Bigger is better? a comparative study of humanitarian efforts of international organizations in Haiti

2011

Crisely Melecio Zambrano

University of Central Florida

Find similar works at: https://stars.library.ucf.edu/honorstheses1990-2015

University of Central Florida Libraries http://library.ucf.edu

Part of the International and Area Studies Commons

Recommended Citation

https://stars.library.ucf.edu/honorstheses1990-2015/1160

This Open Access is brought to you for free and open access by STARS. It has been accepted for inclusion in HIM 1990-2015 by an authorized administrator of STARS. For more information, please contact lee.dotson@ucf.edu.
BIGGER IS BETTER?

A COMPARATIVE STUDY OF HUMANITARIAN EFFORTS OF INTERNATIONAL ORGANIZATIONS IN HAITI

by

CRISELY MELECIO-ZAMBRANO

A thesis submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the Honors in the Major Program in International and Global Studies in the College of Sciences and in The Burnett Honors College at the University of Central Florida Orlando, Florida

Spring Term 2011

Thesis Chair: Dr. Houman Sadri
ABSTRACT

This thesis conducts a comparative study of international organizations in regard to their effectiveness towards addressing humanitarian concerns in Haiti. The three case studies are the operations of the United Nations, Catholic Relief Services, and REBUILD Globally, predominantly after the January 2010 quake. The hypothesis supported in this study is that the services of smaller organizations prove to be more successful than larger NGOs, although they do not have the immense resources of organizations such as the United Nations. The independent variables are type and quantity of funding, form of humanitarian work, and duration of support. All three variables establish the degree of overall effectiveness of the organization. This topic is significant because NGOs are rising in importance and influence in the international community as the average individual can now be involved in the foreign arena. It is important to study what is truly effective in humanitarian aid rather than assuming ‘the bigger the better.’
DEDICATION

For the people of Haiti, who stole my heart and gave me the passion and purpose for this study.

For my family, including roommates and friends, who never let me lose sight of why I learn.

And for God, who allows me to be in communion with everyone I encounter.

Mesi Bon Dye Mesi
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I express all my sincere gratitude to my committee members, Dr. Houman A. Sadri, Dr. Robert L. Bledsoe, Dr. Kevin Meehan, and Dr. Marie Léticée, who have challenged me to think critically in viewing the world from increasingly new perspectives, and who were always willing to impart their wisdom. Their help never went by unnoticed, most especially to my committee chair, Dr. Sadri who unceasingly encouraged me every step of the way.

Also, I wish to thank the United Nations, Catholic Relief Services, and REBUILD Globally staff each of which contributed greatly to my research and allowed me to ask my many questions. I am particularly thankful for the REBUILD artisans, who gave me the opportunity to step in their shoes and see through their eyes.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABSTRACT ........................................................................................................................... iii
DEDICATION ........................................................................................................................... iv
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS ......................................................................................................... v
TABLE OF CONTENTS ....................................................................................................... vi
LIST OF FIGURES ............................................................................................................... viii
ABBREVIATIONS ............................................................................................................... ix
LIST OF TERMS .................................................................................................................. ix

## CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION ...................................................................................... 1

- Thesis and Main Argument ............................................................................................... 1
- Significance of Topic ........................................................................................................ 2
- Literature on the Topic .................................................................................................... 3
- Contribution to Literature ............................................................................................... 8
- Research Design ............................................................................................................... 9
- Overview of Haiti ............................................................................................................ 10

## CHAPTER 2: THE UNITED NATIONS CASE STUDY ........................................... 13

- Introduction to the United Nations .................................................................................. 13
- Finances of the United Nations (MINUSTAH and OCHA): ........................................... 15
- Type of Involvement ....................................................................................................... 18
- Commitment of Time ...................................................................................................... 21
- Conclusion ...................................................................................................................... 24

## CHAPTER 3: CATHOLIC RELIEF SERVICES CASE STUDY ................................... 27

- Introduction to CRS ........................................................................................................ 27
- Finances of Catholic Relief Services ................................................................................ 28
- Type of Involvement ....................................................................................................... 33
- Commitment of Time ...................................................................................................... 37
- Conclusion ...................................................................................................................... 38

## CHAPTER 4: REBUILD GLOBALLY CASE STUDY ............................................... 40

- Introduction to REBUILD Globally ................................................................................ 40
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Finances</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Type of Involvement</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commitment of Time</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER 5: CONCLUSION</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>One Year Later: Republic of NGOs</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overall Quality</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Financial Quality</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Type of Involvement Quality</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commitment Quality</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Future Research</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF REFERENCES</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
LIST OF FIGURES

Table 1: NGO Presence in Haiti ....................................................................................................................... 12
Table 2 Resources for MINUSTAH from 1 July 2010 to 30 June 2011 ......................................................... 17
Table 3 Operating Revenues for CRS .............................................................................................................. 29
Table 4 Functional Expenses for CRS 2009 .................................................................................................. 29
Table 5: CRS Financial Information for Haiti in the 5 Months After Earthquake .............................. 32
Table 6: Overall Quality Summary ............................................................................................................... 53
ABBREVIATIONS

CBO: Community Based Organization
CRS: Catholic Relief Service
MINUSTAH: United Nations Stabilization Mission in Haiti
NGO: Non-Governmental Organization
OCHA: United Nations Office for the Coordination of Humanitarian Affairs
RG: Rebuild Globally
UN: United Nations

LIST OF TERMS

*Sustainability*- the ability to sustain through the loss of external support

*Non-governmental Organization (NGO)*- a type of international organization which functions separate from any government

*Effective*- capable of accomplishing its purpose and producing long term effects
CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION

Thesis and Main Argument

On January 12, 2010 at 4:53 in the afternoon, a 7.0 magnitude earthquake struck the island nation of Haiti leading to extreme numbers of fatalities and economic losses.\(^1\) Since that moment, the world has been captivated by this country. One of the channels through which people are increasingly expressing their willingness to help is the creation of non-governmental organizations (NGOs). This thesis conducts a comparative study of international organizations in regard to their effectiveness towards addressing humanitarian concerns in Haiti, most especially subsequent to the quake. The three case studies are the United Nations, Catholic Relief Services, and REBUILD Globally. My hypothesis is that smaller organizations’ services prove to be more successful than large NGOs, although they do not have the immense resources of organizations such as the United Nations. For the purpose of this study, the thresholds for distinguishing between small, medium, and large international organizations are determined by amount of personnel. Small consists of up to 100 personnel, medium up to 500, and large up to 1000 or more.

The independent variables are type and quantity of funding, type of humanitarian work, and duration of support. Examples of these variables are non-for-profit, agricultural sustainability, and a five year plan. All three variables establish the degree of overall effectiveness of the organization. The type and quantity of funding determines effectiveness of resources to distribute

to the people. The finances will also establish how the money or resources are allocated. For example, how much of the money goes directly to the local people versus advertising or employee salaries. The form of humanitarian work affects what level of connection the organization shares with the people. It also determines whether or not the assistance is sustainable or simply for one time aid. The duration of the support demonstrates how committed an NGO is to being with the people, as well as if they can start to build a relationship with the people. Although the overall relationship is positive, more funds directly to the cause, more sustainability, more relationship and commitment cause positive effects, there are many caveats to the measurement of these variables in which there is no clear cut answer.

**Significance of Topic**

This topic is significant as NGOs are rising in influence in the international community, because they offer information for states and inter-governmental organizations, as well as bridge the gap between the individual and the state.² It is important to study what is truly effective in humanitarian aid rather than assuming ‘the bigger the better.’ As history begins to show what is beneficial for the people of the country, it should impact policy to transform into a more successful system. The United Nations has a lot of impact in states worldwide; therefore focusing on one case study in Haiti could be applied to future and current problems, especially those dealing with poverty and natural disasters. The theoretical importance of the topic is truly for the people of Haiti. The turmoil even before the January earthquakes was disturbing. Now after the fact, the disaster in Haiti rapidly increased. Because of the horrific events in January 2010, a lot of attention was drawn to the country and caused many NGOs to jump to aid in

---
humanitarian efforts. Although this is a positive trend, without studying what is beneficial versus what is not, it can be detrimental to rush to help. Also, for the general public it is vastly important to know where donations are being directed, which organizations are more effective, and which will benefit more from monetary or resource donations. I also find it important for individuals interested in mission work, volunteering abroad or related work to assist them to judge whether or not the organization they associate with is truly aiding and making a positive impact on the particular country.

**Literature on the Topic**

With the multiplication of NGOs in recent years, scholars are beginning to analyze their place within the international system. The literature that is implemented throughout this study derives mostly from 1) Primary documents from each organization, 2) External and internal evaluations, and 3) Expert studies from outside groups. These references are used throughout the study to help prevent biases from one side of the argument or the other. This provides a challenge of piecing together concrete data to develop an answer to a question that does not have a definitive response.

The first layer of analysis is dependent on the direct sources from the case studies of the UN, CRS, and REBUILD Globally. Each NGO has documents and online sources that detail the inner workings of the organization. These are essential to this thesis because they give a background of where each initiative is coming from. These documents also tend to contain facts and figures instead of subjective conclusions.

The United Nations’ primary documents include the UN charter, history of UN involvement, structure and organization of the organization, MINUSTAH reports, OCHA updates and maps,
and their official websites. Each piece of documentation adds to the story of the United Nations. The charter provides a way to measure how the institution is functioning based on their objectives and purpose. The history and structure allows a way to structure a timeline of involvement not only in Haiti, but globally. MINUSTAH reports include financial statements, which document the form in which the mission spends their funds. Both MINUSTAH and OCHA reports are a good source of knowing the statistics of damage from the quake, ways aid in implemented, and studying what those organizations view as important. Maps are another significant part of the study, and supply a better understanding of how the NGOs are distributed throughout the country, and if that is necessarily correlating with the needs.

Catholic Relief Services has similar primary documents. These include: a year-later report, updated financial statements, a pledge to donors, list of partners of CRS, documentation on current projects, and overall the CRS official website. These sources have a similar structure to their information and therefore make it easier to compare between organizations despite size difference. The 6 months later and year later reports clearly report what work has been done, and what work needs to be accomplished. CRS financial statements are easily accessible through their online system, since they want to be transparent for donors. The list of partners and current projects is also relevant to this comparison.

Since REBUILD Globally is much younger than the other two organizations, its documentation is much more limited. The documents include “A Year in Review”, which touches on everything REBUILD has been involved with since becoming involved in Haiti, as well as grant applications and fundraising websites. The official REBUILD website also
provides more background information on their involvements. During my time volunteering in Haiti, I was able to expand the site to include background on the local partner organizations.

External and internal evaluations are also a key resource. For example, it is possible to critique UN finances through studying the MINUSTAH Finance Audit. Thorough evaluations have also been conducted on OCHA, supporting the conclusion of the importance of partnering with CBOs. These studies are also conducted through peer-reviewed articles such as the following.

“Sustainability and Peace Building: A Key Challenge” by Kirsti Samuels focuses on the United Nations. This literature points out the challenge that international peace-building attempts face of creating long-lasting or sustainable effects. The paper goes about this by illustrating the various UN missions, including Haiti (the UN’s ninth mission). The article concludes that sustainable change requires three types of fronts:

a) transformation of the society from one that resorts to violence to one that resorts to political means to resolve conflict, requiring that the elite negotiate and that there should be widespread social dialogue and reconciliation; (b) reform of the governance framework to seek to ensure both that a negotiated governance arrangement between parties prevents future conflict and the adoption of basic democratic governance; and (c) the creation of meaningful institutions that will be sustainable after the mission leaves.\(^3\)

In 2006, Todd Howland wrote “Peacekeeping and Conformity with Human Rights Law: How MINUSTAH Falls Short in Haiti”. This article focuses on the case study of the UN in Haiti to illustrate how peace operations are not effective. Howland uses the examples of the United Nations’ discrepancies between theory and practice. He also demonstrates how the allocation of money and disputes within the UN bureaucrats themselves, do not match up with the United Nations.

Nations statements on what needs to be changed such as violations of economic, social and cultural rights. In conclusion, the paper states that human rights law is a solution to the gap between UN theory and practice.\(^4\)

On the other hand, “A Day of Dawning Peace in Haiti”, an interview with the head of MINUSTAH Juan Gabrial Valdés, sees the UN operation through more positive light.\(^5\) The article was written shortly after the February 2006 elections in Haiti. MINUSTAH and the Organization of American States aided in the process. Valdés stated that MINUSTAH was given the tasks of stabilization of the country, and support for the domestic government during free elections. He also stated that the main cause for the lack of infrastructure in Haiti is poor governance. This also led to lack of a sense of community and faith in the institutions.\(^6\)

Information about my second case study of Catholic Relief Services (CRS) is also documented in literature. The article “Investment Analysis and Budget Allocation at Catholic Relief Services” evaluates the distribution of funds for this particular organization. As illustrated in the paper, CRS, just as any humanitarian relief effort, faces many challenges in distribution of funding. This literature also provides a mathematical model and spreadsheet tool, which is later used in this study to demonstrate the allocation of funds. The article states that this model will

---


\(^6\) Ibid.
help ensure fairness in the distribution process. Also, since the use of this model, CRS recognizes many improvements in the planning process.  

Along with this report, *Bridging the Gaps: Faith-Based Organizations, Neoliberalism, and Development in Latin America and the Caribbean* was also published in 2009. This book attempts to narrow the gap in literature of faith-based organizations and how their proliferation has affected development. The book is divided into several case studies. The most related is “Encouraging Development ‘Alternatives’: Grassroots Church Partnering in the U.S. and Haiti” by Tara Hefferan. Ultimately, the book shows the difference small scale local initiatives can impart. Also, the literature calls to mind that per capita income is not the only factor in determining development of a nation-state.

Furthermore, important findings in literature show the struggle of small NGOs in Haiti after the earthquake. “Haiti’s Excluded” by Reed Lindsay reports that, after the earthquake, international relief efforts by small, local nongovernmental organizations have faced many challenges in providing relief for the homeless victims. For example, since the Port-au-Prince, Haiti airport is controlled by the United States government, planes delivering military troops and

---


supplies have priority. Also, many relief agencies are required to have U.S. or United Nations troops present for distribution of aid.\textsuperscript{9}

Other expert studies also include findings from the United States Institute of Peace publications on the current developments in Haiti. These studies, or PeaceBriefs, play a role in this study because each study includes recommendations for bettering the situation. The studies include “What Role for the United Nations in Haiti?”, “What is in Haiti’s Future?”, and “The International Donors Conference and Support for Haiti’s Future”.

In sum, the available research on NGOs’ humanitarian work tends to be biased depending on the author. For example, if an article sponsored by the UN or CRS is published on their website, it will tend to highlight all of the positive achievement that they have accomplished. On the other hand, articles against UN or large NGO involvement tend to be quite opinionated. Paul Farmer writes, “Haiti may capture the headlines of the American popular press, but understanding of what is at stake here remains, at best, persistently superficial. At worst, journalistic writing about Haiti distorts events and processes in predictable ways, helping to perpetuate a series of peculiarly potent myths about Haiti and Haitians.”\textsuperscript{10} To find a balance, this thesis attempts to focus more on the primary sources and supported articles.

**Contribution to Literature**

Overall, although the literature is widespread it typically falls within two types of analysis: specific studies of an individual impactful international organizations, and NGOs as a whole,


with an emphasis on large organizations. The gap in literature that will be covered by this study is highlighting how the various sized organizations connect and compare with one another. Although there is a wide array of information and writing on specific large NGOs and their effectiveness, there is not much information on the smaller scale organizations and if they are truly making a difference in the long run. For example, many articles and books have been written about the United Nations, the Red Cross, and the Peace Corps and their general accountability and positive or negative effect, but if they are simply being compared to other large NGOs, how can they be expected to better their policies and humanitarian work? Also, simply diving deeper into the topic of smaller NGOs enters into relatively unmarked territory to see if small scale groups really make a difference. Moreover, there is a discrepancy with the literature of before and after January 12, 2010. This study aims to help bridge that gap as well as further the study of international organization crisis relief development.

**Research Design**

The research design is divided into three main case studies. After an introduction to the situation in Haiti, the research begins with a study of the United Nations (UN). This is the representation of a very large international organization. The chapter explores compiled research of UN involvement in Haiti, especially in their MINUSTAH stability mission and OCHA humanitarian efforts. Also, the section is divided into financial, project, and longevity specifics. The second segment is a culmination of research on Catholic Relief Services (CRS) and their involvement in Haiti. This non-profit is also researched with the same specifics. CRS represents the middle scale NGO. The third case study is REBUILD Globally. REBUILD represents the small scale grassroots international organization. It is a non-profit organization based in Port-au-
Prince, Haiti. Since it is a smaller organization, research will depend more on personal interaction with the NGO rather than established literature. Overall, this analysis relies not only on current literature, but also on field work from personal travel to Haiti including interaction with all three organizations. Lastly, the thesis concludes with a summary of findings and relevant conclusions. This includes a return to the original hypothesis and future questions that have risen from the study.

**Overview of Haiti**

The Republic of Haiti has a population of 9,923,243 and is divided into 10 Départments and 140 Communes. Haiti shares the island of Hispaniola with the Dominican Republic. Recognized as the poorest country in the western hemisphere, people easily forget its rich past. In the 17th century, Haiti was the wealthiest country in the Caribbean, through slave trade, sugar production, and forestry industries. This island state was a colony of France, and still has obvious evidence of this legacy, such as the official language of French alongside Haitian Creole. After a slave revolt first led by Toussaint L’ouverture, Haiti was established as the first independent Black republic in the year 1804. Despite this impressive history, Haiti has struggled through political instability and violence. Haitians endured multiple violent dictatorships, most notably the Duvalier family: Papa Doc and Baby Doc. More recently, Haiti had their first democratically elected president, Jean- Bertrand Aristide exiled. Currently, Haiti’s president is Rene Preval, but heated elections are currently taking place.11

However, the history of Haiti cannot be examined solitarily. The Haitian story is inundated with foreign involvement, not only in original colonization from France. Amidst

---

Germany, Britain and France, the United States has been the most influential in shaping the Haitian economic and political policy. Between 1870 and 1913, US participation in the Haitian market doubled.\textsuperscript{12} From 1915-1934, the United States Marine Corps invaded Haiti, with the stated intention of assisting in better governance. \textit{The New York Times} reported on the event at the time by promoting: “It was almost hopeless to expect an orderly government to be established without [military intervention] on the part of the United States.”\textsuperscript{13} This type of explanation was sadly used to excuse future US intervention as well. United States foreign policy towards Haiti is heavily contested by Haitian and international scholars, because of instances such as the Marines’ heavy hand in pushing for pro-US laws such as permitting foreign ownership of land.\textsuperscript{14} The tie between these two states continues to be strong, especially because of President Clinton’s focus on Haiti relations.\textsuperscript{15} It is significant to recognize this past in studying international organizations, because it is important to question whose interests are being addressed in foreign aid.

The earthquake devastated Haiti in every degree. According to OCHA records, there were 3,725,615 people living in the areas affected by the quakes, and 482,349 of those left the Port-au-Prince area to move to rural areas. The death toll rose to an estimated 222,650 with 310,930 reported injured. Schools, homes, hospitals, churches were in pieces. The already present problems of ecological deforestation, unemployment, and water management were only augmented through the crisis. It is in this atmosphere that NGOs have flooded to try to aid. The following table is a glance at the amount of international aid present in Haiti, and where it is

\begin{table}
\centering
\begin{tabular}{|l|c|}
\hline
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Amount of Aid</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>United States</td>
<td>50,000,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>United Kingdom</td>
<td>20,000,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>France</td>
<td>10,000,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Germany</td>
<td>5,000,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Japan</td>
<td>2,000,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>87,000,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
\hline
\end{tabular}
\end{table}

\textsuperscript{13} Ibid, 80.
\textsuperscript{14} Ibid, 80.
\textsuperscript{15} Ibid, 172.
concentrated. With an estimated 10,000 NGOs before the quake, the presence of international support groups in Haiti must be studied in order to be more effective\textsuperscript{16}.

Table 1: *NGO Presence in Haiti*


\textsuperscript{17} “Haiti: Cluster Activities- What Where.” OCHA. Feb 2011. www.haiti.humanitarianresponse.info
CHAPTER 2: THE UNITED NATIONS CASE STUDY

Introduction to the United Nations

The United Nations (UN) is an international organization with 192 member states established in 1945 with the purpose of “maintaining international peace and security, developing friendly relations among nations and promoting social progress, better living standards and human rights.” The organization began after WWI in an attempt to sustain peace. The United Nations is present all over the globe, and is currently leading 16 various peacekeeping operations. The UN is structured into six main organs established by the charter: the General Assembly, the Security Council, the Economic and Social Council, the Trusteeship Council, the International Court of Justice, and the Secretariat. Each of those sectors is then divided into many committees. The headquarters for five of the six organs of the UN are in New York, New York. The International Court of Justice is based at The Hague, Netherlands.

The United Nations serves as the first case study in this academic work because of its immense volume and presence. On a larger scale, the UN is often used as the basis of comparison for other nongovernmental organizations because of the amount of NGOs aligned

---


19 Ibid.


with it. The focus of this analysis is the UN’s operation in Haiti. This peace keeping operation is known as the United Nations Stabilization Mission in Haiti (Mission des Nations Unis pour la Stabilisation en Haiti) or MINUSTAH. According to UN reports, the mission currently has 8,645 troops, 3,105 police, 470 international civilians, 1,222 local civilians, and 220 UN volunteers. To this day, there have been 159 UN fatalities since the mission was established in June 2004 by the Security Council Resolution 1542. MINUSTAH also has a commitment authority of $380,000,000 (gross) from 07/10–12/10. Besides the security mission, the UN is also present through the UN Office for the Coordination of Humanitarian Affairs (OCHA). OCHA provides aid through the form of food, education, health, water sanitation, camp coordination, and various other projects.

The following analysis of UN humanitarian efforts in Haiti is measured by quantity and type of funding, type of work and projects, and timeline of involvement. Each measurement will permit a basis of comparison for overall effectiveness and quality. Overall the results show that the United Nations, as a large organization, has its strength in numbers, while in the same instance its shortcomings also draw from the same cause.

---


24 Ibid.

Finances of the United Nations (MINUSTAH and OCHA):

First of all, integral to understanding the effectiveness of MINUSTAH are the logistics of monetary funding. Funding is the logical channel through which most organizations operate and decide types of projects and timelines of involvement. Resources for MINUSTAH are handled in the same manner as other United Nations peacekeeping missions over the globe. By far, the United Nations has more funding than either one of the remaining case studies in this research. The U.N. is also unique because it acquires its funds from member state’s respective governments. These funds are allocated in two main ways. First, and where over half of the finances originate from, are voluntary contributions. The remaining resources come from “assessed resources”, meaning the required membership dues of each member state. The level of these assessed resources is determined by the member states. These contributions fund the United Nations’ budget, its specialized agencies, and the International Atomic Energy Agency (which works alongside the U.N. to better peaceful uses of energy).

U.N. peacekeeping operations such as MINUSTAH are financed in three ways. 1) The General Assembly forms a separate account for the operation in which every member state is required to contribute a certain percentage of the project. 2) Also, states can chose to voluntarily donate to a specific peacekeeping mission. 3) Lastly, two of the U.N. peacekeeping operations are funded from the general U.N. budget. The funding for peacekeeping varies from the regular U.N. budget because of the assumption that more developed countries are better suited to

---


27 Ibid.

28 Ibid.
contribute to these missions than lesser developed countries.\textsuperscript{29} Also, the permanent members of the Security Council are also expected to bear more responsibility for keeping the international peace and security. While on the other hand, member states that are affected or involved in the events or actions leading to a peacekeeping operation are given special consideration.\textsuperscript{30}

Funding for U.N. peacekeeping in Haiti has a unique history, because of the development of the operations in Haiti. U.N. involvement in Haiti transformed from a peacemaking task force, to a peacekeeping mission, to a mainly U.N. trust fund financed mission. The trust fund came about by the cooperation of the United States and Canada to contribute to Haiti’s stability. Both states would benefit from Haiti stabilization; U.S. because of proximity, and Canada because of immigration.\textsuperscript{31} This trust fund was very beneficial, because as U.N. members are increasingly lagging in peacekeeping contributions, the operation was able to rely on the allotted finances.\textsuperscript{32}

Currently, MINUSTAH funding is categorized and funneled into many different projects and services. According to the United Nations report of finances of peacekeeping missions, the following records the most recent division and amount of resources. Note that the highest spending is in military and police personnel costs, followed by civilian personnel costs, and facilities and infrastructure (refer to Table 2).


\textsuperscript{30} Ibid, 400.

\textsuperscript{31} Ibid.

\textsuperscript{32} Ibid.
Table 2 *Resources for MINUSTAH from 1 July 2010 to 30 June 2011*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Funding (US Dollars)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Military and police personnel costs</td>
<td>191 108 500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Civilian personnel costs</td>
<td>77 010 800</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Operational requirements:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Government-provided personnel</td>
<td>725 600</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Consultants</td>
<td>107 500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Official travel</td>
<td>914 600</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Facilities and infrastructure</td>
<td>52 120 900</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Ground transportation</td>
<td>6 423 600</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Air transportation</td>
<td>15 121 600</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Naval transportation</td>
<td>658 200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Communications</td>
<td>13 515 900</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Information technology</td>
<td>3 502 200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Medical</td>
<td>4 893 000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Special equipment</td>
<td>2 177 900</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Other supplies, services and Equipment</td>
<td>6 719 700</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Quick-impact projects</td>
<td>5 000 000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Staff assessment income</td>
<td>8 219 900</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Net requirements</strong></td>
<td><strong>371 780 100</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Gross requirements</strong></td>
<td><strong>380 000 000</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The other arm of the UN in Haiti is OCHA. This humanitarian involvement is funded by sundry benefactors. After the quake, OCHA has received a majority of their relief funds from these donors. Donors include: European Commission on Humanitarian Aid, and specific countries such as Canada, Denmark, and the Democratic Republic of Congo. These donations have totaled over 1.1 Billion US dollars not including pledges\(^{34}\). OCHA’s funding differs from MINUSTAH, because only five percent of its budget from the UN Secretariat, while the rest is given by member states and other supportive groups.\(^{35}\)

**Type of Involvement**

Secondly, the following variable for effectiveness is type of efforts. What are the time, resources, and effort being directed towards? According to the Security Council resolution 1542 of April 30, 2004, MINUSTAH’s mandate is:

- to support the Transitional Government in ensuring a secure and stable environment; to assist in monitoring, restructuring and reforming the Haitian National Police; to help with comprehensive and sustainable Disarmament, Demobilization and Reintegration (DDR) programmes; to assist with the restoration and maintenance of the rule of law, public safety and public order in Haiti; to protect United Nations personnel, facilities, installations and equipment and to protect civilians under imminent threat of physical violence; to support the constitutional and political processes; to assist in organizing, monitoring, and carrying out free and fair municipal, parliamentary and presidential elections; to support the Transitional Government as well as Haitian human rights institutions and groups in their efforts to promote and protect human rights; and to monitor and report on the human rights situation in the country.\(^{36}\)


\(^{35}\)“OCHA Funding.” Last updated 2010.


\(^{36}\)Ibid. 2-3.
As the problems on the ground have changed, so have the goals and projects of MINUSTAH. For example, after the January 2010 earthquakes, the mandate was changed in the Security Council resolution 1927 to include immediate recovery efforts as well as augmenting the level of support.37

These projects can be generally separated into comprehensive and sustainable Disarmament, Demobilization and Reintegration, Community Violence Reduction (DDR/CVR) programs, and Quick Impact Projects (QIP). U.N. projects are unique because they are often accomplished by smaller NGOs with QIP budget funding. MINUSTAH’s DDR/CVR projects include aiding in stabilization during elections, and providing overall stability. After the quake, MINUSTAH has focused on emergency response, humanitarian relief efforts and reconstruction planning.38 These emergency response efforts include: search and rescue operations, creating field hospitals, identifying priority needs. MINUSTAH has also been working closely with United States Joint Task Force-Haiti, the Canadian Task Force, the European Union Situation Centre and the Caribbean Community to facilitate the recovery process. Humanitarian relief efforts have included: reopening the international airport with the help of U.S. Joint Task Force-Haiti; providing security for food assistance led by the World Food Programme (WFP), which has provided over 3.5M people with food assistance; implementing cash-for-work programs to reduce community violence. Reconstruction planning includes supporting the Haitian

37 Ibid. 2-3.
government in rebuilding the city through funds and personnel. MINUSTAH’s goal is to move beyond immediate relief to more sustainable development.³⁹

Overall, MINUSTAH projects are better understood not as stand-alone projects, but rather as a channel through which other NGOs and international organizations can receive support. Truly, MINUSTAH’s main purpose in Haiti is to aid in promoting stability through maintaining and propping up government efforts to better the situation in the country. However, problems arise though the process of funding DDR/CVR and QIP projects. In the 2008 Audit of Financial Management of projects in MINUSTAH, UN Office of Internal Oversight Services concluded that:

Internal controls relating to financial management of projects in MINUSTAH were inadequate and ineffective resulting in a high and unmitigated risk of executing agencies mismanaging project advances.⁴⁰

These findings indicate that there was a lack of accountability in managing projects, especially through project funding. For example, MINUSTAH distributed approximately $440,000 to staff in charge of projects who had not been designated or authorized for handling the finances, which is against Department of Peacekeeping Operation guidelines.⁴¹


⁴¹ Ibid.
OCHA initiatives represent a rather different set of projects. Involvement is divided into the following focuses: Camp Coordination/ Camp Management, Early Recovery, Education, Food, Health, Logistics, Nutrition, Protection, Shelter & Non-Food -Items (NFIs), Water, and Sanitation and Hygiene (WASH). ⁴² All of the humanitarian response was established to address a particular concern. Some highlights of the aid that OCHA has accomplished include: 95% of tent camps in Port-au-Prince are being monitored, 240,000 people were employed in the Cash for Work programs, 2,100 schools were cleared of rubble, 76,000 in hospitals received a meals the days following the earthquake, 400 partner medical organizations, directed materials from the Dominican Republic to Port-au-Prince, 144,456 tents provided 11,000 latrines built, 70,000 children admitted into feeding programs, and 104 solar lights were installed in tent cities. ⁴³ These significant statistics depict the forms of aid by the United Nations. Also, it is important to keep in mind that they are also the organization with the most funds.

Commitment of Time

The third variable in assessing effectiveness and quality of the United Nations’ efforts in Haiti is the duration of involvement. The United Nations has a diverse history in Haiti beginning long before MINUSTAH was established. The UN first became involved in Haiti in 1990 because of the request from the government of that time for aid in stabilizing the election process. Hence, United Nations Observer Group for the Verification of the Elections in Haiti (ONUVEH) was established and monitored the election process in Haiti. In 1991, there was a

---

⁴² “Haiti: One Year Later.” OCHA. 8 Jan 2011.

⁴³ Ibid, 3-4.
coup and the President of the time was removed from power. Because of the worsening situation, cooperation between United Nations and OAS led to the International Civilian Mission in Haiti (MICIVIH) in February 1993.

The following September, the U.N. Security Council established the first United Nations peacekeeping mission in Haiti which was referred to as the United Nations Mission in Haiti (UNMIH). This operation was not successful because of lack of support from local government officials, and did not follow through with its mission.44 Despite this setback, U.N. Security Council approved the deployment of over 20,000 military and police personnel consisting of individuals from sundry nations in July 1994 to aid in the return of a legitimate government in Haiti, as well as stabilizing a secure environment. Following this deployment, the United Nations maintained various peacekeeping operations beginning with the return of UNMIH in 1995, and followed by: the United Nations Support Mission in Haiti (UNSMIH), the United Nations Transition Mission in Haiti (UNTMIH), and the United Nations Civilian Police Mission in Haiti (MIPONUH) in 2000.45

The United Nations reported various forms of encouraging trends including: “the restoration of some measure of democracy, with the first peaceful handover of power between two democratically elected presidents; the growth of a multifaceted civil society; and its increasing involvement in the development of a political culture based on democratic values.”46


45 Ibid.

46 Ibid.
Logically, there were also many weaknesses during this time including continuous political strife and instability which meant that lasting reforms never prospered during this time period.

This instability fostered the violent conflict that arose in Gonaïves, Haiti and led to fighting in neighboring cities in February 2004. President Bertand Aristide left Haiti in exile during this turmoil. This armed conflict ensnared Northern Haiti, and on February 29, the U.N. Security Council, after deciding Haiti was a threat to international peace, authorized the Multinational Interim Force (MIF) established by resolution 1529. Finally, on April 30, 2004, the UN Security Council through resolution 1542 established the United Nations Stabilization Mission in Haiti (MINUSTAH).47

Since its establishment in 2004, MINUSTAH has continued commitment to Haiti. After the devastation of the January 2010 earthquake with over 220,000 deaths and serious consequences to the Haitian infrastructure, the U.N. Security Council passed resolution 1908 on January 19th to support the Secretary-General’s decision to augment MINUSTAH levels to aid in the rebuilding to Haiti.48 The Secretary-General’s semi-annual report from 22 April 2010 suggested support including an addition of 2,000 troop and 1,500 police. He also recommended that MINUSTAH would require a longer time-line and increased effort to aid the Haitian government in transitioning through a period of reconstruction. The Security Council then followed up with resolution 1927 of 4 June 2010 which sanctioned the deployment of a 680

47 “MINUSTAH Background”

police to MINUSTAH, for the time being, to focus on building the capacity of the Haitian National Police. The Security Council also authorized the temporary allowance of a military component of up to 8,940 troops and of a police component of up to 4,391 police. Through the document, the Council repeats that the main governance in Haiti needs to be by the local government, and the role of MINUSTAH is to stabilize and reinforce that institution. One of the ways to maintain this support is through continued reinforcement of the local elections. The document did not include a proposed end date for the peacekeeping operation.

**Conclusion**

In sum, the United Nations operations in Haiti are measured by quantity and type of funding, type of work and projects, and timeline of involvement. MINUSTAH’s funding is immense with a commitment authority of $380,000,000 (gross) from 07/10–12/10, as well as OCHA’s budget of 1.5 billion USD for the year. Yet, it is important to note that this operation has had internal financial issues in the past as documented by U.N. audits. The Mission’s type of work is focused on promoting stability in the local governance. U.N. also finance’s many other projects throughout Haiti that are not directly conducted through MINUSTAH. These projects also include other NGOs, which are active in the country. Although these projects are conducive in theory, the actual practice has often been questioned. Lastly, U.N.’s timeline of involvement

---


has been very committed throughout the years, but if the UN loses its credibility with the Haitian people, increased efforts might prove ineffective. For instance, the cholera outbreak sparked a rumor within the population of having originated from United Nations peacekeepers. Although the accusations are false, U.N. operations lose accountability within the people.

In summary, United Nation’s humanitarian efforts reflect a positive trend in terms of quantity, but it imperative to also question whether those impressive numbers are being implemented efficiently. MINUSTAH has had self deemed benefits such as the 2006 elections, but as it continues to grow its forces questions arise about the integrity of the mission. For example, human rights issues occur because the purpose and actual tasks of the peacekeeping mission are not clearly designated. Moreover, MINUSTAH does not have a determined form to measure its failures and successes. For example, the presidential elections of February 2006 are considered an obvious success by U.N. officials, yet there is lacking evidence of further positive results. Further addressing these issues, as well as the comparative analysis of other NGOs involved with humanitarian efforts in Haiti, will allow for healthy betterment of the quality of U.N. missions. Lastly, OCHA efforts are also questioned because of their lack of interaction with the local Haitian community and community based organizations (CBOs). One instance is that meetings are conducted in English rather than French or Haitian Creole.

53 Howland, 469.
excluding any local individuals. This connection, as seen later in the study, is vital to the effectiveness of an aid organization.

---

CHAPTER 3: CATHOLIC RELIEF SERVICES CASE STUDY

**Introduction to CRS**

Catholic Relief Services (CRS) was established in 1943 by the United States Catholic Bishops with the goal of servicing World War II survivors in Europe (note its similarity to UN’s founding after WWI). Currently, CRS serves over 100 million people in over 100 countries. Its mission is to assist impoverished and disadvantaged people overseas, working in the spirit of Catholic Social Teaching to promote the sacredness of human life and the dignity of the human person. Although our mission is rooted in the Catholic faith, our operations serve people based solely on need, regardless of their race, religion or ethnicity. Within the United States, CRS engages Catholics to live their faith in solidarity with the poor and suffering of the world.

It is the official international humanitarian organization of the Catholic community in the United States. The organization’s goal is to be completely transparent in its actions as well as accountability and efficiency. CRS is also a partner with Caritas Internationalis which is the Catholic international relief agency.

Catholic Relief Services serves as the second case study because of its committed involvement in Haiti, and its medial size. CRS has partnered with the United Nations in various instances, and is large enough to work with smaller NGOs on its own. Overall, CRS reports 830,204 beneficiaries to its services in Haiti. Just as in the first case study, the following analysis of CRS humanitarian efforts in Haiti is measured by quantity and type of funding, type

---

57 Ibid.
of work and projects, and timeline of involvement. Each measurement will serve as a variable for comparison for overall effectiveness and quality. By and large the results show that Catholic Relief Services, as an intermediate sized organization, has impressive efficiency, while in the same instances can still be too large to create relationship with those receiving aid.

**Finances of Catholic Relief Services**

Firstly, one of the greatest strengths of Catholic Relief Services is the accountability of their finances, despite their growing size. 95% of all CRS operating expenses go directly towards programs, and the remaining 5% goes towards fundraising, awareness, and administration. CRS was also ranked 23 Non Profit Times Top 100. Since the organization relies heavily on donations, it clearly details financial statements, charity ratings, and distribution of resources. For instance, CRS met “all 20 of the strict Charity Standards set by the Better Business Bureau's charity rating arm, the Wise Giving Alliance, and have an "A" rating from the American Institute of Philanthropy.” CRS also makes a pledge to donors that includes providing information about the use of all donations and resources as well as making every financial report available to the public.

There are three main sources of assets for Catholic Relief Services: unrestricted donations, restricted donations, and grants. Unrestricted private contributions are given by individual donors who give freely to organization, simply trusting the CRS distributes the funds

---


where need be. Restricted donations are also given by private donors, but are designated for a project or place in particular. For example, if a donor was interested in donating specifically to aid in Haiti, they could choose to do so. The grants are provided through the U.S. government and other public agencies. The funding from these grants must be used in a highly specific manner. Every dollar spent from the grant must be accounted for and must follow the regulations of the particular agency. For instance, if CRS applies for a grant to provide a certain number of mosquito nets to a certain country, it is only permitted to use the grant money for that purpose. This means that Catholic Relief Services has minimal flexibility on allocation of funds. The following two tables document the percentage of contribution sources and the allocation of those resources.

Table 3 *Operating Revenues for CRS*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source</th>
<th>2004</th>
<th>2003</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>$ Amount</td>
<td>Percentage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contributions</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unrestricted</td>
<td>75,178</td>
<td>13.62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Restricted</td>
<td>33,500</td>
<td>6.07</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agricultural</td>
<td>281,324</td>
<td>50.98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cash grants from USG</td>
<td>145,247</td>
<td>26.32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All other support</td>
<td>16,586</td>
<td>3.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>551,835</strong></td>
<td><strong>100</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Operating revenues summary with respect to contributing source for CRS for 2003 and 2004. All amounts are in thousands of dollars.*

Table 4 *Functional Expenses for CRS 2009*

Catholic Relief Services is very clear it does not go at it alone. CRS works with various partners in Haiti for support. These include: U.S. Agency for International Development (USAID), Caritas Haiti, the Global Fund to Fight AIDS, Tuberculosis and Malaria, and United Nations Children’s Fund (UNICEF). Each partner provides CRS with various resources and allows them to grow financially.

Catholic Relief Services in Haiti committed to a five year program with the U.S. Agency for International Development Office of Food for Peace beginning in March 2008. The purpose of this partnership is to address various risks in Haiti such as lack of preparation for natural

disasters and deficiency of education services. Through the President’s Emergency Plan for
AIDS Relief, CRS also services antiretroviral drug therapy as well as HIV/ AIDS testing and
counseling. United States government grants account for an average of 25% of CRS operating
revenues. Also, in 2009, USAID and USDA donated $159,880 to CRS for agricultural
commodities (see Table-4).

The second partner for CRS is Caritas Haiti. Caritas Haiti is a branch of Caritas
Internationalis, which is a conglomeration of 162 Catholic organizations focused on relief,
development, and social service. The branch in Haiti has worked alongside Caritas for over thirty
years. The purpose of this connection is to create various emergency response programs as well
as development through sustainable agriculture.

Thirdly, the Global Fund to Fight AIDS, Tuberculosis and Malaria supports CRS Haiti.
The purpose of the Global Fund is to greatly increase support and resources to combat the three
main diseases, and distribute that support to those most in need. Catholic Relief Services directs
the contributions from the foundation to service a thousand children in need, specifically in the
Nippes department of Haiti.

The fourth major partner of CRS is the United Nations Children’s Fund. This partnership
is particularly interesting in this analysis because of the connection to the first case study of the

---


65 Ibid.
United Nations. Part of Catholic Relief Services’ finances is dependent on the U.N. The purpose of this connection with UNICEF is to address the needs of children’s education and protection. This aid to education includes betterment of the quality of schools in the area through trainings for teachers and school directors, providing materials for school, create parent-teacher associations (PTA), as well as health, nutrition, and hygiene training. The aid to children protection includes supporting the struggle against human trafficking, especially in Northern Haiti, through education and training of various communities on the risks, and providing aid for previous victims.

After the January 2010 earthquake, just as United Nations programs and many NGOs, Catholic Relief Services increased their support in Haiti. The following is the reported contributions raised for Haiti in the five months after the fact according to their “6 Months Later” report.

Table 5: CRS Financial Information for Haiti in the 5 Months After Earthquake

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Private funds raised to date:</th>
<th>$141,179,327</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>U.S. government commitments to CRS:</td>
<td>$44,058,952</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other donors:</td>
<td>$12,941,889</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total:</strong></td>
<td>$198,180,168</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Spent so far in 5-year plan:</strong></td>
<td>$30,572,449</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Overall, the finances of Catholic Relief Services have many strengths and weaknesses. The positive side of CRS funding is that they are accountable and very transparent about where their money is distributed. They also draw their sources from many different donors. The negative side is CRS is completely dependent on donors, although this can also be viewed as a testimony to CRS in that donors continue to give even through economic hardships. Another weakness is that CRS is heavily restricted by the grant regulations as well as the restricted contributions, yet this might also be a significant reason for CRS increased reliability.

**Type of Involvement**

The second variable for analyzing Catholic Relief Services is the type of involvement that the organization has in humanitarian efforts in Haiti. CRS is involved with various types of projects including: agriculture, civil society and governance, education, disaster response, health, HIV and AIDS, microfinance, safety net, and water and sanitation. The goal of CRS is balance support between charity and justice efforts, meaning to not place all of their resources in disaster relief and food distribution while still addressing the sources of the problems. This is put into practice by providing relief in times of emergencies through partnership through other agencies such as USAID as mentioned above, while also providing support for sustainable growing agriculture and education on management of natural resources.

Because of the high infant and maternal mortality rate, the lack of efficient food production or distribution, and the rampant diseases such as cholera today, one of the main CRS programs is focused on health and nutrition. These projects include the CRS Haiti’s Maternal and Child Health Nutrition feeding program, which similarly to Women, Infant, and Children (WIC)
nutrition programs in the United States, supplies food for children from 6 to 24 months of age, pregnant women and nursing mothers, and people living with HIV. Along with providing actual nutrition, this program also educates community health centers on effectively managing their programs as well as aids the centers in distributing basic, necessary care, which include immunizations, vitamin A for eye health, and nutrition and follow-up care.68

Due to the increased deforestation, continued soil erosion, and growing poverty, another main focal point of CRS work is agriculture. The way in which CRS supports agriculture is through projects that increase agricultural production, diversification of crops, and guiding farmers to already existing markets. Education is also a tool used to teach farmers how to better their land through reforestation and growing crops that protect against erosion, especially through frequent storms. Micro financing programs are also used to help communities raise average income, and also creating savings groups to support existing organizations such as women’s groups and PTAs.69

A common theme throughout CRS involvement is education. They use education as a means to bettering many different areas of the infrastructure, so logically they build up the education system itself. CRS Haiti does this through better student nutrition, parent involvement, and teacher, director, and education official training. This is concretely seen through providing school lunches to increase school enrollment, rebuilding buildings and latrines, giving health

69 Ibid.
education in school. Their goal is to use education as a way to increase a sense of community and connectedness.

Water and sanitation is an increasingly relevant issue throughout Haiti, especially as diseases such as cholera are easily spread through water sources. CRS specifically works to improve water and sanitation through the building of latrines, better access to potable water supplies, and again provide education in schools and health centers of the importance of good hygiene.

Even before the 2010 earthquake, Haiti has been ridden by other natural disasters such as hurricanes and floods. Haiti’s deforestation and consequent soil erosion make the country very vulnerable to storms. This vulnerability was augmented by the earthquake as thousands of individuals are displaced in tent cities. As soon as a storm arrives, the “homes” are flooded and washed away. CRS is involved in emergency response by supplying food, water, and medical supplies during a disaster. Alongside the immediate response is CRS’ development of warning systems and what they refer to as “civil protection communities.” These communities are groups of local people whom CRS trains in emergency response, such as evacuation plans. Also, provides aid after the emergency through repairing homes and water systems as well as providing equipment and supplies for farming.

Another focus of CRS in Haiti is HIV and AIDS assistance. This aid is done through pairing with organizations such as AIDSRelief in attempting to better the lives of those living with HIV/AIDS. CRS works together with the President's Emergency Plan for AIDS Relief

---

(PEPFAR) to provide needed medical care to those affected by HIV. Again, CRS is involved in education programs to avoid the spreading not only of the disease, but also of the stigma that goes along with it. There are also available education programs for those dealing with the disease for learning about the significance of nutrition and treatment. This support also extends to support HIV-positive individuals financially through a support of a local organization that supplies micro credit loans for the individuals and families affected. These credit programs also educate the families with tips to improve their financial management as well as creating community backs.71

CRS also has projects referred to as “social safety net” programs. These are social assistance programs that essentially supplement already existing local programs and institutions. CRS assists those groups that are not receiving government aid and purely rely on donations. The form in which this assistance takes place is through various projects such as construction for repairing building, providing meals, distributing funds to sustainable projects, education of organization officials in management skills such as proposal writing. 72

Lastly, Catholic Relief Services has programs committed to enhancing civil society, justice, and human rights causes. These programs draw from local organizations and communities as well as the Catholic communities of the United States. CRS attempts to build up the local leadership through education in civics, human rights, and leadership. CRS develops partnership with these communities and connects them to church dioceses in the U.S. CRS

72 Ibid.
implements the Catholic value system of the Catholic Social Teachings, which the U.S. Council of Catholic Bishops state to be, “a rich treasure of wisdom about building a just society and living lives of holiness amidst the challenges of modern society.” This also relates to CRS’ agreement to promote awareness of the issues.

In sum, according to their budget allocation, CRS allocates the most monetary funds towards emergency response, followed by agriculture and education. Catholic Relief Services has a diverse type of involvement in Haiti, as well as a balance between charity or giving, and projects focusing on justice and support systems. There is also a reoccurring theme of education throughout all of the programs, whether it be HIV/AIDS assistance or water and sanitation projects.

**Commitment of Time**

The third variable in determining effectiveness of humanitarian efforts of CRS Haiti is the commitment of time. In addition to the already established aid, CRS has committed to a renewed five year plan to assist with development after the January 2010 earthquake. To understand the timeline CRS efforts, it is relevant to begin in 1954 when Catholic Relief Services first began working in Haiti after Hurricane Hazel hit the country and led to approximately one thousand fatalities.

At the beginning of CRS involvement, their main objectives were to address the emergency concerns such as immediate food, water, and shelter, but over time CRS has

---

transformed those goals to include long term programs as well. Because of their long history in Haiti, CRS has been able to build partnerships with many local as well as international organizations, as witnesses through financial contributions and the type of involvement. From 1954 to today, CRS has worked at building all of the programs discussed previously. As of 2010, Catholic Relief Services in Haiti has 240 employees and two offices in the capital in Port-au-Prince and in Las Cayes.

Out of the three case studies, although Catholic Relief Services is not the largest, it is the organization with the longest presence in Haiti. United Nations was not involved in Haiti before 1990, and REBUILD Globally was established as a result of the quake. This substantial amount of time raises two inquiries: 1) Was this time used wisely? 2) Is this time stretch a result of dependency on the organization? Although both questions are objective, they are relevant to the case study.

**Conclusion**

To reiterate, Catholic Relief Services’ effectiveness was analyzed by quantity and type of funding, type of work and projects, and timeline of involvement. CRS is a non-profit faith based NGO that relies on unrestricted contributions, restricted contributions, and grants to fund their various operations. Their budget thus far for their proposed five-year plan is $198,180,168. This budget many times is limited by restrictions on where the money is allocated. The type of work and projects are diverse and abundant. The main types of programs are: agriculture, civil society and governance, education, disaster response, health, HIV and AIDS, microfinance, safety net, and water and sanitation. These programs include both immediate and long term assistance. The
timeline of involvement has gone from the disaster of Hurricane Hazel in 1954, to today. CRS also began an additional five-year plan established after the 2010 earthquake.

In sum, it is important to note that CRS has the strengths of accountability of finances, diversity in projects, and long term commitment. At the same time, it is also relevant to call to mind the weaknesses of the organization such as restrictions in distribution of resources, full dependence on outside contributions, and possible growth of dependency of the local people and organizations on CRS. Since CRS is smaller than the U.N. and perhaps because of its status as a faith based organization, it is less subject to scrutiny, yet it is imperative to examine both sides of the equation especially through this analysis.
CHAPTER 4: REBUILD GLOBALLY CASE STUDY

Introduction to REBUILD Globally

Restoring Environments By Utilizing Innovative Local Development (REBUILD) Globally was deemed a tax exempt 501(c)(3) non-profit organization in 2010, and was founded by CEO Julie Colombino and partners Malia Schneider and Kim Reidelbach as a result of the January 12, 2010 earthquake. REBUILD’s mission is:

To improve the quality of life and create healthier environments for people in distressed communities by using new and innovative techniques that promote recycling, eco-friendly development, gainful employment, agriculture and education.

Currently, REBUILD is stationed in Port-au-Prince, Haiti with a U.S. base in Orlando, FL. The blooming non-profit has is presently focused on the goal of employing Haitian artisans while repurposing waste materials such as rubber tires and plastic bags. For example, one of the main programs of this NGO is to create sandals from tires left on the streets of the city. By developing these handmade tires, the organization is able to provide employment while removing waste that would otherwise be burned. The REBUILD team consists of the CEO, Board of Directors and Advisory Council in the US, interns, volunteers and most importantly, Haitian artisans.

REBUILD is also partnered with other organizations based in the capital including Grassroots United, European Disaster Volunteers, Caribbean Lodge, and Sogucedes.

REBUILD Globally serves as the final case study because of its small grassroots level of non-profit work. The organization is small enough that there is still a sense of trust and openness between the CEO and Advisory Council and the artisans and volunteers. As a present intern at REBUILD, I am able to base the methodology of this case study upon personal experience and
field work. As in the previous international organizations, the following analysis of REBUILD
Globally pertains to the three variables of: quantity and type of funding, type of work and
projects, and timeline of involvement. Each measurement will serve as a term of comparison for
overall effectiveness and quality. Overall, the results reveal that REBUILD, the smallest
organization within this analysis, while its size prevents it from reaching as many people in term
of numbers, is notably praiseworthy in quality and relationship with each employee of the NGO.

**Finances**

First off, what may be one of the most valuable assets of REBUILD’s size is the
complete assurance that every dollar donated to the organization will be utilized directly towards
REBUILD programs. The money accrued from sundry donations is used to replenish supplies,
provide artisans a living wage, supply a hearty meal for the employees, and pay for tools needed
for existing and up-and-coming projects. The finances for REBUILD are logically much simpler
than CRS and UN since the numbers are much smaller and therefore easily held accountable.
The organization’s finances can be divided into three classifications: unrestricted donations,
grants, and donated revenue from REBUILD products sold.

The NGO was built upon donations, and currently runs completely on donations of both
funding and time. These unrestricted donations come from donors throughout the REBUILD
network, and do not have a specified purpose, and therefore are put to use wherever necessary.
These donations are complied through fundraisers throughout the local and global community.
Past fundraisers include a wine tasting event, rummage sales, bake sales, a ‘Passport to Haiti’
event, and various other events in the like. These unrestricted donations accounted for
$11,652.67 USD of funding. An example of a major fundraising program was entering the GlobalGiving Challenge which secured REBUILD a permanent position on the website that directs donors to specific causes. Each of these donations make a difference from: $15 providing lunch for an artisan for two weeks, $30 securing an artisans wages for a week, $60 purchases macramé straps for 20 pairs of sandals, and $170 puts one child back in school for a year. These donations are received online through a paypal account, and in person or through mail in the form of cash and check. Another impactful type of donation is time. When volunteers come to Haiti, they are expected to cover payment of flight and all expenses while in country. This is vital, because it allows the individuals to support REBUILD’s goal of not utilizing the organization’s project budget for anything other than directly back to the program’s initiatives.

In the future, REBUILD, much like CRS, plans to also rely on grants. Although they are currently receiving only the Hand/Eye Artisan Grant for $2,370, the Board of Directors is also applying for various other grants that would support the REBUILD initiatives. The most significant of these perspective grants is the UN QIP. As previously mentioned in the United Nations case study, QIP are Quick Impact Projects grants that are focused on providing funding to sustainable programs coordinated by smaller NGOs. The amount of funding provided varies from project to project. During my time in Haiti, while visiting one of the UN departments in charge of QIP distribution explained that most funding ranges from $100,000 to $25,000 or less. The greater amounts are usually given to infrastructure development programs, such as repairing a road, while the smaller amount would go to projects such as REBUILD. The UN


representatives also stressed the importance to show that our sandals can be sold on the international market. It is interesting to note that both of the smaller NGOs are connected to the United Nations.

The last form of funding for REBUILD is revenue from the sale of the handmade items made by the employed artisans. As of now, the items include: Rebuilders sandals from recycled tires, handbags from repurposed plastic bags, wallets from cans and milk cartons, and jewelry such as necklaces, bracelets, and earrings. These items are then sold to customers directly from REBUILD volunteers. This is done through events such as the Sandal Premier Party in February 2011, in which the community of Orlando was invited to come view and purchase the products as well as get to know more about REBUILD’s programs. The future plan for sales is to have each REBUILD volunteer host shoe parties. At shoe parties the host would be provided with Rebuilders sandals and other products to sell, as well as an accompanying video to explain more about the organization and artisans involved. The host invites their personal friends and people they know would be interested. From there, those invitees could then sign up to host their own shoe parties. Another form of selling the products is to create partnerships with local companies. REBUILD will draw attention to their products by participating in trade shows. For example, the Rebuilders sandals premiered in a show in New York City in January 2011.

In sum, REBUILD’s finances flow through three different channels: unrestricted donations, grants, and revenue from products. The donations originate from online campaigns such as GlobalGiving, fundraising events such as “Passport to Haiti”, and personal talent and time invested into the organization. Grants are sought from sources such as the UN and will be
restricted as to where the funds will be directed. Lastly, sales from recycled tire sandal...s the very limited funding that is heavily dependent on the generosity of donors.

**Type of Involvement**

The second determinant of the organization’s humanitarian efforts is the type of services and projects rendered. Employment, education, and development are the three main goals of REBUILD. From these goals stem various projects including employing artisans, teaching English classes, and cultivating community gardens. Intertwining all three goals, REBUILD is also involved with local outreach, especially through the artisan’s respective organizations as well as its partners Grassroots United and European Disaster Volunteers. In summary, REBUILD provides a well-rounded sustainable approach for each of their types of involvement within Port-au-Prince, Haiti. This approach stands apart from the other two case studies, because REBUILD has a goal that their initiatives will continue completely locally led and managed.

First and foremost, REBUILD works to provide gainful employment. This is made concrete though the organization’s workshop. The artisans employed there not only earn their wages, but also learn new skills in the process. The NGO has the goal of employing forty artisans in the Port-au-Prince area. Currently, eight men and women are employed as shoe makers. The supervisor at the workshop was a professional shoe maker pre-earthquake, and takes pride in being able to work at his craft once more. Each artisan has their own story to tell. For instance, Brunel Zamor, who serves as accountant and English teacher at the workshop stated,
“The money I earn at REBUILD Globally I use to help the needy children on the street. I have a foundation, and with this foundation I help the children to go to school.”⁷⁷ Along with these eight artisans, there are also two young men who after selling their handbags made from recycled materials to REBUILD are able to pay for school. Employment rather than donations creates sustainable development rather than dependency. Employees also learn skills such as business development, finances, and using their creativity to manufacture sellable products.

Secondly, this non-profit focuses on education. One of the biggest ways REBUILD fosters education is by providing English classes every morning. Before starting work on the sandals, the artisans participate in an English lesson accompanied by Haitian Kreyol/English workbooks. Alongside the classes, REBUILD supports local education endeavors. As previously mentioned the macramé straps on the sandals send college students back to academia, and likewise with the recycled handbags. REBUILD also partners with the Youth Progressive Foundation of Peace, which was the foundation mentioned by Mr. Zamor. The foundation has sent over 134 students back to school, simply by networking to find scholarships from local headmasters. In the future, REBUILD wishes to employ the foundation managers, which were all teachers before the earthquake, as professors. Lastly, REBUILD has provided workshops to the local community on waste prevention and recycling.

This third point of focus is community development. A theme that rings throughout the organization is the significance of recycling. Before the earthquake, Port-au-Prince struggled

⁷⁷ Interview with Brunel Zamor. Jan 2011.
with an inefficient waste management system, and it has only degraded since that time.\textsuperscript{78} Waste piles accumulate in ditches on the side of the streets, to later be burned in dumpsters. This burning releases toxic fumes into the air, resulting in not only an environmental issue but a social political issue as well. As an example, during political riots, especially around elections, people collect rubber tires from the streets and burn them as a demonstration. To stop these chemicals from filling the air, REBUILD attempts to collect the tires to use them in a useful and environmentally safe manner. This is one form of community development.

Another considerable point of focus for the NGO is orphanages. By partnering with European Disaster Volunteers (EDV), they are able to find the orphanages most in need, and after EDV supplies de-worming medication and other needs, REBUILD provides them with sandals. For every tire sandal purchased, one sandal is given to a child. One partner orphanage, Hands Together to Defend the Children Orphanage (HTDC), was founded by Jolina Auguste, one of the REBUILD artisans.

A third form of community involvement is beginning community gardens. One form of repurposing the tire waste leftover after the sandal making is creating a tire garden which uses tires as planters, and also provides easier transportation for the plants. Once the REBUILD garden is fully flourished, the organization plans to take seed and already developing crops to other orphanages in need, which will then do the same once their garden is ready. Lastly,

REBUILD also plans to create a community center in Port-au-Prince, with a focus in the arts such as music, dancing, painting, and singing. As an illustration, the organization has already taught gymnastic classes at the Future Haiti Orphanage. The goal is to utilize the already present talents to spread to others in the community.

To summarize, evaluating REBUILD Globally’s type of involvement in humanitarian efforts in Haiti is the second variable of the case study. This NGO has three main goals of programs: employment, education, and community development. This is realized though employing artisans especially in creating recycled tire sandals, teaching English classes, and recycling initiatives as well as community outreach. This small non-profit differs from the other two case studies because it is a much smaller network, yet with their small amount of employees and volunteers they are able to be very efficient and effective. Another subtle difference is that REBUILD Globally does not have their focus on growth and reaching x number of people, but rather to be a better quality organization that aims on servicing the people they encounter on a personal level. The programs also center on using the natural strengths of the community rather than always being the upper hand that gives for “free”. Also important to note is that this non-profit does not only partner with other NGOs but also with local foundations, which know the pressing needs, because they are experiencing them first hand. For instance, Camp Mona was a tent city in Port-au-Prince that had yet to be recognized by UN officials, and therefore had not received assistance after the earthquake. Sogucedes, the macramé strap making partners for the tire sandals, informed REBUILD of the needs of Camp Mona, who then after many visits to the IOM United Nations office were able to procure a site visit, which is the beginning process of providing assistance.
**Commitment of Time**

Finally, the last variable of measuring effectiveness of this organization’s efforts in Haiti is duration of involvement. REBUILD Globally differs greatly from the fifty plus years of CRS and even the twenty years of UN of presence in Haiti, since it only began after the January 12, 2010 earthquake. Similarly to CRS, REBUILD was established after a natural disaster. The founders of this small NGO came to Haiti to the understanding that they did not intent on being there indefinitely. They had the purpose of staying in Haiti until the local management was established enough to continue on its own. Presently, the goal is to spend two more years in Haiti before branching out to other lesser developed countries.

During these proposed two years, the organization plans to open new REBUILD workshops on the countryside of Haiti. These centers will ideally be managed by the current artisans since they have the most experience and commitment to the NGO. These new centers will be where the additional thirty members will be staffed. The current supervisor is already training individuals interested in the positions. Before branching out, REBUILD also has the plan of hosting workshops for financial and budgetary training. Workshops will also be held to educate the community on innovative ways to recycle waste rather than burn it. Through the future community center, REBUILD will also increase employment, education, and development campaigns.  

Overall, the positive aspect of the short time commitment is that the NGO has the idea of sustainability at the forefront of its decisions, and therefore fosters development rather than

---

dependency. The negative aspect is that REBUILD Globally does not have as much experience as the other two case studies, which in turn is also connected to the amount of outreach simply because relationships take time to thrive.

**Conclusion**

In conclusion, REBUILD serves as the last case study in this research because of its local grassroots level of non-profit work. The size of the organization allows it to foster a deep sense of relationship with each artisan and volunteer. While at the workshop in Port-au-Prince, the artisans explained to me that REBUILD was their family. Every morning, CEO Julie Colombino walks into the workshop and asks, “Eske ou kontan? – Are you happy?” This wouldn’t be possible with an organization as large as the first two case studies. As in the previous international organizations, the analysis of REBUILD Globally pertains to the three variables of: quantity and type of funding, type of work and projects, and timeline of involvement. Each measurement serves as a term of comparison for overall effectiveness and quality.

Funding for REBUILD comes in the three forms of unrestricted donations, grants, and revenue from handmade merchandise. The operating amount is miniscule compared to that of the UN or CRS, which also implies that REBUILD is limited by how much is donated or granted, as in the case of Catholic Relief Services funds. This difference also means that, out of necessity, REBUILD is much more efficient with every dollar entrusted to the non-profit. This leads to an interesting observation that in Port-au-Prince, the majority of the larger NGOs are stationed in Pétion-ville, Haiti, which is located up the mountainside near the capital. Pétion-ville is also
recognized as the wealthy area of town. Catholic Relief Services, American Red Cross, and UNICEF are all based there.

Type of involvement for REBUILD is focused in the three areas of employment, education, and community development. Each of the goals allows the small NGO to have a lasting impact and well-rounded approach in many different areas. For example, each of the artisans has a family they are supporting, through the employment they are not only provided financial stability but also learn English and gain business experience, and yet again are also taking harmful waste off of the street of Port-au-Prince. Although REBUILD cannot surpass the quantity of programs and involvement of the larger NGOs, it can excel in quality.

The time commitment of REBUILD began after the 2010 earthquake. This is considerably shorter than the remaining case studies, and because of this factor does not have as large a network or finances. Although REBUILD lacks in time, one could argue that the short time commitment attests to the dedication to sustainability. REBUILD is in Haiti for the purpose of being a building block, stepping stone, or channel for some people to funnel their valuable abilities, but not as a bandage for an issue.

Overall, the results reveal that REBUILD, while its size prevents it from reaching as many people in term of numbers, is notably praiseworthy in quality and relationship with each employee of the NGO. Since the research in this study is aimed on analyzing effectiveness and quality, it is important to regard the worth of this organization as it affects its smaller network in an effective and quality manner.
One Year Later: Republic of NGOs

A year after the initial catastrophe, Haiti’s streets are littered with at least 10 million cubic meters of rubble, over 810,000 reported individuals are living in 1,150 camps, and 42% of schools have not been cleared of debris.  

Not only has the state faced the after effects of the quake, but it has also confronted new challenges such as the cholera epidemic that spread shortly after. The earthquake exasperated the preexisting issues such as unemployment, poverty, and homelessness. Progress in Haiti has been a slow, conflict-prone process, in which NGOs are eager to get involved.

Haiti is commonly referred to as a Republic of NGOs, especially after the influx of aid organizations after the tragedy. This term is usually used to give a negative twist to the foreign involvement within the state. With an estimated 10,000 NGOs and counting, Haiti has the most NGOs per capita. To place it in perspective, this would mean that there are 1,000 Haitians or less to every non-governmental organization, with the ratio being vastly larger in Port-au-Prince, where the heaviest concentration of organizations is located. With this large number of international organizations, it is difficult to comprehend how the country is not “good as new”. The caveat to this number is the lack of cooperation, not only within other NGOs, but also local organizations. This disconnect leads to lack of local development, especially in the governmental

---


sector. Because the Haitian initiatives do not have a chance to grow, the country cannot build itself up. This is clearly depicted in the disbursement of aid money. Foreign donors direct their funds towards various humanitarian organizations, leading the NGOs to have the monetary power to promote positive change without the firsthand know-how of where it is best placed. Since corruption and inefficiency is not unique to the Haitian government, it is significant to study NGOs’ strengths and weaknesses as they attempt to put a country back together again. In order to remold the phrase Republic of NGOs into a more positive statement, foreign involvement must be the best quality possible.

**Overall Quality**

To best capture what makes NGOs more or less effective, this research focuses on the variables relating to size. The United Nations, Catholic Relief Services, and REBUILD Globally each have their strengths and weaknesses, yet overall the smallest case study provided the most effective and quality service. Nevertheless, what qualities make REBUILD more effective than an organization such as the UN which serves thousands of Haitians? Each variable on the following table depicts the primary differences in size of the organizations, including finances, project focus, and timeline.
Table 6: Overall Quality Summary

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Organization</th>
<th>Financial</th>
<th>Variable of Quality</th>
<th>Duration</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| United Nations        | -membership dues (assessed resources)  
                        | -voluntary contributions 
                        | MINUSTAH: $380,000,000 (gross) 
                        | from 07/10–12/10.  
                        | *UN Haiti Operations 
                        | 2010-1.5 Billion USD goal   
                        | OCHA:  
                        | -Camp Coordination/ 
                        | Camp Management 
                        | -Early Recovery 
                        | -Education 
                        | -Food 
                        | -Health 
                        | -Logistics 
                        | -Nutrition 
                        | -Protection 
                        | -Shelter & Non-Food 
                        | -Items (NFI's) 
                        | -Water, Sanitation and Hygiene (WASH)  
                        | -Since 1990  
                        | -unknown timeline |
| Catholic Relief Services | -unrestricted donations 
                        | -restricted donations 
                        | -grants 
                        | *95% directly towards programs 
                        | *5 months after quake $198,180,168  
                        | -agriculture 
                        | -civil society and governance 
                        | -education 
                        | -disaster response 
                        | -health 
                        | -HIV and AIDS 
                        | -microfinance 
                        | -safety net 
                        | -water and sanitation  
                        | -Since 1954  
                        | -renewed 5 year plan |
| REBUILD Globally      | -unrestricted donations 
                        | -grants 
                        | -donated revenue 
                        | *$10,644.42 spent in 2010  
                        | *100% directed back to REBUILD initiatives  
                        | -employment 
                        | -education 
                        | -community development  
                        | -Since Jan 2010 Earthquake  
                        | -2 year plan before establishing new branches |

82 “United Nations Peacekeeping Operations”

83 “Haiti Earthquake Response.” OCHA. 8 Jan 2011

Financial Quality

First of all, the quality of the funding is not only determined by the greatest dollar amount. Effectiveness also accounts for how the money is utilized. By far, the largest spending budget is the United Nations. With a 1.3 billion USD budget in this past year alone, the UN has immense capabilities to aid in rehabilitating Haiti. The bulk of this funding originates from member states’ dues, followed by voluntary contributions. It is important to note that the United Nations is left vulnerable to states refusing to pay dues or donations. This is relevant in the current case of the United States delaying payment of membership dues, which takes a large toll on the organization since the U.S. is its biggest contributor. Hence, even though they have the most funds, the UN, just like any other organization, if left at the mercy of their contributors.

In continuation, the growth of a financial budget can actually contribute to inefficiencies. For example, imagine a Haitian making average wage of two US dollars a day. To that woman, man, or child, that money means a day of survival. To an average person in a highly industrialized state such as the United States, that same amount means an item from the dollar menu of a fast food restaurant, a pack of gum, or overall something that would go by unnoticed more often than not. When finances increase, it is easy to lose sight of how much every dollar counts. In relation to NGOs, this translates into a non-profit such as REBUILD completely relying on walking and tap-tap rides (the rudimentary public transportation) since it does not own an automobile, while on the other hand it is nearly impossible to not encounter one of the hundreds of white UN vehicles on the streets of Port-au-Prince, Haiti. With a limited spending budget, a group is forced to make non-wasteful decisions, but as the number increases, similar to anything else, it is harder to manage. Of course, the large budget in itself is not a negative
quality. It is only when an organization forgets the perspective of the served that finances lack quality.

Catholic Relief Services provides a unique example of finances because it is known for being accountable of all donations and grants given to the organization. CRS is a noteworthy model of the ability to grow in size and still direct 95% of funds to projects. The weakness in their model is once the funds are disbursed to the various initiatives, it is difficult to continually follow through to see how the projects are running or if they have even started because of the continually growing number of projects. This is especially true in the countryside, when the projects stretch to a regional level. Another challenge to funds such as CRS’, which rely chiefly on government funds, is that those organizations are then accountable to their donors rather than the Haitian people. This is true of most organizations, unless that organization is led, run by, and dependent on the locals themselves. It is a grave challenge, because while the accountability should be from the people served, the organizations still require funding, and at times this funding limits rather than expands its capabilities.

Although very limited, REBUILD Globally as a small NGO is effective because of their ability to stretch their small dollar amount to fit their many needs. In 2010, RG raised $11,652.67 USD, which seems miniscule compared to the million dollar donations received by other NGOs. The difference is that all of the funds went directly into existing projects, and 98% went directly into the Haitian community. This number also does not account for the countless volunteer hours that hold the organization together. The reason the money is funneled straight into the pressing needs is not only because of the small budget, but also because of the freedom

84 “Haiti: Earthquake Response,” OCHA. 8 Jan 2011
REBUILD has from its donors. The donors have all given to RG because they confide in the non-profit to properly disburse their funds. Because of this trust between donor and organization, REBUILD Globally has the freedom to move its funds to where need be.

Another aspect that makes RG financially sustainable is their market element. Since REBUILD Globally is selling merchandize to draw funds, they are accountable to their customers to create the best possible product with the best possible production process. This also means that they are not dependent on one form of donations. Benefactors also receive the satisfaction of knowing their contribution went towards someone who earned their wages and as an added bonus get a practical and desired item from the deal.

Type of Involvement Quality

The project focus of an organization is an indicator of the value of the program. The effectiveness of these programs is then measured by the process of the organization itself as well as the outcome. The United Nations is unique in that its largest involvement in Haiti, particularly in Port-au-Prince, is its Peacekeeping mission- MINUSTAH. The purpose of MINUSTAH is to promote stability in the state, especially during election times. The challenge of measuring the quality of this specific work is there is no other stabilization operation in Haiti comparable to the UN’s. Therefore, although there are still continued riots during election time and many votes are not valid, it is difficult to evaluate the MINUSTAH operation, because one can only compare it the elections in absence of the UN.

The other side of UN involvement in Haiti is OCHA. The humanitarian facet of the UN is more measurable than MINUSTAH because of the overflow of humanitarian NGOs in Haiti.
OCHA’s statistics are impressive. For instance, 4.3 million people were given food rations in response to the quake. Numbers this large cannot be duplicated by one small organization, yet an organization such as REBUILD can not only give fair wages, but also provide meaningful education, recycling and garden initiatives with such a small budget and workforce. What makes RG projects any different from OCHA just on a smaller scale? REBUILD Globally’s projects stem from local initiatives. From the straps on the Rebuilders sandals to laptop donations, everything began from local interest and already existing projects or foundations. Without these partnerships, the non-profit would lose its quality and ability to function.

Directly following the earthquake, OCHA was quick to respond, but lacked the very important detail of local leadership. An Oxfam briefing paper states: “Since the earthquake, most UN coordination meetings are held in English, rather than French or Creole, effectively excluding many local NGOs and other Haitians both from contributing their local knowledge and experience and from building their own capacity to contribute to Haiti’s long-term future.”

Haitian leadership within NGOs is vital to the quality of an organization. Without constant communication with the local population, it is too simple to lose sight of what the people need and desire, much like a doctor treating a patient with a broken leg as if he or she had a broken arm. If the medicine or treatment is not applied where need be, it is a wasted effort. A Haitian man known as Streets working to promote local music artists explained it as: “The international

---

85 Haiti Earthquake Response. OCHA. 8 Jan 2011
organizations all have a place here in Haiti, but where is my place?" Big or small every NGO must take this into account.

REBUILD Globally went about this by simply asking what was needed, and they received the overwhelming majority of individuals wanting employment rather than handouts. This desire is what shaped the rest of REBUILD’s involvement in Haiti. Through employment, the employees learn a trade and are provided with English language classes, while recycling waste from the streets. The reason employment makes such a difference is that those wages not only affect the specific worker, but the family of that worker. With their pay, employees can decide for themselves where they see the most pressing needs whether it is dinner on the table, their child’s education, or a uniform for school.

Education is a significant type of involvement because, in theory, it leads to employment. Education of parents is also important because it fosters an environment in which school is regarded as a non-negotiable. During the earthquake, 80% of schools were damaged or destroyed. 68% of those schools were cleared of debris by the United Nations. The remaining issue is not only the 42% of schools still covered in rubble, but the fact that families can no longer afford to send their children to those schools. This again goes hand in hand with the importance of employment. It is crucial to support issues of lasting importance and of greatest need to provide the best quality in an NGO.

---

87 Interview with Streets. 12 March 2011
88 Haiti Earthquake Response. OCHA. 8 Jan 2011
Commitment Quality

The type of commitment goes hand in hand with the other variables to determine an organization’s worth. Without sufficient funds, the future plans and projects cannot be implemented to fruition. The timeline of NGOs is not simply black and white. The longer the timeline does not necessarily equate to a better timeline. Humanitarian groups should have the ultimate goal of leaving wherever they are serving, as in the problem’s solution is already in place or the initiative has become sustainable by the Haitian people themselves. For example, the MINUSTAH peacekeeping mission should have a big picture view of leaving the country in a place where it can monitor fair election on their own, rather than become a permanent fixture replacing the governing body.

The United Nations has been involved with Haitian affairs since 1990, and currently does not have an estimate of how long their time there will continue. Following the quake, all of the UN branches active in Haiti increased their efforts. OCHA quickly led search and rescue teams as well as catered to immediate needs such as food distribution. MINUSTAH increased their number of troops and time commitment. Again, the issue with this updated commitment is that the UN is seemingly serving as an interim governing body rather than only supporting the local government, especially through the growing number of forces and other NGOs dependency on UN funding and grants.

Catholic Relief Services became committed to Haiti in 1954, making it the case study with the longest involvement. This extensive time period certainly portrays that CRS is committed to support Haiti through the long haul. Yet, length does not have a right or wrong
answer. The duration of this organization’s aid can be seen through the positive lens that the time was sufficient to build lasting relationships with the people of Haiti, as well as give their projects a long term focus. The negative aspect is that the extended commitment can represent another issue of dependency. If an initiative is only being sustained by CRS funding rather than alongside the local economy, the people are dependent on the outside organization and will not be working towards being sustainable.

REBUILD Globally was established just after the quake. It is the case study with the shortest timeline thus far. REBUILD plans to stay in Port-au-Prince for two to three more years. This does not mean that the projects will come to a close, rather that they will be completely locally run and therefore not require outside supervision. This shows a complete contrast to the case of CRS. While the short timeline can be seen as the weakness of inexperience and lack of dedication, it also represents the desire to let the initiative be run by the people affected instead of an outside source.

Overall, the effectiveness of each case study revolves around the connection to the local people, no matter the size of the group. The reason smaller organizations are of better quality is simply because it is easier to focus on the direct relationship between the people. A Catholic Relief Services Haitian upper-level correspondent shared his honest opinion: non-profits and international organizations can only create change at a local level. Without direction from a governing body, NGOs will not be helpful because they are then striving against the system rather than trying to work through it. He also explained that NGOs are not effective past a local level because it is nearly impossible to oversee regional and national projects. Lastly, he believed
that NGOs in Haiti are becoming a channel for resources rather than an agent for social change.\textsuperscript{89} Each of these comments alludes to further questions and research.

**Future Research**

Although this study supplies various answers, it also opens up many questions. First off, if NGOs are as effective as they are connected to the Haitian people, how are organizations held accountable? For instance, an ordinary organization, such as a restaurant, serves their customers and is also held accountable by their customers. People will not come to your restaurant if they are not pleased by your food or service. This is skewed in world of NGOs. The people served do not have an outlet in which to express their concerns, especially since they are receiving services without payment. Also, since the government is not in control of the state, the NGOs govern themselves. As a clear example, for every dollar given to the country of Haiti, 2 cents are directed to the government while the rest is disbursed to various organizations involved in Haiti.\textsuperscript{90} One scholar theorized that: “Members of the petite bourgeoisie have found a privileged niche in the rapidly growing sector of nongovernmental organizations (NGOs) and voluntary associations through which they are staking their claims for positions of power.”\textsuperscript{91} If this is true, the NGOs receiving all this large percentage of aid money must be closely monitored and held accountable. While it is true that the government is in turmoil and not effective, if it is not given the opportunity to attempt to better itself it will stay in the condition it is presently. Is there a way to involve the government without feeding the corruption?

\textsuperscript{89} Catholic Relief Services interview. 13 March 2011.
A second topic of future research is a test of the sustainability of NGOs. If the UN, CRS, RG, or any other NGO were to leave Haiti, would the projects continue locally? How much of the leadership is Haitian? Also as a continuation of the study of size effects, is an organization with their focus on growth and affecting more people, harmful rather than helpful? This would require a comparison to the local organizations and projects that perhaps began even before the 2010 earthquake.

Lastly, is this same trend applicable to other disaster areas laden with international organizations? This research is only worthwhile if it is relevant to the real world. Haiti is not the only location with natural disasters. Japan’s March 2011 earthquake is just one example of a recent natural disaster that will attract humanitarian NGOs. It is necessary to apply this research to other areas and pinpoint the most effective way to go about serving others abroad instead of assuming that bigger is better. Above all, this study is relevant because it highlights that an international organization will be most successful as it has a better collaboration with community based organizations. Smaller grassroots groups are of better quality, since they can more easily connect to local initiatives. The last step of this research is putting it to use in emerging NGOs to truly make a positive difference rather than misusing the three aspects of finances, involvement, and time.
LIST OF REFERENCES


Aid to Haiti Accelerates; Numbers of Dead, Injured, Homeless Rise." America 202, no. 3 (February 2010): 8-9. Academic Search Premier, EBSCOhost


Allocation at Catholic Relief Services.” Vol. 36, No. 5, September–October 2006, pp. 400–406


http://www.usip.org/files/resources/PB%2020Haiti%20a%20Republic%20of%20NGOs.pdf


“OCHA Funding.” Last updated 2010.


http://crs.org/haiti/partners.cfm


“Pledge to Donors.” Catholic Relief Services. Last updated 2010.

http://crs.org/about/finance/donors_pledge.cfm


http://www.globalgiving.org/projects/rebuildglobally/


http://www.rebuildglobally.org


United Nations Official Document. Distributed 13 July 2010,

“United Nations Peacekeeping Operations”, United Nations, last updated 31 October 2010,

