens by the majority of Americans, and if African American males won citizenship and the vote with the Fourteenth and Fifteenth Amendments, women's status remained anomalous: they were citizens but could not actively participate in politics. Brown concludes that when the Supreme Court denied them the vote in 1875, it severed the historic "connection between being informed and being empowered" (195).

Brown's study is extremely valuable, bringing the fields of political, intellectual, and cultural history to bear on the idea of an informed citizenry, a concept previously lacking such a sustained synthesis. Brown is largely concerned with the collapse of the colonial social hierarchy and with the role that the early-nineteenth-century communications revolution played in the subsequent democratization of American politics and culture. His sources reflect this interest and are drawn mainly from the upper and middle classes. Despite his concern with the conflicts engendered by the acceptance of the idea of an informed citizenry, his relegation of labor, Native Americans, African Americans, and women primarily to the last chapter removes them as active participants in the national dialogue. One is left wondering how their resistance to the hegemony of middle- and upper-class white men through the appropriation of the idea of an informed citizenry shaped the various constructs of that idea put forth by politicians, reformers, businessmen, religious organizations, and educators. Despite this limitation, the book provides an important account of the idea of an informed citizenry for those interested in American intellectual, political, and cultural history and develops the historical context by which concerned citizens can evaluate the contemporary belief that we face a crisis in our democracy.

University of Colorado at Colorado Springs

HARLOW SHEIDLEY

Slavery, Capitalism, and Politics in the Antebellum Republic, Volume 1: Commerce and Compromise, 1820-1850. By John Ashworth. (Cambridge and New York: Cambridge University Press, 1995. xii, 520 pp. Preface, acknowledgments, introduction, appendix, index. \$64.95 hardcover.)

Because historians often write history the way they engage audiences, John Ashworth's latest work, though written within the

broad Marxist tradition, appeals to a large audience since it is history on a grand scale. At a time when scholars are narrowing their focus, Ashworth reminds us that looking at the larger picture is still perhaps the most useful way of understanding the complexities of forging connections between people and places. He examines the fundamental relationship between the antebellum marketplace, society, and the political culture by looking at the connection between ideology and class development to help explain why the incompatibility between slavery and capitalism in the antebellum period ultimately brought about the Civil War.

Similar to William Barney's *The Passage of the Republic*, Ashworth argues that the changing marketplace of the Jacksonian period shattered Americans' ability to effectively neutralize the slavery issue as a political and economic consequence to the emerging capitalist order. In the early nineteenth century the American republic passed from an attitude that democracy was incompatible with wage labor, to one that embraced the idea that a prosperous, free society and government depend on wage labor for their existence. Traditionally, southerners defined freedom and independence in terms that reflected their agrarian environment, whereas northerners came to define freedom in terms of the marketplace and the wage. It is not surprising then to find that they viewed slavery as something fundamentally different. Although the expectations of the employer and slaveowner were not dissimilar in profit making, the motivation on the part of the slave and the wage earner for fulfilling those expectations was quite different, since freedom for slaves could not be achieved by laboring. Consequently, northern capitalism and southern slavery could not be reconciled in the democratic capitalist environments in which they were cast. This forced political party leaders of both forms of capitalist democracy to fashion their opinions in arguments that either defended or attacked slavery while maintaining ideological continuity. Ashworth argues that Democrats generally supported the institution whether they understood it or not; Whigs, in contrast, were more closely identified with a developing early American capitalism. Thus, the alliance between worker and employer in a wage society was one that was continually adjusting to market changes, whereas the relationship between slave and master remained one that embodied a continual resistance from slaves, creating contradictions to the proslavery advocates.

The heart of Ashworth's thesis is rooted in the collapse of the second party system as a consequence of the political culture's in-

ability to successfully place slavery in the context of an emerging capitalist order. At a time when America was facing severe changes in the marketplace, and trying to reconcile class conflict within that context, Democrats and Whigs were facing serious divisions over how they could position their parties to deal with slavery. In developing these positions, Ashworth argues, abolitionism and slave resistance played key roles. As he points out, resistance to slavery was a main cause of the Civil War, since abolitionists would have never been abolitionists were they not convinced that slaves desired freedom. But oddly enough, slaves never demonstrated serious revolutionary strikes against masters that directly threatened the ruling class of the South. And even when they did employ some sort of resistance, masters remained unaware.

There are many appealing aspects of this volume. It is wonderfully conceived, well written, and employs a sophisticated analysis derived from a wealth of research displayed, refreshingly, at the end of the page as opposed to the end of the volume. *Commerce and Compromise, 1820-1850*, is the first in a two-volume series focusing on antebellum class conflict and the marketplace, and provides confirmation for those who think the crisis of the Civil War had ideological roots in the Jeffersonian period. In the sequel to this volume, he forecasts an argument that suggests the Republican party that emerged in the 1850s needed to combat and revise older views of wage labor, which would have been utterly inappropriate and dangerous in an economy where free labor was increasingly taking this form and in a regime which enfranchised the wage worker. With such a projection, one can expect that perhaps the second volume may prove more engaging than the first. Whatever the case, scholars of the middle period will read them with profit.

Florida Atlantic University

STEPHEN D. ENGLE

The Papers of Andrew Jackson, Volume IV, 1816-1820 and Volume V, 1821-1824. Edited by Harold D. Moser, David R. Hoth, George H. Hoemann. (Knoxville: University of Tennessee Press, 1994 and 1996. Introduction, editorial policies, chronology, appendices, calendar, index. \$49.50 each, cloth.)

Volumes IV and V of the projected sixteen volumes of *The Papers of Andrew Jackson* are of primary interest to students of Florida history because they encompass Jackson's takeover of Florida in

1818 and his governorship of Florida in 1821. These volumes supersede John Spencer Bassett, ed., *Correspondence of Andrew Jackson*, Seven Volumes (1926-1935), because they are based upon a multitude of sources, not just correspondence, and benefit from enlightened editorial policies.

Volume IV covers the period of James Monroe's first term as president. Though on the sidelines, Jackson remained controversial: as hero of New Orleans in 1815, Jackson overstepped his authority and argued with John Adair over the conduct of Kentucky troops in New Orleans. These sometimes rancorous issues cast long shadows into the 1820s. Jackson was busy in 1816 and afterwards making treaties with different Indian tribes to get them to move west. Amidst these torturous negotiations, Jackson revealed attitudes, policies, and practices that would eventually lead into the Second Seminole War. As Commander of the Southern Division, he was concerned with building forts to protect western and Gulf Coast frontier areas.

The documents in the two volumes under review reveal Jackson's penchant for seizing upon discretionary orders and exercising his authority in grandiose fashion. He sometimes experienced difficulty in recognizing civilian control over the military. A strict disciplinarian over his slaves and the troops under his command, he rejected Secretary of War William Harris Crawford's authority to assign an officer under Jackson's command to other duty unless the secretary of war went through Jackson. General Winfield Scott called Jackson's 1817 "Division Order" an act of mutiny. (Animosity over this was played out when Jackson, as president, fired Scott from command of troops in Florida during the Second Seminole War.) President Monroe reminded Jackson of his proper subordinate role by firmly but graciously declaring that an order of the secretary of war was an order from the president. Enmity between Jackson and Crawford continued into both of their candidacies for president in 1824.

With the above as prelude, Jackson caused another controversy and possible cabinet condemnation and congressional investigation with his invasion of Florida in 1818. After taking over St. Marks and Pensacola, he wanted to keep troops in Pensacola and mount a new campaign to take over Tampa Bay and penetrate up the St. Johns River. Jackson offered to take Cuba within six months if Spain did not cede Florida. In the meantime, his correspondence reveals rich details about his active use of friends and the western press to protect himself against congressional investigations of his 1818 campaign.

Volume V, 1821-1824, is at least of equal significance to Florida historians as Volume IV because it includes Jackson's governorship of Florida and his first attempts to gain the presidency. In 1821, Jackson was at home, desiring retirement but always accepting the call of public service. Congressional demands for military reduction might have forced his retirement. However, President Monroe offered him the governorship of the newly acquired Florida as a tribute and to ease his retirement. Jackson accepted and exercised his governorship in such a high-handed manner as to invite yet another congressional investigation. Not the least of his controversial actions was the incarceration of Jose Maria Callava, Spanish Governor of West Florida, following a dispute over records. As military governor, he posted moralistic blue-law decrees, some of which were rescinded by Congress.

Jackson offered his resignation and left Florida in less than three months. Before he left, some of his friends were busy organizing his campaign for the presidency. Much of the correspondence of the next three years concerns Jackson's run for the presidency. Always the reluctant candidate, he proposed to serve only in response to the will of the people. He did, however, mend many fences with political enemies and engaged in pamphleteering and other forms of campaigning. He succeeded in winning the popular vote in 1824 but the electoral votes forced the choice of president into the House of Representatives. Volume V closes with Andrew and Rachel in Washington, D.C., in December 1824, speculating on their future.

Interspersed among letters of significance for Florida and national history are personal letters between family and friends. Some letters reveal Jackson's extensive involvement in land sales, although no clear picture of his land speculations or holdings emerges from the volumes. Jackson did, however, have advance knowledge of lands opening up for sale and apprised friends about such opportunities. A number of friends in the early correspondence came to prominence later as Jackson cronies in Florida territorial politics. The papers in the two volumes do not change the conventional picture of Florida as presented by such eminent scholars as John K. Mahon, Herbert J. Doherty and Sidney Walter Martin. However, the volumes do provide myriad details and depth for scholars wishing to pursue the personalities and issues of the period.

Publication of these papers is not going to quiet any controversies that surround Jackson's career. The reader is still left with an

impression of his deep morality as well as with Jackson's accusations of immorality against political opponents and his over-zealous execution of orders which themselves were sometimes ambiguous. His exceptional qualities were marred by petty shortsightedness, and he expressed benevolent, fatherly concern for Indians as he helped grab off millions of acres of their land. An awkward and extremely poor writer, he nevertheless had the ability to write and speak with passion and persuasion. His depth of friendship was matched with an equal depth of enmity.

The two volumes under review continue to show the impeccable editorship of the first three volumes. Particularly praiseworthy are the notes on sources and the calendar of papers not included. Also, editorial summaries guide the reader through groups of materials to make the seemingly disparate letters more coherent. Two editorial policies seem to this reviewer worthy of special note. One was the decision to stay true to the text of Jackson's letters, faithfully reproducing the terrible spelling— a source of embarrassment to him— of this not very literate man. His wife, Rachel, was as bad a speller, if not worse. The second editorial policy was to include all of Rachel Jackson's correspondence. Some letters are directly relevant to her husband's activities and her description of Pensacola in 1821 is noteworthy, although much of her correspondence has less than historical significance. The decision to include her letters was not based upon her role as a president's wife, since she died before he was inaugurated. Instead, inclusion of her correspondence must have been based upon enlightened editorial policy, which augurs well for the future. This reviewer hopes that after we have had a female president, her papers might include a few words from her spouse!

Largo, Florida

ERNEST F. DIBBLE

Two Months in the Confederate States: An Englishman's Travels Through the South. By W. C. Corsan. Edited by Benjamin H. Trask. (Baton Rouge: Louisiana State University Press, 1996. xx, 155pp. Acknowledgments, editor's introduction, illustrations, bibliography, index. \$26.95 hardcover.)

Few literary genres contribute to our understanding of cultural and individual interactions more abundantly than travel writing, a form which combines the characteristics of journalism, autobiography, fiction, history, and political analysis into a smorgasbord of in-

terpretation and experience. Travel literature and tourism inevitably form a symbiotic relationship, each promoting the other, and in the mid-nineteenth century more specifically, the increasing accessibility of cross-Atlantic travel made possible by technological advancements and economic growth encouraged more tourists to avail themselves of the rewards and stresses of international travel. More writers, in turn, put their reactions to such experiences down on paper, and readers responded by clamoring in unprecedented numbers to take their own virtual tours. The abundance of travel writings that accompanied this tourism explosion offers a fertile field of study and pleasure for a wide variety of disciplines and interests. Unfortunately, it is a field which remains largely fallow for most modern readers.

Benjamin H. Trask, with his astutely edited edition of W. C. Corsan's *Two Months in the Confederate States: An Englishman's Travels Through the South*, takes a significant step in correcting this oversight. By making this important, virtually forgotten, text readily available to modern readers and also by complementing it with exhaustive, eclectic annotations, Trask has performed an essential service, and this volume is a welcome addition to the primary materials we may use to deepen our understanding, in this case, of the American South during the Civil War.

Travel writers must be a little bit of everything for their readers—objective reporter, subjective interpreter, tireless historian, and trusted companion. Corsan's text indicates that he was not only a perceptive man but also that he was a capable and effective travel writer, his narrative demonstrating his firm awareness of the genre's conventions. It is important to note that, although travel writing in theory portends to be wholly factual, in practice it is often highly judgmental and even capricious. This tendency, however, does not make such narratives any less compelling or instructive. Corsan's southern adventure is no different in this context, and his observations, therefore, reflect both his personal responses to the South as well as many popular assumptions and perceptions held by his contemporaries.

Examination of any portion of Corsan's narrative reveals his obeisance of travel-writing conventions, exemplifying his ability to work within a well-established tradition and to meet his audience's expectations. First and foremost, travel readers wanted to be informed. English readers, specifically, were fascinated by the American Civil War and were especially curious to learn about the

geographically complementary and reunion seemed possible. Indeed, due to Malins' commitment to internationalism, he appeared more willing to compromise for the sake of unity. He thus justified temporary segregation on the grounds that both races wanted it. Ironically, Malins had ridiculed the same argument when "Hickmanites" had used it for racist reasons during the great schism. As it happened, in 1887 the two sides reconciled by agreeing to provide blacks access to segregated subordinate lodges. The terms of reunion, Fahey concludes, combined a diluted antiracist principle with a diluted racist practice. Understandably, within a few years black Templars had virtually disappeared. Several decades later the white Grand Lodges in North America followed suit.

Drawn from previously untapped sources that lie in British and American archives, Fahey's book illuminates a fresh aspect of African American history—the study of the black Templars. By rescuing them from the neglect of historians, Fahey has revealed much about racial attitudes in the Anglo-American world of the late nineteenth century. Thoughtfully organized and clearly written, this detailed account of the Templars should appeal to anyone interested in temperance reform, race relations, or southern history.

Daytona Beach Community College

JOHN J. GUTHRIE JR.

Gender & Jim Crow: Women and the Politics of White Supremacy in North Carolina, 1896-1920. By Glenda Elizabeth Gilmore. (Chapel Hill: The University of North Carolina Press, 1996. xxii, 385 pp. Acknowledgments, introduction, illustrations, notes, bibliography, index. \$17.95 paperback, \$49.95 hardcover.)

Glenda E. Gilmore states at the beginning of her fine book, *Gender & Jim Crow*, that "since historians enter a story at its end, they sometimes forget that what is past to them was future to their subjects" (1). Nowhere is this more true than in writing about race in America. Historians most often take current racial categories and identities back into the past, reifying conceptions of racial differences that are in fact the products of the very historical processes they are trying to understand. Gilmore does not just avoid this paradoxically ahistorical history. Returning both characters and categories to history, she narrates a political story that not only has been forgotten but that has been and continues to be very deliberately erased. The vision of the future that animated and or-

dered the ways of her small town and small city African American middle-class men and women in North Carolina at the turn of the century was not only threatening then. It is also threatening now.

In late-nineteenth-century North Carolina, Gilmore's subjects— especially Sarah Dudley Pettey, the “star” of her story— envisioned and lived toward a very different world. They believed that class, defined by them in the fluid and achievable terms of education and Christian virtue, and not race would order southern and American society in the not-too-distant future, and that their “rising”— their civic, political, and professional achievements— would hasten this transformation. Their “New South” would not be colorblind, a condition they considered not only unattainable but also ignorant of the particularities and achievements of African Americans. Class rather than racial distinctions would signify power. Yet African Americans of the “better classes” worked not just for self-interest. They would lead other southern blacks in their “rising” too, a leadership these “best men” and “best women” earned through their cultivation of the necessary skills in “self-presentation” and the interpretation of white meanings. They would serve as “ambassadors” to powerful whites, representing the southern African American community as a whole in the task of making a New South that included all southerners.

To this end, African American men and women, in those heady North Carolina days before the 1898 elections, the Wilmington race riot, and the disenfranchisement campaign of 1900, threw themselves wholeheartedly into electoral politics. From the 1870s to the 1890s black men won election to a variety of local offices, the statehouse and senate, and even to the United States Congress, when Sarah Dudley Pettey's neighbor George White became the U.S. Representative from eastern North Carolina's Second Congressional District. Middle-class African American women, often, through their attendance at co-educational college-preparatory schools, better educated than their southern white female peers, charged into public life as well. Active and full of a sense of their mission for “the race,” they formed church-based groups, women's clubs, and chapters of the Woman's Christian Temperance Union. Alongside their men, they promoted “uplift,” the learned middle-class identity that they believed would save both their race and their region.

Gilmore is well aware of the peculiarities of late-nineteenth-century North Carolina politics, where the joining of Republican

and Populist Party votes gave African Americans real political power well after Reconstruction and through the end of the nineteenth century. *Gender & Jim Crow* sings when Gilmore surveys the mobilization of gender identities in the Democrats' 1898 campaign to defeat North Carolina's uniquely interracial and successful fusion politics. A new, racialized definition of manhood, Gilmore persuasively argues, set the stage for the gendered rhetoric Democrats would employ in a new kind of political campaign. Shifting from a masculine ideal rooted in middle-class identity, the "Best Man," to a racially rooted ideal, the "New White Man," a new generation of white men uncoupled manhood from class and made it racially exclusive. In the Democratic Party's "home protection" campaign, these new white men, together with white middle-class women, rhetorically extended the ideal of a pure and elevated womanhood, protected from "the black beast rapist," to white women of all classes. These shifting conceptions of gender relations, in turn, erased the black middle-class of Pettey and her peers, grounding the substitution of race for class that founded the New South's expansive, evolving culture of segregation.

We must situate Gilmore's celebration of the black middle class and especially middle-class women, then, within both the regional and the larger American cultures' deep and continuous erasure of their story. Southern history has for far too long privileged both a perspective and a narrative centered on white men, and writing history from the standpoint of black middle-class women provides a much needed corrective. Yet at times, Gilmore's celebratory tone disturbed me. All perspectives are certainly not equal, neither in terms of insight nor ethics. But while Gilmore deftly situates her black middle-class women within an expanding white southern dialectic of black versus white within which their very attempt to make themselves known represented an important resistance, she also needs to address more directly the ways in which their promotion of their own class position solidified their power overworking-class African Americans.

To write the story of these middle-class men and especially these women between 1896 and 1920, Gilmore had to confront the depth and effectiveness of their erasure in both professional and popular histories, in the archives, and even in family stories. Corine Pettey, the granddaughter of one of Gilmore's southern black middle-class subjects, was astounded at the history Gilmore had reconstructed. Raised in poverty, Corine Pettey and her siblings had

laughed as their father and aunt told of childhoods in the South spent riding in "horsedrawn carriages." Pettey was shocked to find out that this astounding story, this "cosmopolitanism," the trace of an elusive southern black middle class made invisible by white violence, disenfranchisement, and the elaboration of segregation, was not just a wish, a family whimsy, but the truth. And Gilmore is certainly right, in both the past and the present, in asserting that the most important story about white supremacy is the everlasting nature of African American resistance.

University of Virginia

GRACE ELIZABETH HALE

Feeble-Minded in Our Midst: Institutions for the Mentally Retarded in the South, 1900-1940. By Steven Noll. (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 1995. xiii, 254 pp. Acknowledgments, introduction, photographs, notes, bibliography, index. \$16.95 paper, \$39.95 hardcover.)

The national movement to build specialized state institutions for the mentally retarded came relatively late to the South and developed a distinctive regional character which has been too little recognized by historians. According to Steven Noll, southern reformers' "almost blind reliance on the example set by the rest of the country" (157) has obscured the very different institutional practices which emerged in states which were less urban, less ethnic, and less industrial than their Northern counterparts. Further, longstanding hostility to state-initiated solutions for social problems kept institutions for the feeble-minded (as they were popularly called) small. In this carefully researched monograph, Noll first sets the southern experience in its national context and then looks at regional issues of sterilization, race, programming, and demographics.

In the early twentieth century, national professional organizations concerned with mental retardation grew in size and influence. By 1920, intelligence testing was widely used to categorize the feeble-minded; most popular was the tripartite scheme of idiots (those with scores of twenty-five or lower), imbeciles (with scores between twenty-five and fifty-five), and morons (with scores between fifty-five and seventy-five). The response to morons was particularly complex. Some argued that they were the most promising of the feeble-minded; others saw them as dangerous and threaten-

ing. Frequently included in this last group were individuals whose major “defects” were of behavior rather than of intelligence, especially young girls with histories of sexual promiscuity. Not surprisingly, institutions for the feeble-minded had trouble meeting the very different needs of “deviant morons” and “incompetent idiots” (63).

A popular policy developed to help control (as well as protect) the feeble-minded was eugenics sterilization. After the U.S. Supreme Court sanctioned Virginia’s sterilization legislation in *Buck v. Bell* (1927), a number of southern states passed similar laws. Perhaps most sweeping was North Carolina’s 1929 statute which allowed for the sterilization of even noninstitutionalized individuals on the recommendation of county welfare boards. In North Carolina as elsewhere, almost all of those sterilized were women. Three southern states, including Florida, never passed sterilization laws, in part because of their ambivalence about progressive reform and their distrust of state power.

One of the most fascinating chapters describes policies toward feeble-minded African Americans. While there was a widely articulated fear of such individuals, especially the high-functioning, only two of the ten southern states that opened public institutions for the feeble-minded between 1914 and 1923 provided for them. In Florida, for example, when the Florida Farm Colony for Epileptics and Feeble-minded opened in 1921, it planned to add a separate building for African Americans but was never given the money to do so. Periodically, Florida courts committed African Americans to the institution but they were always turned away. The court-ordered were most often the severely disabled. While a burden to their families, they were not considered a threat to the larger society and the state was unwilling to pay for their care.

By the 1940s, limited by both ideology and funding, southern institutions for the feeble-minded had abandoned rehabilitative goals for custodial care (of whites, especially females). Even specialized farm colonies, set up to save money and teach high-level patients useful skills, had largely failed. For example, at the Florida Farm Colony, only 5% of its residents worked on the farm, despite the superintendent’s efforts to restrict the admission of low-functioning idiots. Overall, Noll offers a valuable history and critique of these institutions. He argues that, obsessed with maintaining a racially bifurcated society, southern leaders were unable to see or respond to the distinctive ways in which race, class, and gender

shaped feeble-mindedness in their region. I wish this book had been longer because Noll clearly has consulted an enormous volume of materials, only a small part of which could be used. Despite its page limitations (increasingly common in these days of fiscal austerity at presses), the book makes an important and much-needed contribution to the history of mental retardation.

Indiana University

ELLEN DWYER

All Over the Map: Rethinking American Regions. By Edward L. Ayers, Patricia Nelson Limerick, Stephen Nissenbaum, and Peter S. Onuf. (Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins University Press, 1996. vii, 136 pp. Preface, introduction, notes, contributors, index. \$13.95 paper, \$35.00 hardcover.)

This collection of essays seeks to answer the question: what makes a region a specific place where people living there see themselves as different from those in other regions? Supposedly the answer lies in geography, but even cursory analysis reveals that definitions of regions have changed over time. In the antebellum era, both North and South poured their differing versions of the American dream into the constantly moving "West." In the process, they more clearly defined their regional distinctiveness.

The authors move beyond such common insights. "What we lack," Edward L. Ayers and Peter S. Onuf tell readers in their introduction, "is a sense of how regional identity shaped, and has been shaped by, national identity—of how we have spatialized time and historicized space" (2). This is what the essayists strive to provide.

While sectionalism is closely related to regionalism, Onuf argues that, rather than springing simply from geographical differences, sectionalism was "integral to the original conception of construction of the federal system" (12). The framers of the Constitution invoked its evils to persuade Americans to adopt a more centralized government. Ironically, these arguments sowed the seeds for future divisions.

Peter Nissenbaum's essay asks if we actually know New England. By the nineteenth century its leaders had successfully fused their region's identity with the nation's identity. Even today its literature is viewed as American literature, while that of southerners or westerners is seen as regional literature. Citing the work of geographer Marilyn Bowden, Nissenbaum suggests that on the eve of the

Revolution, dispersed farms rather than tightly knit towns focused around communally oriented churches and tidy village greens were more characteristic of New England. By mid-nineteenth century, it had emerged as “the most Catholic, the most heavily immigrant in population, and the most rapidly changing area in the United States” (40). In that context, Nissenbaum suggests, “idealization of the New England village began in part as a cultural strategy by which members of the old local elite could maintain their social authority within a republican polity” (47).

Ayer’s essay on the South examines the impact of perspective on views of this region. The South has always had, he notes, “a different moral geography for black and whites. . . .” (64). Summarizing common views, Ayers sees the South as “the American Place where modern life has not fully arrived, for good and for ill” (65). More intriguing, while Americans perceive certain traits as southern, the meaning of these traits “are given varying moral meanings, depending on the use to which they are put” (72). Thus plain folk, formerly perceived as lazy, are seen as “actually exercising their independence against white employers” (72) and so forth. Chiding historians for “provinciality,” he challenges them to reinterpret the South as part of the western hemisphere. In that context, it becomes a materialistic, urbanized region, technologically advanced and dedicated to “white democracy and equality” (73).

As always Patricia Limerick combines her trademark skills— incisive analysis with personal, often humorous experience that speaks to large issues. She argues that in the “unholy triumvirate” of race, class, and gender now complicating the writing of history, regions provide more manageable areas for exploring these issues. More important, since no region has suffered such a distorted and mythologized history as the West, Americans must examine it unflinchingly if we are to move beyond “some of the worst distortions afflicting American history in general” (87).

This provocative and insightful collection reflects the newest scholarship. It should appeal to any serious student of Florida history, a state that has always defied easy regional categorization. A common truism states that the farther south one travels, the more “northern” the state becomes. The essayists are correct; geography alone can neither define nor explain regions.

University of Central Florida

SHIRLEY A. LECKIE

Pistols and Politics: The Dilemma of Democracy in Louisiana's Florida Parishes, 1810-1899. By Samuel C. Hyde Jr. (Baton Rouge: Louisiana State University Press, 1996. xv, 262 pp. Preface, introduction, figures, maps, photographs, notes, bibliography, index. \$34.95.)

Samuel C. Hyde passes a bleak judgment on the white residents of eastern Louisiana. He concludes that "when left to their own devices, the piney-woods dwellers proved incapable of effectively governing themselves." Although "planter dominance had been good for the region, promoting stability and prosperity," it also contributed "to decades of bloodshed" (261). This provocative argument forms the core of Hyde's well-crafted monograph. *Pistols and Politics* provides not only an important contribution to the scholarship of rural life in nineteenth-century America, but also a much-needed study of a region that few historians have investigated.

Unlike the rest of Louisiana, where the French, Spanish, and German heritage proved so critical, settlers in the Florida parishes northeast of New Orleans were overwhelmingly Protestant and Anglo-American. When the United States seized Spanish West Florida (from which the region took its name) in 1810, migrants from other southern states had already established burgeoning plantations and small freeholds. Hyde chronicles the process by which area planters consolidated political and economic power throughout the antebellum era. The commonfolk accepted planter hegemony because it brought stability and prosperity without impinging on their own vision of Jeffersonian independence.

Hyde argues that the Civil War initiated the collapse of this system. Emancipation stripped planters of their economic power while democratic impulses ended their control over area settlers. Secession, warfare, and local resistance to Union occupation undermined public faith in civil government at the same time that it seemed to validate brutality. In the years that followed, residents applied those lessons with a vengeance. White-on-black violence mirrored developments in other states as residents forced freedmen into submission. White-on-white violence, however, was unusually pervasive. Throughout the 1890s the Florida parishes were rocked by a series of bloody feuds as residents attempted to settle old scores and control local offices.

In trying to explain the chaos of the 1890s Hyde constructs an intriguing analysis of the forces that contained or exacerbated violence throughout the nineteenth century. Deploying a broad array

of newspapers, public documents, and private correspondence, he makes a compelling argument that contemporary notions of independence and honor shaped planter-commonfolk relations. He provides a similarly cogent portrait of the process by which order collapsed toward the end of the century and whites began to kill one another at an appalling rate.

Yet Hyde's argument suffers from his emphasis on ideological principles at the cost of other critical factors. He argues that a democratic culture stimulated disorder without investigating the systems of local governance that were supposed to control aberrant behavior. *Pistols and Politics* provides an incisive analysis of legislative action and local activity, but where are the judges, justices of the peace, and parish police juries? For a study of law and order, there is actually relatively little on the law itself. This is no small matter in Louisiana, where the Civil Code has stimulated illuminating studies in legal history. Only in the last chapter does Hyde provide any substantive discussion of the courts that were supposed to provide the institutional backbone of an orderly society.

These issues underscore more general problems with Hyde's periodization. This book does not really begin to move until the 1850s. Hyde pays only brief attention to the vital decades during which the Florida parishes failed to develop a system of managed conflict that might have enabled residents to settle their grievances peacefully. Such an investigation is critical to account for why democracy, independence, and class relations became so important in determining the trajectory of local order.

Despite these flaws, Hyde has produced an incisive and intriguing book reflecting first-rate scholarship: The unanswered questions indicate how much work remains to be done on Louisiana, especially the rural country outside New Orleans. He has gone a long way toward integrating Eastern Louisiana into the mainstream of nineteenth-century history. Equally important, Hyde has written complex social history in a lively, accessible style that should prove equally engaging to both scholars and undergraduates. That is no small accomplishment, and Hyde deserves credit for his literary as well as his historical achievement.

University of Virginia

PETER J. KASTOR

Dust Bowl Migrants in the American Imagination. By Charles J. Shindo. (Lawrence: University Press of Kansas, 1996. xv, 252 pp. Acknowledgments, list of illustrations, photographs, appendix, notes, bibliography, index. \$25.00 cloth.)

"I'll be everywhere," a determined Henry Fonda in the role of Tom Joad tells a teary-eyed Jane Darwell, playing the heroic Ma Joad. "Wherever there's a fight so hungry people can eat, I'll be there." Ripe with emotion, this late scene in Hollywood's *The Grapes of Wrath* brings to a climax the saga of the Joad family when Tom emerges as a symbol of the downtrodden yet politicized dust bowl migrant. But this popular image that continues to move Americans even today, Charles Shindo contends, is a mythic blending of the migrants' real-life misfortunes with John Steinbeck's literary imagination and John Ford's screen adaptation. The real migrant and his/her true aspirations lie buried beneath such popular and official portrayals by artists, folklorists, and New Deal reformers. All the latter were driven to advance a personal vision of American democracy, and in their zeal, they appropriated the voices of the migrants and reduced them to passive victims of corporate farming, government paternalism, and nature.

Shindo sustains this theme throughout his book's six neatly organized chapters and a lengthy photo essay. The chapters explore separately the enterprises of government administrators, folklorists, and four artists: Dorothea Lange, John Steinbeck, John Ford, and Woody Guthrie. A cultural historian, Shindo is interested in "an understanding of a person, people, society, institution, and/or nation by examining the products of those agents," products including material artifacts, and intellectual and artistic creations (219).

He begins by pointing out that many liberal government administrators regarded the migrants as slow-witted bumpkins requiring educated guidance in democratic citizenship and economic self-sufficiency. Reformers wanted to turn these lost people into class-conscious workers united in securing their rights. But the migrants—who had journeyed to California from the dust bowl states and beyond—had been business people, landowners, and quasi-independent tenant farmers pursuing the Jeffersonian dream, not laborers apt to side against management. Unlike the New Dealers, they formed a conservative lot that looked to land and business ownership to ground "a desirable morality based on the traditional ideas of independence, family, and God" (4). From the migrants came votes that later helped elect Ronald Reagan governor of California.

Shindo also describes inconsistencies between migrants and those who arose as the custodians of their popular image. To push their own political agendas, artists turned the migrant into an object of their work and ultimately of the American imagination. The forlorn face of Dorothea Lange's famous migrant mother provided the documentary photographer with visual support for her advocacy of government relief. The sometimes radical, sometimes moralizing words of Tom Joad echo not the sentiments of the migrants but variously the voices of John Steinbeck in his call for democratic reform and John Ford in his emphasis on character building. While drowning out the political ideals of the migrants themselves, the lyrics of the Okie folk singer Woody Guthrie were those of a Communist sympathizer.

Shindo says his book is about these artists and the reformers and not about the migrants. But in using the migrants as a contrasting reference to the views of the image makers, Shindo has an obligation to prove to us rather than simply tell us— as he mostly does— that the migrants tended toward conservative ideals. As a result, Shindo himself in effect appropriates the voice of the migrants, and edifies them with his words rather than with empirical evidence of their spirit, grit, and ambition. One also wonders why Shindo did not ask whether in creating the reductionist image of the migrants as hapless, helpless victims the artists and reformers contributed to the contempt Okies encountered in larger society. For instance, was H. L. Mencken influenced in part by the popular creation of the migrant when he called Okies biologically inferior specimens of humankind who should be barred from farm ownership and even childbearing?

Quibbling aside, Shindo's book is interesting, his style is engaging, and his subject has importance. The strengths outweigh the weaknesses, and together should generate stimulating classroom discussion.

University of Alabama at Birmingham

JACK E. DAVIS

Women of the Far Right: The Mothers' Movement and World War II. By Glen Jeansonne. (Chicago and London: The University of Chicago Press, 1996. xix, 264 pp. Preface, acknowledgments, illustrations, notes, bibliographical essay, index. \$29.95 hardcover.)

Glen Jeansonne's *Women of the Far Right: The Mothers' Movement and World War II* is an engaging study of the women involved in ul-

tra-right politics during the 1930s and early 1940s. The scope of the book is exceptional. Its thirteen chapters examine the context of the Mothers' Movement, the various characters involved in the movement, such as Elizabeth Dilling, Cathrine Curtis, Lyril Clark Van Hyning and Agnes Waters, and finally, the role geographical location served in determining the intensity and appeal of the Mothers' groups. Intertwined within its structural coverage, *Women of the Far Right* illuminates a group of individuals who failed to fit within society's accepted nationalistic and gender norms. After all, as America was indirectly preparing for war, these women sided with the enemy— Germany and Hitler.

The author's careful categorization of these women as "'extremists,' 'bigots,' and 'reactionaries,'" rather than members of mainstream conservatism is imperative to *Women of the Far Right's* historical contribution (xii). The Mothers' position outside of traditional American ideology allowed them to work comfortably beyond conventional gender mores. Ironically, while these women struggled to preserve their country from perceived un-American threats— Communists, Jews, New Dealers, as well as Franklin and Eleanor Roosevelt— they often held certain beliefs and engaged in actions which were completely removed from the same traditional ideals they sought to uphold.

Perhaps Jeansonne's greatest accomplishment is his subtle argument throughout the text that while Jews, Communists, and New Dealers threatened the Mothers' Movement, Eleanor Roosevelt served as their greatest danger. After all, she was the most powerful woman in the United States and one who certainly took an active role in the causes in which she believed. Moreover, Roosevelt's crusades completely countered what the Mothers believed. Her gender struck at the very heart of their rhetoric. If their claim of saving America was grounded in their roles as mothers, wives or future mothers and wives, the popularity of the First Lady eroded and negated their claims and causes.

While recognizing that his biographical knowledge of these women is limited because of a dearth of personal writings and letters, Jeansonne painstakingly reconstructed their causes and experiences from a variety of outside sources, including letters written to other members of the Far Right, court testimony, and FBI records. In this reconstruction, the reader senses the urgency felt by these women to block the United States' entry into World War II. Because of the extreme nature of their views, these women often

appeared comical, but certainly had to be taken seriously. After all, they were effective mobilizers, a fact particularly evident in their protests against the passage of the Lend-Lease Bill. While they ultimately failed to stop Lend-Lease and other preparedness measures, the results easily could have been otherwise.

Women of the Far Right provides an excellent examination of the geographical divisions plaguing the United States in the twentieth century. Jeansonne's lucid exploration of the different isolationist groups exposes the ever-present sectionalism which continued to plague American politics and culture on the eve of war. According to the author, the success of Philadelphia and New York organizations paled in comparison to their Midwest counterparts, which were intensely bigoted and racist. The author attributes this discrepancy to the large German-American population in the Midwest, the cosmopolitanism of the East Coast, and Easterners' affinity for the Roosevelts and the New Deal.

Jeansonne's successful tracking of these women throughout the late 1930s and early 1940s is an important contribution to American and women's history. While the author initially intended to study women involved in far-right politics from the 1930s to the 1980s, he was unable to because the ideology of the Mothers' Movement revolved around economic, political and social changes taking place in the United States and worldwide during the 1930s and 1940s. In the vacuum of these changes, radical right-wing groups were able to gain sound footing. While some of these women continued to write and vicariously participate in politics after the war, they never regained the momentum obtained during the early years of World War II.

University of Central Florida

PATRICIA FARLESS

BOOK NOTES

New Titles

Florida's History Through Its Places (University Press of Florida, 1997) takes readers on a picturesque, mosquito-free journey highlighting more than eight hundred historically significant buildings and sites around the state. The catalog, compiled by University of Florida Geography professor Morton D. Winsberg, features over 325 illustrations as well as an introductory essay chronicling Florida's development from Paleo-Indian hunting ground to world famous tourist playground. Organized alphabetically by county, the book also contains a convenient appendix divided into functional categories such as government, religious, and residential. Each entry includes a street address or other locating information and, if applicable, comments on architectural style, designer, and construction materials. At the end of each entry Winsberg notes the site or structure's ownership status (public or private) and the year in which it entered into the National Register of Historic Places. The catalog is an excellent reference guide for scholars, students, or simply those wishing to plan a historic excursion through the state. *Florida's History Through Its Places* is available in paperback from the University Press of Florida for \$19.95.

The Tampa Bay History Center proudly announces the publication of Canter Brown Jr's, *African Americans on the Tampa Bay Frontier* (1997). This slim but concise booklet is the third in a reference series published by the Center focusing on frontier life in the Bay area. Brown's work describes African-American life in Tampa as well as its surrounding environs from the 1810s to the early 1880s. The booklet contains sections discussing the black Seminoles, the leasing of slaves, and the post-Civil War efforts of freed persons to establish permanent communities. Brown, historian in residence at the Tampa Bay History Center, trains his historical flashlight on numerous unrecognized figures and in the process illuminates not only their stories but the mind of the reader as well. *African Americans on the Tampa Bay Frontier* is available for purchase at the Tampa Bay History Center for \$4.95 or by phone at (813) 228-0097.

[385]

Cubans and the Mass Media in South Florida (University Press of Florida, 1996) by Gonzalo R. Soruco is a fascinating sociological study which, although ethnic group and region specific, delivers probing insights into the nature of American media consumption. To inform his research, Soruco conducted a small scale survey of Cubans living in south Florida. The results of the survey appear in charts throughout the book which, contrary to most byzantine statistical tables, inform rather than confuse the reader. Soruco's book features chapters analyzing Cubans' mass media preferences, their perceptions of Spanish and English newspapers (including *El Nueva Herald*), and an especially enlightening section discussing the problems with Hispanic research which poses the provocative question, "Who is a Hispanic?" (18). It is a tribute to the author's lucid writing style that makes reading the answers to such complex questions an enjoyable exercise. *Cubans and the Mass Media in South Florida* is available from the University Press of Florida for \$39.95.

Ed Winn's *My Florida Soul: History with Humor* (1996) is a heart-felt ballad to the author's beloved state. Winn, a retired businessman, writes with unabashed enthusiasm about the state's vast wilderness and the pioneers who worked to establish homes and communities within these sylvan environs. The author makes no pretensions to be a historian, preferring to describe himself as a storyteller who writes "with some humor and feeling" (13). Stories about Florida's natural surroundings abound in Winn's book, which, among other eclectic tidbits, includes a description of a razorback pig named John— a sort of porcine St. Patrick for the Florida backwoods— and a recipe for a type of coffee best described as a campfire cappuccino. The book is divided into three sections: a loosely organized history of the state, the author's personal reminiscences, and the century-spanning recollections of five lifelong Florida residents. The book closes with a page of aphorisms chosen by the author. *My Florida Soul: History with Humor* is available in paperback for \$10 plus \$2 s&h from Edward T. Winn, 1621 Sunnyside Drive, Maitland, FL. 32751-6557.

The illustration on the front of *Cahokia: Domination and Ideology in the Mississippian World* (1997) shows a group of Indians carefully erecting a wooden pole as part of a massive half-formed circle described by anthropologists as one of several "Woodhenges" at the Cahokia site. The landscape behind the Indians shows hundreds of multi-family sized houses neatly arranged around monumental

earthen mound structures. Domination indeed. Edited by Timothy R. Pauketat and Thomas E. Emerson, *Cahokia* features a collection of essays which analyze the political and social organization, trade practices, and construction skills of these early Native Americans. Cahokia, which flourished between A.D. 1050 and 1200, was at the center of a sprawling network of Native American settlements which stretched across North America into Mexico. As a result, the ideas and influences of the Cahokia people moved down the Mississippi and had a profound impact on the Indians of the Southeast. Those wishing to further understand the roots of Southeastern Indian society would undoubtedly benefit from this volume. *Cahokia: Domination and Ideology in the Mississippian World* is available in hardcover from the University of Nebraska Press for \$55.00.

The American South is no stranger to bizarre criminal trials. Individuals, circumstances, even court proceedings can seem drawn from the pages of a pulp novel. Often, the fantastic quality of such cases is only superseded by the realization that they are not fiction. Byron Woodfin's *Lay Down With Dogs* (University of Alabama Press, 1997) is a factual account of the 1972 attempted murder of Scottsboro, Alabama attorney Loy Campbell and the subsequent investigation and trial of one of the town's wealthiest citizens, Hugh Otis Bynum. The car bomb explosion which almost took Campbell's life resulted in the loss of both his legs and touched off waves of widespread fear and suspicion in the small Alabama community. The eventual revelation of Campbell's attempted murderer also led to the discovery of a hit list and exposed the twisted character of the man who residents knew "you didn't want to cross . . ." (19). Books such as Woodfin's are always susceptible to such cliched book jacket blurbs as "gripping courtroom drama," but *Lay Down With Dogs* explores more than just the case's gavelled proceedings. Woodfin's book takes readers through Scottsboro's main square, down its streets, and into its restaurants and in the process draws a fascinating sketch of life in a small southern town. *Lay Down With Dogs* is available in hardcover from The University Press of Alabama for \$29.95.

Reprints

The University of Nebraska Press Bison Books Series announces the reprint of William E. Dodd's *Jefferson Davis* (1907; reprint 1997), a concise and well-drawn biography of the enigmatic

Confederate president. Originally published in 1907, Dodd's book was obscured for several decades by an ever-increasing number of mammoth Davis retrospectives. In the book's new introduction, historian Steven E. Woodworth reassesses the importance of Dodd's work to students and scholars alike pronouncing it a "genuine classic." Although brevity is rarely the soul of historical biography, Woodworth concludes that Dodd's "thin book" succeeds almost above all others in giving the reader a "grasp of the character of Jefferson Davis . . ." (xii). *Jefferson Davis* is available in softcover from the University of Nebraska Press for \$16.95.

Also available in the Bison Books series is the reprint of two volumes of Kenneth P. Williams' *Grant Rises in the West*, originally published in the 1950's as a five volume series entitled, *Lincoln Finds A General*. The first volume, subtitled *The First Year 1861-1862* (1952; reprint 1997), features a new Introduction by Mark Grimsley which discusses the author's unabashed admiration for his subject and assesses his unique contribution to the Civil War canon. The work opens with a biographical sketch of Grant's ascension from Illinois store clerk to colonel of the Twenty-first Illinois regiment and then expands to follow the development of Union strategy in the Western theater. Williams offers a detailed account of numerous early battles including: Belmont, Forts Henry and Donelson, and Shiloh. The focus in all these analyses is the Union high command; how men such as Grant, Sherman, Buell, and Wallace led thousands of genuine Henry Flemings into battle. As Grimsley explains, "Williams's subject is command: its challenges, its stresses, and above all its endless demands for decisions, decisions, and more decisions" (ix). The second volume, subtitled *From Iuka to Vicksburg 1862-1863* (1956; reprint 1997), focuses mainly on Grant's campaign for Vicksburg which Lincoln would later exalt as, "one of the most brilliant in the world" (xii). This volume features a new introduction by Brooks S. Simpson which briefly details the formidable difficulties Grant faced on his journey to the laurels following Vicksburg. Both volumes of *Grant Rises in the West* are available in softcover from the University of Nebraska Press for \$25.00 each.

Second Editions

In the second edition of *Remembering James Agee* (University of Georgia Press, 1997), T. S. Matthews, Agee's editor at *Time* magazine, recalls him this way: "Perhaps he was torn apart by all the dif-

ferent things he was or might have been: an intellectual, a poet, a cineaste, a revolutionary, God's fool" (134). James Agee was a literary jack-of-all-trades and, some might say, master of all. *Remembering* is a collection of speeches, group panels, and reminiscences recorded in October 1972 at the Agee Week Conference at St. Andrews School in Tennessee. Edited by David Madden and Jeffrey J. Folks, this eclectic volume features contributions by Agee's friends, critics, and colleagues. Far from being a tortured artist panegyric, the book delivers a straightforward picture of a man who often characterized the world, along with himself, as "lousy." Included in the book is a thought-provoking discussion of *Let Us Now Praise Famous Men*, Agee and Walker Evan's account of two months spent living among Alabama sharecroppers. Honest and quietly insightful, the book is an inspired collage of a Tennessee boy who became one of the century's most mythic figures. *Remembering James Agee*, Second Edition, is available in hardcover from the University of Georgia Press for \$29.95.