


2010

## Book Reviews

Florida Historical Society  
membership@myfloridahistory.org

 Part of the [American Studies Commons](#), and the [United States History Commons](#)

Find similar works at: <https://stars.library.ucf.edu/fhq>

University of Central Florida Libraries <http://library.ucf.edu>

This Book Review is brought to you for free and open access by STARS. It has been accepted for inclusion in Florida Historical Quarterly by an authorized editor of STARS. For more information, please contact [STARS@ucf.edu](mailto:STARS@ucf.edu).

---

### Recommended Citation

Society, Florida Historical (2010) "Book Reviews," *Florida Historical Quarterly*. Vol. 89: No. 2, Article 6.  
Available at: <https://stars.library.ucf.edu/fhq/vol89/iss2/6>

## Book Reviews

*Daniel Murphree, Book Review Editor*

*Zamumo's Gifts: Indian-European Exchange in the Colonial Southeast.* By Joseph M. Hall, Jr. (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2009. Acknowledgments, illustrations, notes, glossary, index. Pp. x, 232. \$37.50 cloth.)

In the spring of 1540, Altamaha chief Zamumo sent to Spanish conquistador Hernando de Soto and his rapidly approaching army a load of gifts. In return, de Soto gave Zamumo a feather which Zamumo gratefully received with the words, "this your feather that you give me, I can eat with it; I will go forth to war with it; I will sleep with my wife with it" (1). This seemingly simple exchange, Joseph M. Hall, Jr. contends, was far more important, complex, and frequent than the casual reader might imagine. Although gift-giving was central to most Native diplomacy in the colonial period (and, indeed, long before 1540), Zamumo was especially interested in using the Spanish presence to gain a leg-up on his regional rival, Ocute. Although in this case, de Soto did not stay long enough to make a difference either way for Zamumo, this exchange nonetheless serves for Hall as the paradigm for which we should understand the ensuing two centuries of increasingly complex Native-European relations in the American southeast.

The central argument around which this book coheres is that Native conceptions of exchange—more in terms of building networks and alliances and less in term of commerce—was central and powerful in the colonial southeast and forced Europeans as early as de Soto in the 1540s and as late as British trader Patrick Mackay in

## BOOK REVIEWS

253

the 1740s to adjust imperial strategy to existing Native realities. "Histories of exchange deserve more sustained examination," Hall asserts, and clearly this book is an attempt to recast southeastern Native-European history with exchange at the center of most of what goes on (5). At its most radical moments, this book is a reconceptualization of how the southeast was "won"; in short, "feathers and lace accomplished much more than fire and steel" (53).

For the most part, this is a convincing recasting. The chronological scope of the book (1540 – 1760s) and the ongoing presence of multiple imperial powers are crucial for establishing the essential continuities Hall argues exist. The chapters proceed chronologically, with each chapter highlighting nuanced changes in how exchange and trade are revised over time (essentially from gift-giving on Native terms to English-dominated, commercial-driven exchange of goods). Along the way, Hall is especially interested in the ways in which Natives themselves forced European empires to reshape their imperial ambitions and commercial desires to fit Native conceptions of trade, exchange, and alliance. Southeastern Indians, for example, "compelled the Spaniards to abandon the pike and harquebus for quieter means of conquest," i.e., trade (43). Exchange/gift-giving/trade ends up being foundational for most of Native activity, movement, and negotiation with Europeans. Exchange and diplomatic gift-giving allowed the Spanish to build a wide network of influence and alliance far into the interior in the late sixteenth and early seventeenth centuries. Attention to Native expectations of gift-giving was the foundation for English traders establishing commercial networks in the mid seventeenth century. Networks of exchange provided connections for the Native groups fleeing the slave raids of the Westos in the late seventeenth century. Despite the English colonists' increasing attempts to impose order on the southeastern backcountry in the 1720s, as long as the French and Spanish imperial presence remained, Native gift-giving and exchange allowed the Creeks and Cherokees to renegotiate English trade relations in their favor.

At times, however the lines between these various modes of exchange (gifts-trade-diplomacy-commerce) can feel somewhat muddled (Hall's discussion on p. 71 is less than clear, for example). Throughout, Hall weaves archeological evidence, historical documentation (impressively, from Spanish, French, and English sources), and contemporary oral histories and ethnographic data into one seamless narrative. Such creative use of sources is almost demanded by the subject matter, but at times the presence of oral



histories and ghost stories with their reality-defying tales and historic recasting verge on trivializing the more concrete information in the surrounding paragraphs.

In the end, however, this is essentially a retelling of an increasingly well-trodden history of Native-Native and Native-European relations in the southeast, albeit through the lens of exchange (which can feel artificially imposed at times). The opening chapters on the pre-contact Native history of the region and, later, Spanish intrusion and influence, seem the strongest in many respects, in part because they contain material less familiar to most Americanists. Specialists will be familiar with the particularities of the English-driven Indian slave trade in the colonial southeast from the 1670s through the Yamasee War, although somehow reading about it in the larger context of imperial dynamics and the longer history of Indian exchange practices makes it feel slightly different, particularly since Hall's emphasis is less on the English and more on how Native groups responded to English aggressiveness and fought to refashion trade and alliances on their own terms (primarily through warfare and alliance with rival European empires). *Zamumo's Gifts* feels somewhat reminiscent of Alan Gallay's *The Indian Slave Trade* (2002), although Natives take center stage for Hall in a different way than they do for Gallay. Christina Snyder's *Slavery in Indian Country* (2010) covers much of the same history and cast of characters, although with differing emphases (slavery and race).

Nonetheless, this book is an important contribution to the fields of Native American and colonial American history. Hall has an amazing grasp of the vagaries of local dynamics and events that will likely seem bewildering to a non-specialist. The overall point is well-taken, and the volume goes a long way toward providing yet another "facing east," Native-centered history in ways that are exciting and historically nuanced. Although the book can feel dense at points (despite its relative brevity—171 pages of text), it is full of content and interpretation that graduate students and scholars in related fields will appreciate. At some point, however, one begins to wonder what the outer limits of assertions of ongoing Native control might be with regard to exchange. When the French are gone from the region after 1763, and—later—the Spanish from Florida, it is difficult to imagine Natives dictating much of anything in the face of a criminally aggressive newly United States, as the sad history of the nineteenth century demonstrates.

*The Quaker Community on Barbados: Challenging the Culture of the Planter Class.* By Larry Gragg. (Columbia: University of Missouri Press, 2009. Acknowledgements, introduction, map, epilogue, bibliography, index. Pp. vii, 192. \$39.95 cloth.)

When I imagine the lives of colonial Quakers, they always seem to appear in gray and wintry settings—the impassioned Mary Dyer bowed at the gallows in Boston, John Woolman trudging through a muddy lane toward his next heavenly vision. Why do I see them in such grim climates? Because of their well-known plain dress, so often gray itself? Because of the apparent austerity of their silent worship? Larry Gragg's new book not only corrects my mistaken impression but also offers reasons for the error. *The Quaker Community on Barbados* provides a carefully researched glimpse into the lives of colonial Friends on the island of Barbados from their earliest migrations in the 1650s to the eventual decline of the Quaker community in the early eighteenth century. In the book, Gragg suggests that scholarship on Quakers has overlooked the significant presence of Caribbean Friends in favor of studying other outposts along the "transatlantic network of Friends" (4). In addition, Gragg illuminates ways in which Friends on Barbados ran counter to the social and political expectations of Anglican colonial authorities. By attending to colonial Friends in a sunnier climate, Gragg effectively reveals their critical influence on broad currents of Quaker thought.

*The Quaker Community on Barbados* begins by providing a brief overview of the cradle of the Society of Friends in England and the rise of the English colony on Barbados. Both chapters provide useful context for those that follow (and will serve as a helpful introduction for readers unfamiliar with these histories). In addition, these early chapters show that the Quaker community in Barbados was intimately aware of and connected to English reports and ideas. Many Quakers went to Barbados for the same reason they went to the Puritan stronghold of New England: to mission. As in Boston, their reputation for radical dissent often preceded them. Gragg takes care to show, for example, that the antics of the English Quaker dissenter James Nayler were apparently common knowledge amongst suspicious Anglicans on Barbados. Colonist Henry Fell wrote to his wife in 1657, worried by those who "Blaspheme the name of our God, because of reports wch come out of England concerninge J.N." (45).



Using sources like letters, Quaker wills, and Friends' own testimonies, Gragg pieces together a remarkable history of a colonial people who "left no birth, marriage, or death records" (59). He ably demonstrates that these colonial English Friends—who numbered an estimated 1200 at the height of their island presence—were both like and unlike their Puritan and Anglican counterparts on Barbados and in New England. Like, in that they enjoyed the benefits of occasional prosperity in the colony. Unlike, due to their religious prohibitions against oath-taking, military service, and their unwillingness to provide financial support to the established church. Despite these proscriptions (and their perpetual impulses to confront local Anglicans loudly in the name of their own gospel), Friends continued to increase until their proportional representation amongst white colonists on Barbados outstripped their presence in England by more than six to one (61).

It is the Quakers' position amongst this privileged group of white colonists that Gragg attends to most movingly. Quakers arrived on Barbados just as many of the principal doctrines of the Society of Friends were solidifying, but they migrated many decades before the Friendly testimony against slaveholding began. Most Quakers on Barbados, like their counterparts to the north, were active participants in the slave trade. George Fox himself, the founder of the Quakers, visited Barbados in 1671 and spoke and wrote extensively on the subject of slavery. Gragg shows clearly that Fox was concerned by what he saw on the island and called on Friends to consider enslaved people as members of their own families. He urged Quakers not only to treat their slaves humanely, but also to make every attempt to convert them—a goal that was both frightening and illegal in the eyes of many fellow slaveholders on the island. Fox even suggested that Quakers might plan for eventual manumission after a period of "thirty years servitude" (134). Gragg seems to suggest that Barbados may well have served as an important crucible for later Quaker views on abolition. Quaker efforts to convert enslaved people and to agitate for their right to worship were feared and despised by colonial authorities, who expected rebellion to follow. But Gragg is realistic, too—the Quakers, like their fellow colonists, remained largely complicit in the ideologies of race and biblical interpretation that propped up the brutal system of slavery on the island.

Like their endeavors to ameliorate slavery, Quaker society on Barbados eroded and faltered. The thriving community on Barbados was ravaged by disease and worn away by migration—the promise of

an easier and simpler life in the Quaker colony to the north was irresistible for many. In this book, Gragg has unveiled their presence and their significance. He successfully argues that Friends on Barbados are not only a crucial component of transatlantic Quakerism in its earliest decades, but also an unmistakable and often noisy counterpoint to the dominant English expectations in this sunny clime.

Jennifer Lockard Connerley

James Madison University

***Encountering Revolution: Haiti and the Making of the Early Republic.***

By Ashli White. (Baltimore, MD: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2010. Acknowledgements, notes, essay on sources, index. Pp. ix, 280. \$55 cloth.)

Ashli White makes a strong contribution toward understanding the Haitian Revolution's political impact on the United States with her well-organized, well-written book, *Encountering Revolution*. In a work that will engage scholars of Atlantic revolutions, the early national United States, and social, cultural, and political aspects of American slavery and abolition, White examines the public and private responses of Americans to the flight of some 25,000 whites, enslaved blacks, and free "people of color" from the French Caribbean colony of Saint-Domingue to the United States between 1791 and 1809, and the political consequences of interactions between refugees and residents.

Since the early twentieth century, studies have attempted to place Saint-Dominguan migrants to the United States in historical context. Works like Frances Sergeant Childs's *French Refugee Life in the United States, 1790–1800: An American Chapter of the French Revolution* (1940) argued that while some refugees assimilated into American society, the vast majority, disenchanted with life in the United States, eventually returned to France. More comprehensive recent studies like Alfred N. Hunt's *Haiti's Influence on Antebellum America: Slumbering Volcano in the Caribbean* (1988) have examined the Haitian Revolution's impact on culture, race relations, and politics in the United States. In light of Haiti's bicentennial, recent conferences have produced a number of essays on topics relating the Revolution to developments in the United States. Among the works featuring these essays are *The Impact of the Haitian Revolution in the Atlantic World* (2001), and *The World of the Haitian Revolution* (2009), the latter featuring an essay by White.



In *Encountering Revolution*, White distinguishes her work from social or demographic studies of the refugees while at the same time ably using these elements to provide a foundation for her arguments that “exiles forced Americans to confront the paradox of being a slaveholding republic” even as the Haitian revolution itself “bolstered and rationalized American slavery and racism” (2). American national identity was part of the “paradox” that White analyzes, and she argues that the Haitian Revolution provided an opportunity for both black and white Americans to define that identity.

Contextualizing her study in the larger historiography of the early republic, White does not claim that the Haitian Revolution alone influenced discourse on race, slavery or national identity. The heart of White’s political analysis lies in connections between the Haitian Revolution and American discourse on republicanism, with debate influenced not only by events in France and Saint-Domingue, but by the presence of exiles from those locales. Her use of a variety of sources—letters, newspaper articles, and government documents such as the Alien Reports required in the aftermath of the 1798 Alien and Sedition Acts—is especially useful to this end. White examines the influence of interactions among refugees and residents on different aspects of republican ideology, emphasizing how such interactions, and fears of residents regarding the importation of slave rebellion, helped redefine republicanism in its American framework.

Acknowledging the many influences on republicanism during this period, White teases out the relationship between these influences, the presence of refugees, and the events of the Haitian Revolution itself. Refugees with a variety of political outlooks arrived in the United States. These refugees made use of, and in many cases helped expand, the public sphere as they attempted to present themselves as true representatives of republican ideals (a task that required royalists and other colonists to discredit Saint-Domingue’s revolutionary government), while portraying their political opponents as fanatics or reactionaries. White effectively portrays this heated debate as having an unintended effect on American audiences, in that it lessened sympathy for the refugees. This debate had significance for American politics too, with Federalists using it to stress the folly of political factionalism, and Jeffersonian Republicans tempering their support for revolutionary republicanism in the belief “that the future of the U.S. republic depended on white solidarity” (112).

In their efforts, Republicans were countering what they viewed as “the contagion of rebellion,” the title of White’s fourth chapter



(124). While this chapter touches on debates familiar to historians of abolition in the early republic, relating the views of writers like Abraham Bishop and St. George Tucker, its treatment of the actions of enslaved Saint-Dominguans in the United States is nuanced and insightful. The range of motives driving enslaved migrants—the threat of violence, loyalty to masters or family—was lost on many white Americans who mistakenly viewed slaves from Saint-Domingue as agents of revolt. Many black Americans also made their own uses of the Revolution, with free blacks inspired to speak out against the racist structures of early national politics and society, and enslaved blacks creating opportunities to gain their own freedom, whether through escape, or less frequently, violence.

White argues that American fears of imported slave revolt were further expressed and acted upon after passage of the 1807 federal law banning the Atlantic slave trade. The enforcement of this law (and similar state laws previously ignored) by southern states came into play with the arrival of a last wave of some 10,000 refugees in 1809 after their expulsion from Cuba some five years after the declaration of Haitian independence. While these fears of the “specter of Haiti” were ultimately not enough to bar these refugees from keeping their slaves, White uses the episode to illustrate the continuing role that such fears would play in American politics, even after the Civil War.

Through her focus on republican ideology, White convincingly argues for the long-lasting impact of the Haitian Revolution on American political theory and practice. Skillfully tying together developments in Saint-Domingue, France, and the United States, White’s analysis furthers our understanding of the Haitian Revolution’s significance for United States history, and provides insights on the changing nature of politics in the Atlantic world in an age of republican revolutions.

John Davies

Plattsburgh State University

*Pirate Hunter, A Novel.* By Tom Morrissey. (Minneapolis, MN: Bethany House, 2009. Pp. 352. \$13.99 paper.)

*Pirate Hunter*, by professional deep-sea diver and adventure-travel writer Tom Morrissey, interweaves two storylines: the early eighteenth century adventures of a pirate crew during the golden age of piracy, and a twenty-first century treasure hunt. Though liv-

ing centuries apart mainly in the Caribbean and Key West, the book's characters face similar challenges and circumstances that culminate in overlapping themes: love and forgiveness.

Though unlikely themes at first glance for a book involving pirates, many of Morrissey's characters are religious, while others have strained personal relationships that taint their beliefs and are working through their dilemmas. The novel evolves in part as Morrissey's characters explore faith to reconcile their past. Though some readers might avoid a novel with religious tones, Morrissey's use is relevant and well placed in plot and character.

For historical context, Morrissey researched the golden age of piracy, and in an interview with his publisher, cited his means of finding evidence: archaeological dives on Blackbeard's pirate ship *Queen Anne's Revenge*, dives to shipwrecks in the Florida Keys and interviews of historians at the North Carolina Maritime Museum, and Tortola in the British Virgin Islands.

In many cases, the research shows. Captain Henry Thatch, one of the novel's main characters, is based in part on Edward Teach, also referred to as Tash or Thatch in some references, but better known by his alias Blackbeard (David Cordingly, ed., *Pirates: terror on the high seas, from the Caribbean to the South China Sea*, 1996). Although Thatch shares some of the physical characteristics of Blackbeard, Morrissey's pirates are veritable saints compared to those of the era who frequently tortured their prisoners (Cordingly, *Pirates*).

Morrissey also draws from research about the slave trade. The novel opens with Thatch's crew commandeering a slave ship whose occupants are sold for pirate profit, a common practice in the eighteenth century. Thatch explained his decision regarding the captured slaves: "Slavery may be the devil's own commerce, but death is irreversible. So I sold them to save them, . . . and put a few farthings in our pockets" (13).

However, Thatch invites one young black slave dubbed Bold Ted to join the crew as his understudy because he speaks "the King's English," is "familiar with Scripture," and seems "to have an extremely able head" (13). Bold Ted was raised and educated by a Scotsman living in Africa, but ambushed during a chore and sold into slavery. Though some slaves joined pirate crews, often they were relegated to hard labor or lowly tasks (Cordingly, *Pirates*; Cordingly, *Under the Black Flag*, 1995) According to one report, black men didn't have weapons during an attack, revealing their status as servants. (Cordingly, *Under the Black Flag*).



## BOOK REVIEWS

261

As for the novel's style, Morrissey alternates or combines chapters to carry both storylines, successfully structuring the novel as a page-turner. And though switching from third person for one storyline to first person for another was sometimes jarring, it doesn't distract from a good read. For the adventure or action-minded reader, pirate chase scenes - as pursuer and pursued - detailing tactics and attacks are intriguing, peaking with a high-winds hurricane finale in Florida.

Edward C. Woodward

Tampa, Florida

*Railroads in the Old South: Pursuing Progress in a Slave Society.* By Aaron W. Marrs. (Baltimore, MD: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2009. Acknowledgments, Maps, Introduction, Notes, Essay on Sources, Index. Pp. xi, 268. \$55 cloth.)

In this innovative study of modernity in the Old South, Aaron Marrs seeks to go beyond the usual dichotomy linking traditionalism with Southern slavery, and modernization with Northern industry. In his thoroughly researched and well written analysis of railroads in the South, Marrs shows that southern slaveholders did manage to incorporate a certain level of modernity into their slave society. His goal is to understand how white Southerners "married conservative social ideals with forward-looking technological advancement" (7). The South got off to a fast start in building railroads in the 1830s, but fell far behind the North and West in the 1840s. Most of the southern lines were short distance connections between cotton plantation and river or ocean facilities. Few efforts were made to build systems and little attention was devoted to long-distance traffic.

Marrs emphasizes that the rapid growth in southern railroad-ing in the 1850s needs to be appreciated in terms of the region's confrontation with modernity. Instead of a chronological or narrative approach, Marrs explores four basic themes. He argues that to a large degree the railroad experience in North and South was parallel despite the differences in labor systems. The North relied on immigrants and the South relied on slaves to do jobs that most Americans were unwilling to undertake. Both regions imported their technology from Britain, and both were linked to a national program of internal improvements. Marrs' second theme is an

analysis of the difference that slavery made on southern railroads, and how the South's modernization efforts had to work around racial barriers. A third theme is the multiplicity of southern responses to railroads from many different groups. Finally, Marrs is intrigued with the question of time. He agrees that the increasing attention to punctuality and precise schedules in the South was due primarily to the railroads, but also shows that the railroaders' efforts to control and standardize time came into confrontation with other groups, ranging from the Post Office which called for Sunday trains, to the Sabbatarians, who denounced the desecration of the Sabbath. Close attention to time and precise rules in a highly bureaucratic system proved successful in preventing accidents to passengers.

Marrs approaches the labor history of the railroads from two perspectives, that of civil engineers who were trying to finish projects on schedule and within the budget, and from the workers themselves, especially the slaves. With upwards of 500 to 1,000 workers, the railroads had labor forces significantly larger than plantations, and they were spread out over long miles rather than concentrated in one location. The railroads rarely owned slaves, because of the high capital costs involved in their purchase and upkeep. Instead, railroad companies hired them from nearby plantations, and used nearly all of them for unskilled work, especially the heavy labor of construction. The planters who wanted to invest in a railroad could provide slave labor in lieu of cash. Three-fourths of the railroads in the South employed slaves, totaling over 20,000, including women and children. In the North, there was an ample supply of free labor, with more arriving by the shipload every week. In the South, however, the railroads competed directly with cotton farming, which given the very high prices in the 1850s, made it difficult to hire enough slave labor. Other historians have pointed to the importance of the Irish labor gangs in the building of the nation's railroads, but Marrs pays little attention to ethnicity, or to the uniquely Irish system of gang labor. He does report instances of intra-Irish gang fights and cases where contractors fired white workers and replaced them with slaves. Although white workers were rarely compensated for death or serious injury, the owners of slaves did receive compensation, either through specific contracts or through the action of local courts which ruled that the fellow servant rule did not apply to slaves since they were unable to bargain for higher wages in dangerous situations. On average, slaves were



## BOOK REVIEWS

263

cheaper than white labor; the wages of the slaves went to the owners but they did collect an occasional dollar for extra jobs.

Marrs does find important structural differences between the sections; for example, more than half of the investment in southern railroads came from government subsidies, compared to 25 percent nationwide. He suggests the similarities outweigh the differences, noting that in both sections, the Whig party promoted railroads, while the radical Democrats opposed them. Marrs seems uninterested in comparing the political context of North and South. Civil engineers were in short supply across the land, but they had to solve very similar challenges everywhere. He pays a good deal of attention to boosters who used three basic arguments involving technological advantages over water transport, the economic benefits to the region, and the fact that railroads would bind the nation together and divert attention away from the slavery issue to promote their cause.

The research effort is impressive, with the author employing wide reading not only in the contemporary newspapers, magazines, pamphlets, and business reports, but also the modern historiography as well. Marrs successfully synthesizes business and labor history, covering the first three decades of railroading in the South, while making frequent judicious comparisons to conditions in the North. The passengers have not been left behind, as Marrs undertakes insightful descriptions of the exciting new experience of racing along at 20 miles per hour, as the South in 1860 appeared to be on an unstoppable fast track toward modernity.

Richard Jensen

Culver-Stockton College

*Confederate Minds: The Struggle for Intellectual Independence in the Civil War South.* By Michael Bernath. (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2010. Acknowledgements, illustrations, notes, bibliography, index. Pp. xiii, 432. \$39.95 cloth).

This nicely written and well-organized book presents a wide-ranging and comprehensive survey of the writings of Confederate cultural nationalists during the Civil War. In seven mainly chronologically organized chapters, Michael Bernath, the Charleton W. Tebeau Assistant Professor of History at the University of Miami, traces what he sees as the dramatic rise and

even more abrupt collapse of a literary Confederate nationalism found in the pages of countless newspaper articles, magazines, pamphlets, and books between 1861 and 1865. Purely political writings and polemics and legal or constitutional texts are generally excluded from this treatment in favor of writings on education, literature, and intellectual life. For the most part, these cultural nationalists sought to create and deepen Southern cultural identity as the necessary foundation for political independence of the Confederacy, a struggle for intellectual independence that was an essential complement to the political and military struggles to create a new nation. Although Bernath notes these are not great or profound thinkers, he does describe the "impressive" accomplishments of the cultural nationalists, who were generally able to keep publishing and writing in the midst of war and invasion. Bernath gives due weight to the "crippling obstacles" faced by these men, but argues that overall the quest of these cultural nationalists was doomed not by these material obstacles, but by a more fundamental problem, for they were simply unable to demonstrate "southern cultural distinctiveness" or a "unique literature and culture" (287, 297).

Bernath has read and synthesized a vast array of material across the breadth of the Confederacy and the entirety of the war. As he notes, the digital revolution of the last twenty years has greatly increased access to a massive quantity of books, pamphlets, newspapers, and archival material created during the war, which has allowed historians to look beyond the major urban centers that have previously dominated discussion of Confederate culture. As Bernath's book demonstrates, one of the interesting effects has been to reveal a wider range of voices, but, as also revealed by this work, not necessarily a wider range of viewpoints, at least among those Bernath considers cultural nationalists. Indeed, there is a remarkable uniformity across these pages in the basic premises, goals, hopes, and concerns of these writers, perhaps because of the way Bernath has limited his source material by excluding from his analysis Southern Unionists and others outside his "cultural nationalist" designation. This gives a certain monolithic quality to the presentation and does not allow the analysis to range much beyond the limits of the topics and attitudes of the writings Bernath discusses. For this reason, at times one has the sense of reading a description or summary of the writings more than a full interpretation of their meanings.



## BOOK REVIEWS

265

Indeed, Bernath adopts a self-consciously antitheoretical approach, explicitly eschewing discussion of nationalism, cultural memory, subalterns, imagined communities, and the like. This is a defensible stance, but it does limit Bernath's ability to place the quest to create a culturally independent Confederate nation within the larger intellectual and political contexts of the nineteenth century. For example, the great majority of the writings discussed here defend existing institutions and sought to maintain hierarchies. Although Bernath argues that cultural nationalists were "enthusiastically inclusive when it came to gender" (9), this was almost wholly within strict separate sphere limits, as when women were sometimes deemed suitable to be school teachers because of the shortage of available men (243). Yet the successful nationalisms in the nineteenth century generally harnessed the power and enthusiasm of ever-larger spheres of society, from working class men, to women, to (in the United States to the north) groups previously excluded on racial and ethnic grounds. Without this engine of "popular" or "radical" nationalism, could the Confederate cultural nationalist enterprise founded in defense of the status quo ever hope to succeed? In one of the few passages that approaches these issues, Bernath suggests that cultural nationalists "absorbed" European romantic nationalism (288), yet romantic nationalism is often thought of as being deeply revolutionary and thoroughly imbued with democratic values. If it is the measure of nationalism, then the majority of the program outlined in these pages was not nationalist, but rather, traditionalist.

Bernath draws a distinction between the cultural nationalism of the war years, which ended with military defeat, and the "Lost Cause" mythology of the postwar years, but he does recognize some continuities across the Appomattox divide. Still, his tendency is to view the wartime cultural nationalist program as a distinct moment: its origins may have been in the antebellum era, and it may have been a foundation for some future developments, but the cultural nationalism depicted here was an episode that was decisively shaped by secession and bound up with the fortunes of war. Perhaps the greatest strength of this work is the author's impressive ability to synthesize and present a vast quantity of diverse writings. Anyone interested in the nature and fate of the Confederacy beyond the battlefield will find this thoroughly researched work to be rewarding and highly informative.

Martin P. Johnson

*Miami University Hamilton*

*The Wilderness Warrior: Theodore Roosevelt and the Crusade for America.* By Douglas Brinkley. (New York: HarperCollins Publishers, 2009. Maps, tables, index. Pp. xv, 939. \$39.39, cloth.)

Mention the name Theodore Roosevelt and scholars and history buffs alike are likely to think of trust busting, Progressivism, the Panama Canal, "big stick" diplomacy, and big game hunting. Roosevelt's love of nature and passion for wilderness conservation are well known too, particularly his efforts in the West, where as incredible as it seems today, the Grand Canyon was dismissed as a "big ditch" early in the last century by mining interests eager to exploit it.

Roosevelt protected the Grand Canyon by using his executive powers to declare it a national monument. In similar fashion, he preserved nearly two-dozen other Western treasures, from Mount Olympus in Washington to the Platt National Park in Oklahoma. He also created or enlarged 150 national forests, nearly all of them in the West. But as acclaimed historian Douglas Brinkley writes in *The Wilderness Warrior: Theodore Roosevelt and the Crusade for America*, the nation's 26<sup>th</sup> president also fought for conservation in Florida, a place he apparently visited only once. In 1898, after resigning as assistant secretary of the Navy, Roosevelt spent two months in Tampa assembling his Rough Riders for their foray into Cuba on the side of Cuban freedom fighters during the Spanish-American War.

But as Brinkley explains, Florida was critically important to Roosevelt because the state was home to an amazing variety of wading birds and migratory songbirds. Roosevelt had been an avid bird watcher since his New York boyhood. A devotee of the naturalist Charles Darwin, he educated himself through books—Darwin's 1859 treatise *On the Origin of Species* was a favorite—and a lifetime of field observations. As president, he was outraged by the plume hunting in Florida that threatened to wipe out the snowy egret and other birds whose feathers were much desired for women's hats. A pound of choice feathers was worth more than a pound of gold. "For unrepentant old Confederates and lowlifes on the lam, wild Florida's vast thickets and tangled vegetation offered not only a haven but also a source of easy income" (10), Brinkley writes.

One of the busiest bird rookeries in Florida, and choicest targets for gun-toting plumers, was a five and a half acre island in the



Indian River near Sebastian, called Pelican Island. It was teeming with flocks of wading birds—egrets, roseate spoonbills, brown pelicans—when the famed ornithologist Frank Chapman paddled around it in the 1880s. Chapman's writings about Pelican Island impressed Roosevelt who was determined to protect those endangered birds. His policy toward plumers throughout Florida was "no surrender, no retreat" (501). To Roosevelt, "the destruction of pelicans—and other nongame birds—was emblematic of industrialization run amok," Brinkley writes. "In fact, with the exception of his family, birds probably touched him more deeply than anything else in his life" (8).

Brinkley deftly weaves the story of how, in 1903, Roosevelt signed an executive order that made Pelican Island the nation's first federal bird reservation, and thereby off-limits to plume hunters. He declared 10 other Florida sites to be bird reservations, too, including Tortugas Keys west of Key West, Mosquito Inlet south of Daytona Beach, and a cluster of sites along the central Gulf coast. Roosevelt also prevented development in parts of Florida's interior by creating the Ocala National Forest in North Central Florida and Choctawatchee National Forest in the Panhandle.

And that was just Florida. During his presidency, from 1901–1909, Roosevelt preserved an astounding 234 million acres of land for future generations and saved countless species, including the bison and brown pelican, from possible extinction. One can only imagine what the country would be like if he had never lived.

Roosevelt was a prolific man of letters, which has served historians well. The author Candace Millard, in her book, *River of Doubt* (2007), said he read several thousand books during his lifetime. He compiled a massive body of work by his own pen: letters, books, journals and diaries. He wrote at least 150,000 letters, priceless primary sources that Brinkley mined for new information about the president's conservation work.

Brinkley used passages from Roosevelt's papers, dug into official archives, and interviewed living people, such as descendants of Pelican Island warden Paul Kroegel, to create an 817-page narrative about Roosevelt's work from Alaska to Florida. Thoroughly documented, the material is as engaging as it is comprehensive. The girth of the book would make it a daunting read if it had been penned by a lesser writer than Brinkley, but from his hand it flows as easily as the Indian River on a calm day around Pelican Island.

Pelican Island remains off limits to humans, but a federally owned wilderness area on the nearby beach barrier island has an observation tower and walking trails. While hiking one of the trails recently, I saw a roseate spoonbill and said a silent word of thanks to Theodore Roosevelt. I should thank Brinkley, too, for shedding more light on this amazing man and his conservation legacy.

Janie Gould

Fort Pierce, Florida

*Toward Freedom Land: The Long Struggle for Racial Equality in America.* By Harvard Sitkoff. (Lexington: University of Kentucky Press, 2010. Acknowledgments, notes, index. Pp. vii, 250. \$50 cloth.)

Over the past five decades, Harvard Sitkoff has established himself as one of the foremost voices on the black freedom struggle in the United States. *Toward Freedom Land*, a collection of his previous publications, continues that trend. Addressing his published work going back to 1969, Sitkoff presents 10 essays on subjects as varied as Harry Truman, Wendell Willkie, Martin Luther King Jr., FDR and the New Deal, racial violence, and black/Jewish relations. All of these choices share the central theme of civil rights and racial justice. The book, he explains, “is evidence of how one historian confronted and articulated some of the attitudes and issues central to civil rights history during the past five decades” (2). It is that, and much more. *Toward Freedom Land* has relatively little on the history of Florida, yet this book will be of interest to those curious about Sitkoff’s work and the history of civil rights struggles in the United States.

In “The Preconditions for Racial Change” and “The New Deal and Race Relations,” Sitkoff describes how the 1930s and 1940s served as the key building blocks for the civil rights movement. African Americans, locked out of the New Deal and America’s postwar affluence, began to fight not only for civil rights but also for social and racial justice. Sitkoff continues this theme in his two chapters on racial violence during the Second World War, noting that while blacks in northern cities battled violently against racism, southern African Americans found racial violence a stifling impediment to black progress. In his essay on Wendell Willkie and Harry Truman, Sitkoff concentrates on



## BOOK REVIEWS

269

white supporters and opponents of black rights. "Willkie as Liberal," for instance, shows how a midwestern Republican, someone who perhaps should not have been concerned with black equality, battled against entrenched racism. His piece on Harry Truman criticizes a president who, while regarded as a liberal, did relatively little for African Americans. His essay on King is similarly varied. Sitkoff shows King not as saint or savior but as radical, a leader willing to criticize the war in Vietnam long before it was popular to do so and incorporate a Marxist understanding of the world into his personal ideology and broader theology. His final essay, "The Second Reconstruction," brings this book to a satisfying conclusion by exploring the debate and passage of the Civil Rights Act of 1964.

Those familiar with Sitkoff's written work will find relatively little new in this book. While I enjoyed getting reacquainted with his essays on the Detroit Race Riot, Wendell Willkie, and the New Deal for blacks, I had read these and most of the other essays elsewhere. The one essay I was not familiar with was the one on Martin Luther King. It is a great piece, albeit a bit short and choppy. Having all of these works combined in a single book, a sort of "greatest hits" for a scholar, is the true value of this work. But for me, the most important aspect of this book came in the page or so of explanation that preceded each essay. In these and the Introduction, Sitkoff elaborates on the reception of each of his publications by the academy. He also periodizes each essay by explaining the historic context in which it was written. Moreover, he oftentimes critiques himself and his writing. For instance, Sitkoff criticizes proponents of the "long civil rights movement," a convention that he helped create: "it is one thing, I believe, to recognize forerunners or acknowledge antecedents and quite another to posit one long, continuous movement stretching back further and further in time so that, in the end, little or nothing distinguishes one era or decade from another" (93-94). To me, having never met the man, *that* is Harvard Sitkoff—an individual so committed to his craft that he willingly takes himself to task for helping craft a historical axiom that (for Sitkoff) no longer rings true. This is a nice collection of essays and a fine tribute to the career of Harvard Sitkoff.

Brian D. Behnken

*Iowa State University*

*The 57 Club: My Four Decades in Florida Politics.* By Frederick B. Karl. (Gainesville: University Press of Florida, 2010. Acknowledgements, illustrations, appendices, index. Pp. xiii, 400. \$40.00 cloth.)

“Your representative owes you, not his industry only, but his judgment; and he betrays, instead of serving you, if he sacrifices it to your opinion” (135). Quoting Edmund Burke, Frederick B. Karl succinctly states a principle central to this memoir of his public service. In *The 57 Club: My Four Decades in Florida Politics*, Karl discusses the concepts, issues, and personalities which he saw shape the modern political and economic landscape of the state from the mid-1950s to 1980. He does not attempt in a single volume to develop the breadth and depth of all critical issues in Florida during this time; instead, Karl succeeds in presenting the purpose for his actions and his impressions of, and reactions to, the challenges he confronted first in the Legislature and later on the Florida Supreme Court.

Fred Karl was elected to the Florida House of Representatives in 1956, serving eight years before an unsuccessful run for Governor. The book takes its title from “The 57 Club,” the informal name given themselves by the thirty-nine members of his freshman legislative class first elected in 1956. Karl later served a four-year term in the Florida Senate, was the first public counsel appointed to represent consumers before the Public Service Commission, was the last Justice elected to the Florida Supreme Court, and in later years served as the County Attorney and County Administrator for Hillsborough County.

Readers should not expect an exhaustive examination of Florida public policy development and political dynamics from 1956 to 1980, for that is not Karl’s intent. Although a personal memoir, the narrative would have been enriched by greater reference or detail about major issues such as the underlying movement for state constitutional reform in Florida and its impact on legislation proposed by Karl and his colleagues. This lack of depth and context, noticeable even in the best passages, is regrettable because the book readily transcends the simplistic form of memoir which focuses solely on the narrator’s personal accomplishments.

Karl plainly states his interest and motives for entering politics but quickly introduces the reader to the significant and divisive issues confronting all legislators in that era: reapportionment of



## BOOK REVIEWS

271

representation in the Florida House and Senate; the movement toward more efficient local government through the concept of home rule; quality and funding of education; whether to open governmental process to public scrutiny; and above all, integration in the wake of *Brown v. Board of Education*.

Writing for the average reader interested in the history of Florida politics, Karl frequently introduces issues with a brief description of the historical or legal context in which they arose. His familiarity with the Florida Constitutions of 1885 and 1968 grounds the reader in the legal authority underlying his actions and decisions as well as those of his contemporaries in the Legislature. The narrative is topical, addressing together similar issues and personalities over a related time frame but then moving chronologically forward or backward to examine another theme. For example, the second chapter gives Karl's impressions of Leroy Collins, Dempsey Barron, and other individuals he knew over the course of his legislative career, moving forward into the 1960s and 1970s. The third chapter moves back to describe the Tallahassee environment of the 1950s Karl encountered early in his legislative career. Later chapters move from his 1964 gubernatorial campaign directly to the 1976 election for the Florida Supreme Court, then back to the operation of the Legislature of some twenty years' prior.

Karl's approach appears calculated to provide the reader with cogent summaries of the plethora of topics arising during his public career and for the most part succeeds in evoking the tenor of each time. Parts 1 and 2, comprising the first ten chapters, treat the factors affecting Karl and his early contemporaries as they began their legislative service and are the best sections of the book. Weaving crucial issues, biographical sketches, legislative operations, and political observations, Karl not only describes but explains this formative period in Florida government. Although falling occasionally into redundant introductions of characters already discussed, Karl never waivers from his goal of using the past to inform the present. This focus is best seen in his use and reference to the 57 Club as a narrative device, moving from one key individual to the next within a larger context of an issue, such as integration, or a legislative operation, such as committee service. The later chapters are more uneven as Karl treats certain events in relative isolation from others. This change in tone is shown by the relative absence of the 57 Club as a narrative device, reflecting its

actually diminished role in Florida politics. Combined with the lower level of detailed analysis, the narrative tends to drag in the final chapters.

Nevertheless, *The 57 Club* is a significant and welcome addition to the history of Florida government and politics. Fred Karl provides an insider's comprehension and insight into key policies which are invaluable to understanding the development of the state. He reminds the reader of a time past when many in public office took seriously the duties and power entrusted to them by the voters, when the general welfare of the citizens predominated over political ideology. Those seeking to learn more about Florida politics in the 1950s and '60s will find this book an excellent introduction to those times. Scholars of history or politics will find Karl's recollections add depth and grace to analyses of this era. Florida legal scholars should find this book on their shelves—a fitting capstone to a life of integrity in public service.

Eric H. Miller

Florida State University

*Negotiating Paradise: U.S. Tourism and Empire in Twentieth-Century Latin America.* By Dennis Merrill. (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2009. Illustrations, notes, bibliography, index. Pp. xvi, 352. \$65.00 cloth, \$22.50 paper.)

In the spring of 2001, Dennis Merrill published an innovative study of tourism development in Puerto Rico, "Negotiating Cold War Paradise: U.S. Tourism, Economic Planning, and Cultural Modernity in Twentieth-Century Puerto Rico," in the journal, *Diplomatic History*. This article represented a growing trend in the history of foreign relations to analyze the impact of culture and soft power against the backdrop of diplomatic relations. The recent release of his book, *Negotiating Paradise*, sets the standard for future evaluations of tourism as a reflection of relationships between hosts, visitors, and governments in the Caribbean basin. Merrill's book is the first monograph-length study of tourism in the Caribbean basin viewed through the lens of diplomatic history. This perspective allows Merrill to explore a multifaceted web of relationships between states, hosts, and visitors in various contexts of the tourism industry. Merrill deftly organizes discussions of developments in the tourist industry, which included various multi-



## BOOK REVIEWS

273

national companies such as Pan American Airways and Hilton International Hotels. On a second level, Merrill examines the actions and reactions of national tourism organizations in Mexico, Cuba, and Puerto Rico, paying particular attention to the ways in which they responded to local and international reactions to their shaping of tourism. Finally, Merrill skillfully examines the relationship between international tourists (mainly Americans) and their hosts in Mexico, Cuba, and Puerto Rico during the twentieth century. The author then places these multiple negotiations within the context of U.S.-Latin American relations. While the results of negotiation within the cultural corridors of tourism did not always mirror official opinions or actions, Merrill demonstrates how hosts and visitors shaped and influenced identities and perceptions of each other and their respective nations.

Given the importance of *Negotiating Paradise* for Caribbean Studies in general, Floridian readers, particularly those interested in tourism development, would profit from its study. Florida generally served as a critical point of comparisons for Cubans, Mexicans, and Puerto Ricans in their development of a tourism industry. In essence, Florida served as a catalyst for tourism throughout the basin and a study of Caribbean tourism development serves as a broader understanding of regional patterns. Those familiar with Floridian tourism development will gain a better understanding of how tourism grew throughout the basin, as well as the patterns of negotiation and accommodation that defined its nearest competitors.

In terms of style and substance, *Negotiating Paradise* is sophisticated and nuanced. Merrill has made a thorough investigation of the relevant archives throughout the region, supplementing what was previously understood about tourism development in host nations. A study of tourist postcards, for example, illuminated tourist attitudes in Mexico in the 1920s and 1930s. In terms of content and scope, Merrill begins his analysis in the wake of the Mexican Revolution, as more Americans traveled south in search of vice or cultural enlightenment. The efforts of diplomats, including Dwight D. Morrow, to recognize the value of Mexico's rich cultural identity forged greater binational unity, despite the culture of vice promoted by Americans seeking enjoyment south of the border during Prohibition. As Merrill notes, "Tourism's soft powers by no means single-handedly caused the modest U.S.-rapprochement, but growing cultural and consumer interaction inherent to

travel brought the two nations closer together culturally" (62). In similar fashion, during the 1930s, Mexican president Lazaro Cardenas and his administration used tourism promotion and development to better align Mexico's identity among tourists with the ideals of the Mexican Revolution, which included promoting Mexico's indigenous identity and cultural heritage. Such a process further enhanced Mexican identity in the wake of Cardenas's expropriation of American oil companies in the late 1930s, contributing to an appreciation of Mexican autonomy. These developments, the author notes, "improved relations between Mexico and the United States, and helped both countries adapt to an increasingly ominous and interdependent world order" (68). Furthermore, Merrill's recounting of Franklin Delano Roosevelt's personal, as well as professional, interest in Mexican culture further underscores the strengthening of binational relations during a tense period.

In contrast, Merrill demonstrates in his two chapters on Cuban tourism development during the post-World War II era that Fulgencio Batista's mafia-dominated management of Cuban tourism undermined the ability of Cubans to assert a respectable identity in the onslaught of pleasure-seeking tourists who conflated vice with Cuban tourism and character. In contrast to the Mexican example, Merrill contends, the willingness of the Batista regime to allow transnational companies and American tourists to dictate the nature of Cuban tourism encouraged many Cubans to sympathize with the 26<sup>th</sup> of July Movement, which would reassert respectability and host-participation in Cuba's tourism offerings (135). "Tourism and culture clash caused neither the Cuban Revolution nor the collapse in U.S.-Cuban relations that followed," Merrill writes, "But the cultural discourses that arose from the visitor-host relationship ran through both societies and shaped the way their citizens perceived, analyzed, and dreamed of each other" (174).

In the final chapters of *Negotiating Paradise*, Merrill contextualizes Puerto Rican host-visitor relations against the backdrop of the tourism development efforts of the island's government. In contrast to Cuba, Merrill contends that Puerto Rican officials were better able to limit the economic impact of tourism on the island's economic portfolio. Furthermore, like Mexican administrations in the 1930s, island governments utilized cultural tourism, namely the rehabilitation of Old San Juan, and African and indigenous



BOOK REVIEWS

275

cultural traditions and symbols as tools to reposition discourse over island identity that had traditionally been couched in the context of poverty and modernization. As a result, Merrill contends, "Rather than being swallowed by U.S. and transnational power, Puerto Rico had negotiated a modicum of economic and cultural independence despite its commonwealth political status" (238).

In sum, *Negotiating Paradise* is required reading for those interested in the development of tourism in Latin America, cultural enthusiasts who would better appreciate the intersection of diplomacy and the use of soft power, and students of Latin American history. Through a masterful blend of theoretical interpretation, the thoughtful use of accounts gleaned from archives, and a thorough understanding of U.S.-Latin American relations, Merrill has created a standard that will remain relevant for years to come in the fields of foreign relations and tourism development.

Evan R. Ward

*Brigham Young University*