

2009

Book Reviews

Florida Historical Society
membership@myfloridahistory.org

 Part of the [American Studies Commons](#), and the [United States History Commons](#)

Find similar works at: <https://stars.library.ucf.edu/fhq>

University of Central Florida Libraries <http://library.ucf.edu>

This Book Review is brought to you for free and open access by STARS. It has been accepted for inclusion in Florida Historical Quarterly by an authorized editor of STARS. For more information, please contact STARS@ucf.edu.

Recommended Citation

Society, Florida Historical (2009) "Book Reviews," *Florida Historical Quarterly*. Vol. 88: No. 4, Article 6.
Available at: <https://stars.library.ucf.edu/fhq/vol88/iss4/6>

Book Reviews

Daniel Murphree, Book Review Editor

Mapping the Mississippian Shatter Zone: The Colonial Indian Slave Trade and Regional Instability in the American South. Edited by Robbie Ethridge and Sheri M. Shuck-Hall. (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2009. Acknowledgements, illustrations, notes, bibliography, index. Pp. x, 536. \$35.00 cloth.)

Scholars have struggled to explain the period between the fall of the Mississippian chiefdoms and the rise of various Native confederacies across the South during the two centuries after European contact. Thanks to this collection, they have a new term to assist them. Editors Robbie Ethridge and Sheri M. Shuck-Hall suggest the phrase “shatter zone” to describe the instability during this era and in this region and present a satisfactory case for its acceptance into mainstream academia. The combination of European colonialism, epidemic diseases, commercial trade in animal skins and Indian slaves, and intensified violence created a whirlwind that resulted in the demise of the great precontact Mississippian chiefdoms and the reconfiguration of more loosely organized Native polities brought together by circumstance and for survival. In a lengthy introduction, Ethridge defines important terms and presents a broad history of the Southeast that provides a useful foundation upon which readers can build their understanding of this concept and its application to the early South. Each author engages the shatter zone theory and relates it to their area of expertise allowing them to discuss the merits and flaws of the idea as well as offer highlights of their own work. This approach demonstrates the validity and diversity of the shatter

zone and offers a through-line that links these many different articles together in a logical, if not entirely coherent, narrative.

Ethridge admits in both her introduction and afterword that this volume is not a comprehensive survey but argues that the included studies serve as examples of the shatter zone theory and as reference points for future work. Most authors focus on a specific Native group, while a few choose to take on broader topics. For instance, Maureen Meyers and Eric E. Browne independently discuss the significant role the Westos played within the shatter zone because their slave raids throughout the South helped create and sustain regional instability among the Native population. Robin A. Beck, Jr., Mary Elizabeth Fitts, and Charles L. Heath all examine the Catawba and show how they coalesced into a separate and new entity in the wake of various shatter zone events, and Sheri Shuck-Hall does the same for the Alabama and Coushatta. Stephen Warren and Randolph Noe show how the Shawnee operated within the shatter zone and thrived because their nomadic heritage protected them from the cultural destruction experienced by more sedentary, and therefore less adaptable, peoples. In one of the more thorough articles, Ned J. Jenkins presents a detailed analysis of the historical origins of the Creeks through a meticulous study of ceramics found throughout present-day Alabama. Patricia Galloway and George Edward Milne look at the Choctaws and Natchez respectively and demonstrate how the consequences of the shatter zone affected polities living on its periphery. The Choctaws were able to resist full assimilation into the market economy and thus dictate their own terms for trade, while the Natchez used intermarriage and relied upon the diplomatic skills of their women to preserve their way of life.

Not all authors chose this individualized approach, however. Matthew H. Jennings emphasizes the important and complex role violence played in creating the shatter zone and explains how violence could be both destructive as well as reconstructive, depending on the circumstances. John E. Worth offers a new perspective on the history of early Florida and blames slave raids financed by English entrepreneurs and led by Westos and Yamasee for the demise of the Spanish mission system and its defenses, contributing factors to the end of Spanish dominance over the region. Paul Kelton links the spread of disease to slave raids because both microbes and slave catchers traveled the same routes, and he reminds readers to consider disease an important component of

the shatter zone and an underestimated factor in the Yamasee War. Marvin D. Jeter observes that the ripples of the shatter zone did not reach as far as the Lower Mississippi Valley, thus drawing a possible boundary for this particular experience. These authors therefore demonstrate how to apply this concept in ways other than the study of specific Native polities and thereby strengthen the argument for its adoption by academia.

Ethridge and Shuck-Hall do a remarkable job of bringing together a wide variety of scholars that includes archaeologists, ethnohistorians, and anthropologists and combining them in this innovative framework. To assist them, each author goes out of his or her way to comment upon the shatter zone concept and integrate it into their specialty. As a conclusion, Ethridge presents both an overview of the volume's achievements as well as a lengthy list of topics for future study and notes that further discussion and application of this theory still remains to be done. Perhaps one of the most useful aspects of this volume lies in the extensive footnotes at the end of every article. Each author offers a thorough postscript surveying past and recent literature on his or her topic and creating almost a second dialogue within the larger discussion of the shatter zone concept. Like all edited volumes, some articles are stronger than others, but taken together, this collection satisfies its objective of mapping at least the basic outlines of the Mississippian shatter zone.

Julie Anne Sweet

Baylor University

Guardians of the Valley: Chickasaws in Colonial South Carolina and Georgia. By Edward J. Cashin. (Columbia: University of South Carolina Press, 2009. Preface, acknowledgements, illustrations, notes, bibliography, index, Pp. ix, 196. \$ 29.95 cloth.)

The Chickasaw peoples of what is now the southeastern United States have been the subject of several histories. The majority of these works have tended to reinforce the perception that the Chickasaws populated a good deal of the mid-lower South, often locating them in the area of present day Mississippi, Alabama, and western Tennessee. We tend not to think of the Chickasaws as peoples of the Atlantic coastal South. In his last book, *Guardians of the Valley: Chickasaws in Colonial South Carolina*

and Georgia, the late Edward J. Cashin offered a corrective for this sort of thinking. Cashin points out that the native peoples of the colonial southeast were for the most part, mobile when they chose to be. But alliances with Europeans, and preferential access to the trade goods they could provide, could also dictate, as in the case of the Chickasaw, where they would settle. European competition for empire in the coastal southeast prompted colonial governments' attempts to convince native peoples to remain (relatively) stationary to some degree so that they might provide a valuable, local, military asset for settlers in time of conflict.

Cashin's narrative centers on the military, diplomatic, and trade relationships between the Chickasaw and the English colonies of South Carolina and Georgia. He points out that some Chickasaw bands allied themselves with the English on the eastern seaboard where they helped to shield South Carolina and Georgia from Spanish excursions out of Florida and provided a buffer on the frontiers of the two colonies that helped secure them against the French in Louisiana and their native allies. The Chickasaw proved to be such valuable allies that the two colonies sometimes quarreled over "whose" Indians they were and who should form alliances. The Chickasaw also served as military proxies for the English, fighting their traditional Choctaw foes, who in turn acted as proxies for the French in Louisiana.

It is easy to forget that England's North American colonies often regarded each other as competitors rather than comrades. Since both South Carolina and Georgia needed protection on their respective frontiers, they both sought out the Chickasaw as allies, buffers between themselves and the French to the west, and in the late 1750s and early 1760s, as security against the Cherokees.

Perhaps the most interesting portion of Cashin's tome is his discussion of the personalities involved in relations between the English and Native Americans. Some years ago, James Merrell pointed out the importance of cross-cultural "go betweens" in colonial Pennsylvania who negotiated the space between native people and colonists. Cashin does likewise in his study, noting the activities of Mary Musgrove Bosomworth, who was a trader, landholder, and liaison between Georgia and the Chickasaws and Creeks. However, while Cashin often mentions Bosomworth's actions as an cultural intermediary, and notes her marriages (she once scandalized Augusta society by marrying the local minister) he tells us little about the woman herself; the reader is left to wonder if she was

English, native, or of mixed parentage. Nor does Cashin offer the reader a clue as to how or why she attained so much influence. We do not know if her power came through her marriages or by virtue of her birth into an important family, or if she was simply a dynamic individual with the skills and charisma to pull it off. Given that female go betweens were comparatively rare (but not unknown) on the frontier, this reader wishes that Cashin could have provided a bit more detail about Mary Bosomworth.

It is also interesting to note that leaders of the South Carolina colony engaged in a bit of historical revisionism concerning their past relations with Indians. In 1765, Cashin relates, Governor William Bull offered the Chickasaws protection and a refuge from their enemies, informing the common house that the colony also had offered them protection twenty-six years earlier. Bull's history was inaccurate. South Carolina had invited the Chickasaw to settle within the colony's borders forty-three years earlier, not in order for the colonists to protect the natives, but so that the natives would be able to protect the colony.

Overall, Edward J. Cashin's last book is a fitting end to a life and a career. I could see the book perhaps being used in upper-division and graduate level classes and seminars regarding south-eastern Native American history or the history of the colonial Southeast.

Roger M. Carpenter

University of Louisiana at Monroe

Material Culture in Anglo-America: Regional Identity and Urbanity in the Tidewater, Lowcountry, and Caribbean. David S. Shields, ed. (Columbia, SC: University of South Carolina Press, 2009. Acknowledgments, introduction, maps, images, drawings, tables, notes, contributors, index. Pp. 368. \$59.95 cloth.)

This engaging and eclectic set of essays asks us to consider the local, regional, Atlantic and early national influences that defined material culture. They range geographically from Frederick, Maryland, to the British Caribbean, and chronologically from the late seventeenth century to the early nineteenth. Only one, an excellent survey by Paul Hoffman of archaeological work on the layout of early St. Augustine, specifically deals with Florida, but readers of this journal will still find much of value in these essays.

Essays by Carl Lounsbury (on Christ Church, Savannah), Louis Nelson (on Anglican churches in the southern colonies and Caribbean), Jeffrey Richards (on a dissenting church in South Carolina), and Roger Leech (on urban buildings in plantation settings), and Emma Hart (on the eighteenth-century expansion of Charleston) all raise parallel questions about the influences that local concerns and Atlantic contexts had on built environments. Other essays are provocative efforts to link material culture, cultural history, and power; Eric Klingelhofer's study of colonial "castles," Natalie Zacek's essay on elite rituals in the West Indies, and Benjamin Carp's work on the revolutionary movement in South Carolina, all have this general theme. A brief and very provocative essay by Bernard Herman on the multiple meanings and contexts of archaeological evidence is best read alongside Martha Zierden's study of Charleston ceramics and Maurie McInnis's interpretation of a Raphaele Peale painting as a cultural artifact.

Perhaps a fuller sense of the volume can be achieved by surveying several of the essays more closely. In "Building for Disaster," Matthew Mulcahy asks what the settlers in South Carolina and the Caribbean learned about building from their experiences with hurricanes. Richard Dunn in *Sugar and Slaves* (1972), argued that English people initially refused to abandon their food, clothing, and building ways in the Caribbean, even when these became fatal conceits. Mulcahy shows that eventually they figured it out. Or did they? One generation learned to build for disaster, but several decades later, defenses forgotten, a powerful hurricane could flatten plantations and kill multitudes. The story Mulcahy tells is all the more fascinating because it is not a straight line from English practice to colonial adjustment to the environment.

Paula Stoner Reed presents an architectural account of a Haitian-French farmstead, the Hermitage, in Frederick County, Maryland. The farmstead, an architectural anomaly in the largely German and English settlement, was constructed by the Vincendiere family shortly after they arrived in 1793 and became a haven for refugees from the Haitian Revolution. The hip-roofed stone barn they constructed stands out as the most distinctive aspect of the farm complex. The leadership role taken by the family's teenaged daughter (her father settled in South Carolina and never rejoined the family) in guiding the family's successful resettlement may have made the family seem distinctive to others in

Frederick County. Reed also notes that the family ran into trouble with local authorities for their mistreatment of some of the many slaves they brought with them from Haiti. Perhaps the way Haitian whites punished enslaved people stood out in Maryland, even to local slaveowners, just as much as the unusual architectural constructions on the Hermitage.

R.C. Nash's essay, the longest in the collection, provides a comparative analysis of material culture and consumerism in South Carolina and other locations in the eighteenth-century British Atlantic. Adopting categories used by colonial Chesapeake scholars to analyze probate inventories allows Nash to make very explicit comparisons and point to the distinctive features of South Carolinians' accumulation of necessities, comforts and luxuries. Nash also examines trade records and store inventories to get a better sense of consumer expenditures on non-durable goods, especially on textiles and groceries, that leave less of a trace in probate inventories. He argues that Carolina consumers became attached to new consumer goods earlier than other colonists (modeling themselves on English urban culture) and that consumer expenditures, if not the value of consumer goods, went up sharply from mid-century on because people increasingly bought and replaced fashionable textiles.

Laura Croghan Kamoie brings together two seldom-connected strands in the early architectural history of Washington, D.C. and spells out their contradictory history. One was a public project to create a "new Rome," whose buildings symbolized the republic's virtues. The other was the creation of the Georgian plantation homes of Virginia and Maryland families who established residences in the capital. At the heart of this contradiction, of course, was slavery. Kamoie displays not only the familiar images of the capitol and other public buildings, but also drawings and sketches of the walled enclosures that slaveowners erected around their miniature plantation complexes to recreate the order and control they had over enslaved people. How exactly enslaved people experienced this landscape invites further study.

David Shields' excellent introductory essay teases out common threads from these essays and assesses more generally the local and Atlantic factors that shaped late colonial and early national material culture in the region.

Paul G. E. Clemens

Rutgers University

Nexus of Empire: Negotiating Loyalty and Identity in the Revolutionary Borderlands, 1760s-1820s. Gene Allen Smith and Sylvia L. Hilton, eds., (Gainesville: University Press of Florida, 2009. Introduction, illustrations, maps, tables, notes, contributors, index. Pp. 375. \$69.95 cloth.)

In this collection of fourteen original essays, editors Gene Allen Smith and Sylvia L. Hilton have reinvigorated the concept of the borderlands through the analysis of identity and loyalty in the Gulf South. The essays in *Nexus of Empire* explore personal and communal experiences that represent various social groups in the region. Essays explore people of French, Spanish, British, American, Creek, Caddo and various other national or tribal backgrounds; they examine free people of color and slaves, men and women, rich and poor, landed and landless. All of the essays demonstrate the remarkable fluidity that characterized identities on the borderlands, reminding us that nations and empires are built on the periphery, not the core. For readers interested in eighteenth-century Florida and borderlands in general, this collection of essays is a must-read.

Although the volume has a short introduction, the heart of the volume begins with a fascinating look at loyalty oaths in Spanish West Florida and *Luisiana* by Sylvia Hilton. This essay introduces readers to many of the issues that the other essays explore. Importantly, it highlights the ways that imperial nations struggled to obtain loyalty in the tumultuous decades that surrounded the American Revolution. Hilton distinguishes between Spanish loyalty and patriotism in West Florida and *Luisiana*—showing what Spain was willing and not willing to negotiate as it expanded its empire. Rather than blindly impose a preordained mandate of what constituted loyalty or expect instantaneous patriotism, Spain created policies that addressed the multiethnic and politically unstable region as well as the self-interest of the potential Spanish citizens themselves. In this examination, Hilton makes it clear that local perspectives and realities shaped imperial policies.

The rest of *Nexus of Empire* is divided into three sections. Kathryn E. Holland Braund, H. Sophie Burton, Erin M. Greenwald and F. Todd Smith contribute essays in “Dilemmas Among Native Americans and Free Blacks.” The next section—“Building Fortunes through Family Connections and Local Communities”—includes essays by J. Edward Townes, Robin F. A. Fabel, Light

Townsend Cummins, Elizabeth Urban Alexander, and Betje Black Klier and Diane M. T. North. The final section—"Personal Ambition in Government and Military Service"—contains essays by Andrew McMichael, Gene Allen Smith, and Samuel Watson.

In addition to these topical perspectives, the volume makes several other important contributions to borderlands historiography. The limits of national identity and the importance of local and individual perspectives are perhaps best illuminated in McMichael's essay on the Florida frontier. In his examination of William Dunbar, William Claiborne, and Daniel Clark, McMichael demonstrates how "political nationalism... relied on local issues and the promise of prosperity rather than loyalty to any single political entity" (289). The contrasting and complex types of loyalty among these three prominent men—scientific, personal, institutional, and economic—should convince readers that national loyalties are neither inevitable nor easily explained.

Several of the essays explore the allegiances and alliances between Indians and Europeans. Braund's exploration of the Creek Indians—one of the few non-biographical essays—illustratively re-examines the contested struggle over diplomatic allegiances among the Lower South's most powerful Indian tribe. In the process, she complicates Creek factions by placing their imperial loyalties in local contexts. The fluidity of identities in the region requires scholars to use sources and define their terms very carefully. Some chapters are more effective than others in this regard. Din's essay on Louis LeClerc De Milford—also an examination of Creek society—struggles to get beyond Milford's own self-delusion of himself as a prominent chief. Din effectively demonstrates how Milford (frequently spelled Milfort by other scholars) played various roles in Creek society; he was a "Creek brave," "Spanish agent" and "French commissioner in charge of the native confederation" (63). Few would doubt Din's claims that Milford represented a unique personality on the southern frontier, one whose loyalty and identity frequently shifted. Without providing a careful explanation for why Natives allowed or encouraged him to shift identities, however, Din inadvertently misses an important source of national instability in the region.

Several other essays in *Nexus of Empire* demonstrate how the region's racial and ethnic diversity required diplomatic leaders who could carefully balance the conflicting needs and fears of their communities. Greenwald makes this clear in an exploration of New

Orleans, where the population was divided by "religion, politics, race, and language" (113). In this complex historical milieu, Greenwald demonstrates how political officials like William C. C. Claiborne needed to "diffuse repeatedly the potentially explosive animosity between incoming American settlers, Louisiana Creoles, and New Orleans's free colored community" (114).

As a whole, *Nexus of Empire* effectively demonstrates the inability of any of the imperial or tribal powers in the region to impose national identities on its inhabitants. Instead, several authors describe individuals as "chameleons." Some of the essays point to the conscious decisions and negotiations that individuals must have made in order to realign their loyalties; other essays point to the often-meaningless and ever-fleeting nature of national identities in the region. Similarly, the essays explore differences between the ever-mutable personal identities and loyalties of particular individuals and the necessarily fixed sense of identity and loyalty that allowed empires and nations to assert power and regulate the communities themselves. As the editors explain in the conclusion, "the constant pressures generated by imperial and national rivalries in the Gulf borderlands meant that identities and loyalties could change easily as long as the region remained in political flux" (353).

Readers and scholars will be well served to embrace this fluidity and the insights of the volume. Those interested in eighteenth-century Florida, in particular, may want to rethink the tendency to see the transfer of power from Spain to Britain to Spain as being milestones of the era and instead begin to imagine the era as one of fluidity where the meaning of these transfers are yet to be fully explored.

Andrew K. Frank

Florida State University

A Faithful Account of the Race: African American Historical Writing in Nineteenth-Century America. By Stephen G. Hall (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2009. Acknowledgments, notes, bibliography, index. Pp. xv, 352. \$65 cloth, \$22.95 paper.)

When discussing the growth and development of African American history as a field of study, many begin with its professionalization in the twentieth century, particularly Carter G. Woodson's creation of the Association for the Study of Negro Life

and History (ASNLH) in 1915 and the creation of the *Journal of Negro History* the following year. Some push the narrative back to include George Washington Williams and the publication of his two-volume, *History of the Negro Race* (1883), but most intellectual historians point to the post-1915 period to discuss the development of the field. August Meier and Elliott Rudwick's pioneering historiographical work, *Black History and the Historical Profession* (1986) followed this model of historiography, but in recent years a number of scholars have begun to "trouble the pages" of this narrative, including, among others, Mitch Kachum in *Festivals of Freedom* (2003), Elizabeth McHenry in *Forgotten Readers* (2002), and John Ernest in *Liberation Historiography* (2004). While these works are not all historiographical by design, each urged readers to seriously engage often ignored intellectual works of the nineteenth century, including historical based pamphlets, books, speeches, literary society productions and newspaper publications. With *A Faithful Account of the Race: African American Historical Writing in Nineteenth-Century America*, Stephen Hall takes the discussion a bit further by not just recognizing the works, but by discussing the ways in which they "informed subsequent production and the professionalization of the field" (13). Indeed, the "central purpose of" Hall's study, "is to chart the origins, meanings, methods, evolution, and maturation of African American historical writing from the period of the early republic to its professionalization in the twentieth century" (3-4).

A Faithful Account of the Race is divided into six chapters that chart and analyze the historical writing of African American intellectuals throughout the nineteenth century. Hall, using the works of Jacob Oson and Hosea Easton in his first chapter, attempts to move beyond the ordinary vindicationist or contributionist discussions of the influence of their works by providing more nuanced considerations that demonstrate that early black thinkers drew upon more mainstream "humanist paradigms" that "allowed African Americans to establish a historical genealogy whose beginnings transcended the narrow confines of the hold of slave ships" or the slave quarters and plantations of the American South (14, 47). The second chapter, "To Present a Just View of Our Origin," looks at how black writers "created a counternarrative to the dominant discourse on African Americans in the antebellum America" (83). Using the works of Martin Delany, James W. C. Pennington, Henry Highland Garnet, and others, Hall demonstrates how these authors used the

intellectual culture of the period to create a more humanistic image of the black community and the African past that transcended the present, slavery, Middle Passage, and "first ages of man" (14).

In the third chapter, "Destiny of the Colored People," Hall looks at the writings of William C. Nell, George Boyer Vashon, William Wells Brown, and James Theodore Holly, and argues that their work, "provided intellectual signposts that aimed to demonstrate black patriotism, argue for black citizenship, and prove the capacity of black people to govern themselves" (122). In the fourth chapter, "The Historical Mind of Emancipation," Hall focuses on the work of William Wells Brown and William Still, highlighting the shifting priorities of writers on the dawn of freedom. These writers "wrote, about heroism, self-sacrifice, and historical precedent to demonstrate what the race had achieved during its darkest hour as an indicator of what it could accomplish in freedom" (150). The fifth chapter, "Advancement in Numbers, Knowledge, and Power," examines the most commonly discussed pre-professionalization period of black history, 1883-1915, and links the publication of George Washington Williams' *History of the Negro Race* (1883) to the founding of the ASNLH in 1915. Hall, however, broadens the usual discussion by considering works, by Anna Julia Cooper, Frances Watkins Harper, John Cromwell, Daniel Barclay Williams, William Simmons, and Gertrude Mossell, among others. Building on the work of the early republic and antebellum authors, these writers, who published emancipation narratives, race textbooks, and collective biographies, created the bridge between the earlier century production of black history and the professionalization of the field in the post-1915 period. According to Hall, these works, along with those that preceded them, "continued to embody the aspirations of a people that understood the importance of giving their own faithful account of the race." "In a moment framed by tales of black degeneracy . . . black writers used history to tell and shape an alternative textual record of racial possibility" (186).

Overall, *A Faithful Account of the Race* is an insightful study of African American historical writing from the early republic to the creation of the ASNLH. Hall has done a wonderful job placing many of these works into historiographical context and explaining how these early works need to be taken seriously as historical writings and how they influenced or became the bedrock for the "professional" historians and scholars of the twentieth century and

beyond. There are some areas in the study, however, where one wishes for more detail or explanation. One such area is the basis for the selection and/or exclusion of particular works. Why, for example, did Hall select the texts that he discusses, and why has he ignored or only cursorily mentioned others? This brings this particular reader to one of the more curious aspects of the book, Hall's brief mention and relative dismissal of Booker T. Washington's *The Story of the Negro* (1909), the only book in the *A Faithful Account of the Race* called, a "quasi-historical study" (210). Why is Washington's study "quasi-historical" when none of the other books or pamphlets discussed are set aside in such a manner? *The Story of the Negro* became quite popular, as Hall acknowledges, after its initial publication and continued in its popularity as a source of African American history at least until the publication of John Hope Franklin's *From Slavery to Freedom* in 1947. Why then is it not given the same treatment as other works in the study or at least the same recognition as contemporary works such as John Cromwell's *The Negro in American History* (1914)? Such a glaring oversight with little to no explanation has left this reader confused and wanting more analysis of Washington's work and in the end, other works in the study as well. Such an exploration would have strengthened Hall's argument about the influence of these early works, or lack of influence in some cases. This criticism aside, *A Faithful Account of the Race* is a fascinating study of black historical writing from the period of the early republic to its professionalization in the twentieth century. All who are interested in African American history and the historiography of the field should read *A Faithful Account of the Race* as well as the original texts and materials that Hall has analyzed in this important study.

Shawn Leigh Alexander

University of Kansas

Counterfeit Gentlemen: Manhood and Humor in the Old South. By John Mayfield. (Gainesville: University Press of Florida, 2009. Acknowledgements, notes, index, bibliography. Pp. ix, 173. \$65 cloth.)

John Mayfield enters a new and exciting area of historical scholarship by exploring what it meant to be man in the Old South. Taking his cue from works such as Craig Friend and

BOOK REVIEWS

553

Lorri Glover, eds., *Southern Manhood: Perspectives on Masculinity in the Old South* (2004), Stephen Berry, *All That Makes a Man: Love and Ambition in the Civil War South* (2003), and Joan Cashin, *A Family Venture: Men and Women on the Southern Frontier* (1991), this author brings a fresh approach to the subject. Mayfield uses humor as an analytical tool with which to examine representations of manhood in the Old South. The author argues that the ambiguities and incongruities found in works of fiction illuminate internal subversions which reflect the social and economic changes of the antebellum period. Mayfield argues that John Pendleton Kennedy's *Swallow Barn* (1832) was the model from which later authors spun their own variations on various aspects of the southern gentleman's nature and identity. The larger argument is that in the post Civil War era southern men were no longer able to laugh at themselves. A static manly ideal subsequently emerged in the portrayal of Robert E Lee, as one who displayed all the unambiguous qualities of southern manhood.

Swallow Barn was set in Virginia at a time when the tobacco market was volatile and a new restlessness was evident in the movement of southerners to the southwestern frontier. These economic shifts put the Virginia gentleman on the defensive as he was confronted with the choice of embracing the rapid changes of the market revolution or retreating into marginalization. The core characteristics of the Virginia planter were deeply rooted in harmonious domestic and localized relationships. This was an insulated world that was rapidly disintegrating in the face of Jacksonian democracy and increased social and economic mobility. The Virginia planter was in danger of being "relegated to a domesticated life of feminized passivity" denied the opportunity of "northern patricians" who could "reinvent themselves as captains of industry" (24). Mayfield demonstrates the irony that this static pastoral setting would provide the roots of the post civil war plantation mythologies that have proved so tenacious.

The early chapters examine the works of Augustus Baldwin Longstreet, Johnson Jones Hooper and Joseph Glover Baldwin and skillfully explore the negotiation and re-negotiation of male identities in a period of economic insecurity and rapid expansion. In a world where reputation was no longer based on family heritage but on business acumen, the characteristics of the planter gentleman proved to be weaknesses rather than

strengths. The organic relationships of Tidewater Virginia devolved into confrontational relationships between men struggling to prove their manhood. Here Mayfield exposes another irony in the development of the confidence man and his victim. These were both liminal figures, set loose from the constraints of family tradition and struggling with the transition between boyhood and manhood in a world that had yet to embrace social mobility as a positive. And yet, even while they failed to provide men with the tools to achieve the success they so desired, gentlemanly codes of behavior remained the ideal.

The subsequent chapters increasingly move away from historical context and the latter half of the book is more of a literary analysis. This is not a book for the uninitiated as it is heavily sprinkled with underdeveloped references to Shakespeare, Jane Austen and (even more challenging) Dostoevsky's "Underground Man." As Mayfield purports to be examining the specifics of antebellum southern life that made these quests for manhood so intriguing, the relevance of these comparisons is never clear. At this point the book also fails to reveal any sense of humor or wit in the literature examined and the later examples are more tragic than comic.

In the final chapter the author does succeed in showing how, even if he was ill suited to the world of the marketplace, the man of honor was a vital player in the war effort. And unsurprisingly the fiction of the immediate post war period reflected both disillusionment and humiliation in the wake of Confederate defeat. In the Epilogue Mayfield suggests an intriguing example of the way in which two overarching ideals of manhood, the man of honor and the man of enterprise, fought side by side in the Civil War. Robert E. Lee and Josiah Gorgas personified these models. But again, although most readers will be familiar with the characteristics associated with Lee, Gorgas remains an unexplored example of the professional man.

The greatest weakness in this book is its failure to explore paternalism. Although the author uses the term, he neglects the power of this ethos in shaping ideals of manhood and mastery in the old South. Also, although the author ends with a focus on slavery, there is no exploration of the centrality of the institution to concepts of manhood. Manhood was created, not only in negotiation between men of different classes, who embraced different economic imperatives, but also in terms of black men's

inability to share in a sense of manhood. Nevertheless this exploration into the complexities of manhood in the Old South suggests new and intriguing avenues for future scholars.

Jacqueline Glass Campbell

Francis Marion University

The Problem of Emancipation: The Caribbean Roots of the American Civil War. By Edward Bartlett Rugemer. (Baton Rouge: Louisiana State University Press, 2008. Acknowledgements, Introduction, maps, epilogue, footnotes, bibliography, index. Pp. xiii, 342. \$42.50 cloth.)

Embracing the scholarly agenda of Atlantic historians, Edward Bartlett Rugemer provides an international approach to one the most "American" of all events: The American Civil War. Rugemer's primary thesis is to chart the roots of the Civil War beyond an American context, demonstrating that even though America successfully captured its independence in the late eighteenth century, it remained wholly connected with the events of the West Indies and other occurrences in the "Anglo-Atlantic" world. Indeed, Rugemer's elegant prose and exhaustive research successfully argue that North America remained historically, culturally, and economically tied to the Caribbean throughout its early history.

Rugemer's book is a product of three diverse, but interconnected historiographies: the first is literature concerning the Civil War, the second emancipation/abolition, and the third is the relatively new Atlantic paradigm that seeks to place historical events within an international or "Atlantic" context. For Rugemer, these elements of the Civil War are best viewed as intellectual history. Rugemer effectively tracks the exchange of ideas across the Atlantic, beginning with the implications of the Haitian Revolution all the way to Caribbean inspired political discourses during Radical Reconstruction.

One of Rugemer's most novel approaches is his ability to connect individuals and events internationally. He convincingly demonstrates that early nineteenth century Americans were far more mobile than usually credited by scholars who frequently frame their analysis by focusing exclusively on the nation state. Rugemer also adds to the expanding literature concerning the international implications of Haiti's revolution and subsequent independence. Rugemer agrees that Haiti's Revolution contributed significantly to

American discourses concerning slavery and emancipation. He argues that the biased account of Haiti's rebellion by the Jamaican pro-slavery apologist Bryan Edwards in 1797 was frequently referenced and even plagiarized by US slaveholders throughout the antebellum period. Expanding beyond Haiti, however, Rugemer investigates the international connotations of certain events that many historians of the U.S. South continue to ignore, namely the 1816 Easter Rebellion in Barbados, the Denmark Vesey conspiracy in Charleston, South Carolina in 1822, and the Demerara rebellion of 1823. Each of these events had particular implications for both advocates and opponents of U.S. slavery. Additionally, Rugemer cites a variety of legislative and social actions that have specific Atlantic contexts. One such action was the Negro Seaman law, enacted in 1822 by the legislature of Charleston, South Carolina, in order to curtail the mobility of black sailors. Paranoid southern whites believed the mobility of these black sailors throughout the Atlantic enabled them to spread news of rebellion in the Caribbean and rumors of emancipation to restless U.S. slaves.

Much of Rugemer's argument rests upon analysis of the competing discourses and rhetoric used by both abolitionists and pro-slavery theorists as emancipation began sweeping throughout the British Atlantic. Rugemer uses a chronological format to demonstrate a chain of events that manacled U.S. slavery in the Atlantic World. For example, when Britain enacted its Act of Abolition in 1833, southern slaveholders and northern abolitionists both used the Caribbean example to demonstrate the pros and cons of emancipation. American pro-slavery apologists inherited the racist rhetoric of white Caribbean planters, and Northerners often traveled throughout the Caribbean studying the positive results of Britain's abolition.

Importantly, Rugemer provides evidence that the "Atlantic World" is not just an innovative framework historians are employing to reframe colonial and antebellum history, but was a reality for those who lived during this period of history. Rugemer creatively reviews the life of Unitarian minister William Ellery Channing who, despite residing on a Virginia plantation as a tutor for the planter's children, was not converted to the abolitionist cause until his visit to the sugar colony on the Dutch-controlled island of St. Croix. After witnessing the slave system on St. Croix, Channing frequently cited the Caribbean as evidence for his discourses against the U.S. slave system. Thus, the Caribbean's connection to Channing's abolitionism came from both physical *and* intellectual roots. Rugemer pro-

vides numerous other examples of the Caribbean connection to U.S. slavery and their accompanying debates as the Civil War approached, a list too lengthy to include in this review.

Rugemer's success is found not only in his engaging prose and thematic-chronological format, but also in his extensive use of a wide variety of primary source materials. Using various archives, Rugemer demonstrates that newspapers, government documents, personal narratives, and journals reveal an intense American interest in international events. While Rugemer's work is predominantly an "Anglo Atlantic" history, those interested in Caribbean history outside of the Anglophone colonies might find Chapter six of particular interest. Rugemer devotes a section of this chapter to the connection the slaveholding states held with the Spanish empire, as they were "only a stones throw from Cuba," according to pro-slavery advocate Robert Monroe Harrison (210).

In essence, Rugemer effectively accomplished what he set out to argue: that "the boundaries of the United States were permeable," and that "many Americans lived Atlantic lives that took them beyond the United States" (7). The book does, however, leave the reader with a few questions. One wonders if Rugemer's approach could go a step further. Scholars have demonstrated that African-American newspapers were read in Africa, the Caribbean, and Latin America. Is it possible that African reports from the colonies of Sierra Leone and Liberia partially influenced both pro-slavery rhetoric and abolitionist thought in the United States prior to the Civil War? Did Southerners ever employ the examples of abolition that happened throughout continental Latin America? While finding answers to such questions was not Rugemer's objective, his book does extend the Atlantic model into the nineteenth century, and opens the field for further investigation for the international connotations of America's national problems. Rugemer's use of the Atlantic paradigm in analyzing the international roots of the Civil War is a much needed approach to a historiography that continually circumscribes this important event within the confines of U.S. borders. Rugemer provides an interesting and insightful piece that has potential to attract lay readers, individuals interested in revisionist histories, and professional scholars seeking new approaches to subjects with already substantial historiographies.

Tyler Parry

University of South Carolina

Bluejackets & Contrabands: African Americans and the Union Navy. By Barbara B. Tomblin. (Lexington: University Press of Kentucky, 2009. Acknowledgments, illustrations, map, notes, index. Pp. viii, 400. \$39.95 cloth.)

In this exhaustive study, Barbara Brooks Tomblin embarks on the unenviable task of adding significantly to the growing body of historical literature on the life of black sailors, pilots, and watermen during the Civil War era, imparted in such pioneering works as Jeffrey Bolster's *Blackjacks: African American Seamen in the Age of Sail* (1998), David Cecelski's *The Waterman's Song: Slavery and Freedom in Maritime North Carolina* (2001), and David Ramold's *Slaves, Sailors, Citizens: African Americans in the Union Navy* (2002). To accomplish this she charts a slightly different course, focusing her lens primarily on fugitive slaves—commonly referred to as contrabands—who enlisted during the Civil War and in various other ways contributed to the Union Navy's war effort. Limiting her examination to the North and South Atlantic Blockading Squadrons, she draws on the voluminous Official Records of the Union and Confederate Navies as well as other standard maritime and military sources. It is prodigious research that makes it hard to believe so many once failed (and to some extent continue to fail) to acknowledge the contribution of enslaved people to the abolition of slavery in the United States.

Tomblin chronicles slaves' heroic attempts both to become free and to assist the Navy in defeating the Confederacy. In spite of the threat of physical punishment and death, bondpeople from the opening moments of the war went to extraordinary lengths to find refuge on naval ships and in the camps established by the Navy that dotted the rivers, creeks, and coastline of the southern Atlantic between Virginia and Florida. Once safe, their fidelity to the United States intensified. Contrabands donned the blue jackets of the Union navy and joined the battle to restore the Union and destroy slavery. William B. Gould, Robert Blake, and the well-known South Carolinian Robert Smalls are among the long list of bondmen described in these pages who undertook the radical transformation from slave to sailor and citizen. In addition to serving on the front lines of major engagements on both land and sea, contrabands made significant contributions to the Navy as guides, mechanics, laborers, and servants. Female contrabands contributed to the Navy by working as informants, nurses, laundresses,

and cooks. The music and dance provided by contrabands, so often dismissed by observers and historians alike, also added to the wartime experience of Navy officers and sailors, Tomblin argues. Throughout the course of the war, the Navy not only relied upon but also eventually anticipated contraband assistance and adjusted strategy accordingly.

The book makes several important additions to the academic conversation on the relationship between fugitive slaves and the United States military. First, contrabands often put an incredible strain on a Navy that already had its hands full with Confederates. Though offering sailors valuable services and goods, including vegetables, fresh meat, fish, and occasionally even "home-cooked meals" (147), contrabands' demands for food, shelter, and clothing placed a great burden on the Navy, which routinely assumed responsibility for their well-being. The Navy's efforts in this regard represent, Tomblin demonstrates clearly, a marked "expansion of the navy's original mission to blockade the southern coast" (77). Second, historians have largely ignored the extent to which free black southerners along the coast assisted the Union Navy. Though unbound before the war, these men and women enjoyed a standard of living that in many cases exceeded only slightly that of their enslaved neighbors. Thus, it is no surprise that when naval vessels appeared along the coast, free people like Archy Jenkins, Alonzo Jackson, Samuel Williams, and Mary Louveste joined contrabands in seeking refuge and, upon reaching safety, likewise offered their services to the military. Tomblin describes the prevalence of white refugees among the black exodus; however, she declines offering any theoretical comment.

This, and her unwillingness to provide an overarching analytical framework throughout the book, will disappoint some readers. Since the publication of Leon Litwack's Pulitzer Prize-winning *Been in the Storm so Long: The Aftermath of Slavery* (1980) a cadre of historians have detailed slaves' contribution to the United States' victory over the Confederacy. What is needed now are studies that instead of simply cataloguing important events, explore the complex relationships that developed among slaves, soldiers, and both free black and white refugees and explain the significance of these relationships in the context of nineteenth-century American history. Joseph Glatthaar's *Forged in Battle: The Civil War Alliance of Black Soldiers and White Officers* (1991) is a rare but prime example. That being said, despite its derivativeness this is an encyclopedic work

with which any serious student of the remarkable alliance of fugitive slaves and the United States Navy must now contend.

Matt Clavin

University of West Florida

Wars within a War: Controversy and Conflict over the American Civil War. Joan Waugh and Gary W. Gallagher, editors. (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2009. Introduction, notes, contributors, index. Pp ix, 292. \$30.00 cloth.)

Current histories of the American Civil War tend to examine specific human experiences (death, terror, and memory to name a few), a trend that deviates from the traditional focus on military battles, politics, and personalities. Joan Waugh's and Gary Gallagher's anthology, *Wars within a War*, does an excellent job in continuing this movement by gathering an all-star cast of contributors to examine nonconventional conflicts that occurred during and after the Civil War. Some of the familiar names include Carol Reardon, Drew Gilpin Faust, and James McPherson. Topics that the contributors examine are easily grouped into five themes: the home front, military affairs, literature and the visual arts, care for the dead and veterans, and historical memory. With the topics and contributors combined, readers will find an excellent sampling of groundbreaking approaches to Civil War history.

Despite the overachieving nature of this book, some chapters stand out from others. Stephen McCurry does an excellent job reexamining Southern food riots by connecting them to the larger topic of the relationship between women and the government. Through the examination of Southern women's letters he is able to discover an unintended cultural movement that emerged in reaction to the war and sacrifices made at home, one that ultimately forged a new political identity for many involved. Another interesting chapter is Joseph Glatthaar's examination of resistance to Robert E. Lee taking command of the Army of Northern Virginia. He dispels the Lost Cause myth of the South's faith in Lee from the first moment. Additionally, he outlines how Lee overcame the initial distrust and how he altered the culture of the Southern army. Similarly, the Lost Cause is the focus of Gallagher's chapter on Civil War movies. He traces the presentation, retraction, and reemergence of the Lost Cause in the history of Hollywood from *Birth of a Nation* to *Gods and*

BOOK REVIEWS

561

Generals. Though over time historians have been able to influence the movie industry to shy away from the myth, it still has a presence in modern films such as *Riding with the Devil*. Unfortunately *The Outlaw Josey Wales* was not mentioned, which would have strengthened his thesis by including Native Americans in the Lost Cause mythos of Hollywood. Perception of how aging and impoverished veterans were viewed by their countrymen and its impact on their own self image is another interesting topic covered. James Marten examines these aspects in his chapter on soldier homes and pensions. Conflict arose within the nation as to what should be done to support its veterans. Should the country provide a pension and housing with medical benefits? How much should be provided and to whom? These questions created conflict amongst the veterans. Many saw accepting charity from the government as embarrassing, causing many to question their manhood in doing so. While some men adjusted to the situation, others did not. Finally, the age-old exam question of who is buried in Grant's tomb is pushed aside by Joan Waugh to ask, why is Grant's tomb where it is? Waugh reveals the controversies and clashes that erupted over the placement of Grant's tomb in New York City. Former soldiers felt it appropriate that he be interred in Washington, D.C. while powerful leaders were able to raise the funds and build the tomb in New York.

This anthology contributes significantly to current trends in Civil War history. It succeeds in combining personal, political, social, cultural, racial, and history and memory approaches between two covers. Additionally, the editors provide a well-balanced and organized work that addresses the topic throughout. This book will prove useful for any scholar researching these aspects of the Civil War experience while still appealing to the common reader.

Charles D. Gear

Prairie View A&M University

U.S. Grant: American Hero, American Myth. By Joan Waugh. (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2009. Acknowledgements, illustrations, maps, notes, index. Pp. 384. \$30.00 cloth.)

The maxim Mark Antony immortalized when eulogizing Julius Caesar, "the evil men do lives after them; the good is oft interred

with their bones" found an exception in the case of Civil War hero and former U.S. president Ulysses S. Grant. After Grant stepped into the spotlight following impressive military victories in the western theater of the Civil War, his flame as a celebrity fluctuated between raging inferno and smoldering ember, but was never fully extinguished. Yet, as Joan Waugh explains in her new book, Grant's popularity became inextricably linked with that of the Civil War itself, and as historians began to question the war and loss of human life, some disparaged Grant and suggested that he was a war criminal (7).

In its effort to reestablish Grant's importance in history, Waugh's book is one of many recent studies that, as she explains, focus on the Union cause to balance scholarship on Confederate identity. While she places emphasis on commemoration, Waugh carefully guides the reader through the evolution of Grant's celebrity, from his early life and relative obscurity through his military successes, presidency, and rise to almost mythic status. The Grant that Waugh reveals achieved greatness despite personal setbacks, financial insecurity, and a grounded, realistic perspective on his abilities.

The biography successfully demonstrates what Grant meant to contemporaries. Although he had notable critics, Americans willingly overlooked or forgave Grant for incurring high numbers of casualties at the Battle of Shiloh in 1862, the shocking carnage that resulted from pursuing Robert E. Lee through the Wilderness in 1864, and presiding over one of the most corrupt presidential administrations in the nation's history. Each loss made the Union victory more crucial and contributed to Grant's General Order No. 60, denying guerillas the same treatment accorded uniformed prisoners of war, and his decision to wage "total war" on the South. But as Waugh indicates, because of his conciliatory terms at Appomattox, Grant personified the Union cause and reunification. In several chapters the theme that "Appomattox" was "a sacred symbol of a peaceful reunion after a long and bitter war," connects Grant to the survival of the Union (100).

Enthusiasts will enjoy the chapters dealing with Grant's post-presidential personal life, death, and commemoration. Recounting Grant's reception when traveling around the world and the important part his memoir played in forever articulating the causes and objectives of the Civil War, Waugh explains why Americans grouped Grant with George Washington and mourned him, but not Lincoln, in every part of the nation. According to Waugh, the year 1885, fol-

lowing the election of the first Democrat, to the presidency since the Civil War, "was the perfect time for U.S. Grant, that symbol of a hard northern victory and a hard northern peace to die..." (258).

Waugh's discussion of Grant's monument is among the book's most important contributions. Following its dedication in 1897, the monument became a "sacred pilgrimage spot for Union veterans and their families from all over the country" (262-263). It remained the most visited monument until the mid-twentieth century when the neighborhood in which it was located declined, the monument fell into disrepair and defacement, and the number of visitors dwindled. Waugh celebrates the renewed interest in "Grant's Tomb" sparked by recent scholarship that corrects unfavorable interpretations of Grant's military service and presidency. Moreover, based on the importance she places on his personal accounts, Waugh will doubtless direct newer and younger readers to Grant's *Personal Memoirs* for his firsthand account of the Civil War. This alone, is an important reason to recommend the book.

The book follows a chronological path through Grant's life that works well. It combines iconography with historiography, but in some areas, especially the early chapters, the book's tone is reminiscent of biographical works targeting a preteen audience. Happily, there are few editorial problems. There is one statistical discrepancy regarding the Battle at Shiloh, however. The author contends that the battle resulted in 23,000 casualties, but lists only 1,745 Union and 1,723 Confederate deaths. Overall, however, the book is nicely packaged and well-chosen illustrations show Grant's status as a nineteenth century hero.

While most readers will appreciate the book's endeavors to convey the complexities of Grant's upbringing, wartime exploits, and Gilded Age politics in a readable monograph, scholars will likely look more closely at, and take issue with, Waugh's assertions that issues such as tariffs, civil service reform, Native-Americans, and almost anything but the failure of Reconstruction and race relations were symbols of national healing. In fact, it will be difficult for the book to escape criticism for its overt romanticism, in addition to what may be perceived as serious lapses of objectivity. For example, when attempting to place Grant in the antislavery camp, Waugh presents scant evidence to substantiate her claims. Explaining his "unstinting support for emancipation" when African-American soldiers were recruited by Union forces, Waugh quotes Grant's assurance to President Lincoln, "Whether the arming of the Negro

seemed to be a wise policy or not, because it is an order that I am bound to obey and I do not feel that in my position I have a right to question any policy of the Government" (72). Following orders is hardly a ringing endorsement of the policy, and although Grant cast his first vote against antislavery Republican candidate John C. Fremont in 1856, for most of the book Waugh brandishes "Grant's contempt for the southern cause of slavery" (45, 212).

More disturbing to academic scholars will be Waugh's inability to combine Grant's memory into a narrative that avoids creating a white and black America, and her assertion that "accuracy is irrelevant" when larger truths are involved (204). While the book attempts to address Grant's memory in a multilayered culture, it never deals with the reality that reuniting the nation on an emotional and sentimental basis in order to reconcile southern and northern whites, hardly made the nation whole or fulfilled the ideals that led to Union victory. As the race riots of the early twentieth century and related violence and bloodshed throughout the eighty years after Grant's death demonstrated, the Civil War was not over. Despite Waugh's efforts to convince readers that Grant's funeral was a "benchmark event for sectional reconciliation," the nation was not healed (218). Grant's memory and image will be better served through honest appraisal than filiopietistic praise. Perhaps we should suggest that Grant's death represented the first phase of achieving ideals his generation had only just begun. Nonetheless, this is a good time to recapture Grant's importance in our collective historic memory and Waugh tells us much about Grant to sustain the scholarly conversation.

Dinah Mayo-Bobee

University of Massachusetts Amherst

The Varieties of Women's Experiences: Portraits of Southern Women in the Post-Civil War Century. Edited by Larry Eugene Rivers and Canter Brown Jr. (Gainesville: University Press of Florida, 2009. Acknowledgements, illustrations, notes, index. Pp. xvi, 432. \$69.95 cloth.)

This informative volume contains chapter-length biographical essays about fourteen southern women, primarily from Florida and Georgia, whose careers flourished in the century following the American Civil War. Inspired by the work of southern women's histo-

BOOK REVIEWS

565

rians such as Anne Firor Scott, Kriste Lindenmeyer, and Joan Johnson, editors Rivers and Brown set out to show that the longstanding image of the southern woman as confined primarily to domestic pursuits still prevails in the historiography of the Deep South not because it accurately reflects women's experiences but rather because so little attention has been paid to researching and telling women's stories. To help fill this gap, the editors and contributors to this volume selected subjects whose lives collectively reveal how women in the post-Civil War South created or responded to opportunities to improve themselves and their families and in the process made a difference in the quality of life in their communities, state, and nation. By including women of diverse backgrounds and fields of endeavor, the editors hope to dispel the view that there was such a thing as a typical southern woman, contending that "women who defied the stereotypes of the times proliferated at most every hand" (xiv). They also seek to understand the dynamics of change over time by including women of different generations. The subjects featured in this volume were born between 1823 and 1879 and died between 1897 and 1974.

The editors express a desire to highlight the experiences of ordinary women rather than famous women achievers, and to a large extent the examples they chose fit that description. Still, several of the volume's subjects came from backgrounds that were more privileged than commonplace, and they achieved a degree of public recognition in their day that set them apart. Ellen Call Long, for example, was the daughter of one of Florida's territorial governors. After the Civil War she became a celebrated good will ambassador for Florida, a vocal advocate of sectional and racial healing, and a noted writer. Mary Barr Munroe, daughter of the highly successful romance novelist Amelia Barr, became one of South Florida's most active community leaders and conservationists and was recognized in her day for her efforts in establishing Royal Palm State Park, the precursor of today's Everglades National Park. Adella Hunt Logan, one of eight children born to a free mulatto woman and a white planter, considered her upbringing to have been much more fortunate than that of most African Americans living in central Georgia in the 1860s and 1870s. As a result, she was able to graduate from normal school and become an instructor at Tuskegee Normal and Industrial Institute, a prominent clubwoman and suffragist, and a close friend of W.E.B. DuBois and Booker T. Washington.

Most of the essays, however, shed light on the lives of women who were not known outside their circle of activity and whose stories have

not been told elsewhere. The volume includes, for example, women such as María Valdés de Gutsens, a Cuban émigré, who galvanized support in Key West to establish a charity hospital for the community's primarily Cuban and African American poor, many of whom had no access to medical care. For more than thirty years, she kept the *Casa del Pobre*, or Mercedes Hospital as it was also known, open through her indefatigable fund-raising efforts. Gertrude Dzialynski Corbet, one of Florida's first female lawyers, was active in Duval County Democratic politics before passage of the Nineteenth Amendment and founded several important women's organizations in Jacksonville as well as the Florida League of Women Voters in 1921. Jerenia Valentine Dial Reid, Florida's first registered African American nurse, worked through the National Association of Colored Graduate Nurses to improve professional opportunities for black nurses while she held important positions at hospitals in Florida, North Carolina, Missouri, and elsewhere.

The fourteen essays focus not only on the public accomplishments of the women highlighted in the volume but also describe their private lives and the individual approach that each of the women took in fulfilling their aspirations while balancing their public and private worlds. Well researched and thoroughly grounded in surviving primary sources, these essays reveal that Florida and Georgia women's experiences in the century following the Civil War were similar to many of their counterparts in other southern states who have received much more attention from historians. While this volume alone does not provide us with a new interpretation of women in the period, it does offer rich examples of the variety of women's contributions that should inform studies of the Gilded Age and Progressive-era South and encourage future study of Florida's vibrant women's history.

Sandra Gioia Treadway

Library of Virginia

Pursuit of Unity: A Political History of the American South. By Michael Perman (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2009. Acknowledgements, illustrations, maps, notes, bibliography, index, Pp. xiv, 408. \$35.00 cloth.)

Michael Perman, having written several books on politics in the post-Civil War South, has now produced a synthesis of southern politics from the era of Jefferson to Clinton. Focusing on the

eleven states that comprised the Confederacy, the author surveys both internal southern politics and the region's unique political relations with the rest of the country, connecting these dual strata with a normally realized but occasionally frustrated goal of unity among the region's white population. For the better part of two hundred years, there has been no substantial opposition party to the dominant regimes in southern politics—the two exceptions of significant duration occurring in the life of the second party system from the mid-1830s through the early 1850s and in contemporary America. *Pursuit of Unity* addresses the impact of the South's unique political experience, one based on the drive for racial domination, on both southern and national politics.

Much of the basic narrative thrust of the book has been told before, whether it concerns the dominance of the Virginia dynasty in the early years of the Republic, the South's role in the second party system of Whigs and Democrats, the drive toward secession, the southern reaction to Reconstruction, the threats to the Redeemer regime posed by the Populists and other dissenters, disfranchisement and the development of the one-party South, the role of demagogues, the South's conditional acceptance of Wilson's and then Franklin Roosevelt's policies, resistance to the Civil Rights movement, and southern influence in national politics since the 1970s.

What makes Perman's analysis new and refreshing are the longitudinal and institutional perspectives he brings to this rather well-tread terrain. For example, unlike James McPherson, who has argued that southerners and northern allies dominated the federal government through the 1850s, Perman makes much of the differential quality in southern influence between the first and second party systems, arguing that never again would southerners dominate national politics as they did between 1800 and 1824. He also partially disagrees with Eric McKittrick's contention that the lack of a two-party system hindered the Confederate government, arguing that Jefferson Davis pretty much got what he wanted in terms of legislation. Indeed, for Perman, the Confederate Constitution's impediments to party development were consistent with the Calhounite pursuit of unity that southern whites struggled to achieve.

He also finds intriguing long-term similarities in southern reactions to external threats—whether it was the attack on slavery in the Missouri crisis, the relatively modest demands of the Andrew

Johnson administration at the beginning of Reconstruction, and the anti-lynching campaigns of the early and mid twentieth century. The need to nip every threat in the bud was, in Perman's view, only one part of the political equation. In some ways, southerners hoped that by resisting even modest demands for reform they would force their opponents to make greater demands, and thus weaken the latter's credibility even among their own initial supporters. Thus, northern wariness of radical Reconstruction found a parallel in northern support for George Wallace in the late 1960s and early 1970s.

The author also points to the advent and then elimination of certain "rules of the game" in explaining oscillations in the influence southern whites exerted in politics. The development of the two-thirds rule for nominating Democratic presidential candidates in 1836, along with its repeal a century later, were critical, as was, in 1975, the reduction of the requirement of 67 votes to 60 votes to end filibusters in the Senate. Like V.O. Key, Perman sees disfranchisement and the development of the white primary as solidifying a disorganized form of what Key called "no-party" politics within the South, in which an institutionally weak Democratic party served as something akin to a "holding company" for various factions, even as that party functioned as, essentially, a state department in combating external threats to the region's ruling order in Congress and in presidential nominating conventions.

For Perman, the Supreme Court's annulment of the white primary played a critical role in shattering the solid South. And while emphasizing the importance of the Voting Rights Act and other Civil Rights legislation, he also argues that just as disfranchisement had led to a reduction of white participation as well as the near elimination of African American participation in the early twentieth century, the re-enfranchisement of African Americans and the development of a competitive form of politics in the late twentieth century has produced a heavier and countervailing increase in conservative white voter participation as well. The Supreme Court's "one man, one vote" ruling in *Baker v. Carr*, while aiding liberal causes by boosting urban representation, also had, because of mandated redistricting, the effect of aiding conservative Republicans in the South through the packing of blacks in a few districts, while marginalizing the white Democratic vote.

Perman is especially adept at comparing and contrasting the roles of southern national politicians as the majority faction within

a minority party (when Republicans controlled congress), the majority faction within a majority party (during the most of the first half of the nineteenth century and then later in Wilson's terms of office), and a minority faction within a majority party (as increasingly and uncomfortably became the case during the life of the New Deal coalition). The low turnover rate for southern senators and representatives, due in large part to the perennial one-party structure of the region, gave the South disproportionate power in congressional committees whose members' authority was based on seniority.

The author is also mindful of social and economic changes and how they affected the fabric of southern politics, such as the roots of rural discontent in the 1880s and 1890s, the economic impact of New Deal policies and black out-migration, the proliferation in the region, during and after the Second World War, of the defense and petroleum industries, and (in recent decades) northern in-migration, suburbanization, and the revival of evangelical Christianity. With the rise of salient issues aside from racial domination, and the development of a viable two-party system in the South, the region has, Perman maintains, lost its political distinctiveness, leading one to wonder whether it makes sense even to refer to "the South" any longer in a political context.

Well-argued, cogently written, and insightful on many levels, *Pursuit of Unity* would work well in courses on the South, as well as on the history of American politics and political institutions.

Lex Renda

University of Wisconsin-Milwaukee

Ditch of Dreams: The Cross Florida Barge Canal and the Struggle for Florida's Future. By Steven Noll and David Tegeder. (Gainesville: University Press of Florida, 2009. Acknowledgements, illustrations, notes, bibliography, index. Pp. xi, 352. \$29.95 cloth.)

In *Ditch of Dreams*, Steven Noll and David Tegeder relate the compelling tale of the Cross Florida Barge Canal, one of the nation's largest public works projects that was never built. With meticulous detail, the authors explore the twists and turns of this canal project from its genesis during the first half of the nineteenth century to the present day. The proposed nearly two-hundred-mile long canal, had

it been completed, would have linked the St. John's, Ocklawaha, and Withlacoochee rivers, thus creating an inland passage from the Atlantic Ocean, near Jacksonville, to the Gulf Coast.

Ditch of Dreams is broad and ambitious in its scope. The book's overarching thesis is that the convoluted history of the canal reflects competing (and changing) "visions of progress, economic growth, and preservation, as well as the use of political power to achieve those goals" (2). As they explicate these visions, the authors reveal the importance of citizen activism in challenging the power of pro-canal business groups and in halting the momentum of the project despite the support of state and federal officials, including the Army Corps of Engineers. In itself, this is an important theme, as the role and efficacy of previously overlooked groups of dissenting citizens has become an integral thread in the discipline of environmental history. The actions of these citizens, led by Marjorie Harris Carr and the Florida Defenders of the Environment, is skillfully interwoven with the emerging environmental movement of the 1960s and far-reaching changes in public perceptions of the intrinsic values of the natural world. These evolving attitudes toward nature eclipsed one strand of the legacy of New Deal liberalism—large public works projects authorized and funded by the federal government. In the end, the lands once dedicated for the canal right-of-way were returned to the state of Florida and converted to a 107-mile greenway, fittingly named the Marjorie Harris Carr Cross Florida Greenway, now dedicated to recreation and nature preservation.

Noll and Tegeder explore in great detail the evolving rationales for the canal: economic development, the provision of employment during the difficult years of the Depression, wartime security during World War II (by providing a safe inland passage), and, finally, recreational opportunities. Yet, although authorized and partially constructed twice during the twentieth century, first as a deepwater ship canal during the 1930s and then as a shallower barge canal during the 1960s, the project was never able to sustain enough broad support to be completed. With a marginal cost/benefit ratio and questionable environmental consequences ranging from possible saltwater contamination of the Floridan aquifer to the destruction of the largely unspoiled Ocklawaha River, the canal faced opposition during each successive iteration. But it also had many ardent champions, most notably Florida senator Claude Pepper, who kept alive the dream of the canal generation after

generation. Even after its final demise in the late 1980s, the physical imprint of the canal project is still present in the form of Kirkpatrick Dam and Rodman Reservoir on the lower Ocklawaha, now a premier bass-fishing destination, but an obstacle to the restoration of the river, the elusive goal for which Carr dedicated the last three decades of her life.

Ditch of Dreams is painstakingly and commendably researched, and well illustrated with historical photographs and maps. The authors delve deeply into a wide array of primary sources, including numerous manuscript collections, engineering reports and other government documents, and more than a dozen newspapers. The result is an authoritative recounting of the complicated and contested tale of the canal, including its proponents and detractors as well as its legislative history. It is always a challenge to convey the intricate details of legislative proceedings, especially inconclusive ones, without becoming entangled in a morass of overwhelming detail. But on this count, the authors are largely successful. The text is written in crisp and lively prose, and the book gains momentum as it progresses. While the authors draw important connections to larger themes of the shifting national environmental mood, this reviewer would have appreciated a bit more attention to the parallels and contrasts with the fight to restore the Everglades, much of which is contemporaneous with the later twentieth-century battles over the canal and which also is intimately connected to the designs of the Army Corps of Engineers. Much, of course, has been written about the ecology and the environmental history of the Everglades, from Marjory Stoneman Douglas's classic, *The Everglades: River of Grass* (1947) to David McCally's book, *The Everglades: An Environmental History* (1999). Still, a brief treatment of some of the connections between these north and south Florida battles would have provided useful historical context and reinforced the authors' already strong thesis.

That minor criticism aside, *Ditch of Dreams* deserves a wide audience. Written in a style accessible to both lay and academic readers, this book is of importance not only to those interested in Florida history, but also to anyone interested in evolving notions of the definition of progress and of environmental preservation, the political calculations that often underlie environmental decision-making, and the role of citizen activists in influencing national environmental policy.

Philip Garone

California State University, Stanislaus

And They Were Wonderful Teachers: Florida's Purge of Gay and Lesbian Teachers. By Karen L. Graves. (Champaign: University of Illinois Press, 2009. Acknowledgements, notes, index. Pp. xxi, 216. \$65.00 cloth, \$20.00 paper.)

In 1956, the seven-member Florida Legislative Investigation Committee was formed to "investigate all organizations and individuals advocating violence...or violations of the laws of Florida" (1). State Senator Charley E. Johns of Bradford County took over as chair of this Committee in 1957, and it was known thereafter as the Johns Committee. In the beginning, the Committee focused on the activities of the NAACP and its sympathizers. Its goal, essentially, was to thwart implementation of *Brown vs. Board of Education* in Florida. As their efforts met legal resistance from the NAACP and Cold War hysteria spread across the nation, the Committee turned its attention to rooting out communists. Finding very few, the committee had to present a new rationale for its continued existence in 1959. Its focus shifted to rooting out homosexuals in the educational system. This book chronicles the activities of the Johns Committee as it systematically carried out a purge of suspected gay and lesbian Florida teachers from 1957 to 1963. The title came from an interview with a retired Hillsborough County teacher, who, when referring to other teachers who "disappeared" unexpectedly during the purge, wistfully noted "and they were wonderful teachers" (xvii).

According to the author: "the history of the Johns Committee—with its interlocking elements of racism, homophobia, anticommunist sentiment, and attack on the schools—illustrates the American commitment to domestic containment ideology as clearly as any event of the Cold War era" (16). She maintains that to control teachers is to control the dominant ideology (xvii). The strategy was to circumscribe any action that threatens stability. Gay and lesbian teachers were, in the minds of Charley Johns and his committee, a triple-threat to Florida's stability: they were subversive, disloyal, and perverted. These teachers were thus caught in the crosshairs of Cold War containment ideology, and the schools had to be cleansed of them. Graves claims that the Florida purge was unique and important because of the resources and singularity of purpose that the Johns Committee brought to its work.

The author examined the interrogation transcripts of eighty-seven Florida schoolteachers in the Johns Committee records at

the State Archives. In the preface and notes, Graves conducts a comprehensive literature review of current research about the teacher purge specifically, and the activities of the Johns Committee in general. Previous works like James A. Schnur's *Cold Warriors in the Hot Sunshine: The Johns Committee's assault on Civil Liberties in Florida, 1956-1965* (1995), and Allyson Beutke and Scott Litvak's documentary film *Behind Closed Doors: The Dark Legacy of the Johns Committee* (2000) shed light on the purge of college and university students and faculty. The author distinguishes her study from previous work by focusing specifically on the activities of the Committee with regard to Florida's K-12 teachers.

In the preface, Graves provides disturbing excerpts from the interrogations that illustrate the deceptive and misleading practices of Remus J. Strickland, the chief investigator for the Committee. Strickland exceeded the mandates of the Investigation Committee in his pursuit and intimidation of teachers and consistently flaunted due process and proper legal procedures. In most cases, the teachers were pulled into the superintendent's office or local highway patrol station, denied legal representation, and told if they refused to cooperate, they would be subpoenaed to appear in a public hearing. The questioning started out rather innocently, and quickly became very personal in nature and tone, with Strickland often implying that he had sworn testimony from homosexual sex partners when there was none. Questions about specific sex acts, and their frequency and effect on the participants were very common. Many of those who admitted homosexual activity often denied a homosexual orientation, thinking this might help their cause. Denials notwithstanding, the teachers were asked to resign immediately. If they refused, again they were threatened with public exposure. Even those who denied everything lost their jobs and teaching credentials once they were questioned. The Florida Education Association, which ostensibly represented these teachers, instead assisted the Board of Education and the Johns Committee by identifying possible targets by marital status or gender non-conformity. Graves calls this action "one of the most appalling examples of abuses of state power during the Cold War" (117).

In writing this book, Karen L. Graves hopes to enhance gay and lesbian historiography by studying antigay discrimination as it played out in, arguably, the "most central social institution—the school system" (xxiii). I believe that she succeeds by placing the

phenomenon of Florida's teacher purge in the context of education history. The Johns Committee may be long gone, but many of the political, social and ideological factors that contributed to its development remain a part of the way Americans look at the education of our youth. Graves concludes:

Until Americans let go of the notion that homosexuality is "sinful", queer teachers will be regarded as "immoral," in spite of pronouncements to the contrary by medical and legal authorities... Since Americans have made schoolteachers the guardians of the dominant ideology, public oversight of teachers' sexuality will remain intense as long as the battle is fixed (148).

This book effectively explains the way in which the Florida Legislative Investigative Committee purged Florida's gay and lesbian teachers during its tenure. Graves was thorough in her careful and diligent collection of documents and data from many different sources. A generous notes section and index enhance the work and stimulate ideas for future research.

Florence M. Turcotte

University of Florida

Truth, Lies, and O-rings: Inside the Space Shuttle Challenger Disaster.

By Allan J. McDonald and James R. Hansen. (Gainesville: University Press of Florida, 2009. Foreword, illustrations, acknowledgements, bibliographic essay, index. Pp. xix, 576. \$39.95 cloth.)

The explosion of the *Challenger* on a frigid January day in 1986 starkly revealed the dilemma of science and technology. Engineers had achieved breakthroughs in space flight that galvanized the country, but the complexity of this technology meant that O-rings and other small pieces of sophisticated equipment suddenly assumed national importance. In addition, such a massive endeavor was vulnerable to the vagaries of politicians, bureaucrats, and corporate managers. The unassuming Morton Thiokol engineer Allan J. McDonald, knowing his company's rocket boosters might fail at low temperatures, found himself at the mercy of all these forces when he futilely warned against launching *Challenger*.

In *Truth, Lies, and O-rings: Inside the Space Shuttle Challenger Disaster*, McDonald recounts the decision to launch *Challenger*, the investigation of the accident, and the return of the shuttle to space

flight. McDonald's book is, like the shuttle itself, a massive, complex, and fascinating work. Other books on *Challenger*, emphasizing the almost-pathological culture of NASA, have overlooked the physical causes of the accident, while works focused on mechanical errors have obscured the responsibility of individuals. McDonald's memoir convincingly shows how all these factors combined to create disaster. It was not just NASA, moreover: McDonald openly skewers his bosses at Thiokol. When NASA officials improperly pressured Thiokol to approve the *Challenger* launch despite the unseasonably cold weather, Thiokol brass saw their engineers' opposition to launch as a threat to the company's livelihood. After Thiokol's top engineer recommended against launch, his bosses told him, "take off your engineering hat and put on your management hat" (112). The recommendation was thus changed in the hopes of placating the company's biggest customer, thereby sealing *Challenger's* fate.

The book will appeal to an audience beyond space shuttle buffs as it (somewhat unintentionally) sheds light on the tangled skein of politics, technology, and industrial giants like Thiokol that fueled the arms race and the space program. While McDonald concentrates on the space shuttle, he briefly mentions Thiokol's role in developing the Strategic Defense Initiative and the MX missile. McDonald himself lobbied the Pentagon, the Army, the NSC, the CIA, and Congress to purchase his rocket motors, showing how the space shuttle was thoroughly enmeshed in the military-industrial complex. For information on the role of Kennedy Space Center readers had best look elsewhere, however, since the controversial decisions were made at Marshall Space Flight Center in Huntsville, Alabama.

Much of the value of this rich primary source lies in the overwhelming evidence detailing the technical failures and the arrogant practices of both NASA and Thiokol. But writing about complex technology offers its own distinct challenges, and *Truth, Lies, and O-rings* has its drawbacks. The following sentences are fairly typical: "These three engines produced just over 1.1 million pounds of sea-level thrust, offset of the launch vehicle's center line, which caused the entire vehicle to bend over more than two feet prior to SRB ignition, while it was still being held down on the launchpad. SRB ignition occurred after the SSME engines were verified to go as the Shuttle stack sprang back to the vertical position" (448). Like much scientific writing, McDonald's descriptions

and diagrams often give the impression of explaining without actually doing so. The book contains a hilarious number of acronyms, though a list of abbreviations is included. None of these quibbles should deter readers, since one can skim the technical details and still retain a strong grasp of the discussion.

Despite its exhaustive detail, the book reveals surprisingly little about its author, a man so reserved that he even seems to avoid adjectives. When his redesigned rocket passed a rigorous series of tests, McDonald writes in characteristically subdued language, "I was ecstatic" (454). More problematic is his lack of reflection about the shuttle program as a whole. McDonald dismisses a congressional committee investigating the *Challenger* accident as "out for blood" and "highly suspicious and agenda-laden" (369). Congress, in McDonald's mind, exists solely to engage in self-aggrandizement and re-election stunts. But where would McDonald, Thiokol, and the space program have been without loud-mouthed congressmen clamoring for the United States to win the space race? Furthermore, one congressman had ordered Thiokol to keep McDonald on the shuttle redesign team or lose NASA contracts. Yet McDonald seems oblivious to the cozy relationship between the aerospace industry and the legislative branch.

In fact, McDonald's obsession with the intricacies of the shuttle prevents him from expressing the significance of the shuttle program beyond platitudes. With shuttles exploding at an alarming rate, the reader might well wonder why no serious reappraisals of the program ever took place. From McDonald's perspective, the return to flight proved that "The *Challenger* astronauts had not died in vain" (517), but McDonald needs to explain what redemption had been achieved, especially since (as McDonald instantly recognized) the shuttle immediately exhibited flaws that would lead to the destruction of *Columbia* in 2003. McDonald eulogizes *Challenger* as a sacrifice "in humankind's quest to explore the heavens" (551), yet he never states what the shuttle actually *does* in space, leaving unstated any importance beyond launching. Referring to a failed NASA effort to design new shuttle rockets, McDonald rails, "What a waste of the taxpayers' money!" (552), blissfully unaware that many say the same about the shuttle program itself. When a former coworker denounced Thiokol and NASA for the *Challenger* accident, McDonald thought his comments were "poisoning young minds" (511). But if children lost interest in the space program, would it have been the nation that

BOOK REVIEWS

577

suffered? Or Morton Thiokol? Or aerospace engineers? While far from authoritative, Gerard DeGroot's polemic *Dark Side of the Moon: The Magnificent Madness of the American Lunar Quest* (2006) serves as an entertaining counterpoint to McDonald's uncritical embrace of the space program. Nevertheless, *Truth, Lies, and O-rings* rewards readers with a fascinating account of technological disaster, as well as an eye-opening look at those who drive the space program. In the process it documents the ethical behavior of a compulsively honest engineer and his dogged determination to revive, rehabilitate, and stand by the space shuttle.

Paul Robinson

University of South Florida